

Interim Evaluation No. R/SR/INT/0206



**Interim Evaluation of the  
European Union  
Pre-Accession Instrument  
PHARE**

**The Slovak Republic**

**Sector: Internal Market**

**Programmes covered:  
PHARE 2002/2003**

- **Agriculture**
- **Cadastral, Statistics**
- **Energy, Transport**
- **Environment**
- **Finance, Banking, Customs**

**Author:**



**Interim Evaluation Report  
Date: 21 June 2006**



This report has been prepared as a result of an independent evaluation by D&D Consulting being contracted under the PHARE programme.  
**The views expressed are those of D&D Consulting and do not necessarily reflect those of the Government Office of the Slovak Republic.**

Government Office of the Slovak Republic  
Aid Co-ordination Unit  
E-mail: [phare@vlada.gov.sk](mailto:phare@vlada.gov.sk)

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

### The Slovak Republic – Internal Market

**Monitoring Reports:** M/SR/INT/05011/AGR issued on 21 October 2005, M/SR/INT/05011/ENV issued on 14 October 2005, M/SR/INT/05011/INT issued on 27 October 2005.

**Interim Evaluation Report:** R/SR/INT/0206

#### A) Background and scope of the evaluation

The purpose of this Interim Evaluation is to assess the performance of on-going Phare support under the Internal Market monitoring sector, assisting Slovakia in the area of agriculture, cadastre, statistics, energy, transport, environment, finance, banking and customs. This Evaluation covers Phare support allocated for the years 2002 and 2003, approximately totalling a sector allocation of 39.8 M€ from Phare and 13.1 M€ from national sources. The applied interim evaluation methodology is based on the following four main evaluation criteria: *relevance*, *efficiency*, *effectiveness*, *sustainability*, and on *impact*<sup>1</sup>.

#### B) Main evaluation findings and conclusions

The programmes under the **AGRICULTURE** Component are *relevant*, fully compliant with EU and governmental priorities. Some projects addressed urgent needs requiring enforcement of legal measures or the setting-up of institutions and their operations by the date of accession. The main problems concerning relevance were identified in the 2002 Phytosanitary Control programme. Due to changed conditions the original need, to establish a quarantine glasshouse for the phytosanitary control of imported consignments, via the external border with Ukraine, does not correspond with the current needs. Several 2002 and 2003 projects were planned with the assumption that they would be completed before the accession date. As their actual implementation took place much later originally planned, the activities required modifications. As regards **CADASTRE**, **STATISTICS**, **ENERGY** and **TRANSPORT** their relevance is fully justified and in compliance with accession needs, the projects dealing with nuclear safety measures respond well to the urgent national needs. Support given under the **ENVIRONMENT** Component is fully justified, primarily focusing on enforcement of harmonised legislation dealing with pollution, waste, water and nature protection. However, one project (2002 Preparation for Structural Funds), after modification, comprised similar activities to a parallel project within the **FINANCE** Component (2003 Protection of Financial Interests), here provided to all concerned line ministries. The **FINANCE/BANKING/ CUSTOMS** Component with its sub-components has been addressing

---

<sup>1</sup> *Relevance*, whether the design of the project targets the needs of beneficiaries; *Efficiency*, whether the same results could have been achieved at lower costs; *Effectiveness*, whether the project purpose has been achieved; *Sustainability*, whether project benefits are likely to continue after external funding ends; *Impact*, the extent to which the benefits received by the beneficiaries had a wider overall effect.

accession priorities in the area of financial management and control of public funds, financial market regulation and alignment of the customs.

As regard *efficiency*, the majority of the **AGRICULTURE** interventions performed satisfactorily. The 2002 Integrated Administrative and Control System programme was successfully implemented despite a huge time pressure. Less positive is the assessment of interventions for the Central Control and Testing Institute of Agriculture: the PHARE-funded glasshouse (2002 Phytosanitary Control) is questioned in terms of value-for-money; the capacity of laboratory equipment delivered exceeds the need of one institution and could be utilised more efficiently. Some deficiencies were identified in the management of interventions, which influenced the quality of the implementation. These included insufficient reporting, differences between planning documents and actual implementation, and no improvement was observed as regards the assignment of responsibilities for PHARE management and training plans. The interventions within **CADASTRE** and **STATISTICS** were efficient with the exception of the Global Positioning System supply for the Cadastre Authority where the entire allocation was lost. Commitment and the enthusiasm demonstrated by the Statistical Office has been excellent and substantially contributed to the projects' success. However, despite repeated efforts of the REGSTAT staff, the necessary response concerning indicators has still not been provided by the Ministry of Construction and Regional Development. The efficiency of **ENERGY** and **TRANSPORT** programmes has been satisfactory and, particularly, the 2002 Decontamination programme serves as a good example of well managed intervention with highly valuable benefits.

Efficiency of **ENVIRONMENT** programmes was generally sufficient. A more efficient performance could have been achieved within the 2002 Integrated Pollution Prevention Control where more overall co-ordination from the side of the Ministry of Environment could have positively influenced the implementation. The same applies for 2002 Natural Habitats where the implementation suffered from an initial misunderstanding of the basic principle of twinning. Efficiency was not found adequate as regards organisation of the detection bodies for Genetically Modified Organisms. On the other side, excellent results regarding reporting were achieved within the 2003 Capacity Building twinning. The **FINANCE/BANKING/CUSTOMS** Component was efficiently managed overall. With the exception of 2003 Naples II Convention, which encountered administrative difficulties, the interventions were running smoothly and providing the expected benefits.

Most of the **AGRICULTURE** interventions managed to achieve their objectives *effectively*. However, achievement of the project purpose could not be justified in case of 2002 Phytosanitary Control. Nevertheless, the new general framework, tasks and functions compliant with EU Regulations regarding phytosanitary, veterinary and food control (including borders) were established and are operational. The benefits of the completed **CADASTRE** and **STATISTICS** interventions have already materialised. INTRASTAT is fully operational, REGSTAT is commencing operations and a part of the 2003 Statistics project was pilot tested, with very good prospects. The full achievement of the **CADASTRE** objectives however will require the completion of all activities, including the indispensable Global Positioning System. The interventions under

**ENERGY** and **TRANSPORT**, once completed, were successful but results of the 2003 Radioactive Waste Agency project still await political support for the establishment of the Agency.

The **ENVIRONMENT** Component has been effective overall, and mainly introduced numerous measures in the area of environmental protection, pollution prevention, quality control and monitoring. Individual tasks and responsibilities were assigned to the existing institutions, as stipulated in the legislation. A few, ongoing projects have the same positive prospects. An identical assessment can be provided for the **FINANCE/BANKING/CUSTOMS** Component, and the prediction of effectiveness for the outstanding interventions is good.

The majority of the benefits achieved in **AGRICULTURE, CADASTRE, STATISTICS, ENERGY, TRANSPORT** and **ENVIRONMENT** are likely to be *sustainable* since the legal frameworks, hosting most of the programmes, are established and thus will ensure sustainability. Some doubts in relation to sustainability on a few **AGRICULTURE** project outputs have been raised, where efficiency has been a subject of concern: maintenance of the glasshouse and spare parts for the laboratory equipment are rather costly and cannot be always secured from the state budget sources. Similarly, the operation of three laboratories for Genetically Modified Organisms may face difficulties in future, in particular if the demand for testing remains low. Sustainability of training interventions, in general, cannot be guaranteed although measures were already introduced for preventing people to leave institutions after training or to reimburse its costs. There are no indications which would endanger sustainability in the area of **FINANCE/BANKING/CUSTOMS**.

A large majority of the interventions under evaluation are expected, to a varying extent, to contribute to the achievement of their overall objectives - mostly stated as harmonisation with the *acquis*. The eventual socio-economic *impacts* for the whole of society should be visible mainly in the form of healthy food, cleaner environment, and good and transparent management of public funds in the longer term.

### **C) Main recommendations**

#### Addressed to Geodesy, Cartography and Cadastre Authority and Ministry of Finance

The Authority in co-operation with the Ministry of Finance should seek further state budget support to replace lost PHARE funding. The allocation of state budget, originally devoted as co-funding, should be retained for this purpose and additional means should be negotiated in order to secure a sufficient number of Global Position System stations.

#### Addressed to Ministry of Environment

The Ministry of Environment should ensure more direct and pro-active participation in any intervention linked with the important Integrated Pollution Prevention Control legislation, to make sure that decisions taken are more acceptable and fully respected by sub-ordinated institutions, rather than leaving such decisions as a subject of negotiation between sub-ordinated bodies.

Addressed to Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Health, State Veterinary and Food Administration, Central Control and Testing Institute of Agriculture

The relevant Ministries should consider in future a possible change in the structure of laboratories performing tests for the phytosanitary, veterinary and food control bodies to ensure the most optimal and cost-effective utilisation of the PHARE funded equipment.

#### D) Performance Rating

Component/ Project	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Sustainability	Impact	Verbal overall rating
<b><i>Agriculture</i></b>						
2002/000-610.05	2	1	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.06	2	2	2	1	1	HS
2002/000-610.07	1	-1	0	0	0	U
2002/000-610.08	1	-1	0	1	0	S
2003-004-995-03-02	1	0	0	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-03	1	1	0	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-04	1	0	0	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Swine Fever	1	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Audit for APA	1	1	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.02 Strengthening of RAS	1	1	1	1	1	S
<b><i>Cadastre and Statistics</i></b>						
<b><i>Cadastre</i></b>						
2003-004-995-02-01	1	0	1	1	1	S
<b><i>Statistics</i></b>						
2002/000-610.09	2	2	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.10	2	2	2	1	1	HS
2003-004-995-03-05	2	2	1	1	1	S
<b><i>Energy and Transport</i></b>						
<b><i>Energy</i></b>						
2002/000-632.09	1	1	2	2	2	HS
2003/5812.07.01	1	1	0	0	1	S
<b><i>Transport</i></b>						
2003 -995-01-04 Road Transport	1	1	1	1	1	S
<b><i>Environment</i></b>						
2002/000-610.16	1	1	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.17	1	0	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.18	1	0	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.02 Noise	1	1	1	1	1	S
2002/000.610-02 Info Network	1	1	1	1	1	S
2002/000.610-02 SF Implementation	1	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-16	1	2	1	1	1	S

2003-004-995-03-17	1	0	1	0	1	S
2003-004-995-03-18	1	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Capacity Building	0	0	1	0	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 PCB	1	1	1	1	1	S
<b>Finance, Banking and Customs</b>						
<i>Finance</i>						
UIBF 2002/000-610.02 Act on VAT	1	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 IS Review	2	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Strategy for IS	2	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Financial Interests	2	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Budget Evaluation	2	1	0	0	0	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Financial Controllers	2	1	1	0	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Risk Management	1	1	0	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 ODA	1	0	0	0	0	S
<i>Banking</i>						
2002/000-610.04	1	1	0	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-01	1	1	0	1	0	S
<i>Customs</i>						
2002/000-610.20	2	2	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.02 Risk Analysis Techn.	1	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-25	2	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-26	1	0	0	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Naples II	1	0	1	0	0	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Admin. Capacity	1	1	0	0	0	S
<b>Taking into account the contextual constraints on the evaluation, the sector overall is rated to be 'SATISFACTORY'</b>						
<b>Internal Market Monitoring Sector</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>S</b>

Ratings guide: -2 unacceptable; -1 poor; 0 sufficient/adequate; +1 good; +2 excellent.  
HS-Highly Satisfactory, S- Satisfactory, U-Unsatisfactory, HU-Highly Unsatisfactory.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b>	
<b>PREFACE</b>	
<b>GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS</b>	
<b>FINANCIAL AND CONTRACTUAL DATA OF THE SECTOR INTERNAL MARKET</b>	
<b>1. SECTORAL BACKGROUND AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>1.1 SECTORAL BACKGROUND</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>1.2 SCOPE OF EVALUATION</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>2. EVALUATION RESULTS</b> .....	<b>8</b>
<b>2.1 COMPONENT 1 – AGRICULTURE</b> .....	<b>8</b>
<b>2.2 COMPONENT 2 – CADASTRE AND STATISTICS</b> .....	<b>12</b>
<b>2.3 COMPONENT 3 – ENERGY AND TRANSPORT</b> .....	<b>14</b>
<b>2.4 COMPONENT 4 – ENVIRONMENT</b> .....	<b>16</b>
<b>2.5 COMPONENT 5 – FINANCE, BANKING AND CUSTOMS</b> .....	<b>19</b>
<b>2.6 SPECIFIC ISSUES</b> .....	<b>24</b>
<b>3. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	<b>25</b>
<b>3.1 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	<b>25</b>
<b>3.2 PERFORMANCE RATING</b> .....	<b>29</b>
<b>ANNEXES</b> .....	<b>31</b>
<b>ANNEX 1 INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT</b> .....	<b>32</b>
<b>ANNEX 2 LIST OF INTERVIEWS</b> .....	<b>38</b>
<b>ANNEX 3 LIST OF DOCUMENTS REFERRED TO IN THE INTERIM EVALUATION</b> .....	<b>43</b>
<b>ANNEX 4 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM PREVIOUS INTERIM EVALUATION</b> .....	<b>46</b>
<b>ANNEX 5 DISSENTING VIEWS AND COMMENTS NOT INCORPORATED</b> .....	<b>48</b>
<b>ANNEX 6 ANNEX TO CHAPTER 1 SECTORAL SCOPE AND BACKGROUND OF THE EVALUATION</b> .....	<b>54</b>
<b>ANNEX 7 PUBLICITY AND VISIBILITY OF PHARE INTERVENTIONS</b> .....	<b>73</b>

## PREFACE

This Interim Evaluation Report covers PHARE assistance to the Internal Market monitoring sector in the Slovak Republic under the following programmes:

- 2002/000-610.05 Control Transmissible Spongiform Encephalopathy – Food Safety;
- 2002/000-610.06 Development of Integrated Administrative and Control System;
- 2002/000-610.07 Enhancement of Phytosanitary Controls of Plants and Plant Products;
- 2002/000-610.08 Registration of Producers, Importers and Exporters of Plants and Plant Products;
- 2003-004-995-03-02 Support of Agriculture Food Chain in Comprehensive Food Safety Policy;
- 2003-004-995-03-03 Veterinary and Phytosanitary Border Inspection Posts – II. Phase (Bratislava Airport BIP);
- 2003-004-995-03-04 Animal Protection during Transport;
- 2003-004-995-02-01 Land Administration and Cadastre Infrastructure;
- 2002/000-610.09 Implementation of INTRASTAT-SK System;
- 2002/000-610.10 Strengthening Regional Statistics – REGSTAT;
- 2003-004-995-03-05 Enforcement of New Acquis in the field of Statistics
- 2002/000-632.09 Decontamination of the Bohunice NPAA-1 Primary Circuit;
- 2003/5812.07.01 Technical Support to SR in Establishing the National Agency for Disposal of Radioactive Waste;
- 2002/000-610.16 Implementation and Enforcement of the Council Directive on Discharge of Dangerous Substances into Aquatic Environment;
- 2002/000-610.17 Integrated Prevention and Pollution Control;
- 2002/000-610.18 Implementation and Enforcement of Council Directive on the Conservation of Natural Habitats and Wild Fauna and Flora and Wild Birds;
- 2003-004-995-16 Institutional and Capacity Building in the Environmental Sector;
- 2003-004-995-17 Biosafety Monitoring System;
- 2003-004-995-18 Implementation of Council Directives on Electric and Electronic Scrap;
- 2002/000-610.04 Financial Sector Supervision;
- 2003-004-995-03-01 Support to the Implementation of Risk-based Supervision;
- 2002/000-610.20 Information System for the Administrative Units Promoting the Law Enforcement in the Slovak Customs Administration;
- 2003-004-995-03-25 Supply to the Slovak Customs Laboratory;
- 2003-004-995-03-26 X-ray Inspection Systems for Protection of the Future EU External Border;
- 2002/000-610.02 Unallocated Institution Building Facility (UIBF):
  - Strengthening of Rapid Alert System Network for Food Safety;
  - Public Information Network on the Structural Funds Utilisation within the Environmental Sector;
  - Preparation of the Ministry of Environment for the Proper Implementation of Structural Funds;
  - Assessment and Management of Environmental Noise;
  - Implementation of risk analysis techniques in the field of customs duties for the Excise Movement Control System;
  - New Act on VAT and New Acts on Excise Duties;
- 2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF:



Monitoring of Classical Swine Fever in Wild Boar;  
 Audit Assistance to APA in Execution of Audit of Guarantee Section in APA;  
 Strengthening of the Rapid Alert System Network for Food Safety;  
 Road Transport (Social Legislation) Alignment;  
 Capacity Building for Effective Implementation of Environmental Acquis through Environmental Investment Projects  
 Institutional Strengthening of the Management of Equipment Containing PCB in Slovak Republic;  
 Strategy for Information System for Public Finance Management Reform;  
 Review of Information System in the Revenue, Treasury, Budget and Accounting Area;  
 Strengthening of the Protection of the Communities Financial Interests and the Fight Against Fraud;  
 Capacity Building for Evaluation of the Budget and for the Public Administration;  
 Training of Financial Controllers;  
 Strengthening of the MF Administrative Capacity for Providing Official Development Aid;  
 Implementation of Naples II Convention;  
 Risk Management in the Slovak Tax Administration;  
 Strengthening of the Administrative Capacity of SCA.

This Interim Evaluation Report has been prepared by D&D Consulting<sup>2</sup> during the period February to April 2006 and reflects the situation at 31 March 2006, the cut-off date for the Report. The factual basis is provided by the Monitoring Report M/SR/INT/05011/AGR issued on 21 October 2005, M/SR/INT/05011/ENV issued on 14 October 2005, M/SR/INT/05011/INT issued on 27 October 2005, prepared by the Aid Co-ordination Unit and, covering the period from 1 May to 31 August 2005.

Other findings are based on analysis of the Financing Memoranda, formal programme documentation, interviews with the main parties and published material.

The Interim Evaluation Report examines the progress of the programmes towards the objectives stated in the formal programming documents, i.e. Financing Memoranda, Project Fiches, etc. The report is intended to provide management information for the benefit of the Joint Monitoring Committee (JMC) and other involved parties. It draws conclusions and puts forward recommendations. It provides a general assessment of programmes or components under consideration and included in the corresponding Sectoral Monitoring Report.

Comments requested on the draft version were received from the following parties:

<b>Parties invited</b>	<b>Comments received</b>
Ministry of Agriculture	yes
Statistics Office	no
Geodesy, Cartography and Cadastre Authority	yes
Ministry of Environment	yes
National Bank of Slovakia	yes
Ministry of Transport	no
Office of Government/ Aid Co-ordination Unit	yes
Nuclear Regulatory Authority	yes
Ministry of Finance/ Central Finance and Contracting Unit	yes
Ministry of Finance/ National Fund	no
Ministry of Finance	yes

<sup>2</sup> Authors: Dagmar Gombitova, Dietmar Aigner and Short Term Technical Expert Alexander Fröhlich. This Report has been reviewed by Dietmar Aigner (D&D Interim Evaluation Cell) and by Peter Hall (MWH Headquarters).

Where possible, the Evaluators have integrated the comments received into the report. Dissenting views and comments not incorporated are in Annex 5.

Following an invitation of the Office of the Government of the Slovak Republic/ Aid Coordination Unit this Report has been debriefed on 14 June 2006 in Bratislava.

## GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS

ACU	Aid Co-ordination Unit
AGR	Agriculture
APA	Agriculture Paying Agency
BIP	Border Inspection Post
BNK	Banking
CAD	Cadastre
CAP	Common Agriculture Policy
CCO	Customs Criminal Office
CCTIA	Central Control and Testing Institute of Agriculture
CFCU	Central Finance and Contracting Unit
CSF	Classical Swine Fever
CUS	Customs
EAGGF	European Agriculture Guidance and Guarantee Fund
ENE	Energy
ENV	Environment
EU	European Union
FIN	Finance
FM	Financing Memorandum
FMA	Financial Market Authority
FWC	Framework contract
GCCA	Geodesy, Cartography and Cadastre Authority
GMO	Genetically Modified Organism
GPS	Global Positioning System
HW	Hardware
IoA	Indicator of Achievement
IACS	Integrated Administrative Control System
IAS	INTRASTAT Administrative Structure
IE	Interim Evaluation
INT	Internal Market
IPPC	Integrated Prevention and Pollution Control
IS	Information System
ME	Million(s) of Euro
MoA	Ministry of Agriculture
MoCRD	Ministry of Construction and Regional Development
MoE	Ministry of Environment
MoF	Ministry of Finance
MoH	Ministry of Health
MR	Monitoring Report
N/A	Not available, not applicable
NBS	National Bank of Slovakia
NF	National Fund
NRA	Nuclear Regulatory Authority
ODA	Official Development Aid
OoG	Office of the Government of the Slovak Republic
PCB	Polychlorinated Biphenyls
PF	Project Fiche
PFMR	Public Finance Management Reform
RAS	Rapid Alert System for Food and Feedstuff
SCA	Slovak Customs Administration
SEA	Slovak Environmental Agency
SEI	Slovak Environmental Inspectorate

SF	Structural Fund
SK/SR	Slovak Republic
SOSR	Statistical Office of the Slovak Republic
SPO	Senior Programme Officer
STA	Statistics
SVFA	State Veterinary and Food Administration
SW	Software
TA	Technical Assistance
ToR	Terms of Reference
TRA	Transport
TSE	Transmissible Spongiform Encephalopathy
TW	Twinning
TWL	Twinning Light
UIBF	Unallocated Institution Building Facility

## FINANCIAL AND CONTRACTUAL DATA OF THE SECTOR INTERNAL MARKET

Number	Title	Beneficiary	Contract		PHARE			Co-financing		
			start	expiry	allocated M€	com %	dis %	allocated M€	com %	dis %
<b>COMPONENT 1 – AGRICULTURE</b>										
<b>2002/000-610.05</b>	<b>Control TSE (Transmissible Spongiform Encephalopathy) – Food Safety</b>	<b>MoA</b>	-	-	<b>3.400</b>	<b>98</b>	<b>94</b>	<b>6.430</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>98</b>
	Twinning		14.01.04	13.02.05	0.350	87	87	0	0	0
	Supply of Laboratory Equipment for SVFA		05.01.04	05.03.04	0.350	87	78	0.150	87	79
	Supply of Prionic Tests		26.06.03	28.02.06	2.700	100	96	1.200	100	90
<b>2002/000-610.06</b>	<b>Development of IACS (Integrated Administrative and Control System)</b>	<b>MoA</b>	-	-	<b>1.800</b>	<b>89</b>	<b>86</b>	<b>0.327</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>100</b>
	Development of Structures for Implementation of IACS (TW)		05.06.03	05.09.04	0.350	95	95	0	0	0
	Supply of IT Equipment for Implementation of IACS – SW		16.10.03	16.12.04	0.052	100	100	0	0	0
	Supply of IT Equipment for Implementation of IACS		10.02.04	31.07.04	0.748	80	76	0	0	0
	Pre-accreditation Audit of APA (TA)		03.03.04	03.07.04	0.410	85	85	0	0	0
	Assistance to IACS (TWL)		25.02.04	10.08.04	0.100	82	82	0	0	0
	Training on IACS Administration and Controlling		19.03.04	19.07.04	0.140	96	96	0	0	0
<b>2002/000-610.07</b>	<b>Enhancement of Phytosanitary Controls of Plants and Plant Products</b>	<b>MoA</b>	-	-	<b>0.650</b>	<b>94</b>	<b>91</b>	<b>0.400</b>	<b>98</b>	<b>91</b>
	Training Programmes (TWL)		15.09.03	15.05.04	0.150	91	91	0	0	0
	Construction of Quarantine Glasshouse/Equipment		01.04.05	30.11.05	0.500	96	91	0.400	98	91
<b>2002/000-610.08</b>	<b>Registration of Producers, Importers and Exporters of Plants and Plant Products</b>	<b>MoA</b>	-	-	<b>0.700</b>	<b>93</b>	<b>92</b>	<b>0.200</b>	<b>92</b>	<b>89</b>

