

**Interim Evaluation No. R/SR/ESC/0304**



**Programmes covered:**  
2003-004-995-01-05 Support to Further Integration of Roma in the Educational Field,  
2003-004-995-01-06 Improved Access of Roma to Health Care,  
SR-0107.02 Human Resources Development through Preventive and Individual Active Measures for the Unemployed,  
2002/000-610.15 Human Resources Development Grant Scheme,  
SR-0110.01.01.12 Strengthening the Performance of Slovak Administrative Structure Required for Co-ordination of Social Security Schemes,  
2002/000-610.02 UIBF HRD – Legislation in the Field of Education and its Eligibility for European Social Fund Funding,  
2003-004-995-03-11 Grant Scheme on Equal Opportunities and Social Inclusion Support,  
2003-004-995-03-13 Create the Administrative Capacity for Implementing the Equal Initiative,  
2003-004-995-03-14 Preparing for ESF Project Management,  
2003-004-995-03-06 Strengthening of Statistical Health Information and its Harmonisation with EU requirements,  
2003-004-995-03-07 Strengthening the Surveillance and Control of Communicable Diseases,  
2002/000-610.02 UIBF Ensuring Preparedness of the SR Health Insurance System to Apply the Acquis on Co-ordination of Social Security Systems

**Interim Evaluation of the European Union Pre-Accession Instrument PHARE**

**The Slovak Republic**

**Sector:  
Economic and Social Cohesion/ Social Affairs and Human Resources Development**

**Author:**



**Interim Evaluation Report**

**Date: 13 April 2005**

Controlled copy.....of.....

Signed:.....



This report has been prepared as a result of an independent evaluation by MWH being contracted under the PHARE programme.  
**The views expressed are those of MWH and do not necessarily reflect those of the Government Office of the Slovak Republic.**

Government Office of the Slovak Republic  
Aid Co-ordination Unit  
E-mail: [phare@vlada.gov.sk](mailto:phare@vlada.gov.sk)

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

### The Slovak Republic – Economic and Social Cohesion/ Social Affairs and Human Resources Development

**Monitoring Reports:** M/SR/CIV/04008 issued on 10 September 2004; M/SR/HEA/04003 issued on 9 September 2004; M/SR/CIV/04003 issued on 6 September 2004, M/SR/ESC/04008 issued on 10 September 2004.

**Interim Evaluation Report:** R/SR/ESC/0304

#### A) Background and scope of the evaluation

The purpose of this Interim Evaluation is to assess the performance of on-going PHARE support under the Economic and Social Cohesion Monitoring Sector/ Social Affairs and Human Resources Development part, assisting Slovakia in the area of European Social Fund preparation, human resources development, employment, Roma minority integration and health care. This Evaluation covers Phare support allocated for the years 2001, 2002 and 2003, approximately totalling an allocation of 16.4 M€ from Phare and 4 M€ from national sources. The applied interim evaluation methodology is based on the following four main evaluation criteria: *relevance*, *efficiency*, *effectiveness*, *sustainability*, and on *impact*<sup>1</sup>.

#### B) Main evaluation findings and conclusions

Overall, not much can be said about the 2003 Roma Minority projects as these are still in the preparatory phases, nevertheless they are considered relevant, addressing actual problems. Most of the Human Resources Development and European Social Fund Preparation projects are *relevant* with the exception of a few projects where the assistance is likely to come too late and, therefore, no longer reflects the actual needs. Concerning the Health Care projects, their *relevance* is justified. The individual projects were mostly linked with the implementation of the *acquis* and/or the obligations placed on Slovakia as a new member state to harmonise its legal framework with EU Directives.