	Establishment of Registration System (TWL)		30.05.03	16.01.04	0.150	93	93	0	0	0
	Upgrade of IT System		-	-	0.400	92	89	0.200	92	89
	SW Development									
	TA to Draft TS for Upgrade		29.10.03	01.05.04	0.150	98	98	0	0	0
<b>2003-004-995-03-02</b>	<b>Support of Agriculture Food Chain in Comprehensive Food Safety Policy</b>	<b>MoA</b>	-	-	<b>2.000</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>62</b>	<b>0.650</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>60</b>
	Support of Agriculture Food Chain in Comprehensive Food Safety Policy (TWL)		15.06.05	15.05.06	0.150	100	80	0	0	0
	Supply of Laboratory Equipment		30.11.05	30.01.06	1.850	100	63	0.650	100	60
<b>2003-004-995-03-03</b>	<b>Veterinary and Phytosanitary Border Inspection Posts – II. Phase (Bratislava Airport BIP)</b>		-	-	<b>0.500</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>79</b>	<b>0.135</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>96</b>
	Veterinary and Phytosanitary BIP – II. Phase (TWL)		22.03.04	22.11.04	0.100	86	86	0	0	0
	Supply of Equipment		30.11.05	28.02.06	0.400	98	90	0.135	100	96
<b>2003-004-995-03-04</b>	<b>Animal Protection during Transport</b>	<b>MoA</b>	-	-	<b>0.300</b>	<b>92</b>	<b>70</b>	<b>0.100</b>	<b>80</b>	<b>80</b>
	Animal Protection during Transport (TWL)		26.04.04	26.02.05	0.120	95	95	0	0	0
	Technical Assistance		29.11.05	29.05.06	0.180	89	53	0	0	0
	Supply of Equipment		11.05.05	02.12.06	0	0	0	0.100	80	80
<b>2002/000-610.02 UIBF</b>	<b>Strengthening of Rapid Alert System Network for Food Safety</b>	<b>MoH</b>	01.12.04	31.05.05	<b>0.120</b>	<b>91</b>	<b>81</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF</b>	<b>Monitoring of Classical Swine Fever in Wild Boar</b>	<b>MoA</b>	18.10.04	17.08.05	<b>0.150</b>	<b>73</b>	<b>73</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
	<b>Audit Assistance to APA in Execution of Audit of Guarantee Section in APA</b>		30.11.05	30.09.06	<b>0.240</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>COMPONENT 2 – CADASTRE AND STATISTICS</b>										
<b>2003-004-995-02-01</b>	<b>Land Administration and Cadastre Infrastructure</b>	<b>GCCA</b>	-	-	<b>3.100</b>	<b>78</b>	<b>55</b>	<b>0.450</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>50</b>

	Land Administration and Cadastre Infrastructure – SW Customising and System Integration		17.02.05	30.06.06	1.600	100	90	0	0	0
	GCCA Management Training and Staff Development (TWL)		13.02.04	14.07.04	0.150	99	93	0	0	0
	Supply of Equipment, SW and SW System for GIS and Cad. Graphic		28.11.05	28.05.06	0.825	81	16	0.450	50	50
	Supply of Equipment, SW and SW System for Permanent GNSS		-	-	0.525	0	0		0	0
<b>2002/000-610.09</b>	<b>Implementation of INTRASTAT-SK System</b>	<b>SOSR</b>	-	-	<b>1.500</b>	<b>85</b>	<b>85</b>	<b>0.615</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>100</b>
	TA		04.07.03	28.03.04	0.150	82	82	0	0	0
	TA to SW Development and Testing of Data Processing		11.12.03	11.08.04	1.050	95	95	0	0	0
	Training of IAS staff		01.12.04	01.05.05	0.130	72	72	0	0	0
	TA to ToR and TS Preparation		24.03.03	19.04.03	0.039	85	85	0	0	0
	Supply of Technical Equipment for IAS		31.03.04	30.05.05	0.100	73	73	0.235	100	100
<b>2002/000-610.10</b>	<b>Strengthening Regional Statistics - REGSTAT</b>	<b>SOSR</b>	-	-	<b>1.000</b>	<b>92</b>	<b>91</b>	<b>0.150</b>	<b>96</b>	<b>95</b>
	Twinning		04.08.03	04.12.04	0.300	95	95	0	0	0
	TA		24.03.04	23.09.05	0.450	96	96	0	0	0
	Equipment Supply Lot 2		07.05.04	07.07.07	0.075	100	0	0.008	100	0
	Equipment Supply Lot 1,3		10.05.04	10.07.07	0.175	100	100	0.105	100	100
<b>2003-004-995-03-05</b>	<b>Enforcement of New <i>Acquis</i> in the Field of Statistics</b>	<b>SOSR</b>	-	-	<b>2.300</b>	<b>87</b>	<b>44</b>	<b>0.040</b>	<b>78</b>	<b>70</b>
	Adopting New <i>Acquis</i> for Financial Accounts in the Statistics		12.01.05	31.10.06	0.500	84	50	0	0	0
	Statistics of Income and Living Conditions (TA)		01.02.05	31.10.06	1.050	94	56	0	0	0
	Iron and Steel Statistics (TWL)		21.12.04	16.11.05	0.150	70	56	0	0	0
	SW Development		30.10.05	31.10.06	0.480	84	0	0	0	0
	Supply of Technical Equipment		-	-	0.120	78	71	0.040	78	70
<b>COMPONENT 3 – ENERGY AND TRANSPORT</b>										

2002/000-632.09	Decontamination of the Bohunice NPAA-1 Primary Circuit	NRA	13.05.04	13.05.05	1.250	75	75	0	0	0
2003/5812.07.01	Technical Support to SR in Establishing the National Agency for Disposal of Radioactive Waste		-	-	0.855	28	0	0.085	95	0
	Technical Support to SR in Establishing the National Agency for Disposal of Radioactive Waste		05.10.05	31.10.06	0.530	0	0	0	0	0
	TA		05.10.05	31.10.06	0.070	0	0	0	0	0
	Technical Equipment for National Agency for Radioactive Waste		30.11.06	31.08.06	0.255	95	0	0.085	95	0
2003-995-01-04 UIBF	Road Transport (Social Legislation) Alignment		04.03.04	04.09.04	0.080	90	90	0	0	0
<b>COMPONENT 4 - ENVIRONMENT</b>										
2002/000-610.16	Discharge of Dangerous Substances	MoE/ SHMI	-	-	1.350	97	97	0.065	79	72
	Twinning		26.06.03	26.08.05	1.165	96	96	0	0	0
	Supply of Equipment		11.05.04	11.08.04	0.185	80	72	0.065	79	72
2002/000-610.17	Integrated Prevention and Pollution Control	MoE/ SEA	-	-	1.100	99	79	0.090	90	87
	Twinning		22.01.04	31.10.05	0.830	100	100	0	0	0
	Supply of Equipment		05.04.04	05.07.04	0.270	90	87	0.090	90	87
2002/000-610.18	Conservation of Natural Habitats	MoE/ SNC	-	-	1.300	92	90	0.115	100	90
	Twinning		06.10.03	05.10.05	0.900	95	95	0	0	0
	Supply of SW		02.06.04	29.10.04	0.035	100	90	0.115	100	0
	Supply of IT		09.07.04	09.09.04	0.300	95	86	0	0	0
	Information Campaign				0.065	73	73	0	0	0
2002/000-610.02 UIBF	Public Information Network on the Structural Funds Utilisation within the Environmental Sector	SEA	03.05.04	03.12.04	0.150	100	100	0	0	0
2002/000-610.02 UIBF	Preparation of the MoE for the Proper Implementation of SF	MoE	28.05.04	28.01.05	0.140	100	100	0	0	0



2002/000-610.02 UIBF	Assessment and Management of Environmental Noise	MoH	13.04.04	13.10.04	0.150	88	88	0	0	0
2003-004-995-03-16	Institutional and Capacity Building in the Environmental Sector	SEA	-	-	1.000	93	50	0.160	92	35
	Twinning		24.06.04	24.06.06	0.420	98	80	0	0	0
	TA to Staff Training		30.11.05	30.03.06	0.060	91	0	0	0	0
	SW Development		30.11.05	31.04.06	0.090	93	0	0.161	92	35
	Equipment for SHMI		30.11.05	31.03.06	0.130					
	Supply of HW and SW for IS		30.11.05	31.03.06	0.250					
	Supply of Specific SW and Licen.		30.11.05	31.03.06	0.050					
2003-004-995-03-17	Biosafety Monitoring System	MoE	-	-	1.200	95	45	0.300	94	40
	Twinning		26.07.04	26.07.05	0.300	100	69	0	0	0
	Supply of Equipment		-	-	0.900	94	37	0.300	94	40
2003-004-995-03-18	Implementation of Council Directives on Electric and Electronic Scrap	Mnv	29.11.05	31.10.06	0.400	90	0	0	0	0
2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF	Capacity Building for Effective Implementation of Environmental Acquis through Environmental Investment Projects	MoE	30.11.05	30.07.06	0.185	100	0	0	0	0
2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF	Institutional Strengthening of the Management of Equipment Containing PCB in SR	SEA	30.11.05	31.05.06	0.130	80	0	0	0	0
<b>COMPONENT 5- FINANCE, BANKING AND CUSTOMS</b>										
2002/000-610.02 UIBF	New Act on VAT and New Acts on Excise Duties	MoF	30.11.04	31.08.05	0.100	96	96	0	0	0
2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF	Strategy for Information System for Public Finance Management Reform	MoF	03.05.04	03.05.05	0.200	95	95	0	0	0
2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF	Review of Information System in the Revenue, Treasury, Budget and Accounting Areas	MoF	30.04.04	31.12.04	0.200	97	97	0	0	0

2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF	Strengthening of the Protection of the Communities Financial Interests and the Fight Against Fraud	MoF	07.07.04	07.06.05	0.200	84	84	0	0	0
2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF	Capacity Building for Evaluation of the Budget and for the Public Administration	MoF	05.08.04	05.08.05	0.200	100	0	0	0	0
2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF	Training of Financial Controllers	MoF	14.06.04	14.03.05	0.200	100	100	0	0	0
2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF	Risk Management in the Slovak Tax Administration	MoF	27.07.04	27.05.05	0.140	83	66	0	0	0
2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF	Strengthening of the MoF Administrative Capacity for Providing ODA	MoF	30.11.05	31.05.06	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	0	0	0
2002/000-610.04	Financial Sector Supervision	MoF/NBS			2.000	96	96	0	0	0
	Technical and Legal Assistance		21.06.04	21.12.05	1.400	98	98	0	0	0
	SW Development		25.06.04	25.10.05	0.600	90	90	0	0	0
2003-004-995-03-01	Support to the Implementation of the Risk-Based Supervision	MoF/NBS	-	-	1.250	98	41	0	0	0
	TA		02.05.05	31.10.06	1.150	92	41	0	0	0
	SW Development		30.11.05	31.10.06	0.100	64	0	0	0	0
2002/000-610.20	Information System for Customs (Law Enforcement)	MoF/SCA	-	-	4.000	99	99	1.200	92	92
	TA for IS		26.03.04	26.06.05	1.240	100	100	0	0	0
	Equipment for IS		03.12.03	02.01.04	2.760	100	100	1.200	92	92
2002/000-610.02 UIBF	Implementation of Risk Analysis Techniques in the Field of customs Duties for the Excise Movement Control System	MoF/SCA	30.11.04	31.08.05	0.110	100	80	0	0	0
2003-004-995-03-25	Equipment Supply to the Slovak Customs Laboratory	MoF/SCA	22.11.05	22.05.06	1.250	99	0	0.421	100	0
2003-004-995-03-26	X-ray Inspection Systems for Protection of the Future EU External Border	MoF/SCA	03.11.05	03.06.05	3.300	82	0	1.140	82	0
2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF	Implementation of Naples II Convention	MoF/SCA	27.07.04	27.11.04	0.047	100	79	0	0	0

---

<b>2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF</b>	<b>Strengthening of the Administrative Capacity of SCA</b>	<b>MoF/SCA</b>	30.11.05	31.05.06	<b>0.070</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
------------------------------------	--	----------------	----------	----------	--------------	------------	----------	----------	----------	----------

PHARE 2002: commitment deadline 30/11/04; disbursement deadline 30/11/05;

PHARE 2003: commitment deadline 30/11/05; disbursement deadline 30/11/06

Source: Perseus by cut-off date 31/03/06.

# 1. SECTORAL BACKGROUND AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION

## 1.1 Sectoral Background

1. This Interim Evaluation (IE) report covers PHARE support under the Internal Market (INT) sector, one of the three monitoring sectors for PHARE assistance in Slovakia. The individual programmes under evaluation are closely linked to the priorities set out in the Accession Partnership and the National Programme for Adoption of the *Acquis* valid at the time of the programmes' preparation.

## 1.2 Scope of Evaluation

2. The INT monitoring sector shows currently a portfolio of more than 100 individual interventions (programmes, projects, sub-projects), financed from the Financing Memoranda (FM) 2002 and 2003. For the purpose of the IE, the individual activities under the sector were grouped into the following Components:

- Agriculture (AGR)
- Cadastre and Statistics (CAD&STA)
- Energy and Transport (ENE&TRA)
- Environment (ENV)
- Finance, Banking and Customs (FIN/BNK/CUS)

### 1.2.1 Performance of Activities

This section provides a basic overview of activities, outputs and effects. For more detailed information on the individual Components please see Annex 6 of the Report.

### Component 1 – Agriculture

*2002/000-610.05 Control Transmissible Spongiform Encephalopathy (TSE) – Food Safety, 2002/000-610.06 Development of Integrated Administrative and Control System (IACS), 2002/000-610.07 Enhancement of Phytosanitary Controls of Plants and Plant Products, 2002/000-610.08 Registration of Producers, Importers and Exporters of Plants and Plant Products, 2003-004-995-03-02 Support of Agriculture Food Chain in Comprehensive Food Safety Policy, 2003-004-995-03-03 Veterinary and Phytosanitary Border Inspection Posts (BIP) – II. Phase (Bratislava Airport BIP), 2003-004-995-03-04 Animal Protection during Transport, UIBF 2003-004-995-01-04 (Monitoring of Classical Swine Fever in Wild Boar, Audit Assistance to APA in Execution of Audit of Guarantee Section in APA); UIBF 2002/000-610.02 Strengthening of the Rapid Alert System Network for Food Safety*

### Activities and Outputs

3. Substantial support given under the **AGR** Component aims mainly at preparation for the Common Agriculture Policy (CAP) and at harmonisation of legislation in the area of veterinary, phytosanitary and food control, which had to be respected at the date of the accession or shortly afterwards, and its enforcement. This includes strengthening,

screening and eradication of TSE, the establishment of local institutional structures, systems and procedures necessary for the implementation of the Integrated Administrative and Control System (IACS), strengthening phytosanitary control on the future EU external borders, establishment of a registration system of producers, importers and exporters of plants and plant products, establishment of the required veterinary and phytosanitary service infrastructure internally and at the external borders, and the provision of veterinary control of animal welfare during transport. Support was also provided for census, monitoring and vaccination of wild boars against classical swine fever (CSF); for internal auditing of the Agriculture Paying Agency (APA) and for the improvement and upgrading of the Rapid Alert System (RAS).

#### Effects

4. The 2002 AGR projects are fully completed and have largely achieved their originally expected outputs and results. The 2002 Control TSE TW has assisted in introducing standard testing procedures, rapid tests, and confirmation diagnostics, and supplied Prionic tests to cover the ad-hoc needs. The support provided for the IACS implementation brought benefits through drafted legislation, practical training of staff, preparation of manuals, software (SW) development, etc., and has resulted in the establishment of the IACS system, which became operational as of 1 May 2004. The 2002 Phytosanitary Control TW provided training in phytosanitary area and familiarisation with the operation of a quarantine glasshouse which was needed for the preparation of the proposed technical equipment supply. The glasshouse was eventually built, supplies delivered and it is operational, dealing with biological testing. Regarding the 2002 Registration of Producers intervention, the TWL delivered information on plant passports applied in Hessen; the accompanying Technical Assistance (TA) project analysed the existing registration system and prepared technical specifications for SW development and HW supply. Subsequently, the SW was developed and tested and the registration system became fully operational; currently the loading of information from the old system is ongoing. The 2003 training project for the staff of Border Inspection Posts (BIP) Bratislava Airport delivered the required knowledge on the veterinary and phytosanitary inspection services and supplied necessary equipment. The 2003 Animal Protection Twinning Light (TWL) verified the preparatory activities and assisted with the development of a SW system needed for control activities. The 2003 project on Food Chain provided assistance to Central Control and Testing Institute for Agriculture (CCTIA) and State Veterinary and Food Administration (SVFA). CCTIA staff received advice, thus improving the laboratory methods used for identification of residues in soil and control of pesticides, and GMO monitoring. Veterinary inspectors were made familiar with the new EU legal requirements regarding meat inspection. The laboratory equipment provided will enable a substantial speed-up of analyses. As regards 2003 UIBF projects, the Internal Audit Unit of APA is being trained to improve the level of its performance. The CSF project introduced a new vaccination system to eliminate the disease. The completed RAS project provided methodological guidelines for risk analysis.

## **Component 2 – Cadastre and Statistics**

*2003-004-995-02-01 Land Administration and Cadastre Infrastructure, 2002/000-610.09 Implementation of INTRASTAT-SK System, 2002/000-610.10 Strengthening Regional Statistics – REGSTAT, 2003-004-995-03-05 Enforcement of New Acquis in the Field of Statistics*

### Activities and Outputs

5. The 2003 programme for **CAD** – comprising a TWL and dealing with training activities, TA for system integration and equipment supply - is focused on the improvement of the land administration based on spatial and cadastral data, and on better public access to the land administration and cadastre data. The purpose of the interventions in the area of **STA** is to implement a comprehensive statistical system for the monitoring of the goods flow between EU Member States (INTRASTAT) and to develop a fully operational regional statistical system with improved quality of regional data (REGSTAT). The 2003 STA intervention deals with the improvement of social statistics (income, health, education, demographics and employment characteristics); improvement of data collection and data processing systems for annual and quarterly financial accounts and financial balance sheets; and the development of new information system for iron and steel statistics.

### Effects

6. The 2003 CAD TWL project delivered training for the Geodesy, Cartography and Cadastre Authority (GCCA) and prepared a human resource development plan. The strategic proposals delivered to GCCA initiated lively discussion on its future operation, however as with the training, they have not able to deliver the desired results yet. SW development has started and equipment supplies should be delivered soon. Complementary training activities are taking place. However, tendering of the planned GPS delivery was not managed in time and the allocation was lost. The 2002 INTRASTAT projects were successfully completed. The SW system was developed and is fully operational, providing thus EUROSTAT with the data processed through the required methodologies. Similarly, the 2002 REGSTAT system was completed and is operational. The system includes over 700 indicators that are stored in 156 data cubes. The programme's original intention to establish a web page was eventually extended to the web portal of the whole Statistics Office, which should soon be operational and provide access to numerous statistical data. As regards the 2003 STA programme, the financial accounts part deals currently with the preparation of a central database of source data from different administrative sources relevant for the creation of the financial accounts, and with the development of software for creating a final version of the financial accounts consistent with the non-financial accounts; statistics of income completed its pilot testing and a real survey was conducted, part of the data were processed and reported; a new SW system was developed and tested to provide EUROSTAT with required statistics on steel and iron.

### **Component 3 – Energy and Transport**

*2002/000-632.09 Decontamination of the Bohunice NPAA-1 Primary Circuit, 2003/5812.07.01 Technical Support to SR in Establishing the National Agency for Disposal of Radioactive Waste, UIBF 2003-995-01-04 Road Transport (Social Legislation) Alignment*

#### **Activities and Outputs**

7. The 2002 assistance provided to the **ENE** sub-sector focused on decontamination of a nuclear power plant, which has been running since 1997, aimed at the removal of the reactor and decontamination of the primary cycle of the nuclear power plant. The purpose of the 2003 Radioactive Waste Agency intervention is to propose a legal, institutional and financial framework for the management of radioactive waste and subsequently to establish an IS for radioactive waste management (national radioactive waste database). In the **TRA** area the 2003 Road Transport TWL focused on social legislation, namely recording equipment – digital tachographs, working and rest time.

#### **Effects**

8. The 2002 Decontamination activities were running in accordance with the plan and a detailed manual was prepared. The 2003 programme on Radioactive Waste Agency commenced recently and a first proposal for the Agency set up is awaited. The 2003 UIBF Road Transport TWL delivered all expected outputs and obligatory introduction of digital tachographs should be enforced through legislation.

### **Component 4 – Environment**

*2002/000-610.16 Implementation and Enforcement of the Council Directive on Discharge of Dangerous Substances into Aquatic Environment, 2002/000-610.17 Integrated Prevention and Pollution Control (IPPC), 2002/000-610.18 Implementation and Enforcement of Council Directive on the Conservation of Natural Habitats and Wild Fauna and Flora and Wild Birds, UIBF 2002/000.610-02 (Public Information Network on the Structural Funds Utilisation within the Environmental Sector; Preparation of the Ministry of Environment (MoE) for the Proper Implementation of Structural Funds; Assessment and Management of Environmental Noise), 2003-004-995-16 Institutional and Capacity Building in the Environmental Sector, 2003-004-995-17 Biosafety Monitoring System (Genetic Modified Organisms - GMO), 2003-004-995-18 Implementation of Council Directives on Electric and Electronic Scrap, UIBF 2003-004-995-01-04 (Capacity Building for Effective Implementation of Environmental Acquis through Environmental Investment Projects; Institutional Strengthening of the Management of Equipment Containing PCB in SR)*

#### **Activities and Outputs**

9. Overall, support under the **ENV** component is focused on the alignment and enforcement of the requirements of various Council Directives. Whilst the 2002 interventions dealt with Dangerous Substances, IPPC and Natura 2000, the 2003 projects have focused on standardisation and reporting, on improving monitoring and detection of GMO, and on the reduction of hazardous waste from electric and electronic equipment.

The 2002 UIBF project on Information Network dealt mainly with the training of staff for 10 Regional Environmental Advisory and Information Centres; whilst the Preparation for SF project's intention was to deliver assistance for the preparation of internal manuals. The Noise project was assisting methodological alignment of legal drafts and their enforcement in this specific area. The 2003 Institutional and Capacity Building TW is assisting with the rationalisation of numerous reporting obligations in the ENV area. The Biosafety Monitoring System TW assisted the establishment of the GMO laboratory and introduction of monitoring and control mechanisms. The TW on Electronic Scrap was slightly refocused from the establishment to a review of activities connected with the enforced legislation. The 2003 UIBF projects should ensure compliance with the EC Directive on the disposal of Polychlorinated Biphenyls (PCB), inventory, control/management of the equipment containing PCB and the respective reporting obligation. The Capacity Building project is focused on the issue of public-private partnership in order to identify the MoE's possible role in such projects.

### Effects

10. The 2002 Dangerous Substances intervention carried out the inventory of pollution sources, assisted the preparatory work for permits provision, developed waste-water management database, and provided methodologies and equipment for the reference laboratory. The 2002 IPPC programme assisted the enforcement of respective legislation and established the basic tools for monitoring, reporting obligations, issuing permits, training and other functions related to IPPC. Under the Natural Habitats programme, a manual for management plans has been drafted, equipment delivered and application SW developed. Among the 2002 UIBF ENV interventions, the Information Network became operational and its activities are focused on the promotion of SF interventions and assistance with their preparation. The Preparation for SF project for the Implementing Agency for Environmental Investment Projects assisted with the revision of internal manuals, prepared a guide on eligible costs, and provided training and advice. The project on Noise resulted in the preparation of the required noise maps. The 2003 Institutional and Capacity Building programme shows excellent achievements. Slovakia moved within a year from its original 15<sup>th</sup> position to the fifth position among 32 European countries in priority dataflow reporting. The Biosafety Monitoring System introduced monitoring of GMO fully compliant with the EC requirements. Activities of Electronic Scrap started with legal analyses. Further reviews of existing collective systems and processing capacities are about to start. The 2003 UIBF PCB project assessed the current situation with regard to the Directive requirements - institutional set-up, data collection, including reporting requirements. The information system (IS) focusing on equipment containing PCB is being developed. The ongoing 2003 UIBF Capacity Building project has practically completed its training part on public-private partnership and further activities will follow as planned.

### **Component 5 – Finance, Banking and Customs**

*2002/000-610.02 UIBF New Act on VAT and New Acts on Excise Duties; 2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF Strategy for Information System for Public Finance Management Reform; Review of Information System in the Revenue, Treasury, Budget and Accounting Area; Strengthening of the Protection of the Communities Financial Interests and The Fight*



*against Fraud; Capacity Building for Evaluation of the Budget and for the Public Administration; Training of Financial Controllers; Risk Management in the Slovak Tax Administration; Strengthening of the MoF Administrative Capacity for Providing Official Development Aid; 2002/000-610.04 Financial Sector Supervision, 2003-004-995-03-01 Support to the Implementation of Risk-Based Supervision; 2002/000-610.20 Information System for the Administrative Units Promoting the Law Enforcement in the Slovak Custom Administration, 2003-004-995-03-25 Supply to the Slovak Customs Laboratory, 2003-004-995-03-26 X-ray Inspection Systems for Protection of the Future EU External Border; 2002/000-610.02 UIBF Implementation of Risk Analysis Techniques in the Field of Customs Duties for the Excise Movement Control System; 2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF Implementation of Naples II Convention; Strengthening of the Administrative Capacity of SCA.*

### Activities and Outputs

11. In the main, the intention of the **FIN/BNK/CUS** Component has been the strengthening of the local financial management and control systems, and support to the adequate utilisation of public funds in compliance with Community standards, notably through introduction of new legislation and methodologies for budgeting, tax harmonisation and fund management, including also capacity building for control and evaluation of public funds, strengthening of the financial market supervisory institutions and procedures, including risk-based supervision, exchange and processing of the information between the Slovak Customs Administration (SCA) and the EU CUS systems, together with providing equipment for detection of tax evasions and fraud in trade with agricultural products and goods of special interest, as well as illegal immigration, and the promotion of law enforcement by special customs administrative units.

### Effects

12. As regards FIN, the 2002 New Act on VAT project introduced new rules regarding VAT and excise duties in relation to the Slovakia's accession into EU. The 2002 Strategy for IS project developed the planned strategy and outlined an evaluation methodology. The majority of 2003 UIBF projects has been already completed. The review of IS carried out an analyses of five business models and, based on the recommendations, improved the IS for public finance management. Methodologies and procedures for transparent and efficient financial management, consistent with the applicable Community rules at the National Fund and Implementing Agencies were developed within the Financial Interest project. The Evaluation of the Budget project prepared a Monitoring and Evaluation Strategy for the State Budget, including a handbook and recommendations on public funds evaluation. The project on Training of Financial Controllers provided training to the *ex-post* financial controllers, who will perform sample checks on Structural Funds, Cohesion Fund and Schengen Facility. A complex system of risk management in all areas of activities of the Tax Administration was developed within the Risk Management project. The ODA project is in its inception phase. In the area of BNK, 2002 Financial Sector Supervision introduced a pro-active supervision on institutions of capital market, insurance companies and banks. The 2003 Risk-Based Supervision TA contractor was asked to evaluate capital adequacy

calculations, to evaluate internal credit risk and operational risks management procedures used by banks, to evaluate the current on-site supervision procedures and monitoring of the market discipline, and to provide consultations concerning transposition from Basle I to Basle II. The methodologies, seminars and training focused on the banking supervision, supervision of capital market, insurance and pension funds were delivered. Concerning the 2002 IS for SCA programme, HW and SW together with the relevant training were delivered to the CUS Criminal Office (CCO) and provided the Customs Criminal Office with an IT background, enabling detection of crime in the field of customs. The implementation of Risk Analysis Techniques project completed the process of transfer of responsibilities concerning collection of excise duties from the Tax Administration to the Customs Administration and assisted with the computerisation in this area. Regarding the 2003 interventions under this Component, the delivery of special equipment enabling determination of origin authenticity of goods within Equipment supply to the Slovak Customs Laboratory and X-ray inspection system is expected to take place in July/August 2006. Implementation of Naples II Convention completed the pre-accession process in the field of management of internal borders and provided transfer of know-how to the target group, however administrative problems prevented the official conclusion of the project. Strengthening of SCA was recently contracted and the first activities have been taking place.

## 2. EVALUATION RESULTS

### 2.1 COMPONENT 1 – AGRICULTURE

#### 2.1.1 Relevance

13. The design of **AGR** Programmes is clearly accession driven and projects addressed the needs and problems related to the EU accession, mainly as regards harmonisation and enforcement of legislation. The overall objectives and project purposes were set out fully in line with the priorities identified in the Accession Partnership and *acquis*. The 2002 Control TSE programme became a matter of urgency in relation to the BSE occurrence. Apart from TW activities adjusting the existing prevention, control and eradication measures, the allocation was made available for supplying BSE tests. The 2002 IACS support was urgently required to introduce the obligatory IACS system in accordance with EU regulations for EAGGF. Within the programme, assistance was provided for SW development, training of staff administering the system, applicants and advisory bodies involved in the application procedures. The original design of 2002 Phytosanitary Control, broadly referring to the strengthening of the phytosanitary control on the future EU external border, was eventually reduced to the construction of a quarantine glasshouse and some seminars for CCTIA staff, dealing with appearance of certain diseases. The project design was based on the assumption that volume and variety of the plants imported to the country would increase as intensive trade with the plant material from Russia and Ukraine was expected. However, the Commission Decision on “equivalency of procedures” on plant improvement does not enable such trade. Therefore there are currently no such imports taking place at the external borders and the need and effective utilisation of such glasshouse in this sense cannot be fully justified and raises some questions in relation to relevance. The future development is difficult to predict. 2002 Registration of Producers assisted the establishment of the registration system, complying with EU standards on plant passports. Although undoubtedly relevant, the two projects (TWL and TA) within the programme had nearly identical objectives and had to be adjusted to avoid duplication of activities.

14. The 2003 AGR interventions were relevant, but their objectives were rather general which did not allow the identification of appropriate Indicators of Achievement (IoA). Moreover, all the interventions were planned by inexperienced staff as they were based on the assumption that the project implementation would have taken place by the date of accession. The usual time gap between planning and implementation led to a situation where the majority of interventions had to be re-focused and adjusted to reflect the actual development in the sector. 2003 Food Chain focused on the enforcement of the food safety legislation rather than infrastructure as planned, as this had changed in the meantime. 2003 Bratislava Airport BIP was well oriented on the completion of airport BIP (external EU border), but overall the co-ordination of training activities provided by three PHARE projects for BIP phytosanitary inspectors was absent. The 2003 Animal Protection intervention was to confirm compliance of the valid legislation and practice with the requested standards and provided some complementary training. The 2003 UIBF provides support for internal audit operations of the APA, whilst the other parts of 2003 UIBF were focused on the introduction of vaccination as a new measure to control

CSF and strengthening of the Rapid Alert System (RAS) to ensure its performance in compliance with the EU standards.

### 2.1.2 Efficiency

15. Most of the projects implemented in AGR did not encounter any substantial problems. Although their original design had to be re-focused or adjusted to respond to the actual needs, planned activities were delivered and outputs achieved. The 2002 Control TSE TW project, implemented by SVFA was smoothly completed. The supply part was flexibly divided into two as the occurrence of BSE reduced the number of cattle and proportional adjustment of tests was appropriate. The 2002 IACS programme, implemented under heavy time-pressure by the newly established APA, went smoothly. In particular, the co-operation with the TW contractor was excellent and the simplified IACS scheme was introduced despite the absence of any previous experience. The rest of projects provided complementary assistance to ensure all necessary functions and tasks for APA operation. The value-for-money of the 2002 Phytosanitary Control is a subject of concern. For unspecified reasons, the objectives and activities set out in the PF, ToR and project final report differ. The project management was entirely left with the contractor and project reporting does not enable the tracing of the actual training (in terms of details on duration, topics, number of participants). The current utilisation of the glasshouse, for the purposes specified in the planning documents<sup>3</sup>, does not demonstrate the project's efficiency and suggests that such an investment was excessive. However, as reported by the beneficiary, due to the increase of the glasshouse capacities, the phytosanitary control of the seed potatoes will take place there. The accreditation of phytoinspection/CCTIA, expected before the accession, is still not completed. The TWL project under 2002 Registration of Producers intervention substantially reduced original scope of activities to avoid duplication with TA project, but it was not reflected in the budget. Efficiency was already questioned in relation to ten study tours conducted - the BIP at Frankfurt airport was visited seven times. Although this BIP deals with a wide range of phyto-inspection activities, this seems excessive, in particular, taking into account the overall number of BIP phyto-inspectors, which is 11, as well as numerous other training activities for this target group delivered also by 2002 Phytosanitary Control, 2003 Bratislava Airport BIP and 2003 Food Chain projects. Moreover, the contractor's performance within Registration of Producers TWL project did not satisfy the needs of the beneficiary. The quality of TA project outputs was much better.

16. The 2003 Food Chain TWL was split into phytosanitary and veterinary parts. However, a part of the phytosanitary assistance lacked proper preparation. The final

---

<sup>3</sup> The expected result in the PF was set out as follows: Through the construction of the quarantine glasshouses for the phytosanitary control of goods imported from the third non-EU countries, the Slovak Republic and as well the EU Member States will be protected from quarantine pests from the third countries, plants will be controlled on the infestation of the quarantine pests and transit of the consignment will be possible only after the checkout, especially in the case of latent infections of the virus extraction. The staff will be trained to execute all inspections according to EU standards. The staff of CCTIA will be prepared for external accreditation within the EU accession. This will lead to a significant improvement of the protection of the Slovak territory against the outbreaks and spreading of the plant pests and it will contribute to the completion of the harmonisation process in the Slovak Republic with the *acquis* in the phytosanitary field

beneficiary was informed only at the last minute about the mission of short-term experts, who did not know what exactly is required from them. Eventually their mission proved to be helpful, but with adequate preparation, it would have been much more efficient. Study trips as well as veterinary part delivered their expected benefits. Efficiency can be questioned for the supply parts. It was undoubtedly necessary to improve laboratory equipment and the supply part provided top quality machines. Taking into account the price of the equipment, its capacity should be fully utilised to make such a purchase cost-effective. The current number of performed tests is, however, far below these capacities. The veterinary part had to reduce the number of participants for study trips. As these were taking place in Greece the travel expenses exceeded the possibilities of the SVFA. The assistance provided within 2003 Bratislava Airport BIP covered both phytosanitary and veterinary part again. The benefits were delivered at high professional level and fully satisfied the beneficiaries' requirements. Despite that, the difference in the performance, where the veterinary part fully secured its operations, whilst the phytosanitary part suffers from uncertain situation concerning renting of offices in relation to the current privatisation of the airport is noticeable. The start of 2003 Animal Protection, implemented by the SVFA, experienced some delay on the side of the contractor due to the delayed advance payment<sup>4</sup> and subsequently required an extension to manage the delivery of proposed activities. The implementation did not experience any substantial difficulties with the exception of complaints by local experts because of late payments, this time from the contractor's side. The outputs were delivered as planned. The efficiency of the various 2003 UIBF AGR initiatives is satisfactory. All concerned projects assisting internal audit functions of APA, dealing with vaccination against CSF as well as assisting the staff involved in RAS operation were implemented in line with the original plan and delivered their expected outputs.

17. In general, the issue of value-for-money could be addressed in all cases where the originally planned activities had to be adjusted and mostly refocused away from doing things that had already been done, to reviews of the work completed. It should be noted that in most cases no discrepancies were identified and the work was completed using internal sources without additional financial support. However, in such cases, the change in the scope of planned activities was rarely proportionally reflected in a budget reduction. The quality of the contractors was often influenced by the limited interest of bidders, mainly for the TWL projects where quite commonly only one proposal was obtained. The effort to avoid loss of funds led to the contracting of this proposal, as there was no time for re-tendering, or when re-tendered, the situation was repeated and time was lost, causing further delays in the project implementation.

### *2.1.3 Effectiveness*

18. Effectiveness of the **AGR** assistance is generally acceptable. As regards the 2002 Control TSE, its objective - set out as TSE screening in line with the EU regulation was fully achieved. The 2002 IACS made rapid progress and within the short implementation the remarkable achievements were confirmed by the start of operations of APA, implementing the CAP and currently running all support schemes for farmers. The IoA

---

<sup>4</sup> Advance payments for all started 2003 projects were delayed because of late transfer of funds from the European Commission to the National Fund.

determined in the PF was fulfilled. The achievement of the rather vague objectives set out for the 2002 Phytosanitary Control intervention is difficult to justify. Its main benefit is the operation of the glasshouse, but its contribution to the operation of the diagnostic control system is not so clear. The registration system built with the assistance of 2002 Registration of Producers was finalised but is not fully operational as testing and data loading are not completed yet. The 2003 Food Chain objective, referring to the completion of the veterinary and phytosanitary services infrastructure, was achieved before the project's start. The broadly set objective referring to the monitoring of foreign bodies in agri products was partly met. Food safety control was adjusted, based on the beneficiary's needs, where the veterinary part specifically required the area of meat control and slaughterhouses in connection to the newly adopted EU legislation. The phytosanitary part dealt with GMO and pesticides residues. Compared with the original expectations the approval of BIP operations within 2003 Bratislava Airport BIP could not be achieved by the accession date as the project was in its initial stage. While the first part of equipment was fully delivered in 2005 and is operational, the second part was delivered only recently. The BIP is currently carrying out the required controls. Due to the delays, the staff of SVFA involved in the 2003 Animal Protection project had to achieve part of the objectives before the project's start. Partly revised activities were eventually delivered as agreed. The system of control of animal welfare during transport is fully established and operational. The effectiveness of the 2003 UIBF projects is good. The completed project on CSF fully met its objective and improved control and surveillance of this disease. Similarly, the RAS project improved the respective knowledge and risk assessment as foreseen. The same positive prospect applies for the ongoing APA project where improved knowledge of internal auditors is expected.

#### 2.1.4 Sustainability

19. Most of the projects completed under the **AGR** Component have achieved sustainable results. The obligatory legal frameworks, their enforcement and administrative structures – as the benefits achieved by the programmes under the evaluation, result from the Slovakia's EU membership, and must be automatically sustained. These measures are linked with the operations of APA and with the introduction of the new system of food, phytosanitary and veterinary organisation and control, mainly as regards the standard procedures applied for inspection, monitoring, administration and management of the system. Because of the permanently changing legal frameworks, some of the measures had to be adjusted before or during the implementation to follow this development. As regards sustainability, doubts are connected with the continued operations of the glasshouse. If actual utilisation of the capacity of the glasshouse is not secured, its operations could be too expensive in the longer run. Similarly, the utilisation of the laboratory equipment provided to the CCTIA would require funding to ensure that spare parts, chemical substances, etc. are affordable and can be provided from the CCTIA's budget.

#### 2.1.5 Impact

20. The overall objectives, generally referring to the harmonisation with the *AGR acquis* were achieved and the individual interventions supported within the **AGR** sub-sector have contributed to its achievement. A valuable contribution has been made to the

establishment of legal, administrative and institutional set-up necessary for the implementation of the CAP. The original needs identified in the area of food control, veterinary and phytosanitary inspection, both internal and at the external borders, were fulfilled. The achievement of the overall objective was not always directly attributable to the individual PHARE interventions, however. This was observed mainly where planned activities had to be completed earlier than the projects were contracted.

## 2.2 COMPONENT 2 – CADASTRE AND STATISTICS

### 2.2. *Relevance*

21. The objectives set out for the 2003 **CAD** programme fully comply with the EU initiative in the area of geo-spatial information and try to overcome the difficulties with fragmentation, duplication and lack of geographical information, access and utilisation of data. The programme is a continuation of a series of previous PHARE assistance. The design of the 2002 and 2003 **STA** programmes is clearly *acquis* driven and responds to the needs resulting from the membership obligations, namely requirements of EUROSTAT. Both 2002 STA programmes have been targeted on duties indispensable for Slovakia under membership conditions and are highly relevant. The INTRASTAT programme dealt with the development of a tool enabling unified statistical processing of data on trading of goods between member states and reporting to EUROSTAT from the date of accession. REGSTAT is being developed with an aim of gathering and storing data for regional development purposes. The originally tested provision of data by the Statistical Office of the Slovak Republic (SOSR) has been changed and individual institutions are providing data directly to EUROSTAT. Nevertheless the EU standards for regional statistics, which are annually updated, must be respected. The data will be provided for the public sector and regional authorities (SF programming, monitoring and evaluation), for other external users as well as for reporting to EUROSTAT and other international institutions. The 2003 STA programme is focused on three particular areas: (i) financial accounts, (ii) social area and (iii) iron and steel, in order to comply with the new *acquis* in STA. The design of the programmes in general is adequate and the projects address the identified needs. The majority of the IoAs are valid and allow the verification of the achievement of objectives.

#### 2.2.2 *Efficiency*

22. The management of PHARE **CAD** programmes at the GCCA has not encountered any substantial difficulties. The only problem occurred with the tendering of Global Positioning System (GPS) supply: the introduction of External Decentralised Implementation System (EDIS) and its accreditation resulted in a temporarily blocking period and subsequent change of the tendering procedures now following Slovak national legislation. This conversion caused delays in launching tenders. The objections raised by bidders extended the whole process beyond the commitment deadline and thus the allocation could not be committed.

23. As regards **STA**, implementation of projects is delegated to the concerned SORS departments. In all cases, staff were fully committed and understood the additional tasks

as inseparable part of their work. Technical implementation of INTRASTAT was devoted to the Department of External Trade Statistics. Due to the initial lack of experience, the assistance was delivered as a set of subsequent projects. The absence of bidders, and the change of TW to TA, caused delays in contracting of project activities, which left a very tight timeframe to implement the activities and to provide required reporting from the date of accession. With the commitment of the implementing body, the deadlines were met despite the fact that the full functionality of the system could not be ensured. To secure necessary data collection, co-operation was initiated with tax offices and customs. The system was fully developed, pilot tested and necessary training was provided to the concerned staff and reporting units. Further development of the system is planned. REGSTAT was entrusted to the Unit of Regional Statistics. The co-operation on input and output data was offered by SOSR to all relevant bodies and worked well, however, the feedback from the key player - Ministry of Construction and Regional Development (MoCRD) - is still missing. The initiative of SOSR towards MoCRD remained unanswered. Implementation of the 2003 STA programme is allocated to the respective SOSR Departments, managing the individual projects with the enthusiasm and professionalism. The social statistics project has been performed with very tight deadlines but the commitment on both sides does not indicate any problems. Financial accounts statistics is progressing well and the first outputs were delivered as planned. The iron and steel statistics projects were completed as planned and data are processed and reported as required. The working relationships with the contractor were exceptionally friendly and helpful.

### 2.2.3 *Effectiveness*

24. The 2003 **CAD** programme has already initiated a debate on new ideas for the future operations of CAD as a client-oriented institution. Nevertheless, in the absence of strong political commitment to support such a change, the actual operation is not likely to materialise soon. The objectives referring to improved land administration and public access to data are likely to be achieved however the envisaged GPS can operate if financial sources are found to replace the lost PHARE allocation. Concerning the **STA** sub-sector, 2002 INTRASTAT met its objective. The system is fully operational and the compulsory statistical reporting is provided in line with EUROSTAT requirements. REGSTAT was completed and training is taking place to manage its full operations without problems. As with other statistical systems, this system is under permanent development and additional indicators are being loaded. The original intention of the REGSTAT web page was extended and the new page of the whole of SOSR has been developed, including a possibility to access REGSTAT data via the presentation tool, which enables their selection and creation of charts and tables. The 2003 STA programme is also likely to achieve all its objectives. The respective SW systems are under development and all relevant statistics should become operational in accordance with the EU requirements.

### 2.2.4 *Sustainability*

25. The technical benefits delivered via PHARE assistance within the 2003 **CAD** programme should be sustainable. The missing GPS system will affect accuracy and speed of measurements in the area of cadastre, environment, agriculture, etc., but should



not influence the sustainability as such. The institutional transformation from a technically focused organisation into a client-oriented service organisation is continuing however the sustainability of these outputs, which have not been converted into actual results, is difficult to predict. Regarding **STA**, sustainability of all newly developed statistical systems is fully assured as these systems provide obligatory reporting for EUROSTAT and other international institutions. The systems are developed with all the necessary features to take into account possible future changes (mostly legal) or, if needed, to add additional modules reflecting new requirements.

### 2.2.5 Impact

26. The achievements of the 2003 **CAD** programme should contribute to meeting the requirements of the European initiative supporting the availability and use of spatial information in EU policies. The INTRASTAT and the 2003 **STA** programmes are likely to contribute to the achievement of their wider objectives referring to the compliance with the *STA acquis*. As expected, the REGSTAT should provide reliable information on socio-economic regional development for policy making and monitoring of regional development.

## 2.3 COMPONENT 3 – ENERGY AND TRANSPORT

### 2.3.1 Relevance

27. Regarding the **ENE** and **TRA** interventions under this Component, the following aspects should be noted: Design of the 2002 horizontal initiative dealing with Decontamination of the Bohunice nuclear power plant correctly identified the need for a safety assessment of the actual situation in the Nuclear power plant A-1, polluted after a series of accidents<sup>5</sup>. The result of the project should help, and will be used as an important source of technical methods, economic and safety information for the future project of decontamination and disposal of specific nuclear power plant parts. The 2003 horizontal **ENE** programme on Radioactive Waste Agency is addressing the need of correct and safe disposal of all radioactive waste in the Slovak Republic in order to reach the EU standards. The project is designed to prepare the establishment of a new institution for disposal of radioactive waste. The 2003 Road Transport TWL addressed the need of harmonisation of legislation connected with the EU accession process, focused on introduction of digital tachographs.

### 2.3.2 Efficiency

The 2002 project on Decontamination is a good example of efficient co-operation and management between the Nuclear Regulatory Authority, Slovak Electricity Company and the contractor. The cost of the project corresponded well with the project's benefit - the technical project of pre-dismantling decontamination of the specific parts of nuclear power plant A-1 primary circuit, including methods, economic and safety assessment. Based on the recommendation from the previous evaluation report, the PF of 2003 Radioactive Waste Agency was adjusted. The implementation of EDIS caused some

---

<sup>5</sup> The A-1 reactor was subject to several serious accidents with impacts on safety, health and environment. It is recognised by the international community and in particular in the EU, that such reactors should be brought into a safe condition as soon as possible.

delays in the contracting procedure but the project was contracted and the first Interim Report containing a first vision/proposal of the Agency is expected in April 2006. This decision coincides with the final phase of privatisation in the energy sector, which should hopefully eliminate risks of external factors and propose feasible solutions for the establishment of the Agency. The equipment supply (supply of a gamma scanner for national laboratory to verify the character of packed forms of radioactive waste) is ongoing and it is expected that the project will be finished in time. The 2003 TWL project on Road Transport was smoothly completed.

### 2.3.3 Effectiveness

28. The 2002 Decontamination project achieved its objective and will contribute to the sustainable improvement of nuclear safety in the Slovak Republic. Provided that the risk of adverse political influence is eliminated, the 2003 Radioactive Waste Agency initiative should prepare the feasible solution for the establishment of the Agency. The approval of the proposal and demanding implementation process is likely to mean that the Agency will not achieve its operational status during the project implementation. The recently completed Road Transport TWL provided the expected support for social legislation in this area. Incorporation of the recommended changes and actual adoption of legislation is taking place, but the EU Directive on digital tachographs was expected to be into force already a year ago. The lack of political will has prevented the suggested reorganisation and the transfer of all competencies into one sector. Despite the division of tasks and competencies, the obligations should be fulfilled. Based on the completed training needs analysis, training to secure the correct performance of all involved bodies is planned.

### 2.3.4 Sustainability

29. Sustainability prospects for **ENE** and **TRA** interventions are high. The results of the 2002 Decontamination project can be used for further implementation and the complex information will be used in the preparation of the significant part of works within the next phase of A-1 decontamination and disposal of its specific parts. The 2003 Radioactive Waste Agency intervention is in the implementation stage. The first vision/proposal of the Agency is expected in April 2006 and therefore sustainability prospects will be better judged when the implementation is over<sup>6</sup>. Nevertheless, with the upcoming election period, all potential external risk factors should be carefully re-considered. The legal measures adopted as a result of 2003 Road Transport project should be self-sustained.

### 2.3.5 Impact

30. The 2002 Decontamination project contributed to the improvement of the nuclear safety in the Slovak Republic, while 2003 Radioactive Waste Agency has the potential to improve radioactive waste and spent fuel management infrastructure in the country,

---

<sup>6</sup> The company for waste management GovCo a. s. got the licence for waste and spent fuel management in April 2006. Therefore basic preconditions for the successful implementation of the projects are already in place. The results of this project can be very useful input for two successive Transition Facility projects.

including amendments of legislation<sup>7</sup>. It is expected that the 2003 Road Transport project will contribute to an increase in road safety.

## 2.4 COMPONENT 4 – ENVIRONMENT

### 2.4.1 Relevance

31. The problems and needs addressed by the **ENV** interventions are relevant, fully compliant with accession priorities and largely focused on the enforcement of the environmental *acquis*. The programme objectives were coherent and outlined the framework to be achieved. Part of the IoAs was applicable to measure the achievement of objectives. Most of the invalid IoAs referred to the adoption of legislation, which was completed before the start of the projects (see Annex 1). The 2002 Dangerous Substances intervention introduced a new system of control and monitoring of substances discharged in the water in compliance with the legislation harmonised with the respective EU Directive. Similarly, the 2002 IPPC programme was to assist the introduction of the new legislation related to pollution, and the 2002 Natural Habitats programme focused on developing Natura 2000 network in Slovakia in line with the EU requirements. The UIBF project on Information Network was assisting creation of the network assisting utilisation of SF in the sector, which was undoubtedly relevant but would be of more significance if delivered earlier. Due to the delays, adjustments had to be done in the project on Preparation for SF. The original intention to prepare an internal manual for the Implementing Agency for Environmental Investment Projects had to be completed earlier and the original activities were flexibly replaced by new ones – its review, and the preparation of a guide on eligible costs. The project on Noise is also part of the obligatory legal harmonisation and covered the needs linked with the methodologies on noise measurements.

32. 2003 Institutional and Capacity Building is a complex intervention mainly addressing standardisation of data flows, networking and data management linked with environmental reporting obligations to the European Commission and other international institutions. The 2003 programme Biosafety Monitoring System assisted the enforcement of the harmonised legal framework on GMO where no previous experience was available and the system had to be newly established. The 2003 programme on Electronic Scrap was originally designed to assist with the harmonisation of legislation, and proposals for the collection and treatment of electric and electronic scrap. Due to the re-tendering and subsequent delays in the implementation, most of the objectives did not correspond with the actual needs. This led to the modification of the PF, and the current planning documents refer to the necessity to review the existing system in the area of electric and electronic scrap. Two projects are being implemented within 2003 UIBF: the Capacity Building project deals with the issue of Public-Private Partnership projects, which is

---

<sup>7</sup> Establishing the Radioactive Waste Agency will not only improve the radioactive waste and spent fuel management infrastructure in Slovakia but also will make the financial process more transparent. The workshop organized within this project in May 2006 clearly identified the necessity for significant and substantial changes of the existing legal framework. For example it was recognized that changes should be made in the Act on the National Nuclear Fund. In addition, a new Act will be proposed that will govern the future activities of the waste management organisation.

undoubtedly needed but not obligatory, and possibly available free from organisations like the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development. The PCB project is *acquis* related, introducing new measures to carry out the inventory and subsequent disposal of PCBs.