Apart from the need to launch the tendering as soon as possible, in order to avoid last minute contracting, no substantial problems are currently foreseen in terms of efficiency for the upcoming 2003 Roma Minority initiatives. The *efficient* implementation of the Human Resources Development and European Social Fund Preparation projects has encountered some difficulties, and notably the monitoring of grant schemes, which require some improvements. Regarding capacity building for the European Social Fund, the respective Section at the Ministry of Labour, Family and Social Affairs is new and its staff have not been directly involved in PHARE grant schemes so far. The long-term experience of the Central Office for Labour, Family and Social Affairs, so far the only Slovak

---

<sup>1</sup> *Relevance*, whether the design of the project targets the needs of beneficiaries; *Efficiency*, whether the same results could have been achieved at lower costs; *Effectiveness*, whether the project purpose has been achieved; *Sustainability*, whether project benefits are likely to continue after external funding ends; *Impact*, the extent to which the benefits received by the beneficiaries had a wider overall effect.

institution dealing professionally with Human Resources Development grant schemes, is being little used in future, and is mostly devoted to the implementation of national interventions. The intention of PHARE, to provide assistance to regional bodies, has not materialised as planned: some original regional structures were abolished in the meanwhile, and the European Social Fund is currently managed centrally, without much regional involvement. The 2002 Human Resources Development grant scheme was expected to have an overall co-ordination body; however, this was either not established or not made operational. There has been an indication that some of the PHARE experts involved in implementation have a potential conflict of interest due to their previous involvement in project preparation. Moreover, the payment of PHARE fees to regional expert team members (Strategic Action Plans) who are employees of public institutions has been observed in a number of cases. The current institutional arrangements for the European Social Fund may duplicate some PHARE activities, mostly in the area of project design and partnership development. In addition, the 2003 preparation projects, which have not started yet, will require substantial re-orientation. For the time being, implementation of the Health Care component is on-going without major difficulties.

Based on the design of the 2003 Roma Minority interventions, the expected effects are likely to materialise. In the area of Human Resources Development and European Social Fund Preparation it is likely that the individual grant projects will achieve some *effects*. However, based on the limited time and data available, it is not yet possible yet to estimate the benefits. The 2002 grant scheme is only partly in line with the original intent and, therefore, is not likely to bring the full scope of expected results. For the future, only much closer co-operation between the Ministry of Labour and the regions, and their direct involvement, can guarantee more successful results. The experience gained through the 2001 and 2002 grant schemes has provided a limited platform for current European Social Fund proposals, as demonstrated by the number and quality of applications received. Limited benefits are expected from the 2003 grant scheme on Equal Opportunities, clearly overlapping with the already launched European Social Fund assistance in this area. To ensure effectiveness of the 2003 European Social Fund Project Management activities, these should be re-focused towards the next structural funds cycle, and should clearly involve regional levels. Moreover, within the current European Social Fund institutional arrangements, a rational approach for replacing the numerous overlapping training initiatives for different target groups through more effective support measures would be beneficial. Some Health Care projects are likely to become *effective* and taking into account the current management structure, performance, the design of the projects and expected results, this is likely for the Health projects that are still to commence.

The 2003 Roma Minority initiatives are designed as pilot projects and sustainability of their potential benefits will depend on the results achieved and their proper dissemination. The majority of the Human Resources Development and European Social Fund Preparation projects has achieved or are expected to achieve results that have good prospects for *sustainability*. In terms of sustainable capacity building, however, it is unfortunate that the long-term experience of the Central Office for Labour (and also of some regional structures) in managing grant schemes will have very limited future use despite the urgent need for this experience at the Ministry of Labour. *Sustainability* of the Health Care

projects is highly probable. The expected results are mostly self-sustainable because they are linked with EU membership obligations.

For the time being, a likely contribution to the planned impacts is expected from the upcoming 2003 Roma Minority interventions. Some positive *impact* from the Human Resources Development and European Social Fund Preparation component through increased employability can be expected from the 2001 grant scheme and from the 2003 grant scheme on Equal Opportunities. A positive long-term impact, identified as stable and increased employment is also expected from the 2003 EQUAL Initiative. In terms of improved administration for the effective use of the European Social Fund, less is expected from the 2002 grant scheme, due to the marginal involvement at regional levels. Similarly, little impact is likely to result from the 2003 European Social Fund Project Management activities, which would have been much more useful if implemented earlier. Regarding Health Care, it is expected that all of the projects will contribute to the achievement of their overall objectives, thus bringing some *impact* in the mid-term perspective.

In the overall context of the introduction of the Extended Decentralised Implementation System in Slovakia, the current legal framework for PHARE implementation may require some adjustments in order to be in line with the newly introduced provisions, following complete decentralisation of EU aid management.

### **C) Main Recommendations**

#### Addressed to the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Health

- To prepare and to implement for the 2003 Roma pilot project a dissemination strategy, in order to raise awareness on the project outcomes.

#### Addressed to the Ministry of Labour, Family and Social Affairs

- To re-assess and to increase the amount of training (including follow-up training) for Roma social field workers and to initiate networking between the established community centres (in co-operation with the Office of the Plenipotentiary).
- To identify, together with all institutions involved in the European Social Fund, common activities/ services that could be covered by harmonised and co-ordinated horizontal structures at central as well as at regional levels.
- To re-consider the current design of the not yet started 2003 European Social Fund preparation projects, taking also into account the need for close involvement of the regional levels.

#### Addressed to the Regional Development Support Agency

- In cases of potential conflicts of interest of PHARE experts, to clarify whether the PRAG rules were respected and to introduce corrective measures where needed.

#### Addressed to the Institute of Health Information and Statistics

- To consider, in consultation with the Statistical Office of the SR, the harmonisation of tools for the presentation and provision of statistical health data.

Addressed to the National Fund/ National Authorising Officer and Implementing Agencies

- To clarify the legal framework and the rules, including necessary changes, that have to be introduced for PHARE and Transition Facility, following the introduction of the Extended Decentralised Implementation System.

#### D) Performance Rating

Component/ Project	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Sustainability	Impact	Verbal overall rating
<b><i>Roma Minority</i></b>						
2003-004-995-01-05	1	1	1	0	1	S
2003-004-995-01-06	1	1	1	0	1	S
<b><i>HRD and ESF Preparation</i></b>						
SR-0107.02	1	0	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.15	1	-1	0	1	0	S
SR-0110.01.01.12	1	1	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.02 UIBF	-1	-1	0	-1	0	U
2003-004-995-03-11	-1	0	-1	1	1	U
2003-004-995-03-13	1	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-14	-1	0	0	-1	-1	U
<b><i>Health Care</i></b>						
2003-004-995-03-06	1	0	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-07	1	0	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.02 UIBF	1	1	1	1	1	S
<b>Taking into account the contextual constraints on the evaluation, the sector overall is rated to be 'SATISFACTORY'</b>						
<b><i>ESC Monitoring Sector/ Social Affairs and Human Resources Development</i></b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>S</b>

Ratings guide: -2 unacceptable; -1 poor; 0 sufficient/adequate; +1 good; +2 excellent.  
 HS-Highly Satisfactory, S- Satisfactory, U-Unsatisfactory, HU-Highly Unsatisfactory.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....</b>	<b>I</b>
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b>	
<b>PREFACE</b>	
<b>GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS</b>	
<b>FINANCIAL AND CONTRACTUAL DATA OF THE SECTOR ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COHESION/ SOCIAL AFFAIRS AND HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT</b>	
<b>1. SECTORAL BACKGROUND AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION .....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 SECTORAL BACKGROUND.....	1
1.2 SCOPE OF EVALUATION .....	1
<b>2. EVALUATION RESULTS .....</b>	<b>5</b>
2.1 COMPONENT 1 – ROMA MINORITY .....	5
2.2 COMPONENT 2 – HRD AND ESF PREPARATION.....	6
2.3 COMPONENT 3 – HEALTH CARE .....	10
2.4 SPECIFIC ISSUES .....	12
<b>3. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>13</b>
3.1 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....	13
3.2 PERFORMANCE RATING.....	18
<b>ANNEXES.....</b>	<b>19</b>
ANNEX 1 INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT .....	20
ANNEX 2 LIST OF INTERVIEWS.....	23
ANNEX 3 LIST OF DOCUMENTS REFERRED TO IN THE INTERIM EVALUATION.....	25
ANNEX 4 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM PREVIOUS INTERIM EVALUATION.....	26
ANNEX 5 DISSENTING VIEWS AND COMMENTS NOT INCORPORATED .....	28
ANNEX 6 ANNEX TO CHAPTER 1 SECTORAL SCOPE AND BACKGROUND OF THE EVALUATION.....	30

## PREFACE

This Interim Evaluation Report covers PHARE assistance to the Economic and Social Cohesion sector/ Social Affairs and Human Resources Development in the Slovak Republic under the following programmes:

2003-004-995-01-05 Support to Further Integration of Roma in the Educational Field,  
2003-004-995-01-06 Improved Access of Roma to Health Care,  
SR-0107.02 Human Resources Development (HRD) through Preventive and Individual Active Measures for the Unemployed,  
2002/000-610.15 HRD Grant Scheme,  
SR-0110.01.01.12 Strengthening the Performance of Slovak Administrative Structure Required for Co-ordination of Social Security Schemes,  
2002/000-610.02 Unallocated Institution Building Facility (UIBF) HRD – Legislation in the Field of Education and its Eligibility for European Social Fund (ESF) Funding,  
2003-004-995-03-11 Grant Scheme on Equal Opportunities and Social Inclusion Support,  
2003-004-995-03-13 Create the Administrative Capacity for Implementing the Equal Initiative,  
2003-004-995-03-14 Preparing for ESF Project Management,  
2003-004-995-03-06 Strengthening of Statistical Health Information and its Harmonisation with EU requirements,  
2003-004-995-03-07 Strengthening the Surveillance and Control of Communicable Diseases,  
and 2002/000-610.02 UIBF Ensuring Preparedness of the SR Health Insurance System to Apply the Acquis on Co-ordination of Social Security Systems.

This Interim Evaluation Report was prepared by MWH<sup>2</sup> during the period from October to November 2004 and reflects the situation at 20 November 2004, the cut-off date for the Report. The factual basis is provided by the following Monitoring Reports, covering the period from 1 April to 31 August 2004:

- M/SR/CIV/04008, prepared by the Office of Government (Section of Human Rights and Minorities) and issued on 10 September 2004,
- M/SR/HEA/04003, prepared by the Ministry of Health issued on 9 September 2004,
- M/SR/CIV/04003, prepared by the Ministry of Education issued on 6 September 2004,
- M/SR/ESC/04008, prepared by the Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family and issued on 10 September 2004.

Other findings are based on analysis of the Financing Memoranda, formal programme documentation, interviews with the main parties and published material.

The Interim Evaluation Report examines the progress of the programmes towards the objectives stated in the formal programming documents, i.e. Financing Memoranda, Project Fiches, etc. The report is intended to provide management information for the benefit of the Joint Monitoring Committee (JMC) and other involved parties. It draws conclusions and puts forward recommendations. It provides a general assessment of programmes or components under consideration and included in the corresponding Sectoral Monitoring Report.

---

<sup>2</sup> Authors: Dagmar Gombitova, Dietmar Aigner and Short Term Technical Expert Will Guy. This Report has been reviewed by Dietmar Aigner (MWH Interim Evaluation Cell) and by Peter Hall (MWH Headquarters).

Comments requested on the draft version of this Report were received from the following parties:

<b>Parties invited</b>	<b>Comments received</b>
Ministry of Education of the SR	Yes
Ministry of Construction and regional Development/ Regional Development Support Agency	No
Ministry Labour, Family and Social Affairs of the SR	No
Central Office for Labour, Family and Social Affairs of the SR	No
Ministry of Health Care of the SR	No
Ministry of Finance/ Central Finance and Contracting Unit	No
Ministry of Finance/ National Fund	Yes
European Commission Representation	Yes
Office of the Government/ Aid Co-ordination Unit	Yes

Where possible, the Evaluators have integrated the comments received into the Report. Comments which are not incorporated are in Annex 5.

The findings and recommendations of this Interim Evaluation Report have been formally debriefed in Bratislava on 17 February 2005, following an invitation of the Office of the Government of the Slovak Republic/ Aid Co-ordination Unit.



## GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS

ACU	Aid Co-ordination Unit
CFCU	Central Finance and Contracting Unit
COLSAF	Central Office of Labour, Social Affairs and Family
EC	European Commission
ECD	European Commission Delegation
ECR	European Commission Representation
EDIS	Extended Decentralised Implementation System
ESC	Economic and Social Cohesion
ESF	European Social Fund
EU	European Union
FM	Financing Memorandum
GS	Grant Scheme
HRD	Human Resource Development
IA	Implementing Agency
IoA	Indicator of Achievement
IHIS	Institute for Health Information and Statistics
IT	Information Technology
IE	Interim Evaluation
MA	Managing Authority
M€	Million(s) of Euro
MoCRD	Ministry of Construction and Regional Development
MoEd	Ministry of Education
MoH	Ministry of Health
N/A	Not available, not applicable
NAO	National Authorising Officer
NF	National Fund
NSS	National Support Structure
OoG	Office of the Government of the Slovak Republic
PF	Project Fiche
PRAG	Practical Guide for PHARE, SAPARD and ISPA
RDSA	Regional Development Support Agency
SAC	Sector Aid Co-ordinator
SF	Structural Funds
SGC	Self-Government Counties
SIC	Social Insurance Company
SK/SR	Slovak Republic
SPO	Senior Programme Officer
SW	Software
TA	Technical Assistance
ToR	Terms of Reference
TW	Twinning
TWL	Twinning Light
UIBF	Unallocated Institution Building Facility