#### 2.4.2 *Efficiency*

33. The majority of ENV programmes were efficiently delivered and well managed. The necessary co-operation was secured and assistance was provided without overlaps or duplications with the previous and parallel-running PHARE and bi-lateral interventions in the sector. The 2002 TW on Dangerous Substances was successfully completed and achieved all planned results. The monitoring system and permitting regime are in place and operational. Based on the feedback, the scope of the assistance was wide, and could not fully cover all the details, therefore the operation of the local environmental offices will require some additional support to strengthen their activities in this respect. As regards the 2002 IPPC programme, the intended results were delivered. All necessary databases to record and manage data on IPPC as well as the national pollution register were developed. The absence of a MoE involvement in the programme and IPPC as such, was identified as the programme weakness. Participation by several of the Ministry's bodies, required strong management and co-ordination from the top to secure better efficiency, information flow and division of responsibilities. The 2002 Natural Habitats TW project suffered from insufficient understanding of the TW concept on both sides. Whilst the beneficiary institution was not ready in terms of time and capacities to accommodate such an intervention, the twinning partner had some difficulties to understand and adjust to local circumstances. These deficiencies hampered the programme efficiency and although the planned results were eventually delivered it could have been done in a more efficient manner. The 2002 UIBF Information Network project was well managed and, with the exception of one result - IT system for project proposals, which was too expensive and eventually redundant - all others were achieved. Due to the delays, the Preparation for SF project was flexibly adjusted to correspond to actual needs and delivered the results agreed during the inception phase. The implementation of the project on Noise did not encounter any problems and provided the requested methodological support.

34. The 2003 Capacity Building intervention is in its final stage. So far it has been smoothly implemented and although TW is not yet completed it has managed to achieve results exceeding the original expectations. All redundant and duplicated activities were abolished, and in priority dataflow reporting, Slovakia jumped, according to the latest unofficial information, from the 15<sup>th</sup> to the fourth position among 32 European countries. 2003 Biosafety Monitoring System was not so successful. The development of a GMO database was found unrealistic with the resources available and thus was not implemented. The organisation of GMO detection bodies cannot be considered as being efficient. Taking into account the country needs, the existing network of three GMO laboratories is excessive and costly, as well as the current number of inspectors. The planned accreditation process of a newly established GMO laboratory could not take place as the equipment was delivered only after the TW completion. The necessity to re-tender the 2003 Electric and Electronic Scrap programme resulted in its late contracting and subsequent needs to adjust original activities. The activities were launched,

implementation continues in line with agreed plan and the project is now likely to deliver its expected benefits. Both 2003 UIBF projects were contracted in the last minute and are carried out fully in compliance with ToR. Implementation has not encountered any difficulties and therefore it is expected that the intended results will be achieved.

#### 2.4.3 Effectiveness

35. In general, the objectives set for individual ENV interventions under the evaluation were successfully achieved. Most objectives focused on enforcement of the harmonised legal frameworks. The 2002 Dangerous Substances programme enabled the relevant public administration responsible for environmental protection, quality control and monitoring, to implement and enforce the requirements of legislation on pollution caused by dangerous substances discharged into aquatic environment. Similarly, the related 2002 IPPC programme assisted with implementation and enforcement of the respective legal requirements regarding all types of industrial pollution; its monitoring, prevention and control measures. The 2002 Natural Habitats delivered its expected benefits and developed a Natura 2000 network. The 2002 UIBF Information Network project for the SEA developed skills and professional abilities of the staff involved in co-ordination, information and preparation of SF ENV projects. Although the activities of the Preparation for SF project were changed, its original purpose was met and the staff of the Agency dealing with the SF management benefited from the provided assistance. The 2002 UIBF project on Noise provided technical and human resources for implementation and enforcement of the legislation linked with the noise.

36. The 2003 Capacity Building programme succeeded in the standardisation and rationalisation of reporting obligations. The benefit has directly materialised in a more effective flow of information and improvement of the rate in the priority dataflow reporting. The purpose of the Biosafety programme was achieved and the national system for detection and quantification of GMO was established, although it is considered to be too large in comparison with the country's needs. The modification of activities of the 2003 Electric and Electronic Scrap should provide the expected benefit and improve environmental conditions via a reduction of electrical and electronic waste. It is expected that the planned benefits of the 2003 UIBF ENV projects will also fully materialise. Completion of the Capacity Building project should result in a proposal of a public-private partnership project in the selected ENV area. The PCB project is likely to achieve effective management of equipment containing PCB and should lead to eventual disposal of PCBs in compliance with the prepared plan.

#### 2.2.4 Sustainability

37. In general, the enforcement arrangements for the environmental legislation are automatically sustainable. They are supported by a compulsory legal framework, including monitoring and control functions covering all sorts of environmental protection, which has to be regularly reported to the Commission. Following the changing EU legislation these measures have to reflect all the changes and incorporate them into national legal frameworks adequately. The institutional and administrative arrangements in the country together with the new procedures and processes are fixed and operational, and with the high probability they will be sustained.

38. Some doubts in relation to sustainability appear for the 2003 Biosafety Monitoring System programme. The operation of three GMO laboratories could be too costly considering the number of tests to be performed. Similarly, doubts occur in relation to the 2003 UIBF Capacity Building on public-private partnerships, where political commitment will be needed to implement projects and this cannot be guaranteed.

#### 2.4.5 Impact

39. All of the *acquis* driven programmes should substantially contribute to the achievement of the overall objective, generally covering strengthening of administrative, monitoring and enforcement capacities in the ENV sector notably as regards the implementation of the *acquis* in the field of air, water quality, waste, nature protection and living organisms as well as standardisation and reporting. As regards the few examples of non-*acquis* UIBF projects, in all cases the projects should contribute to their overall objectives. The 2002 Information Network project contributed to the institutional strengthening of SEA offices and the established network is providing necessary advisory and counselling services for EU funds management. The Preparation for SF project should contribute to improved SF financial management. The 2003 Capacity Building project should strengthen the MoE's specialist administrative capacity in the field of preparation of public-private partnership projects.

40. Overall, the final impact of the ENV Component, as a result of full alignment of the Slovak environmental legislation with the *acquis*, is likely to materialise in a few years time in the form of improved environmental conditions. This should materialise in the form of improved quality of water, air and soil, protected fauna, flora and habitats in specific areas.

## 2.5 COMPONENT 5 – FINANCE, BANKING AND CUSTOMS

### 2.5.1 Relevance

41. The interventions within FIN/BNK/CUS mostly respond to needs related to EU accession. The individual objectives are relevant, though broadly defined. As most of the interventions cover institution or capacity building issues implemented in the form of training activities and documents, the majority of the project purposes refer to the increase of capacities, but do not provide valid and measurable IoAs to justify the achievements. This component comprised numerous UIBF projects, which proved to be very flexible and, with the exception of some TWL projects which had to be re-tendered because of insufficient interest of bidders, their implementation was short and addressed actual needs in a timely way. The FIN part covered several topics. The design of the 2002 UIBF project Introduction of New Act on VAT was focused on a better application of VAT and Excise Duties systems in practice in order to comply with the EU membership conditions. Several 2003 UIBF projects were/are implemented in this area. IS Review and IS Strategy have clear linkages to Slovakia's Public Finance Management Reform (PFMR) Programme and are complemented by the World Bank interventions in the area of IS improvement. The TWL assistance on Risk Management provided relevant

capacity building activities for an innovative policy of risk management to the Tax Directorate. The Protection of Financial Interests project focused on sound financial management of EU funds in compliance with the Commission financial rules. The Evaluation of Budget project is also closely linked to the PFMR. Training of Financial Controllers is a follow-up of the previous intervention dedicated to *ex-post* financial controllers and is linked with the improvement public funds management. The Official Development Aid (ODA) project aims at strengthening of the financial aspects of the ODA mechanism to meet EU and Organisation for Economic Development (OECD) criteria for financial management and reporting.

42. Supervision was the main area of interest in the **BNK** part. 2002 Financial Sector Supervision was relevant and took into account the expected merge of the Financial Market Authority (FMA) with the banking supervision, carried out by the National Bank of Slovakia (NBS), into one regulatory body under the NBS. 2003 Risk-Based Supervision was a follow-up of previous assistance, adding risk-supervision into the know-how transfer and implementation of the Basle II provisions, together with a focus on new clients, such as e-businesses and pension funds, which is considered relevant to the needs of the new economy.

43. Substantial changes related with the accession took place in **CUS** and involved needs that had to be urgently covered. The 2002 IS for Slovak Customs Administration (SCA) project for the Customs Criminal Office had a cross-sectoral character, namely in connection with the fight against crime, and planned to use an IS for integration of information and its analysis in order to avoid potential frauds in the field of CUS. The UIBF 2002 Risk Analysis Techniques project supported the transfer of the responsibilities concerning collection of excise duties from the Tax Administration to the SCA. Regarding the investment, the 2003 Equipment supply to SCA project is providing specialist equipment facilitating the determination of the origin authenticity of goods covered by the customs tariff chapter on agricultural products and tobacco. The X-ray Inspection Systems programme is to instal fixed and mobile X-rays at the Slovak Eastern border. Both 2003 CUS projects also stipulate conditionalities requiring timely preparation of sites prior to the equipment delivery, which are not yet completed. The design of the X-ray Inspection Systems programme had to be adjusted because of the promised gift of an X-ray system for CUS from China, resulting from bilateral political negotiations. The UIBF 2003 Naples II Convention addressed the need of the CUS Central Co-ordination Unit to improve the management of internal EU borders. The Administrative Capacity of SCA project is focused on the protection of Community and national financial interests and on the fight against fraud.

### 2.5.2 Efficiency

44. The **FIN** activities under the New Act on VAT project were, with small modifications, running according to the agreed schedule and delivered their expected benefits. The assistance was fully utilised for the better application of the new Act on VAT, Excise Duties system and related legislation, which were adopted and came into force from the date of the accession. All 2003 UIBF projects for the MoF, with the exception of the ODA project, are completed and delivered the results as originally

expected. A part of the projects, in particular those dealing with the PFMR Programme required co-ordination with the other donor's activities, which was adequately secured via a MoF Steering Committee. The Review of IS project enabled the necessary alterations of IT system components, which secured efficient accounting and achieved required accuracy and speed. The IS Strategy project prepared strategy and respective implementation plan supporting the main objectives of the PFMR. Evaluation of the Budget project delivered the Monitoring and Evaluation Strategy for the State Budget together with a methodological handbook, in order to harmonise the evaluation of EU funds and the state budget sources. The National Fund and other IA staff benefited from the training within the Financial Interest project, which improved their skills in several areas of the EU funds financial management (mainly irregularities, cash flow forecasting, procurement, eligibility of expenditure etc.). Similarly, the staff of the newly established Department of Financial Control of EC Funds, dealing specifically with the ex-post financial control, as well as Financial Control Administrations located in Bratislava, Zvolen and Banska Bystrica, benefited from the Training of Financial Controllers. Assistance under the Risk Management project contributed to the introduction of risk management into Slovak Tax Administration. The ODA project should contribute to the improvement of the financial management and reporting as well as results-based management of the ODA. After an unsuccessful first round of the call for proposals, within the second round a twinning partner was selected. Activities started in January 2006.

45. Concerning **BNK**, implementation of the 2002 Financial Market Supervision suffered from delays because of insufficient interest of TWL bidders and its overall duration had to be shortened by six months. In spite of the short duration, the project was implemented successfully. The 2003 Risk-Based Supervision project is progressing without any obvious problems and should improve risk management. A small IT project dealing with the SW development for Capital Market Supervision commenced recently.

46. In the area of **CUS**, the efficient co-ordination of the 2002 Information System for SCA project and the professional approach on the side of contractor and beneficiary led to successful conclusion of all activities which were implemented within less than a year (though originally planned for three years). The contracted equipment was successfully delivered and tested and the IS is fully operational. CUS officers gained knowledge on tax audit and risk analysis assessment in the field of excise duties through the UIBF 2002 Risk Analysis Techniques project. Smart preparation and management of the 2003 Equipment supply to the SCA project secured a good combination of the two instruments to determine authenticity and correct origin of agricultural products. The initial difficulties with the X-ray Inspection Systems caused by an unpredictable overlap with Chinese bi-lateral assistance were resolved. The fixed X-ray system will be located on the railway border crossing but the completion of facilities can influence the duration of the project and may require its extension. The transfer of know-how concerning the practical implementation of Naples II Convention was delivered to the Customs Criminal Office and the expected results were achieved. All activities were implemented but the project could not be officially finished for administrative reasons. The request for an extension was submitted late and could not be granted after the contract expiry date. In



order to close the project officially a solution was sought. As the contractor performed well and delivered all the activities, CFCU decided that all expenses after the official end of the project contract will be covered by the CUS Directorate. The UIBF 2003 Administrative Capacity of SCA project commenced a few months ago and so far completed the first activities. It is expected that all planned benefits will be achieved and SCA staff will gain new knowledge on legal and administrative aspects of the customs and excise duties.

### 2.5.3 Effectiveness

47. In general the interventions within the **FIN/BNK/CUS** sector under the evaluation were effective and met or are likely to meet their objectives. To judge the extent to which the objectives are met is more complicated, as most of the IoAs do not provide sufficient specification for assessment. Concerning **FIN**, the 2002 UIBF New Act on VAT succeeded in meeting its objective and helped to apply of VAT and Excise Duties system in practice. The 2003 UIBF projects were equally successful. The review of five business models was completed as indicated in the objective of the IS Review project. Assistance was provided for drafting the IS Strategy for the PFMR and thus the purpose was also met. The Financial Interests project helped to strengthen the financial management capacities of the National Fund and Implementing Agencies. The purpose of Evaluation of the Budget project was partly met. Whilst evaluation strategy and methodologies were produced, the operational evaluation structure for public funds is still absent and the practical implementation (evaluation exercise of public funds) has not taken place yet. Training of Financial Controllers enhanced the qualification of staff involved in public internal financial control system as expected and contributed to the execution of sample checks of the total eligible expenditure of the SF, Cohesion Fund and Schengen facility. The Risk Management project introduced a complex system of risk management in all areas of activities of the Tax Administration via explanatory documents and recommendations for modernisation of tax administration procedures. Based on the progress so far it can be expected that the ODA project will also achieve its purpose.

48. In the area of **BNK**, a considerable part of the expected benefits has already been delivered. The 2002 Financial Sector Supervision project is completed and integrated supervision was introduced in January 2006, as stipulated in the respective legislation on supervision of financial market and NBS. The purpose of the 2003 TA to the Risk-based Supervision - focusing on the establishment of risk-based supervision systems over the capital market and insurance, and enhancement of risk-based supervision of credit institutions – is achievable once the assistance is fully implemented. As the FMA has merged with the NBS, this change has affected the development of SW for Capital Market Supervision. The SW development project was evaluated by the IT experts in order to avoid any duplication with existing applications and to secure its most efficient utilisation.

49. The decrease of the tax and **CUS** evasion within the responsibility of the SCA was met through 2002 IS for SCA project although the statistical indicators to measure this achievement are not available before the end of the year. Nevertheless, the operation of

the integrated IS at the Custom Crime Office supports this judgment. The 2002 UIBF Risk Analysis Techniques project successfully met the purpose and trained CUS officials on the excise duties. The 2003 CUS investments are likely to achieve their purposes as well. Notably, 2003 Equipment supply to SCA - once the new equipment is delivered - should contribute to both determination of goods' origin and also detection of tax evasions. Likewise, the delivery of the 2003 X-ray Inspection Systems should improve the integrity of the EU external border and should help to prevent illegal trade and migration. As expected, the Naples II Convention project contributed to the human resources development of the Customs Criminal Office staff responsible for implementing this Convention. The Administrative Capacity of SCA project is also likely to achieve its purpose once it is completed.

#### 2.5.4 Sustainability

50. Regarding **FIN**, sustainability of the 2002 New Act on VAT project results is automatically ensured. As regards the 2003 UIBF projects for the MoF, their sustainability depends on the successful implementation of the challenging overall PFMR. Due to the governmental support and involvement of the World Bank, with PHARE playing a complementary role, the PFMR's completion is highly probable thus helping to make PHARE assistance such as IS Review, IS Strategy, and Evaluation of the Budget sustainable. Sustainability of the Financial Interests project could be endangered by high turnover of staff, otherwise the necessity to comply with EU financial rules guarantees automatic sustainability. Identical judgments apply for the Training of Financial Controllers, Risk Management and ODA projects where the stability of the staff capacities within the relevant Slovak institution is a key factor for sustainability; moreover, successful implementation of the PFMR can also play important role.

51. Concerning **BNK**, the benefits of the 2002 Financial Sector Supervision project, being part of legislation on financial market supervision should be self-sustained. Forecast on sustainable achievements of 2003 Risk-Based Supervision project are positive, depending on the relevant legislation.

52. Most of the outputs already achieved by the **CUS** interventions are sustainable. The SCA has secured financing and maintenance of the IS developed under PHARE. The 2002 IS for SCA helps with effective detection of serious infringements of customs legislation and brings thus sustainable results. The Equipment supply to SCA project should be self-sustainable and will help with effective determination of the origin authenticity of goods. The X-ray Inspection Systems project will upgrade the CUS control facilities at the external border with Ukraine and should bring sustainable results in prevention of illegal trade and migration. Know-how received through the Naples II Convention and Risk Analysis Techniques projects is used by relevant CUS authorities responsible for internal management of the Convention and for the risk analysis assessment. Training of CUS officers within the Administrative Capacity of SCA project should also bring sustainable benefits in the form of improved legal measures.

### 2.5.5 Impact

53. In the area of **FIN**, the 2002 New Act on VAT project contributed to the improvement of VAT and Excise Duties systems, respecting EU membership conditions. Some of the 2003 UIBF projects, such as Review of IS, IS Strategy, and Evaluation of the Budget should contribute, together with other donors' interventions, to the successful implementation of the Government's PFMR which should bring the wider benefits in the form of improved management of public funds. An impact, in the form of modernised tax administration procedures and introduction of innovative policy of risk management as a decision-making tool, can be attributed to the Risk Management project. The Financial Interests and Financial Controllers projects contributed to the protection of European Communities financial interests. The ODA project is expected to contribute to improved financial management and efficient statistical reporting.

54. In the **BNK** area, the impact in the form of increased efficiency of the supervision over of the capital market institutions, insurance companies and banks, and increased stability of financial services providers can be attributed in part to the 2002 Financial Sector Supervision project. The 2003 Risk-Based Supervision project should contribute to the achievement of the same impact.

55. The benefits achieved by the 2002 IS for SCA project should be reflected in the detection of transit of drugs and psycho-tropic substances and thus ensure enforcement of the law and reveal heavy crime in smuggling, economic crime and frauds. As indicated by the overall objective set for the 2003 Equipment supply to the SCA project, this supply should complete the preparation of the CUS Directorate for tasks resulting from the excise administration. The supply of X-ray Inspection Systems should prevent smuggling of highly taxable goods and other goods of special interest and combat economic crime, trade and illegal immigration on the EU external border with the Ukraine. The benefits of the Naples II Convention project should contribute to the improvement of the management of the EU internal borders. Implementation of the UIBF 2002 Risk Analysis Techniques project assisted with the transfer of responsibilities concerning collection of excise duties from the Tax Administration to the SCA after the accession. The Administrative Capacity of SCA project has potential to contribute to strengthening of the protection of Community and national financial interests and the fight against fraud.

## 2.6 SPECIFIC ISSUES

56. Based on the requirement of the Office of the Government/ Aid Co-ordination Unit the evaluators also tackled the issue of publicity and visibility of PHARE interventions. The respective findings are summarised in Annex 7.

### 3 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### 3.1 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

##### *Relevance*

57. Overall, the relevance of the interventions under the evaluation is satisfactory, which is clearly connected with the fact that PHARE assistance strictly focused on identified accession priorities. Approval was granted to projects which followed priorities set out in the *acquis* or to interventions focusing on measures linked with membership obligations. Design deficiencies concerning too general objectives, insufficient coherence between overall objective and project purpose and poor quality of IoAs are still common, although improvements are visible.

58. The **AGR** programmes are relevant, fully compliant with EU CAP and governmental priorities. Some projects addressed urgent needs relating to the enforcement of legal measures or the setting-up of institutions and their operations by the date of accession. The main problems concerning relevance were identified in the 2002 Phytosanitary Control programme. The original declared need, to establish a quarantine glasshouse for the phytosanitary control of imported consignments via the external border with Ukraine, does not correspond with the current situation. Several 2002 and 2003 projects were planned with the assumption that they would be completed before the accession date. As their actual implementation was taking place much later (delays were caused mainly by EDIS blocking and re-tendering of projects because of insufficient interest of contractors), the planned activities had to be implemented and projects required modification of activities. As regards **CAD&STA** their relevance is justified and in compliance with accession needs. CAD programme is clearly following an EU initiative. The most urgent STA priority was INTRASTAT, which had to be operational from the accession date onwards. The rest of projects, dealing with the obligatory reporting to EUROSTAT, are also relevant but implemented with very tight deadlines. The relevance of **ENE&TRA** programmes is justified. The projects dealing with nuclear safety measures respond well to the identified needs.

59. The **ENV** Component is relevant, primarily focusing on enforcement of harmonised legislation dealing with pollution, waste, water and nature protection. Again, some projects required adjustment of activities because of the delayed start. Moreover, one project (Preparation for SF) after the modification comprised similar activities as a parallel project within FIN (Protection of Financial Interests) provided to all concerned line ministries. Relevance is justified in the **FIN/ BNK/ CUS** Component with its sub-components addressing the accession priorities in the area of financial management and control of public funds, financial market regulation and alignment of the CUS. A part of the interventions is directly related to the PFMR.

##### *Efficiency*

60. As regard efficiency, the majority of **AGR** interventions performed satisfactorily. The 2002 IACS programme was successfully implemented despite a huge time pressure.

Less positive is the assessment of CCTIA interventions where the PHARE-funded glasshouse (2002 Phytosanitary Control) is questioned in terms of value-for-money due to changed circumstances; the capacity of delivered laboratory equipment exceeds the need of one institution and should be utilised more efficiently. Some deficiencies were identified in the management of interventions, which influenced the quality of the implementation. These involved insufficient reporting, differences between planning documents and actual implementation, and no improvement was observed as regards assignment of responsibilities for PHARE management and training plans. The interventions within **CAD&STA** were efficient with the exception of the GPS supply for GCCA where the allocation was lost. It is again noted that the commitment and enthusiasm demonstrated by SORS has been excellent and substantially contributed to the projects' success. However, despite repeated efforts of the REGSTAT staff, the response of the MOCRCD concerning indicators has still not been provided. The efficiency of **ENE&TRA** programmes has been satisfactory. The 2002 Decontamination programme is a good example of a well managed intervention with highly valuable benefits.

61. The efficiency of **ENV** programmes was generally sufficient. More efficient performance could have been achieved within 2002 IPPC where the overall co-ordination from the side of the MoE could have positively influenced implementation. The same applies for Natural Habitats, where the implementors lacked an understanding of the basic principle of TW operation. In a few cases, the expected outputs were found unrealistic (mostly for financial reasons) and therefore were not delivered. Efficiency was not found adequate as regards organisation of the GMO detection bodies. On the other side, excellent results regarding reporting were achieved within the 2003 Capacity Building TW. The **FIN/BNK/CUS** Component was efficiently managed. With the exception of Naples II Convention, which encountered the administrative difficulties, the interventions were running smoothly and provided the expected benefits. Co-ordination of PHARE and complementary bi-lateral interventions was well secured in both components.

#### *Effectiveness*

62. Most of the **AGR** interventions managed to achieve their objectives and the justification is provided by compliance with relevant IoAs. However, achievement of the purpose could not be justified in case of 2002 Phytosanitary Control. Nevertheless, the new general framework, tasks and functions compliant with EU Regulations regarding phytosanitary, veterinary and food control (including borders) were established and are operational. The benefits of the completed **CAD&STA** interventions have already materialised. INTRASTAT is fully operational, REGSTAT is commencing its operations and a part of 2003 STA projects was pilot tested with very good prospects. The full achievement of CAD programme's objective however will require completion of all activities including GPS. The interventions under **ENE&TRA**, once completed, were successful but the results of 2003 Radioactive Waste Agency project await political support for establishing the Agency.

63. The **ENV** Component was effective and mainly introduced numerous measures in the area of environmental protection, pollution prevention, quality control and

monitoring. Individual tasks and responsibilities were assigned to the existing institutions as stipulated in the concerned legislation. A few ongoing projects have the same positive prospects. A similar assessment is provided for the **FIN/BNK/CUS** Component, prediction of effectiveness for the outstanding interventions is good.

#### *Sustainability*

64. The majority of the benefits achieved in **AGR, CAD&STA, ENE&TRA** and **ENV** are likely to be sustainable since the legal frameworks, supporting most of the programmes, are established, and thus will ensure sustainability. Some doubts in relation to sustainability are raised on some AGR projects' outputs, where efficiency has been a subject of concern. The maintenance of the glasshouse, as well as the procurement of spare parts for the laboratory equipment, is costly and cannot be always secured from the state budget sources. Similarly, the operation of three GMO laboratories (two of them to be accredited) may face difficulties in future, in particular if the demand for testing remains low. Sustainability of training interventions, in general, cannot be guaranteed although measures were already introduced for preventing people to leave institutions after training or to reimburse its costs. There are no indications which would endanger the sustainability in the area of **FIN/BNK/CUS**.

#### *Impact*

65. The overwhelming majority of the interventions under evaluation are expected to a varying extent to contribute to the achievement of their overall objectives - mostly stated as harmonisation with the *acquis*. The eventual socio-economic impacts for the whole society should be visible mainly in the form of healthy food, clean environment, and good and transparent management of public funds in the longer term.

## RECOMMENDATIONS TABLE

As this is the last PHARE interim evaluation of the sector some of the identified deficiencies, notably those reflecting imminent weaknesses of the Slovak PHARE system and capacities will not be addressed via the recommendations given below. These imminent weaknesses have been assessed over many years and related recommendations were given in the past in many earlier interim evaluation reports. Recommendations are provided therefore, only for such cases where corrective measures are feasible and can be realistically applied.

Conclusion	Recommendation	Output	Reference/ Paragraph	Responsibility	Deadline
In order to achieve the objectives of the 2003 CAD programme, completion of all activities, including GPS stations supply, is needed.	The GCCA in co-operation with the MoF should seek further state budget support to replace lost PHARE funding. The allocation of state budget, originally devoted as co-funding, should be retained for this purpose and additional means should be negotiated in order to secure a sufficient number of GPS stations.	Delivered GPS stations	22, 60, 62	GCCA /MoF	With immediate effect
Participation of several MoE bodies in the IPPC implementation required strong management and co-ordination from the top to secure better efficiency, information flow and division of responsibilities.	The MoE should secure more direct and pro-active participation (via relevant specialists) in any intervention linked with the important IPPC legislation, to make sure that the decisions taken are more acceptable and fully respected by the sub-ordinated institutions rather than leaving such decisions as a subject of negotiation between sub-ordinated bodies.	Key decision-maker involved	31, 57	MoE	With immediate effect
The capacity of purchased laboratory equipment should be fully utilised to make it more cost-effective. The laboratory equipment exceeds current needs of one institution and could be utilised more efficiently. Identically, the created network of three GMO laboratories is exaggerated in comparison with the actual country needs.	The relevant Ministries should consider in future a possible change in the structure of laboratories performing tests (e.g. highly specialised laboratories serving purposes of all relevant control bodies/institutions) for the phytosanitary, veterinary and food control bodies to ensure the most optimal and cost –effective utilisation of the equipment.	Efficient utilisation of equipment	16, 60, 64	MoA/SVFA/ CCTIA/MoH	With immediate effect

### 3.2 PERFORMANCE RATING

Component/ Project	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Sustainability	Impact	Verbal overall rating
<b>Agriculture</b>						
2002/000-610.05	2	1	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.06	2	2	2	1	1	HS
2002/000-610.07	1	-1	0	0	0	U
2002/000-610.08	1	-1	0	1	0	S
2003-004-995-03-02	1	0	0	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-03	1	1	0	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-04	1	0	0	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Swine Fever	1	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Audit for APA	1	1	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.02 Strengthening of RAS	1	1	1	1	1	S
<b>Cadastre and Statistics</b>						
<i>Cadastre</i>						
2003-004-995-02-01	1	0	1	1	1	S
<i>Statistics</i>						
2002/000-610.09	2	2	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.10	2	2	2	1	1	HS
2003-004-995-03-05	2	2	1	1	1	S
<b>Energy and Transport</b>						
<i>Energy</i>						
2002/000-632.09	1	1	2	2	2	HS
2003/5812.07.01	1	1	0	0	1	S
<i>Transport</i>						
2003 -995-01-04 Road Transport	1	1	1	1	1	S
<b>Environment</b>						
2002/000-610.16	1	1	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.17	1	0	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.18	1	0	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.02 Noise	1	1	1	1	1	S
2002/000.610-02 Info Network	1	1	1	1	1	S
2002/000.610-02 SF Implementation	1	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-16	1	2	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-17	1	0	1	0	1	S
2003-004-995-03-18	1	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Capacity Building	0	0	1	0	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 PCB	1	1	1	1	1	S
<b>Finance, Banking and Customs</b>						
<i>Finance</i>						
UIBF 2002/000-610.02	1	1	1	1	1	S



Act on VAT						
2003-004-995-01-04 IS Review	2	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Strategy for IS	2	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Financial Interests	2	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Budget Evaluation	2	1	0	0	0	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Financial Controllers	2	1	1	0	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Risk Management	1	1	0	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 ODA	1	0	0	0	0	S
<i>Banking</i>						
2002/000-610.04	1	1	0	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-01	1	1	0	1	0	S
<i>Customs</i>						
2002/000-610.20	2	2	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.02 Risk Analysis Techn.	1	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-25	2	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-26	1	0	0	1	1	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Naples II	1	0	1	0	0	S
2003-004-995-01-04 Admin. Capacity	1	1	0	0	0	S
<b>Taking into account the contextual constraints on the evaluation, the sector overall is rated to be 'SATISFACTORY'</b>						
<b>Internal Market Monitoring Sector</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>S</b>

Ratings guide: -2 unacceptable; -1 poor; 0 sufficient/adequate; +1 good; +2 excellent.  
HS-Highly Satisfactory, S- Satisfactory, U-Unsatisfactory, HU-Highly Unsatisfactory.

## **ANNEXES**

## ANNEX 1

### Indicators of Achievement

Immediate Objectives (Project Purpose)	Indicators of Achievement (Objectively Verifiable Indicators)	Remarks
<b>Component 1 – Agriculture</b>		
<b>2002/000-610.05 Control TSE-Food Safety</b>		
To facilitate the introduction of TSE screening in SR as prescribed in the Regulation 999/2001/EC.	Re-evaluation of the position of the SR within the GBR assessment	Not valid or applicable as indicator
<b>20002/000-610.06 Development of IACS</b>		
Strengthening of the Slovak institutional structures necessary for the implementation of IACS in line with requirements of EU CAP	Administrative structures necessary for the implementation of IACS created according to EU requirements – regulations 3508/92 and 3887/92	The required administrative structures were set up and started operations.
<b>2002/000-610.07 Enhancement of Phytosanitary Controls of Plants and Plant Producers</b>		
Strengthening of the phytosanitary control on the future EU external points in the SR	Diagnostic control systems fully operational in line with EU regulations	Not valid or applicable as indicator for this project
	Number of outbreaks of plant reduced	No baseline or benchmark data available
	SR provides specialised data to EU structures	Too general, requires further specification
<b>2002/000-610.08 Registration of Producers, Importers and Exporters of Plants and Plant Products</b>		
Establishment of a registration system of producers, importers and exporters of plants and plant products in SR	The system of registration of producers, importers and exporters of plants and plant products in the SR is fully operational in line with EU legislation	The system was developed and started to operate
	The number of registered producers, importers and exporters increased	Not valid as an indicator – no reason to increase the number of registered entities
	SR provides specialised data to the EU structures	No knowledge on provision of specialised data
<b>2003-004-995-03-02 Support to Agriculture Food Chain in Comprehensive Food Safety Policy</b>		
Complete the veterinary and phytosanitary services infrastructure, required for the food safety <i>acquis</i>	Harmonised Slovak legislation published in the official collection of laws	Not related to the project purpose
Monitor foreign bodies in agricultural products and	Proper market food safety control results achieved and	Rather general, not applicable as indicator

protect the consumers	confirmed by standard regular surveillance results	
Broaden the activities of both the Slovak Agricultural and Food Inspection Authorities and those of the Central Control and Testing Institute of Agriculture to improve their quality with regard to the task they will fulfil on accession to the EU	Target institutions accredited and working as prescribed by the food safety <i>acquis</i>	It could be applied, provided that the accreditation is the result of project activities, which is not the case
<b>2003-004-995-03-03 Veterinary and Phytosanitary Border Inspection Posts – II. Phase (Bratislava Airport BIP)</b>		
Veterinary and phytosanitary inspection post at Bratislava Airport ready for execution of phytosanitary and veterinary controls	Accreditation of BIP achieved by the date of accession of the SR to the EU	The approval of EC is required for BIP operation, the approval of veterinary part was granted (not at the date of accession)
Veterinary and phytosanitary inspectors ready for execution of veterinary and phytosanitary controls	BIP Bratislava Airport conducts control in line with the EU standards and best practice	Veterinary control is fully in line, phytosanitary part operation is limited
<b>2003-004-995-03-04 Animal Protection during Transport</b>		
Strengthening of the veterinary control of animal welfare during transport	Harmonised Slovak legislation published	This does not relate to the project purpose
Establishment of data transmission system between veterinary inspectors executing the animal transport checks and central register of transporters	Results of control of the state veterinary activities on the regional and district veterinary and food administrations	The indicator is too general and not measurable but results should indicate if the control is correctly performed and if the selection of criteria were well chosen
Upgrading of the system of submitted route plan checks		
<b>Component 2 – Cadastre and Statistics</b>		
<b>2003-004-995-02-01 Land Administration and Cadastre Infrastructure</b>		
Improving land administration based on spatial and cadastral data, including permanent Global Positioning System (GPS), in line with the concepts and directions proposed by the European Commission	The permanent GPS stations cover at least 80 percent of Slovakia's territory	It will not be achieved – lost allocation
Public access to the land administration data and cadastre data	1.000 access to the data base per day and 100 directly connected users within 1 year after completion	Valid as indicator, can be measured once the access is available after completion of project
<b>2002/000-610.09 Implementation of INTRASTAT-SK</b>		
Implementation of the INTRASTAT-SK system	INTRASTAT-SK system set up	INTRASTAT-SK was set out and is operational
<b>2002/000-610.10 Strengthening of Regional Statistics – REGSTAT</b>		
Develop a fully operational regional statistical system with improved quality of regional data, supported with methodological and software tools, ensuring regional data collection from different sources, updating the regional data base, data presentation and analysis of	Number of statistical indicators on regions increased by 50 percent by second semester 2003	The system includes currently 700 indicators, benchmark is not known
	Statistical data on regions are fully in compliance with the EU standards and compatible with EUROSTAT REGIO	REGSTAT is in line with the EUROSTAT requirements

regional development	Methods for measuring of regional development are adopted by second semester 2003 by all sectors co-operating in the project	The main co-operating body - MoCRD still ignores offers for co-operation
	Minimum of 40 persons trained in use of REGSTAT at regional level, minimum 20 trained at central level	Output indicator, figures exceeding planned numbers
<b>2003-004-995-03-05 Enforcement of New <i>Acquis</i> in the Field of Statistics</b>		
Improving social statistics by including harmonised data on income, health, education, housing, demographics and employment characteristics	New statistical instruments and new information systems for monitoring the economic and social development in place	The whole system is being developed
Improvement of data processing system for annual and quarterly financial accounts and financial balance sheets compilation through introduction of production system	Required statistical survey carried out	The system is being developed
Developing new information system for iron and steel statistics according to the respective EC regulations for reference years 2003-2009	Required statistical data available	The system is completed and delivery of data is just expected
<b>Component 3 – Energy and Transport</b>		
<b>2002-000-632.09 Decontamination of the Bohunice NPAA-1 Primary Circuit</b>		
To develop a decontamination concept for primary circuit	Final report of the project	Provided that the decontamination concept is meant it can be considered as valid
<b>2003/5812.07.01 Technical Support to SR in Establishing the National Agency for Disposal of Radioactive Waste</b>		
To improve radioactive waste management in SR through the setting-up of a national agency with a legal status, scope and financial resources that are comparable to similar agencies existing in the EU	The same IA are stated as for the results	Not valid
<b>Component 4 – Environment</b>		
<b>2002/000-610.16 Discharge of Dangerous Substances</b>		
Implementation and enforcement requirements of the Directive 76/464/EEC on pollution caused by the dangerous substances discharged into aquatic environment	Authorisation regime in compliance with the Directive by 31/12/04	Valid and applicable as an indicator
	Compliance with set standards and coherence with EC water quality requirements	Deadline missing for the indicator to be applicable
	Monitoring system comprising all dangerous substances in the aquatic environment and control of discharges	Deadline missing for the indicator to be applicable

	Emission reduction programmes for List I and List II dangerous substances	Deadline missing for the indicator to be applicable
<b>2002/000-610.17 Integrated Prevention and Pollution Control</b>		
Implementation and enforcement of the Directive 96/61/EC on Integrated Prevention and Pollution Control	Establishment of the national system for prevention and pollution control with databases and published information on the web by 30/06/05	Databases are established
	Slovak legislation aligned with IPPC Directive	Not valid, legal framework was harmonised before the project start
	Plans and Programmes available at MoE	Not valid as an indicator
<b>2002/000-610.18 Conservation of Natural Habitats</b>		
Development of the Natura 2000 Network due to the Council Directive 92/43/EEC (Habitat) and Council Directive 79/409/EEC (Birds)	Binding regulations under new Act on Nature and Landscape Protection adopted	Not valid
	Management plans for Natura 2000 sites approved and submitted to the EC by 31/12/05	Management plans are being developed, no final deadline for submission was set as yet.
	Monitoring system comprising the conservation status of natural habitats and species providing exact data in compliance with the Annexes of the EEC Directives by 31/12/05	Monitoring system established
<b>2003-004-995-03-16 Institutional and Capacity Building in the Environmental Sector</b>		
Enforcement of the environmental <i>acquis</i> , notably as regards Council directive on standardisation and rationalisation of reports, Council Regulation on the establishment of the EEA and the EIONET, air, water, waste and nature protection Directives	Establishment of IS for connection and co-operation in the ENV sector in the SEA, SEI, MoE, SHMI, SNC, including shared databases in 18 <sup>th</sup> month	IS established
	Improved standardisation and reporting in 22 <sup>nd</sup> month	Not quantified, but reporting was remarkably improved
	Plans and programmes available at MoE – national and regional documents in 22 <sup>nd</sup> month	Should be achieved on time
<b>2003-004-995-03.17 Biosafety Monitoring System</b>		
Network of current scientific institutions reorganised into a competent national system for the detection and quantification of GMO in the SR	Competent national and international authorities have approved institutional structure of scientific institutions charged with detection and quantification of GMO	No reorganisation took place
Slovak national GMO detection system functions as required by relevant legislation, using quantitative and qualitative methods for GMO monitoring	Rates of detection and quantification of GMO and other performance indicators equal or better than in comparable member states	Other performance indicators needs to be specified
<b>2003-004-995-03-18 Implementation of Council Directives on Electric and Electronic Scrap</b>		
Improvement of environmental conditions via reduction of hazardous waste of electric and electronic equipment	Draft Act on WEEE prepared by 1 <sup>st</sup> quarter 2005	Completed before project's start
	Draft WPM prepared by 4 <sup>th</sup> quarter 2004	Completed before project's start
	Key players informed by 1 <sup>st</sup> quarter 2005	Not valid as indicator

<b>Component 5 – Finance, Banking and Customs</b>		
<b>2002/000-610.04 Strengthening Financial Sector Supervision</b>		
Adopt relevant <i>acquis</i> on financial services supervision	Acts and decrees in force as required in the NRTA by 30 September 2005	Partly valid; project on-going; adoption of legislation exceeds the scope of the project
Enhance supervision of financial sector	Increased ratio of detected irregularities by 30 November 2005	Invalid; hardly attributable to the project results only
	Decreased number of collapsed financial market institutions by 30 November 2005	Invalid; hardly attributable to the project results only
Implement FMA and NBS co-ordination measures	Statutory documents on integrated supervision adopted and operational by 30 November 2005	Partly valid; project on-going; adoption of legislation exceeds the scope of the project
<b>2002/000-610.20 Information System for Slovak Customs Administration</b>		
Promotion of law enforcement by functional IS for special customs administrative units	Decrease of the tax and customs evasion in the responsibility of the SCA	Invalid; hardly attributable to the project results only
	Increase of number of custom officers who will have better access to intelligence operative information	Valid; however deadlines, baselines and benchmarks are missing
	Increase of number of customs officers who will have better access to operative information related to evaluation of selection criteria	
<b>2003-004-995-03-01 Risk-based Supervision</b>		
Systems of risk-based supervision over capital market, insurance companies, pension funds established and operational	Relevant laws and decrees on securities, investment services and insurance industry amended by end 2005	Partly valid; adoption of legislation exceeds the scope of the project
Risk-based supervision of credit institutions enhanced in accordance with the implementation of the New Capital Accord Basel II	Principles of Basel II transposed into relevant Slovak legislation by 2006	Partly valid; adoption of legislation exceeds the scope of the project
	0 percent of collapsed financial institutions	Invalid; hardly attributable to the project results only
<b>2003-004-995-03-25 Equipment Supply for the Slovak Customs Laboratories</b>		
Determination of origin authenticity of goods	Detection of origin of supplies with starting capacity 1,500 samples/ year with subsequent optimisation to 2,800 samples/year	Valid; after setting a deadline also applicable
Efficient detection of tax evasions and subsidise frauds	Reduction of tax and customs evasions and subsidise frauds	Valid, however any baseline, benchmark, deadline missing
<b>2003-004-995-03-26 X-ray Inspection Systems</b>		
Border posts on the Ukrainian border are fully functioning, comparable to the external EU border stations	Controlling time in case of passenger traffic does not exceed 30 minutes, average truck waiting time does not exceed 3 hours	Valid; deadline missing

---

Containment and eradication of illegal trade and migration	X-ray detection rate comparable or exceeding the rates achieving in the EU	Valid, however any baseline, benchmark, deadline missing
--	--	--



## ANNEX 2

### List of Interviews

INSTITUTION	INTERVIEWEE	DATE
Statistics Office of SR Mileticova 3 SK-824 67 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Alzbeta Ivanickova</b> Adviser	17.02.2006
Statistics Office of SR Mileticova 3 SK-824 67 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Agnesa Kralikova</b>	17.02.2006
Statistics Office of SR Mileticova 3 SK-824 67 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Alena Illitova</b>	24.02.2006
Statistical Office SR Department of External Trade Statistics Miletičova 3 SK-824 67 Bratislava 26	<b>Ms. Alzbeta Ridzonova</b>	24.02.2006
Statistical Office SR Department of External Trade Statistics Miletičova 3 SK-824 67 Bratislava 26	<b>Ms. Jana Condikova</b> Head of Methodology and Analysis Unit	24.02.2006
National Bank of Slovakia Governor Secretary Department Imricha Karvasa 1 SK-813 25 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Eva Karasova</b> Director	27.02.2006
National Bank of Slovakia Banking Supervision Imricha Karvasa 1 SK-813 25 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Roman Turok-Hetes</b>	27.02.2006
National Bank of Slovakia Banking Supervision IT Department Imricha Karvasa 1 SK-813 25 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Steiniger</b>	27.02.2006
Slovak Environmental Agency Environmental Projects Programming Centre Hanulova 5/d SK- 844 40 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Juraj Gavora</b> Director	02.03.2006
Slovak Environmental Agency Environmental Projects Programming Centre Hanulova 5/d SK- 844 40 Bratislava	<b>Ms Miroslava Tuzinska</b> Programme Manager	02.03.2006
National Bank of Slovakia Banking Supervision Imricha Karvasa 1 SK-813 25 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Svetko</b>	02.03.2006
Research Institute of Geodesy and Cartography Chlumeckeho 4 SK-826 62 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Juraj Valis</b> SPO	06.03.2006

Slovak Environmental Agency Waste and Environmental Management Centre Hanulova 5/d SK- 844 40 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Andrea Laurincova</b> Project Manager	09.03.2006
Slovak Environmental Agency Waste and Environmental Management Centre Department of International Co-operation Hanulova 5/D SK- 844 40 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Elena Bodikova</b> Head of Department Project Manager	09.03.2006
State Nature Conservancy Lazovna 10 SK-974 00 Banska Bystrica	<b>Ms Eva Medvedova*</b>	10.03.2006
Slovak Environmental Agency Tajovskeho 28 SK-975 90 Banska Bystrica	<b>Ms. Veronika Koskova*</b>	10.03.2006
Regional Public Health Institute National Reference Centre for Noise and Vibration Ruzinovska 8 SK-821 01 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Peter Zatkovic*</b>	14.03.2006
Public Health Institute Department of hygiene nutrition Trnavska 52 SK-826 45 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Katarina Kromerova*</b>	14.03.2006
Slovak Environmental Agency Tajovskeho 28 SK-97400 Banska Bystrica	<b>Mr. Vladimir Benko</b> Deputy SPO	14.03.2006
European Integration Department Ministry of Transport, Posts and Telecommunication Namestie slobody 6 SK-810 05 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Milos Prochazka*</b>	16.03.2006*
Statistical Office SR Department of Citizens' Statistics Miletičova 3 SK-824 67 Bratislava 26	<b>Ms. Ludmila Ivancikova</b>	16.03.2006
Central Control and Testing Institute for Agriculture Department of Environment and Ecological Agriculture Hanulova 9/a SK-844 29 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Juliana Schlosserova</b> Head of Department	21.03.2006
Ministry of Finance SR International Relations Department Stefanovicova 5 SK-817 02 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Matej Dostal</b> Deputy SPO	21.03.2006
Central Control and Testing Institute for Agriculture Molecular Biology Unit Hanulova 9/a SK-844 29 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Lubomir Horvath</b>	22.03.2006

Central Control and Testing Institute for Agriculture Department of Plant Protection Hanulova 9/a SK-844 29 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Lydia Fojtikova</b> Head of Department	22.03.2006
Central Control and Testing Institute for Agriculture Department of Diagnostics Hanulova 9/a SK-844 29 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Alexandra Druzkovska</b> Head of Department	22.03.2006
Customs Criminal Office Bajkalska 24 SK-824 97 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Tibor Kosik</b> Deputy Director	22.03.2006
Implementing Agency for Environmental Investment Projects Jeseniova 17 SK-833 15 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Peter Dupej*</b>	23.03.2006
Ministry of Finance SR National Fund Stefanovicova 5 SK-817 82 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Daubnerova</b> Head of Unit	23.03.2006
Tax Directorate SR International Project Management unit Nova ulica 13 SK-975 04 Banska Bystrica	<b>Mr. Lubomir Hrivnak</b>	23.03.2006
State Veterinary and Food Administration Department of Laboratory Diagnostics Botanicka 17 SK-842 13 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Zuzana Buchlerova</b>	24.03.2006
State Veterinary and Food Administration Department of Veterinary Certification Botanicka 17 SK-842 13 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Robert Hacko</b>	24.03.2006
State Veterinary and Food Administration Department of Veterinary Certification Botanicka 17 SK-842 13 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Lubomir Janiuk</b> Head of Department	24.03.2006
State Veterinary and Food Administration Botanicka 17 SK-842 13 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Lenka Macusova</b>	24.03.2006
State Veterinary and Food Administration Department of Legislation, European Integration and Foreign Relations Botanicka 17 SK-842 13 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Elena Klimkova</b>	24.03.2006
Customs Laboratory of the SCA Mileticova 42 SK-824 59 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Ladislav Bistricky</b>	27.03.2006
Office of the Government of the SR Aid Co-ordination Unit Namestie slobody 1 SK-813 70 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Milan Petro</b> Programme Manager	28.03.2006
State Veterinary and Food Administration Department of Food Hygiene Botanicka 17 SK-842 13 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Gabriela Virgalova</b>	28.03.2006

State Veterinary and Food Administration Welfare Department Botanicka 17 SK-842 13 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Milos Juras</b>	28.03.2006
State Veterinary and Food Administration Welfare Department Botanicka 17 SK-842 13 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Roman Matejcek</b>	28.03.2006
Ministry of Finance SR Division of Financial Control Methodology and Internal Audit Stefanovicova 5 SK-817 82 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Dana Dyckova</b> Director	28.03.2006
Customs Directorate ELO Department Mierova 23 SK-815 11 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Kamila Lehutova</b>	28.03.2006
Customs Directorate ELO Department Mierova 23 SK-815 11 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Alexandra Juricka</b>	28.03.2006
Statistical Office SR Department of Production Statistics Miletičova 3 SK-824 67 Bratislava 26	<b>Ms. Edita Holickova</b> Director	29.03.2006
Statistical Office SR Department of Production Statistics Miletičova 3 SK-824 67 Bratislava 26	<b>Ms. Katarina Szalayova</b>	29.03.2006
Ministry of Environment SR Biosafety Department Nam.L. Stura 1 SK-812 35 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Igor Ferencik</b> Director	29.03.2006
Office of the Government of the SR Aid Co-ordination Unit Namestie slobody 1 SK-813 70 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Magdalena Srncova</b> Programme Manager	29.03.2006
Slovak Hydro-Metrological Institute Jeseniova 17 SK-83315 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Peter Roncak</b> Director	29.03.2006
Nuclear Regulatory Authority Department of International Relations Bajkalska 27 SK-820 07 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Mikulas Turner</b> Director	29.03.2006
Nuclear Regulatory Authority Department of International Relations Bajkalska 27 SK-820 07 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Jarmila Racova</b>	29.03.2006
Ministry of Finance SR Stefanovicova 5 SK-817 82 Bratislava	<b>Mr Albin Kotian</b> Adviser to State Secretary	29.03.2006
Ministry of Environment SR Nam.L. Stura 1 SK-812 35 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Katarina Kozinkova</b>	30.03.2006
Customs Criminal Office Bajkalska 24 SK-824 97 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Beata Adameova</b>	30.03.2006

---

Customs Criminal Office Bajkalska 24 SK-824 97 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Lubomir Kovacik</b>	30.03.2006
Ministry of Finance SR Analysis of the Budget Department Stefanovicova 5 SK-817 82 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Jan Marusinec</b> Director	30.03.2006
Customs Directorate Mierova 23 SK-815 11 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Vladimir Kucerak</b>	31.03.2006
Ministry of Agriculture SR Agriculture Paying Agency Section of Direct Support Dobrovicova 12 SK-812 66 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Tibor Gunis</b> Director	07.04.2006
Ministry of Finance SR Tax and Customs Section Stefanovicova 5 SK-817 82 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Jana Balazova</b>	12.04.2006
Office of the Government of the SR Aid Co-ordination Unit Namestie slobody 1 SK-813 70 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Kornelia Cajkova</b> Programme Manager	12.04.2006

### ANNEX 3

#### List of Documents referred to in the Interim Evaluation

Name of Originator	Date	Title of Document
All ToR and TS		
MWH	10 December 2004	R/SR/INT/0204
Government of the SR/EC	2002	Financing Memorandum 2002 and Project Fiches
Government of the SR/EC	2003	Financing Memorandum 2003 and Project Fiches
Office of the Government/ACU	21 October 2005	M/SK/INT/05011/AGR
Office of the Government/ACU	14 October 2005	M/SK/INT/05011/ENV
Office of the Government/ACU	27 October 2005	M/SK/INT/05011/INT
Vehicle and Operator Services Agency UK	4 May 2004	Start-up Report TWL Road Transport (social legislation) Alignment
Research Institute for Animal Health, Italy	March 2005	Control TSE Food Safety - Twinning covenant, Quarterly Report 1 – 3, Final report
Ministry of Agriculture, Nature and Food quality, NL		Support of Food Market Surveillance - Twinning Covenant, Final Report, Quarterly Report 1 – 4
Scanagri	November 2003 April 2004	TA for Registration of Producers, Importers and exporters... - Inception report, Final report
Hessian Ministry of Environment and Consumer Protection	January 2004	TWL - Registration of Producers, Importers and exporters... - Final report
Agrarmarkt		TA in Area of PA Procedures Interlinked with IACS
	31 March 2004	Development of Structures for Implementation of IACS – Twinning Covenant, 3 <sup>rd</sup> Quarterly Report
Scanagri	April 204	Nation-wide training on IACS administering and controlling
Delloite	June 2004	Technical Assistance to the Ministry of Agriculture in Execution of Pre-Accreditation Audit in APA
S&T	September 2005	Registration of the Producers, Importers and Exporters of Plants and Plant Products in SR – Final report
European Public Law Centre, Greece	September 2005	Support of Agricultural Food chain – Inception report, Quarterly report 1, 2
Ministry of Agriculture, Food, Fisheries and Rural Affairs, France	December 2004	Veterinary and Phytosanitary Border Inspection Post Phase II Bratislava Airport BIP – Final report
European Public Law Centre, Greece	February 2005	Animal Protection during Transport – Final report
Delloite	December 2005	Training for the Employees of the Agricultural Paying Agency in the Area of Internal Audit – Incept. report
Hessian Ministry of Environment and Consumer Protection	May 2004	Enhancement of Phytosanitary Control of Plants and Plant Products – Interim, Final report
German Federal Ministry of Consumer Protection, Food and Agriculture	August 2005	Monitoring Of The Classical Swine Fever in Wild Boar – Inception, Final report
Alldeco s.r.o.	1 June 2004	Quality Assurance Plan
Alldeco s.r.o.		Decontamination of Primary Circuit - Monthly Reports, Inception Report
Registers of Scotland	October 2004	GCCA Management Training and Staff Development – Inception, Final report
Netherlands Cadastre, Land Registry and Mapping Agency	January 2006	Land Administration and Cadastre Infrastructure – Inception report, Progress report 1 - 3

Pohl Consulting and Associates	March 2004	TA for adoption of methodology for INTRASTAT – Final report, Inception and Interim reports
	April 2003	Business Requirements Analysis and technical Infrastructure
DAMACO	May 2005	Training of INTRASTAT staff
Statistics Finland	November 2004	Strengthening the Regional Statistics of the SR - TC, Benchmark Reports 1 – 8, Final report
Infostat	January 2006	Development of application SW – Inception report
NESS Slovakia	July 2005	The adopting New Acquis Communautaire for the Financial Accounts in Statistics – Inception, Interim report 1,2
Novitech	March 2005	EU SILC Statistics on income and living conditions in the SR – Inception report, Interim report 1 - 3
Federal Statistical Office of Germany	May 2005	Enforcement of new acquis in the field of statistics – iron and steel – Quarterly report 1,2
Agrifor Consult	July 2004 April 2005	The assessment and Management of Environmental Noise - Inception, Final report
ARPA Emilia Romagna	February 2005 May 2005	Strengthening the Rapid Alert System network for food safety in the SR – Inception, Final report
ECODES	July 2004 January 2005	UIBF 2002 Public Information Network on SF Utilisation - Inception, Final report
Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety, Germany	November 2005	Implementattion of the Habitats and Birds Directive in the SR – TC, Quarterly report 1 – 8, Final report
Italian Committee of the International Federation of United Cities and Local Administrations	August 2005	Implementation and Enforcement of Council Directive on Dischrges of Dangerous Substances... - TC, Quarterly report 1 – 8, Final report
Ministry of External Affairs of Greece	October 2005	Biosafety Monitoring - TC, Quarterly report 1 - 7, Final report
DFC	January 2005	TA for the preparation of the MoE for the proper implementation of SF – Inception, Interim, Final report
SHMU, DEKONTA	December 2005	Institutional Strengthening of the Management of Equipment containing PCB - Inception Report
Integrated Skills, EKOPEN	January 2006	Capacity Building for Effective Implementation of Environmental Acquis... - Inception report
Federal Environment Agency, Austria	October 2005	Institutional and Capacity Building in the Environmental Sector - TC, Quarterly report 1 - 5
Swedish Trade Council	January 2006	Implementation of Council Directive on Electric and Electronic Scrap – Inception report
Federal Environment Agency, Austria	August 2005	Biosafety Monitoring System - TC, Final report
Nuclear Regulatory Authority of the Slovak Republic	3 March 2006	Monitoring Report No. M/SR/NUC/06001 SMSC: Internal Market Development, Sectoral Component: Environment (Energy/Nuclear Safety)
Hungarian Customs and Finance Guard	August 2005	Implementation of Risk analysis techniques in the field of the customs duties for the purpose of the Excise Movement Control Systems, improvement of the tax auditing practices related to excise duties - Final Report
Agency for European Integration and Economic Development (AEI), Austria	8 July 2005	Introduction of New Act on VAT and New Acts on Excise Duties into Practice - Final Report
ASTEC GLOBAL	7 March 2005	Review of Information Systems In the Revenue,

CONSULTANCY		Treasury, Budget and Accounting Areas – Final Report
Antonin Cibulka & Peter Menhard	April 2005	Strategy Plan, Executive Summary, Advisor on Strategy for Information system, Slovak Republic Public Finance Management Reform
European Consulting Organisation	August 2005	Strengthening of the Protection of the Communities' Financial interest an the Fight against fraud – Final Report
ECODES Consortium	August 2005	Capacity Building for Evaluation of the Budget and for the Public Administration – Final Report
ECODES Consortium	August 2005	Evaluation and Monitoring Strategy for the State Budget
POHL CONSULTING & ASSOCIATES	30 July 2005	Training of Financial Controllers – Final Report
European Public Law Centre / Hellenic Customs Authorities	December 2004	Implementation of Naples II Convention
Central Financing and Contracting Unit, Ministry of Finance of the Slovak Republic	September 2005	Strengthening of the Ministry of Finance Administrative Capacity for Providing Official Development Aid – Detailed Summary Project Fiche
Central Financing and Contracting Unit, Ministry of Finance of the Slovak Republic	2005	Strengthening of the administrative capacity in the field of new customs policy implementation, support to excise legislation and administrative practices for the Slovak Customs Administration – Detailed Summary Project Fiche
Microsoft Services	12 May 2005	OIS for CCO SCA – Final Report
Customs Laboratory of the Slovak Customs Administration	June 2005	Equipment Supply to the Slovak Customs Laboratory – Technical Specification
Customs Directorate of the Slovak Republic	June 2005	Mobile X-ray Inspection System for Road Motor Vehicles and Transported Containers - Technical Specification
Hellenic Exchanges Holdings S.A.	August 2005	Software Development and Expert Advice on Early Warning System for Financial Market Authority and the National Bank of Slovakia at Slovak Republic – Final Report
Wiener Börse Consortium	August 2005	Strengthening Financial Sector Supervision Technical and Legal Assistance – Final Report
Belgian Bankers' Association	November 2005	Support to the Implementation of the Risk-Based Supervision – Quarterly Report
Customs Agency, Italy	21 February 2006	Strengthening of the administrative capacity in the field of new customs policy implementation, support to excise legislation and administrative practices for the Slovak Customs Administration – Start-up Report



## ANNEX 4

### Recommendations from previous Interim Evaluation

Interim Evaluation Report No. R/SK/INT/0204, issued 10 December 2004

Recommendation	Applied	Responsibility for Follow-up	Deadline	Remarks
Based on the co-operation agreement signed by MoA, MoE and MoH, the institutions concerned should agree on the establishment of a formal overall body that would provide global co-ordination of market surveillance in Slovakia and could serve as a contact point for the relevant European Commission Services.	Yes	MoA/MoE/ MoH	With immediate effect	Based on the negotiation agreements the National Contact Point for Rapid Alert System was established at the State Veterinary and Food Inspection (SVFI) with two local contacts: Public Health Institute on behalf of the Ministry of Health and SVFI on behalf of the Ministry of Agriculture.
Both CCTIA and SVFA should assign a person responsible for the overall management of all running PHARE activities and should allocate sufficient time resources. The MoA/PIU should initiate common preparation of documents and close guidance on implementation matters with relevant experts from beneficiary institutions.		CCTIA/SVFA/ MoA	With immediate effect	SVFA strengthened the capacities. Both institutions (SVFA, CCTIA) have different organisational structure and the overall co-ordination is solved differently. Veterinary administration has appointed one person for the overall management of all their projects. At CCTIA the main responsibility for Phare lies with the director of the institute. Moreover the MoA requested the directors of the institutes to nominate responsible persons/ project managers responsible for every component separately.
In case of common projects, CCTIA and SVFA should agree on a clear division of tasks, ensuring smooth project implementation. Both institutions should consider a revision of their training activities and should prepare training plans to make sure that priority areas are covered and no duplication occurs. Such plans could also help to justify any future request for further support (e.g. Transition Facility).		CCTIA/SVFA/ MoA	With immediate effect	SVFA prepared training plan and co-ordination was ensured. For every project there is a defined time-schedule for every activity before its implementation starts. The time-schedule is prepared by the contractor in co-operation with final beneficiaries, according to their demands. The CCTIA reported availability of the training plan as well.
For the 2003 Food Chain TWL, contract signature should be postponed until it is definitely confirmed - via successful completion of the	Yes	CFCU	With immediate effect	The Food Chain contract has been signed on 15 July 2005 after the completion of the Animal Protection project.

Animal Protection project - that the selected contractor is able to deliver the requested services within the agreed period.				
To ensure efficient use of funds for the numerous upcoming TWL projects, the CFCU should consider to carry out a cost-effectiveness analysis of the already completed 2001 TWL projects (mostly training activities) and should compare these also with training activities delivered through other instruments, notably TA.	Yes	CFCU	With immediate effect	The CFCU carefully checks the newly submitted PFs as regards the cost-efficiency in relation to expected activities and outcomes, number of participating MS experts as well as BC trainees, and duration of the activities , resp. whole project as well.
The ACU, through the regular meetings of the Deputy Prime Minister or via the Governmental Council for Regional Development, should raise the question of appropriate statistical indicators in relation to the upcoming planning of Structural Funds assistance 2007/2013. The MoCRD and other relevant bodies should clearly identify their requirements for REGSTAT and provide the Statistics Office with their specifications.	Yes	ACU/MoCRD	With immediate effect	The Statistical Office addressed the letter to the MoCRD offering the possibility to identify the indicators needed however, no feedback was obtained.
Based on the progress made with the TA project for the feasibility study, the NRA should pro-actively consider appropriate changes in the programme design and should propose corrective budgetary measures (re-allocation, PF change), in order to avoid any likely loss of funds.	Yes	NRA	mid 2005 latest	Project fiche changes were proposed and approved, including financial reallocation.
The OoG together with the MoF should request an official statement from the MoCRD on the proposed Strategy and should submit the final Strategy for official approval to the Government. In the event of absence of any firm commitment received from the MoCRD, the OoG and MoF should identify ways to make maximum use of the proposed approach.	Yes	OoG/ MoF/ MoCRD	With immediate effect	The proposal to establish National Evaluation Unit at the OoG was submitted to the Government and circulated for the comments. Objections were raised and Department for Regional Policy is preparing new version of the proposal.

## ANNEX 5

### Dissenting Views and Comments not incorporated

Party/ Comment	Reference	Action taken	Evaluators response
<b>Ministry of Agriculture</b>			
<p>2) Nowadays glasshouse provides control on the presence of quarantine harmful organisms on EU external border with Ukraine only on package wood and timber (lumber) imported from European and non-European part of Russia and third countries. In the future, glasshouse will be useful in testing of seeding potatoes on harmful organisms according to the Slovak demands (viruses, bacterial or other affection), fruit trees with reference to the certification and control of plant health state of reproductive material of fruit trees in the Slovak republic. CCTIA enlarges the amount of harmful organisms according to their demand, that are in compliance with slovak regulations harmonised with EU regulations in the field of plant sanitary and reproductive material production. Nowadays are in glasshouse executed many other needed tests – viruses of seeds potatoes, growing of indicators plants of quarantine bacterial infections of potatoes, tests of potatoes samples on the presence of bacterial infections on indicators plants, growing of herbal indicators plants for fruit trees virus testing and herbal indicators of some pathogens, growing of wooden indicators plant for testing of fruit trees viruses from seed wooden plants. See more in attachement „comments_CCTIA“.</p>	p. II, efficiency	no action taken	<p>It is obvious, that number of different tests, are being performed in the glasshouse, which serves of CCTIA testing purposes, however, the project design referred to the need to establish the glasshouse in relation to the fact that the phytosanitary control at the external border should be strengthened and performed in line with the EU requirements. As reported by the CCTIA such testing is not being performed as this sort of goods is not imported via external border because of the Commission's Decision. Provided that the beneficiary's expectations were met, than the basic misunderstanding is caused by the project design, which should have set the objectives differently.</p>
<p>3) Insufficient reporting did not influence the quality of the project implementation. Last two months after MoA interventions was reporting secured by every-day monitoring reports reported by the building authority. Almost every month were organised Steering Committee (contractors, MoA,</p>	p. II, efficiency	no action taken	<p>Insufficient reporting does not concern the glasshouse but TWL project within the same intervention.</p>

CFCU, ACU, final beneficiaries) meeting in Haniska in order to provide physical control of the glasshouse construction. All irregularities between planning documents and actual implementation were treated by addendums (7) signed and approved by every relevant part.			
4) The Project Purpose from the Project Fiche was to strengthen the phytosanitary control on the future EU external border – relevant staff adequately trained. Staff was adequately trained during the implementation of the TWL project and also during installation of every instrument during the glasshouse construction according to the contracts conditions.	p. II, efficiency	no action taken	As reported the special training of the glasshouse staff regarding phytosanitary control was not needed and provision of training within the TWL, due to the insufficient reporting (subject, number of trainees, duration etc.), can not be considered adequate.
5) In the future glasshouse will be useful in testing of seeding potatoes on harmful organisms according to the Slovak demands (viruses, bacterial or other affection), fruit wood with reference to the certification and control of sanitary state of reproductive material of fruit wood in the Slovak republic. Department of plant protection and department of seeds enlarge the amount of harmful organisms according to their demand, that are in compliance with slovak regulations harmonised with EU regulations in the field of plant sanitary and reproductive material production. Service cost are financed from the state budget item „Goods and Services“ of regional CCTIA department for region of Košice and Prešov. CCTIA requested Agrarian Policy and Budget Section of MoA to increase the state budget for the year 2006, but the request wasn't approved. Nowadays is financing of glasshouse mater of communication between MoA and CCTIA. The state budget for years 2007-2009 is still open.	p.III, sustainability	no action taken	The MoA comments confirms the fact that the sufficient financial sources for the operation of the CCTIA are not secured. CCTIA comments states that planning for 2007 – 2009 did not take into account their requirements and financing of glasshouse is not secured from new but only from existing sources (in the same amount as for 2006).
6) <b>2003 Food Chain</b> GMO laboratories covered needs of molecular biological analyses of plant commodities in agricultural testing of species, seeds, mercantile, plant goods, feedstuff, bioproducts and food entrances in SR for future 5-10 years. The testing is concerning not only GMO but also genetical labelling/description, distinguishing and identification of	p.III, sustainability	no action taken	Our comments concerns GMO testing, where regardless the source of origin, the processing of the sample is the same and taking into account the capacity of the equipment all sorts of GMO testing could be performed in one laboratory.

<p>plant species, analyses of species original and seeds cleanness, detection and identification of plant pathogens (bacteria, phytoplasm, viruses, viroids, fungus), determination of plant and animal components and harmful organisms in feed, preparation and maintenance of reference material and other applications. Capacity of equipped laboratories is relevant to real and future demands in the field of agricultural testing in the SR. Increase of molecular-biological testing duties is predicted. Original capacity of GMO laboratories was unsatisfactory and most of needed operation weren't done because of the insufficient laboratory equipment. The capacity of laboratory increased 1,5-2 times according to the PHARE project investment. The main aim was to gain technological and methodological equality/accordance with international standardise and validation methods and technologies in GMO test, to gain the EU level standard and active cooperation with ENGL. Average of sample testing is 200-300 per year, but the number will increase to 300-400 samples per year. One sample means 6-10 tests. The increase of effective utilisation will be provided by increase of growing of GMO maize (corn), control of production and other GMO testing in the SR. CCTIA GMO laboratory is specialized on plant commodities and its function doesn't overlap with other Slovak laboratories. The tests are made basically for CCTIA demands and for external applicants as producers, importers and others.</p>			
<p>7) Trainings for CCTIA users were executed during the supply of equipment from the side of contractor. Also manuals for operation were elaborated for the delivered devices, that will serve as a instruction/guide for new employees.</p>	<p>p.III, sustainability</p>	<p>no action taken</p>	<p>The reference is made to the high turn-over of people also confirmed in CCTIA where people are trained and often leave for better paid jobs.</p>
<p>8) vide ante (see above-mentioned comments - 2,5,6)</p>	<p>p. IV, Main recommendations</p>	<p>no action taken</p>	<p>See above</p>
<p><b>11) 2002 Phytosanitary Control:</b> vide ante (see above-mentioned comments - 1-5)</p>	<p>p.8, para 13</p>		<p>See above</p>
<p><b>12) 2002 Registration of Producers</b> TWL, TA, Supply of SW and HW was planned and</p>	<p>p.8, para 13</p>	<p>no action taken</p>	<p>While the projects within one programme should have the same overall objective/s, their project</p>

<p>programmed in one Project Fiche, that's why the instruments have the same objectives. TWL provided trainings of the inspectors of CCTIA as well as the producers, exporters and importers of plan and plant products on the problem of registration and issuing of plant passports in accordance with EU legislation. TWL provided trainings concerning system of registration, plant passports, production of reproductive materials and its marking by plant passport, execution of control and inspection on the spot of production and storage, execution of operation control and control of documents in order to authorise the passport delivery to the registered subjects, taking of samples of quarantine harmful organism. Moreover the study visits for inspectors in Germany enabled them to check the functioning of the system for registration (RIS). They visited diverse special institution and workplaces – workplaces for plant protection, schools, airport. The system of control and passport delivering in practise were shown them there.</p> <p>TA ensured the assistance of the contractor in order to make a proposal of technical specification of the software. All project instruments were in mutual subsidiarity according to the Project Fiche.</p>			<p>purposes cannot be the same, otherwise projects are duplicated. To avoid this situation the project design was flexibly adjusted. In comparison with the PF the individual projects were quite substantially changed and substantial differences can be found between ToR and agreed TWL proposal.</p>
<p><b>13) 2003 AGR</b> IoA were proposed in Project Fiche (PF) and PF was approved by EC, so there should not be commented matter of IoA.</p>	p.8, para 14	no action taken	Comments on project design are an indispensable part of the evaluation according to the IE methodology.
<p><b>14) 2003 Food Chain</b> Overall Objective (OO) of the project was to harmonise legal standards, regulations and institutions in the agricultural sector of the Slovak Republic with the food safety acquis... Veterinary and phytosanitary services infrastructure for the food safety was one of the project purposes. OO was ensured by the training in the field of safety of foodstuffs of animal origin (meat), residual pesticides and GMO testing that also satisfied and achieved the results identified in PF.</p>	p.8, para 14	dissenting view	In line with the intervention logic the project purpose must be achieved in the first instance and then this should contribute to the achievement of the Overall objective.
<p><b>15) 2003 Bratislava Airport BIP</b> There were two Phare projects intended on BIP – this 2003</p>	p.8, para 14	no action taken	The training of phytosanitary inspectors was provided also within other 2002 and 2003 PHARE

project for BIP on Bratislava airport and the second - project from FM 2000 (SK 0005) in Vyšné Nemecké.			projects (2002 Phytosanitary Control, 2003 Bratislava Airport BIP and 2003 Food Chain ).
<b>16) 2002 Phytosanitary Control</b> vide ante (see above-mentioned comments - 1-5, 7) CCTIA is in process of accreditation according to the STN ISO/IEC 17 025.	p.9, para 15	no action taken	See above The accreditation was expected as an output of the project.
<b>17) 2002 Registration of Producers</b> vide ante (see above-mentioned comments -12)	p.9, para 15	no action taken	See above
<b>18) AGR 2002-2003</b> Training activities matched the final beneficiaries' demands according to their present situation.	p.9, para 15	dissenting view	The repeated visits of the same people at the same place are considered redundant or the study visits were not properly organised and conducted, e.g. comparing with the SVFA inspectors
<b>19) 2003 Food Chain TWL</b> PIU MoA organised Steering Committees were participated final beneficiaries, CFCU, project leaders and project manager from the PIU MoA. Final beneficiaries were informed about all activities planned in the time-schedule, so there was no irregularity concerning implementation of the activities that were planned or that the final beneficiary wasn't informed. The only thing in the phytosanitary part of the TWL project to point out is the fact that there was change in the STE, but it was treated by Addendum and Side letter which were approved by all parts.	p.9, para 16	no action taken	The problem can be most likely attributed to the deficiencies in the internal communication within the CCTIA and already in the previous evaluation highlighted fact that one executive staff member co-ordinating PHARE activities within the CCTIA has not been appointed.
<b>20) 2002 Phytosanitary Control</b> The objectives were approved by EC during the programming phase in Project Fiche. vide ante (see above-mentioned comments - 2)	p.10, para 18	no action taken	The fact that objectives were approved by the EC does not mean that they cannot be subject of evaluation and that they are completely correct.
<b>23) 2002 Phytosanitary Control</b> vide ante (see above-mentioned comments – 2,5)	p.11, para 19	no action taken	The fact that objectives were approved by the EC does not mean that they cannot be subject of evaluation and that they are completely correct.
<b>24) 2002 Phytosanitary Control</b> vide ante (see above-mentioned comments -1)	p.25, para 58	no action taken	See above
<b>25) 2002 Phytosanitary Control</b> vide ante (see above-mentioned comments -2,3)	p.26, para 60	no action taken	See above
<b>26) 2002 Phytosanitary Control</b> vide ante (see above-mentioned comments -1)	p.26, para 62	no action taken	See above
<b>27) 2002 Phytosanitary Control</b>	p.27, para 64	no action taken	See above

vide ante (see above-mentioned comments -5)			
<b>28) 2003 Food Chain</b> vide ante (see above-mentioned comments -6)	p.27, para 64	no action taken	See above
vide ante (see above-mentioned comments – 1-7)	p.28, third line recommendations	no action taken	See above
<b>32) 2002/000-610.08 Registration of Producers</b> , See more in attachment „comments_CCTIA“.	Annex 6	no action taken	No specific comment in CCTIA response found
<b>Ministry of Finance</b>			
Having taken into the consideration the fact, that the Project Leader of the project <u>Training Focused on Handling Informants</u> , Mr Lubomir Kovacik of the Customs Criminal Office was also interviewed, we would like to know whether the project is not going to be evaluated. Commencement of the project implementation has started in the same time as the “Strengthening of the Administrative Capacity of SCA” project.		no action taken	As the project was moved from PHARE to Transition Facility it will be evaluated as TF project.



## ANNEX 6

### Annex to Chapter 1 Sectoral Background and Scope of the Evaluation

#### Component 1 – Agriculture (AGR)

##### **2002-610.05 Control TSE (Transmissible Spongiform Encephalopathy) – Food Safety**

- The TW project focused on the screening and eradication of TSE. A number of missions were undertaken to review the ‘state of art’ of SVFA and other concerned laboratories in terms of equipment needs, organisation, etc. Training sessions were organised on brain sampling, neuropathology, immunohistochemistry, microscopic detection of animal components in animal feedings and genotyping, and numerous procedural aspects were explained and demonstrated. As the twinning experts had a profound knowledge and expertise on TSE, very helpful theoretical and practical advice was provided and apart from full alignment of applied methodologies some new examination methods on TSE and feedstuff were also introduced. Based on the TW recommendations SVFA laboratory in Zvolen became the National Reference Centre.
- The Prionic tests that have been purchased and supplied. Due to the reduction of animals the number of required tests decreased and the second instalment of test supply was postponed. Current screening is taking place in line with EU requirements. EC decided to reimburse the costs of test for all member states while additional expenditures are covered from the state budget.

##### **2002/0000-610.06 Development of IACS (Integrated Administrative and Control System)**

- Development of structures for the implementation of IACS (TW) & Supply of IT equipment for the implementation of IACS – SW&HW: The TW assisted with the introduction of IACS at the newly established APA. The TW started at the time when the decision on a full or simplified IACS scheme was still pending. Then, the newly adopted Directive enabled the establishment of the simplified system. The TW dealt with legal issues – preparation of proposal on adjustments of national law, recruitment plans and job descriptions, preparation of the manual for ‘on-the-spot-control’ as well as training. The TW contractor closely co-operated with the company preparing the IS for IACS. The system made operational on 1 May 2004 and APA was officially accredited 16 November 2004. APA is fully operational, with some 600 staff members organised in 18 regional and district offices, and headquarters.
- Pre-accreditation Audit of APA: The MoA asked for TA to manage the necessary accreditation process, however, ToR preparation was delayed. The tender had to be repeated because of a lack of offers and a last-minute decision had to be taken by European Commission Representation (ECR) to enable the pre-accreditation of APA. Pre-accreditation was granted 15 June 2004.

- Assistance to IACS: To ensure full operations of APA from the date of the accession onwards, TWL support was also needed for the APA procedures linked with IACS. TW consultations were provided on accounting methods in accordance with international standards, on harmonisation of accounting SW to IACS, reporting system in the EU, on risk analysis and on harmonisation of IT security documentation with relevant standards, following findings of the audit.
- Training on IACS Administration and Controlling: The framework contract delivered three types of training activities: (i) staff of APA regional offices was trained on how to conduct on-the-spot-control; (ii) an institution was identified (Slovak Chamber of Agriculture) and its staff were trained on how to provide assistance to farmers on application-related matters; (iii) a series of training seminars (16) was conducted to explain farmers (1,800 participants) how to apply for EAGGF support. Training for Chamber's staff was shortened due to the time pressure and an additional seminar was conducted for internal audit staff of APA. If required training is provided by APA staff mostly based on the request of the MoA, its training institution or Agriculture Chamber.

The established network with the former contractors and officially organised annual meetings of APA representatives provide sufficient forum to discuss occurred problems. The internal and external controls and audits are rather excessive. For the duration of one year, there were two weeks during the holiday period when no such an exercise was taking place.

#### **2002/000-610.07 Enhancement of Phytosanitary Controls of Plants and Plant Products**

- Training Programmes: The project fiche (PF) sets out an objective referring to the strengthening of the phytosanitary control on the future EU external borders. The original design (ToR) of this TWL project referred to processing and assistance in drafting the technical specification of the quarantine glasshouse project, training of experts responsible for its operations and training of phytosanitary experts on how to run the glasshouse and on laboratory diagnosis. Eventually no special training for the glasshouse staff was needed, some seminars and six study tours took place. The first two tours were organised with an aim to clarify technical details needed for the specification of the glasshouse. Two missions of TWL short-term experts to the future location of the glasshouse took place. The rest of internships was focused on phyto-pathological problems of vineyards, Border Inspection Post (BIP) operation, general and special diagnostics. Seminars were provided to the phytosanitary inspectors (including BIP staff). There were study tours for visiting operational glasshouses in another country. Training was focused on how to build an appropriate glasshouse in accordance with EU demands and local conditions. Special training focused on stipulating the technical specification of the glasshouse. The final report refers to numerous meetings, preparatory activities before study tours and their subsequent evaluation. The project provided assistance for the improvement of the applied methodologies. For a period of four months this project took place simultaneously with the TWL on Registration, performed by the same contractor.

- Construction of Quarantine Glasshouse/Equipment: The construction works are completed and glasshouse is fully operational. All service activities (heating, shadowing, humidity etc.) are fully automatic. The biological tests are performed in line with the original specification of this workplace on identification of virus and bacteria diseases of potatoes.

### **2002/000-610.08 Registration of Producers, Importers and Exporters of Plants and Plant Products**

- Establishment of Registration System: The TWL was supposed to elaborate proposals for the registration system and related activities, and to deliver training programme for the CCTIA staff, phytoinspectors and information seminars for producers. The TWL final report mentioned four seminars delivered to inspectors and BIP staff related to passports and three study tours conducted for CCTIA staff. Reference is also made to the specification of IT for registration and passports duplicating TA efforts. Based on the beneficiary feedback the seminars provided information on the operation of the registration system in Hessen and the same information was delivered for the SW development activities while the local requirements were not taken into account. Although the final report of TWL prepared in January 2004 states that registration system will be operational by the date of accession it had to be clear that that is not realistic as the HW and SW were not in place. The final report also states the priority of the project as to establish and to bring to usage the system of plant passports in accordance with EU standards, which was not achieved by the project activities. The database is gradually completed according to the system itself and system users. The number of trained staff and users is 195. 48 workstations are connected to the RIS (except 7 regional stations due to lack of HW equipment).
- Upgrade of IT system: The equipment needed to establish operational network among 36 regional workplaces and headquarters of CCTIA to run the registration system was purchased and installed. It comprised server, SW licences, networking and PCs. The equipment is fully utilised.
- TA to Draft Technical Specification (TS) for Upgrade: A FWC had nearly identical objectives and provided similar assistance as the TWL project but eventually it proved to be more helpful and assessed the new registration system by comparing it with the EU registration requirements, resulting in a number of recommendations. The other part of the TA project was dedicated to the preparation of the TS for the development of the computerised recording system. The SW was developed and pilot tested. The verified version was submitted for CCTIA use in July 2005. The system enables the registration of controls (samples, results) and serves registration purposes and provision of certificates. Several CCTIA departments and workplaces are using the registration system with the restricted access. Currently out of overall more than 2000 registered subjects, some 1400 are already loaded and mistakes are still being eliminated. Overall number of phyto-inspectors working at the workplaces all over the country and dealing with control activities is 60 plus 11 BIP inspectors.

### **2003-004-995-03-02 Support of Agriculture Food Chain in Comprehensive Food Safety Policy**

- Support of Agriculture Food Chain in Comprehensive Food Safety Policy (TWL):  
The TWL contract focused on the training of veterinary staff dealing with food safety/meat, training of CCTIA staff in the area of pesticide residues, upgrading of laboratory equipment for pesticide residues and GMO testing.  
The phytosanitary training activities comprised study trip in Udine for 5 CCTIA staff dealing with diagnostics of plant pathogens and GMO tests for agricultural products; and one-week mission of Greek specialists at CCTIA advising on simplification of applied laboratory methods on pesticide residues and establishment of processes and procedures for accreditation of the laboratory. GMO laboratory is already registered as NRL but also needs accreditation. New rapid quantitative and qualitative methods of food pathogens, and fungal and bacterial diseases of plants are being introduced.  
The veterinary part was originally focused on the assessment procedures for the inspectors in compliance with the EU requirements after accession. Due to the long gap between the preparation and the implementation, the actual training focused on the meat inspection in relation to the new EU legislation. As planned about 160 inspectors dealing with slaughterhouses were trained. Basic information on new legislation was provided. Practical training abroad envisaged for 20 inspectors had to be reduced to four as the SVFA was not in a position to reimburse travel expenditures for originally planned number of participants.
- Supply of Laboratory Equipment: The equipment was procured for two CCTIA laboratories. One part of the equipment comprising mostly standard facilities was delivered earlier, the second part consisting of high-tech analytical machines (gas and liquid chromatographs, DNA analyser, Real-Time qualitative PCR detection system, etc.) is just being installed and staff trained. It will serve determination of pesticides residues in the soil and quality control of pesticides as such. This new equipment will substantially improve the speed and comfort of analyses but at the same time its capacity far exceeds the needs of the CCTIA. The CCTIA laboratory is the only in the country performing this type of analyses (residues, pesticides). GMO laboratory is one of the three in the country and deals specifically with plant commodities, seeds, plant products and feedstuff.

### **2003-004-995-03-03 Veterinary and Phytosanitary Border Inspection Posts (BIP) – II. Phase (Bratislava Airport BIP)**

- TWL - Veterinary and Phytosanitary BIPs training was carried out for the veterinary and phytosanitary inspectors in order to familiarise them with standard proceedings. As regards phytosanitary part majority of training was focused on the wood and wood packaging, which is the most commonly imported item from Ukraine. Very practical and helpful training was conducted on other commodities and very helpful advice was provided on the work with the legislation. Two organised study visits in France enabled to gain practical experience in inspection activities (sampling, analyses) at the airport and sea-port. Accreditation of BIPs is being prepared but number of important questions has to be resolved, yet.

The veterinary training included five training sessions in the country. These were focused on the proceedings how to perform veterinary controls including legislation and import conditions regarding commodities and countries of origin. Practical training was carried out during study trip in France where the whole administration and management was observed. The training was found very helpful as the whole system was newly introduced, administration of documents and records was newly built and all activities are now performed directly at BIP. In total there are 13 veterinary inspectors at BIPs. BIPs were approved through the standard procedure by the EC and included into the European network. The veterinary facilities are fully equipped and operational. Approval was granted for the operation of BIP with the limit of 500 consignments, the current operation covers half of the limit.

- Supply of Equipment: Having equipped BIPs at railways and road crossing-external border with the help of PHARE, the BIP at Bratislava airport followed. The standard equipment needed for the operation of BIP was purchased and part of it was delivered to CCTIA laboratories. Part of the equipment is not installed as the CCTIA staff is currently located in the rented offices at the airport, which was recently privatised and the provision of offices will be subject of negotiations. So far, the number of controls/phyto-inspections is very limited as the airport serves for transport of persons. The supply of equipment was provided to veterinary part in order to secure standard office facilities and the connection to and operation within the TRACES system. As mentioned above the veterinary part is fully operational without any limitations.

#### **2003-004-995-03-04 Animal Protection during Transport**

Although the system was already introduced, there was a need to confirm its correct use in particular whether the reporting obligations are correctly performed and if the right sequence of procedures is ensured. After initial six months break due to unreceived advance payment, the contractor commenced the activities. The newly introduced system was presented and reviewed. The recommended training of BIP inspectors took place in accordance with plan and proposal on protection of animals at slaughterhouses is a subject of proposed TF project. The accompanying TA project and equipment supply enabled the establishment of fully operational system, which enables to enter the record on control (checking documentation, health status of animals, number, conditions etc.), verification of data validity towards TRACES in case of transit of animals, or towards central evidence for in-the-country transport. Trainers were trained in each region to be able to provide training for the transporters and others relevant partners. Two study trips took place in Greece to see the operation of their control system. The twinning partner highly appreciated operation of the identification of animal, which works on-line.

#### **2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF**

- Monitoring of Classical Swine Fever (CSF) in Wild Boar: The TWL project focused on the census of wild boar population, alignment of disease control measures, improvement of disease monitoring and preparation of a proposal for vaccination of wild boars. The applied census methodology was reviewed and agreed. The vaccination against CSF in population of domestic pigs was finished in December 2000 and replaced in compliance with the EU legal requirements by the

vaccination of wild boar, which is a frequent source of disease. This new method of vaccination was introduced and applied and depending of the frequency of occurrence should be carried out annually. In co-operation with the twinning partners the eradication and vaccination plans were prepared and approved by the EC, which provides contributions for vaccination. The twinning partners contributed also to the TV programme for hunters and presented the project activities. The project was also informally introduced to Hungarian partners due to the occurrence of the disease in the bordering region.

- Audit Assistance to APA in execution of Audit of Guarantee Section in APA: The project is focused on the improvement of qualification for 11 staff members of the Internal Audit Unit (IAU) of APA in the area of internal auditing in accordance with legislation of the European Communities. On-the-job training will take place in order to improve procedures and performance of the auditors. Based on the long-term experience the contactor should easily identify weaknesses and the most common mistakes in auditing procedures.
- Strengthening of the Rapid Alert System (RAS) network for food safety: The TWL project was successfully completed. Training activities and seminars were delivered as planned and in total 160 staff members dealing directly with the RAS from both health and agriculture area are familiar with the new legal framework. Specific attention was paid to risk analyses in particular for such cases where no limits are set in the Directives. Special methodological guidelines was produced and made available to all relevant people as a binding guide assisting the risk assessment. The final conference and press conference took place to promote project activities.

## **Component 2 – Cadastre and Statistics (CAD&STA)**

### **2003-004-995-02-01 Land Administration and Cadastre Infrastructure**

- GCCA Management Training and Staff Development was completed and apart from delivered training sessions, Human resource development plan for the GCCA was elaborated. Most of the ideas included in the plan are determined in the Civil Service Act and therefore no special attention was paid to this document. Majority of trained trainers are delivering technical training to the GCCA staff all over the country.
- TA project is on-going and comprises (i) an institution building part focusing on the need to transform the GCCA from a rather technical organisation towards a client-driven provider of information services, and (ii) a system integration part dealing with SW development and (iii) related training activities.  
(i) the report on Strategy development, Marketing and Finance were produced and discussed, however, for the time being the political will is still obviously missing to introduce any substantial changes in the way of operation and system of financing of GCCA. Mapping of users requirements on information (type, quantity) was carried out and seminars were organised to discuss the subject with other relevant state administration bodies. Recommendations and proposals for speeding up the process of land title consolidation were also submitted to the GCCA. Based on the recommendations IT Departments were created at all GCCA workplaces. Automatic back-up is secured and IT phone connection is operational.

(ii) The activities on development of SW have commenced and represent follow up of previous GCCA activities that should enable connection of graphical and numerical information. All GCCA workplaces should be unified and new SW should eventually exclude all mistakes (duplicated ownership, registration of incomplete records. etc).

(iii) Training needs analysis was completed, five study tours to Germany/Netherlands, Lithuania, Finland, Spain and Netherlands took place and three training course on financial management, strategic planning and information technology related to the Institutional Building component were organised. The vocational training related to the system integration component are being organised currently. Three workshops on Strategy Development, Marketing and Finance, National Spatial Data Infrastructure took place as well.

- The activities are complemented by SW and HW supply. The supply contracts were signed for the delivery of hardware, Oracle licence and graphical system to be delivered to GCCA offices all over the country. The foreseen supply of GPS stations, which was tendered in the deadline, eventually did not manage to fit into the tight time schedule as the competing companies raised some objections and the time frame of the tendering exceeded the commitment deadline. The allocation was thus lost.

#### **2002/000-610.09 Implementation of INTRASTAT – SK System**

- TA to ToR and TS Preparation: A FWC assisted with the preparation of ToR and technical specifications in order to enable the subsequent tendering of other 2002 STA projects.
- TA: Another FWC focused on the methodologies that are obligatory to comply with EUROSTAT requirements.
- TA to SW Development and Testing of Data Processing & Supply of Technical Equipment for INTRASTAT Administrative Structure (IAS): The originally planned TW had to be converted into a TA project. Therefore, contracting took place only in December 2003 while it was clear that the system had to be operational by 1 May 2004. The efforts on both, contractor's and beneficiary side, enabled to complete the system by that date. However, it was not possible to ensure full operation in such a short time and therefore the data were processed partly manually. Nevertheless gradually the full operation of the system was ensured and currently it works without any problems. The new system includes also EXTRASTAT module – covering trade with the third countries.
- Training of IAS staff: The aim of the project was to instruct the representatives of the entrepreneurs and state administrations as the providers of statistical information. This project was delivering training to the staff of the SOSR, CUS and tax offices, and importers/ exporters. Seminars increased knowledge on statistical INTRASTAT-SK system and included also quality aspect of the collected information. In relation to INTRASTAT also VAT, terms of delivery and product coding was discussed. In comparison with the original intention to train some 270 – 350 people, total number of trainees was 423. Majority of trainees was from so called reporting units, regularly providing information. Part of the training was

devoted to future trainers and help-desk staff, and to the management of the statistics, customs and tax administration.

### **2002/000-610.10 Strengthening of Regional Statistics – REGSTAT**

- TW & Equipment supply: The original requirements of EUROSTAT as well as changes introduced by the public administration reform together with the need to communicate statistical data for clients inside and outside of the public bodies emphasised by the introduction of SF have resulted in the REGSTAT programme. The TW project defined the overall architecture of the regional statistical database – REGSTAT, defined its content, specified the primary regional breakdowns for different statistical branches and regional indicators, which should be included in the system to monitor the regional socio-economic development of the country. The twinning provided recommendations on the operational platform and SW tools, which were subsequently adapted to local conditions. The specification of the structure and content of the statistical data, indicators and breakdowns was carried out. REGSTAT was integrated into the Automated Statistics Information System. Regional data matrices in accordance with the European Regional Statistics Reference Guide (regularly updated) were specified and currently the database comprises 728 indicators stored in 198 matrices. The specified equipment was delivered, installed and is being used.
- TA: The project developed SW tool for the regional database and recommended application SW specifically developed for statistics, for a user-friendly access to the data for external users was purchased. The system which was developed was assessed by the EUROSTAT as one of the best systems in the new member states and provides flexible tool enabling creation of linkages among various selected data according to the different statistical regions etc. and provides presentation tools (tables and charts) for these data. Up to now out of totally planned 219 people, 134 were trained (42 from regions).

### **2003-004-995-03-05 Enforcement of New *Acquis* in the Field of Statistics**

The individual activities are divided into three areas: (i) data processing system for financial accounts and balance sheets, (ii) statistics of income and living conditions and (iii) a new information system for iron and steel statistics.

- (i) Two TA contracts were signed to assist financial accounts area. One TA project is building an information system for collecting and using the data from different administrative sources with the purpose of creating statistics of the financial accounts in harmony with the requirements of the European System of Accounting. The initial work focused mainly on the establishment of the communication channels with the individual institutions. These linkages were formally established by signing official agreements as well as technically. Data can be thus provided directly by the concerned institutions to the SOSR and vice versa. The first data have been processed. The preparation of quarterly financial accounts for public administration was tested and annual financial accounts for all sectors should be processed soon. The main output of the information system will be the central database of the source data from different administrative sources relevant to the creation of the financial accounts. The parallel TA contract is creating SW enabling interconnection of the



financial and non-financial accounts and identifying inconsistency cases. Eventually the current manual processing of data should be replaced, which would lead to 80% saving of manual work, reduce mistakes, enable to comply with the EUROSTAT timelines and reduce the problems linked with the high turn-over of staff.

(ii) The project on Statistics of Income and Living Conditions (SILC) is based on the special requirements of EUROSTAT office, which launched four-year statistical survey on poverty followed through 216 indicators. The statistical survey is obligatory for all member states and the methodologically processed data have to be reported to EUROSTAT. The project performed detailed analysis of the Regulations and prepared proposals of questionnaires for the pilot processing, methodology related to questionnaires, guidelines for interviewers, identified the sample of households and carried out the pilot survey. The software system was developed and tested, further pilot testing should continue with the monitoring longitudinal variables to acquire data on income structure and data on expenses for social protection in accordance with the methodology. The outputs are immediately transferred into results and real survey is taking place following 2 -3 months period from pilots in order to deliver obligatory data to EUROSTAT in time.

(iii) Based on the new regulation of EC, the provision of data on iron and steel statistics became obligatory. To comply with this requirement the Department of Production Statistics initiated the project. Initial needs analysis took place and the best identified institution was contacted to identify the scope of the work. As the tendering process took longer than envisaged and the reporting obligation providing data for 2003 and 2004 had to be submitted, these data were processed before the project start. The partners established excellent co-operation and prepared new methodology, new user-friendly electronic form for reporting units and technical documentation for SW. Subsequently SW was developed and already processed data were loaded into the system to test its operation. The new methodology including the IT processing is thus completed and ready to process data as required (until 2009). Although the survey includes nearly 300 units, only five companies meet the selection indicators of EUROSTAT and their data are processed and reported.

### **Component 3 – Energy and Transport (ENE&TRA)**

#### **2002/000-632.09 Decontamination of the Bohunice NPAA-1 Primary Circuit**

Due to a number of accidents in the nuclear power plant 1 of Jaslovské Bohunice its operations had to be stopped in 1977. The decontamination of the power plant commenced only 20 years after and should be completed by 2030. A local company specialised in this service area was contracted to perform the job. The project started in May 2004 with measurements and mapping of contamination and continued with the removal of the reactor and decontamination of the primary circuit. The project was implemented according to the approved time schedule and developed the technical project of pre-dismantling decontamination of the specific parts of nuclear power plant A-1 primary circuit, including technical methods, economic and safety assessment.

**2003/5812.07.01 Technical Support to SR in Establishing the National Agency for Disposal of Radioactive Waste**

The purpose of the project is to improve national radioactive waste and spent fuel management infrastructure to reach the status analogous to the EU (establishing the national agency for disposal of radioactive waste). Project should assist with definition and justification of the responsibilities of the agency. This project consists of two parts, institutional and investment. The contracts were signed and activities commenced. The contractor presented a time schedule of realization for both parts of the project. The comparative study of the national radioactive waste and spent fuel management conditions (legislative, financing.) in selected countries of EU were prepared and sent to beneficiary in January. The delivery of the equipment (supply of gamma scanner for national laboratory to verify the character of packed forms radioactive waste) is expected in August 2006.

**2003-995-01-04 UIBF Road Transport (Social Legislation) Alignment**

The project assisted the Ministry of Transport, Posts and Telecommunications (MoTPT) with the preparation of primary and secondary legislation in the area of social legislation – namely the use of digital tachographs. As the new EU directives should come into force only now, the national legislation is in the approval process. The suggested new organisational structure, moving control and reporting obligation under one sector has not been politically supported. The control tasks will be performed by the Labour Inspection in co-operation with the police. These bodies will be responsible for the reporting obligation towards EC. The follow-up of the project – training activities resulting from needs analysis should be performed soon and will concern mainly the staff of the above mentioned control bodies.

**Component 4 – Environment (ENV)****2002/000-610.16 Discharge of Dangerous Substances**

The TW dealt with the implementation of the EU Directive on pollution caused by dangerous substances discharged into water. The twinning partner assisted with the inventory of pollution sources and identified the list of 200 – 300 pollutants. In total some 700 substances were identified and finally the number of List II substances specific for SR was reduced to 59 (this should be reviewed in five years cycle). The database was created. Limits were identified at the source and in the water, and production processes were reviewed, in close co-operation with the industrial companies, to assess their contribution for the pollution. National monitoring system was established and legal measures were adopted to eliminate and reduce dangerous substances. Guidelines for the permitting process were prepared and training took place for relevant public authorities and industry representatives. The supply contract provided necessary equipment for the National Reference Laboratory performing water analysis and new methodologies were introduced. All the permits were issued. Close co-operation was established with the TW project on IPPC. The performance of the regional and local environmental offices was identified as the weakest point of the enforcement process.

### **2002/000.610.17 Integrated Prevention and Pollution Control (IPPC)**

At the time of the project implementation, the original scope of the project set out in the PF did not fully reflect the actual needs. Therefore activities were slightly modified and adjusted to reflect the actual situation and division of competencies. The TW project was completed and dealt mainly with the development of appropriate databases for recording and management of data on IPPC, development of national pollution monitoring and emission register for the categories of industrial activities and with the reporting obligations related to IPPC towards EU and other international institutions. Supply of complementary laboratory equipment for the mobile IPPC laboratory, HW and SW and equipment for the training centre took place. To disseminate the knowledge and project outputs and exchange views with other foreign experts the final conference was successfully organised. In general, the project delivered expected benchmarks. The legal framework in the country exists and is compliant with EU Directives, all the necessary information are being monitored, collected and processed. Nevertheless, the leading role of the MoE in this process was missing, the division of tasks is on one side too scattered (SEA, SEI, SHMU, Research institute...) and on the other side assigns two contradictory functions to the same institution (SEI – issuing permits and control task).

### **2002/000.610.18 Conservation of Natural Habitats**

The programme focused on Training of Natura 2000 co-ordinators, provision of HW and SW for 25 branch offices of SNC, elaboration of 10 pilot management plans and preparation of information material for Natura 2000 sites and creation of homepage. The twinning was completed and all outputs were delivered. Its main benefit was contribution to the methodology for the preparation of management plans, provision of information on NATURA 2000 network<sup>8</sup> and direct exchange of experience with foreign experts. Preparation of the management plans was jeopardised by the absence of the data because the state budget did not provide sufficient sources to secure their collection. German bi-lateral project was initiated, which enabled provision of missing data and the preparation of pilot management plans could be thus completed. The HW was purchased and installed at the SNC and its offices (IT and network, GIS). Although these offices are still not fully equipped, it has substantially improved the level of technical equipment. The delivered IT equipment is currently subject of discussion with the CFCU as it was frequently out of order. SW packages and licences were also delivered together with the complementary training. The TA was contracted for publishing of the materials. Soft-skills training (presentation, negotiation skills) were identified as badly needed and were highly appreciated by the participants.

### **2002/000-610.02 UIBF**

- The Public Information Network on SF Utilisation project was designed with an aim to increase the awareness on SF and to prepare the Slovak beneficiaries for the utilisation of SF in the environmental sector. The activities were focused on the training of SEA regional staff – consultants and started with training needs analysis for the group of 16 selected consultants. The information network was built on the originally existing structure of SEA's regional offices. The group of consultants was trained (as

---

<sup>8</sup> The proposal of areas to be included into Natura 2000 network submitted to EC in May 2004 involved 38 protected bird area and 382 habitats.

trainers) during the project but additional training was provided within other PHARE projects as well as from TA of SF sources. The network of 10 Regional Environmental Advisory and Information Centres is operational all over the country. Most of the trainees are still in their consultancy positions. Consultants are responsible for the promotion activities in relation to SF, provide consultancy services, assist with the project preparation and deal with the provision of technical services such as project management, environmental impact assessment etc. They also carry out co-ordination function in the respective regions – identify and advice on possible common projects of neighbouring municipalities and are involved in the preparatory activities for the new upcoming cycle 2007-2013. The internal manual on SF, which was prepared by the project, serves as a training manual/guideline for the new staff. The proposed model of the information system has not been implemented as it required substantial financial sources, which were not available. Moreover, the central monitoring system was established within the CSF department. Existing Information system is still able to provide required linkages (among Regional Environmental Advisory and Information Centres) and information.

- The revised purpose of the TA project MoE Preparation for SF Implementation was to review and improve internal manuals of implementation procedures under the Managing Authority and Paying Authority, so that the Implementing Agency for Environmental Investment Projects (IAEIP) is properly prepared for SF implementation. Due to the delays in the project approval the originally intended preparation of manuals did not take place as these were already prepared and thus the contractor's task was to review them. Also planned simulation exercise was not found appropriate as the implementation of SF projects was not sufficiently advanced. A new set of tasks was then agreed and a guide on the eligible costs for final beneficiaries was prepared and proved to be helpful. Two-day training workshop for the Agency staff was carried out and the report on the N+2 rule was submitted. The Agency is currently performing its task without any substantial problems. Commitment rate of SF allocation is high and for the concerned measures the absorption capacity potential is higher than current provision.
- Assessment and Management of Environmental Noise: The project was completed. The legal framework is in place and based on the methodological guidelines and knowledge delivered, the concerned bodies (Municipal Council Bratislava, Slovak Road Administration, highway and airport authorities) are preparing noise maps, which should be submitted to the Public Health Institute by July 2007. This Institute as the NRC will report to the Commission Services. Final press-conference on the project achievements was organised.

### **2003-004-995-03-16 Institutional and Capacity Building in the ENV Sector**

This programme involves all key ENV institutions and primarily focuses on improving access to data and information to the staff to avoid duplication of databases in order to improve the quality of work and create the conditions necessary to establish a system for the preparation of reports for various groups of users, e.g. European Commission, European Environment Agency and domestic users. The supply part upgraded SHMI sampling and analytical equipment and improved air pollution monitoring. The data flow schemes at SHMI and SEA were reviewed and updating of Slovak reporting obligations

was completed. Overall 180 reporting obligations were identified at the European level (77 to EC and 9 to EEA). Duplications were identified and division of task and responsibilities was clarified. A database of reporting obligations was created. The National Focal Point was established together with the network of NRC ensuring quality and timely delivery of data for reporting. Training was provided to NRCs, staff of SEA and SEI. The IS is being created for the SEI, which was missing such a system and will involve the area of air, water, waste and nature protection. The system will also enable connection with other MoE institutions.

### **2003-004-995-03-17 Biosafety Monitoring System (Genetically Modified Organisms – GMO)**

The TW project delivered several workshops on GMO for the concerned ministries, prepared inspection manuals and inspection is performed by SEI in Bratislava and Banska Bystrica (11 inspectors for 19 users). The agreement was reached that there will be three GMO laboratories established in the country: CCTIA in Bratislava dealing with seeds and agri-food products, SVFA in Dolny Kubin dealing with food and feedstuff of animal origin (which was already accredited) and Slovak Academy of Science (SAS) – newly established laboratory with responsibility for micro organisms. The planned accreditation process could not proceed as envisaged because the laboratory equipment was delivered only after the project completion. Nevertheless the new methodologies were introduced and SAS staff was trained during study visits. The proposal for expected GMO database was prepared but its development was to be funded from other sources, which has not taken place, yet. Final workshop was organised with an aim to raise public awareness and information brochure was produced. The equipment supply was provided for SAS laboratory.

### **2003-0004-995-03-18 Implementation of Council Directives on Electric and Electronic Scrap**

This Twinning was originally designed with an aim to prepare draft of relevant legislation, set up the system to provide the treatment of waste from electric and electronic equipment, set up collective systems and draw register of producers/importers. The project was unsuccessfully tendered and the only proposal had to be refused. In the meantime the beneficiary institution had changed from the MoE to SEA and the PF had to be rewritten. The twinning was eventually contracted in the deadline with the Swedish Trade Council. Due to the encountered delays most of the originally planned activities had to be in place before the start of the project and the project activities had to be modified. The necessary legislation was already adopted therefore the project will focus on its compliance and will provide proposals for the amendments if needed. Also the collective systems and treatment of waste are already operating. The project should compare their operation with the systems operating in other countries and propose the optimisation using Best Available Techniques for the scrap processing and recycling. A register of all producers/importers of electric and electronic equipment was also established and the project's task is now to develop IS which will serve for collection of data on scrap and following how the obligatory limits are being fulfilled. It should provide link to the IS of collective systems. Current register contains some 500 producers (for 10 categories of electric and electronic scrap and numerous sorts). The planned

training activities for SEA, producers' staff and scrap processing companies should ensure correct provision of data for reporting obligations. Promotion of project activities should be ensured via national workshop and information package provided on the web pages.

#### **2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF**

- Capacity Building for ENV Investment Projects is assisting the MoE to determine its role in possible public-private partnership (PPP) projects and provide some information on state aid provision. Three seminars were organised on PPP and the last one will deal with state aid and training material will be provided as manual. Topics for ad-hoc consultations were identified and screening of activities in the area of waste management to select the most appropriate activity for PPP is planned. The conclusions and recommendations should be provided in the form of the report and will be presented at the final two-day workshop.
- The project Management of Equipment Containing PCB for the SEA is addressing obligations related to the Council Directive on the disposal of polychlorinated biphenyls and polychlorinated tetra phenyls (PCB/PCT). The project is assisting the establishment of an inventory and management of equipment containing PCB in the SR and reporting to the EC. The circulation of proposal was not successful in three rounds and eventually Slovak institution also subordinated to the MoE was selected as the twinning partner. The required analyses of the existing institutional and legal set up were elaborated and development of the IS is progressing. The established database should enable complete inventory of the equipment containing PCB. Its full de-contamination should be completed by 2010. The study visits in the Czech Republic and Austria provided the knowledge on the implementation of the Directive in these countries moreover the Czech producer provided technical specification of the equipment enabling e.g. the estimation of the content of PCB in particular types of equipment. Training activities will take place in three regions to make the staff of regional and local offices of SEA, Energy inspections and other concerned bodies familiar with their tasks and duties. The recommendations improving the information flows, legal framework and division of tasks among concerned institutions should be provided in the final report.

#### **Component 5 – Finance, Banking and Customs (FIN/BNK/CUS)**

##### **2002/000-610.04 Financial Sector Supervision,**

This programme for the Financial Market Authority (FMA) and the National Bank of Slovakia (NBS) aims at the development of procedures and technologies for integrated market operation control in banking, financial and insurance transactions. The programme - originally planned as a two-year TW was implemented as a TA under two separated projects:

- Strengthening Financial Sector Supervision -TA addressed institution building support to the FMA, expert and legal advice to the NBS/banking supervision and training.

- SW Development and Expert Advice on Early Warning System for FMA and the NBS: The second project developed IS for the FMA, covering also SW for an early warning system for capital market and insurance industry, together with enhancement of the NBS on-site supervision IS and risk rating system for banks.

### **2003-0004-995-03-01 Support to the Implementation of Risk-based Supervision**

This programme for NBS and FMA, combining TW and SW development, intends to establish risk-based supervision for the capital and insurance market in Slovakia, together with support in implementing the New Capital Accord Basel II.. Contractor together with both beneficiaries carried out evaluation of requirements and agreed upon their prioritisation. In relation to current needs of the banking supervision contractor was asked to evaluate capital adequacy calculation, to evaluate internal credit risk and operational risks management procedures used by banks, to evaluate currently used on-site supervision procedures and monitoring of the market discipline and to provide consultations concerning transposition from Basel I to Basel II. In relation to current needs of the supervision of capital market, insurance and pension funds contractor agreed on forthcoming activities which will further developed results achieved in former project. The key element will remain continuing training of regulators in specific seminars.

#### Design of SW for the Capital Market Supervision

Objective of the project is development of the SW application for the surveillance over the capital market on daily basis and in e-form, evaluation and storing of data received from capital market participants supervised by the NBS. Integral part of the supply is SW installation and testing, providing all related documentation and training of the programme users, developers and technicians.

### **2002-000-610.20 Information System for CUS (Law Enforcement)**

This programme comprised TA and equipment supply focusing on IS development enabling an exchange of computer processed operative information and data between the EU and Slovakia, among the SCA and its partner units in the SR. Supply of HW and SW was completed in March 2004 and the complementary training finished by the end of June 2004.

### **2003-004-995-03-25 Equipment Supply to the Slovak CUS Laboratory**

The EU accession process and analysis of the Regular Report of the European Commission result in the need of the Slovak Customs to complete the Customs Laboratory to become an adequate and efficient work place capable of accomplishing tasks ensuing from the implementation of the Acquis. Programme will provide Customs Directorate with equipment that enables determination of origin authenticity of goods covered by the customs tariff chapter on agricultural products and tobacco and support the detection of tax evasions and fraud in trade with agricultural commodities. The combination of the two instruments is the most reliable and secures method to determine authenticity and correct origin of several agricultural products. On the basis of an analysis conducted by the Slovak customs laboratory, the total number of samples to be analysed by and in combination of Nuclear Magnetic Resonance with Gas Chromatography is 2800 yearly. This estimation includes only the analyses requested by Slovak Customs

Administration. The total number of the NMR analysed samples may increase by samples requested by other State authorities.

### **2003-004-995-03-26 X-ray Inspection Systems for Protection of Future EU External Border**

The programme intention was to deliver fixed and mobile X-ray inspection systems for the Slovak/Ukrainian border together with the staff training. The programme planning was influenced by an X-ray system unexpectedly received from China. Therefore, the programme had to be re-designed in order to complement this bilateral assistance. Currently, the Slovak Customs Administration does not possess equipment that would allow the fast inspection of entire containers and trucks without the need of opening the container or truck. The existing X-ray facilities used by the customs administration enable only the inspection of smaller consignments, which require unloading and opening the shipments. A fixed X-ray system will be installed on the railway border crossing point completing the inspection facilities of the control hall. The contract was signed and delivery of equipment is expected in July/August 2006.

### **2002/000-610.02 UIBF**

#### Introduction of New Act on VAT and New Acts on Excise Duties into Practice

The only offer received from Austrian Agency for European Integration and Economic Development was accepted by the beneficiary – Department of Indirect Taxes at the MoF SR and the project's activities were with small modifications running according to the agreed schedule. The aim of the twinning light project was better application of VAT and excise duties system in practice in connection with EU membership. Consultations took place discussing theoretical and practical sides of the VAT issues concerning: financial leasing, collection of funds, supplies of the fuel for river traffic on Danube, travel agencies, supplies of gas and electricity, cross-border transportation of passengers, Protocol on the Privileges and Immunities of the European Communities in the Slovak Republic, intra-community supplies, call-off stock, group registration for VAT, public service TV, occasional sales of tangible or intangible property, distance selling, export of goods, reverse charge system, bank and insurance services/tax exemption within a group, tax refund etc. Meetings and seminars dealing with general introduction to VAT were carried out. Slovak Customs Administration officials participated on the project activities. Implementation of risk analysis techniques in the field of customs duties for the Excise Movement Control System. This project was focused on finishing the process of transferring the responsibilities concerning collection of excise duties from the Tax Administration to the Customs Administration, implementation of risk analysis and related computerization in the field of excise duties. Contract with Hungarian Customs and Finance Guard was signed at the end of November 2004, project started on January 2005. Advisory missions, study visits and seminars were realised according to the schedule. Conclusions and recommendations had been integrated as a part of the Final Report and the Final Report was delivered to CFCU in August 2005.

### **2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF**

Review of IS in the Revenue, Treasury, Budget and Accounting Areas objectives were to improve the Information Systems for Public Finance management in general and



specifically to assist with drafting a strategy for achieving the general objective, supporting policies, procedures, methodologies and plans, and to provide related Information System advice to MoF officials. The ToR recognised the need for effective Public Finance Management supported by systems that integrate through appropriate linkages and interfaces. In order to assess the effectiveness of the current systems and their linkages, the project adopted an approach whereby the Business Processes and the systems supporting them were examined and compared to recognised business process and systems models. On the basis of the initial information the team drew up preliminary assessment and recommendations on the information systems in connection to public finance management and Inception Report was sent to the relevant authorities. In the second phase questionnaires on information systems were elaborated and sent to relevant departments. Evaluation of the results of these questionnaires was presented in the Final Report. The review compares the current situation in the Slovak Republic with recognised international best practice. The following business processes were reviewed: Budget preparation and approval; realisation; liquidity and cash management; debt management; fiscal reporting and budget review.

IS Strategy for Public Finance Management Reform (PFMR) intended to assist the MoF with drafting of an IS strategy for PFMR and to provide related advice to MoF officials. The project team prepared Strategy Formulation. Drafting of this document was based on findings made during the contract and interviews conducted with key personnel from affected organisational units. In particular, review meetings with the management of Department for Integrated Services (DIS) were constructive in elaboration of central technical issues.

Protection of the Communities Financial Interests and Fight Against Fraud intended to strengthen the capacities of the financial managerial bodies of the MoF/ National Fund (NF) and three PHARE Implementing Agencies in order (i) to support the development of financial management and of a managerial environment for sound and transparent application of Community Financial Regulations, and (ii) to provide logical links between the financial managerial bodies and to establish the transparent dialogue between the responsible representatives of involved bodies. Seminars and workshops concerning cash-flow and irregularities were organised and consultations covering rights and obligations of financial actors in the project cycle management took place. Consultations relating to responsibilities of SPO, PAO and SAC with representatives of Office of the Government, National Fund, IAs and MoF as the beneficiary took place. Training on irregularities was provided to the staff of National Fund, OLAF, IAs and representatives of line ministries. The Risk management manual of the NF was modified. Manual of IAs was adjusted accordingly. In the field of Public Procurement, the checklist for Public Procurement was prepared and incorporated into the Manual of the Unit for Ex-ante Supervision. Concerning the Cash flow forecasting the rolling cash-flow was prepared, the IAs employees were trained in its use, to ensure the liquidity of the NF and IAs for PHARE/TF funds. The project was extended to ensure the finalization of uncovered activities and the final meeting was dedicated to the issue of irregularities, explaining differences between an error and a fraud; the notion of irregularity and the importance of the common sense criteria. Project was successfully concluded, part of the recommendations was already put into practice and some recommendations will be

incorporated into practice continuously according to the state of the system and personal capacities.

The MoF intervention Capacity Building for Evaluation of the Budget was supposed to establish an evaluation structure for public funds, harmonised with the system for evaluation of EU funds, through drafting of an evaluation strategy and development of methodologies. As requested the draft of an M&E Handbook was produced in close cooperation with the Advisor on Programme Budgeting. In the inception phase some clarification and adjustments of the work plan with regard to the situation of the Slovak state budget reform were made. Agreed outputs were delivered in a form of consultations followed by submitting of advisory documents on state budget monitoring and evaluation.

Training of Financial Controllers was designed to provide training for MoF financial controllers, focusing on sample checks of the total eligible expenditure of the SF, cohesion funds and Schengen facility. Seminars and workshops were performed for three areas: Planning and execution of the 5% sample checks for EU Structural Funds (SF), 15% sample checks for EU Cohesion Fund (CF) and 10% sample checks for Schengen Facility; explanation of execution of on-the-spot checks, explanation of similar and practical controls already performed for EU SF and CF, N+2 rule, public procurement, information and publicity, financial corrections, irregularities, check of eligibility of expenditure, use of currencies and exchange rates, adherence of the competition rules, eligibility of added value tax, practical application and effectiveness of the management and control systems, Audit Trails. Consultations on Sigma Peer Review Report, Comprehensive Monitoring Report 2003 and Clarifications of the problems regarding Central Harmonizing Unit (CHU) took place; recommendations in these fields were attached to the Final Report. Experts delivered also recommendations for the future training for CHU trainers and MoF Training Manual. Despite some difficulties with availability of the Project Leader and Short Term Experts in the first half of the project, requested services and expertise were provided what lead to the fulfilling of its purpose.

Risk Management in the Slovak Tax Administration is a follow-up of the Performance Management project and contributed to the introduction of risk management into Slovak Tax Administration. Seminars and study visits were focused on identification and analysis of risks in Tax Administration, analysis of external risks and their elimination, tax audit, tax enforcement and practical examples of using methods and systems. The Strategy Plan for Risk Management was elaborated.

Implementation of the Naples II Convention was to complete the pre-accession process in the field of management of internal borders supporting the Customs Criminal Office. Contract with the European Public Law Centre / Hellenic Customs Authorities, Greece was signed in August 2004 and planned duration of the project was four months. The project started in January 2005 because both institutions were busy with their work. All activities were implemented but project is not officially finished for administrative reason and problems with Addendums to the contract. These Addendums contain mainly changes of Project Leaders and duration of the project. In February 2006 CFCU decided that all expenses after official end of the project contract will be covered by Customs Directorate.

Strengthening of the MF Administrative Capacity for Providing Official Development Aid aim is to strengthening of the financial aspects of the Official Development

Assistance mechanism to meet EU and OECD criteria for financial management and financial reporting. The project implementation has commenced recently. The first phase is focused on ascertaining information on the legal framework governing providing the Official Development Assistance and bilateral talks with the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and two funds namely Bratislava –Belgrade Fund and UNDP Trust Fund handling the bilateral development assistance with programme countries identified in the Medium Term Strategy till 2008.

Strengthening of the Administrative Capacity of Slovak Customs Administration project purpose is strengthening of the protection of Community and national financial interests and the fight against fraud by more consistent application of current rules and development of a common approach on legal and administrative aspects in the customs field and in the excise duties field. Project was unsuccessfully circulated and after re-circulation one proposal was submitted by Ministry of Economy and Finance, Customs Agency, Italy. The contract was signed in the commitment deadline, during the initial meeting the detailed plan of activities was prepared and the first activities were performed. Three seminars, one study visit and one short term expert visit have taken place.

## ANNEX 7

## Publicity and visibility of PHARE interventions

## Sector: Internal Market

Programme/ project	Finding
<b>COMPONENT 1 – AGRICULTURE<sup>9</sup></b>	
2002/000-610.05 Control TSE	n.a.
2002/000-610.06 Development of IACS	n.a.
2002/000-610.07 Phytosanitary Control	A board at the glasshouse
2002/000-610.08 Registration of Producers	n.a.
2003-004-995-03-02 Food Chain	n.a.
2003-004-995-03-03 BIP Bratislava airport	n.a.
2003-004-995-03-04 Animal Protection	n.a.
2002/000-610.02 UIBF Strengthening of RAS	final seminar for all involved participant took place, press conference in the presence of the contractor and Slovak representatives was organised, project details displayed on web pages of the MoH
2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF Monitoring of CSF	final workshop was organised in Košice for the representatives of state, regional and district veterinary and food administrations, Slovak Hunting Union, Ministry of Agriculture, Slovak chamber of veterinary surgeons, etc.
Internal Audit Unit of APA	ongoing - n.a.
<b>COMPONENT 2 – CADASTRE AND STATISTICS</b>	
2003-004-995-02-01 Land Administration	ongoing - n.a.
2002/000-610.09 INTRASTAT	n.a.
2002/000-610.10 REGSTAT	basic info about the project on the web page of the SO SR
2003-004-995-03-05 New <i>Acquis</i> - Statistics	n.a.
<b>COMPONENT 3 – ENERGY AND TRANSPORT</b>	
2002/000-632.09 Decontamination of Prim. Circuit	n.a.
2003/5812.07.01 Radioactive Waste Agency	n.a.
2003-995-01-04 UIBF Road Transport	n.a.
<b>COMPONENT 4 - ENVIRONMENT</b>	

<sup>9</sup> Publicity and visibility of PHARE projects is carried out via the report „Information about the implementation of PHARE programme in the Agriculture“ at the MoA web site twice a year.

2002/000-610.16 Discharge of Dang. Substances	information about project available on the web site of SHMU, a brochure was issued summarizing project objectives and results for general public
2002/000-610.17 IPPC	information on twinning project and outputs available on Slovak Environmental Agency's web page <a href="http://www.sazp.sk/public/index/go.php?id=946&amp;lang=sk">http://www.sazp.sk/public/index/go.php?id=946&amp;lang=sk</a> Each deliverable of the twinning activities was distributed in hard copy to relevant institutions: SHMI, MoE of SR, SEI. Proceedings on training activities and workshop were distributed in CD version to all participants, including public
2002/000-610.18 Conservation of Natural Habitats	n.a.
2002/000-610.02 UIBF Information Network	as part of project activities a leaflet was issued setting out the role Structural Funds in the Environment Sector and providing contact points for those seeking for further assistance
Preparation for SF	n.a.
Environmental Noise	press conference in the presence of the contractor and Slovak representatives was organised, project details displayed on web pages of the MoH
2003-004-995-03-16 Instit. and Capacity Building	the special web page <a href="http://www.sazp.sk/umbrella/">http://www.sazp.sk/umbrella/</a> was elaborated by Slovak Environmental Agency to present all project outputs and relevant information to public
2003-004-995-03-17 Biosafety Monitoring System	n.a.
2003-004-995-03-18 Electric and Electronic Scrap	the special web page <a href="http://www.sazp.sk/public/index/go.php?id=1234&amp;lang=sk#Phare%20projekt%20Implementácia%20smerníc%20o%20odpade">http://www.sazp.sk/public/index/go.php?id=1234&amp;lang=sk#Phare%20projekt%20Implementácia%20smerníc%20o%20odpade</a> was elaborated by Slovak Environmental Agency to present all project outputs and relevant information to public
2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF Capacity Building PPP	ongoing - n.a.
PCB	the special web page ( <a href="http://www.sazp.sk/public/index/go.php?id=1244&amp;lang=sk#Projektová%20činnosť%20PCHB-COHEM">http://www.sazp.sk/public/index/go.php?id=1244&amp;lang=sk#Projektová%20činnosť%20PCHB-COHEM</a> ) was elaborated by Slovak Environmental Agency to present all project outputs and relevant information to public
<b>COMPONENT 5- FINANCE, BANKING AND CUSTOMS</b>	
2002/000-610.02 UIBF New Act on VAT	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF
2003-004-995-01-04 UIBF IS Strategy	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF
2003-004-995-01-04 Review of IS	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF
2003-004-995-01-04 Financial Interests	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF
2003-004-995-01-04 Evaluation of the Budget	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF
2003-004-995-01-04 Training of Financial Controllers	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF
2003-004-995-01-04 Risk Management	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF
2003-004-995-01-04 ODA	ongoing - n.a.
2002/000-610.04	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF

Financial Sector Supervision	
2003-004-995-03-01 Risk-Based Supervision	ongoing – note about the project on the web site of MoF
2002/000-610.20 IS for Customs	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF
2003-004-995-03-25 Equipment Supply to SCA	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF
2003-004-995-03-26 X-ray Inspection System	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF
2002/000-610.02 UIBF Risk Analysis Techniques	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF
2003-004-995-01-04 Naples II Convention	basic information about the project available on the web site of MoF
2003-004-995-01-04 Administrative Capacity	ongoing - n.a.