## FINANCIAL AND CONTRACTUAL DATA OF THE SECTOR ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COHESION/ SOCIAL AFFAIRS AND HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT

Number	Title	Beneficiary	Contract		PHARE			Co-financing		
			start	expiry	allocated M€	com %	dis %	allocated M€	com %	dis %
<b>COMPONENT 1 – ROMA MINORITY</b>										
2003-004-995-01-05	<b>Support to Further Integration of Roma in the Educational Field</b>	MoEd	-	-	<b>1.000</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.110</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
	Support of Integration of Roma in Education		-	-	0.890	0	0	0	0	0
	Supply of Equipment		-	-	0.110	0	0	0.110	0	0
2003-004-995-01-06	<b>Improved Access of Roma to Health Care</b>	MoH	-	-	<b>1.250</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.460</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
	Training		-	-	0.040	0	0	0	0	0
	Roma Health Education, Educational Tools		-	-	0.045	0	0	0.015	0	0
	Equipment to Health Centres		-	-	0.050	0	0	0.020	0	0
	TA – Health Filed Workers for Roma		-	-	0.590	0	0	0.250	0	0
	Renovation of Rooms for Health Centres – works		-	-	0.075	0	0	0.025	0	0
	Supply of Mobile Medical Units		-	-	0.450	0	0	0.150	0	0
<b>COMPONENT 2 – HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT AND EUROPEAN SOCIAL FUND PREPARATION</b>										
SR-0107.02	<b>Human Resources Development through Preventive and Individual Active Measures for the Unemployed</b>	RDSA/ COLSAF	28.11.03	30.09.04	<b>3.000</b>	<b>99</b>	<b>80</b>	<b>1.400</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>80</b>
2002/000-610.15	<b>Human Resources Development Grant Scheme</b>	RDSA/	-	-	<b>3.500</b>	<b>94</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1.600</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
	TA	MoLSAF/	02.08.04	01.08.05	0.200	91	0	0	0	0
Strategic Action Plans and Partnership	20.07.04		20.07.05	0.500	100	0	0.100	100	0	

	Flexibility of the Labour Market	<b>COLSAF</b>	07.06.04	30.06.05	1.400	100	80	1.000	100	80
	Quality of the Labour Market	<b>MoEd</b>	13.07.04	31.08.05	1.400	100	80	0.500	100	80
<b>SR-0110.01.01.12</b>	Strengthening the performance of Slovak Administrative Structure Required for Co-ordination of Social Security Schemes	<b>MoLSAF</b>	01.12.03	30.09.04	0.150	100	80	0	0	0
<b>2002/000-610.02 UIBF</b>	<b>HRD – Legislation in the Field of Education and its Eligibility for ESF Funding</b>	<b>MoEd</b>	-	-	<b>0.160</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>2003-004-995-03-11</b>	<b>Grant Scheme on Equal Opportunities and Social Inclusion Support</b>	<b>MoLSAF</b>	-	-	<b>2.500</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>2003-004-995-03-13</b>	<b>Create the Administrative Capacity for Implementing the Equal Initiative</b>	<b>MoLSAF</b>	29.04.04	29.04.05	<b>0.300</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>2003-004-995-03-14</b>	<b>Preparing for ESF Project Management</b>	<b>MoLSAF</b>	-	-	<b>1.500</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
	Preparing for ESF Project Management - TWL		28.04.04	28.02.05	0.250	100	80	0	0	0
	ESF Project Management Capacities		-	-	0.550	0	0	0	0	0
	Project Generation Facility		-	-	0.600	0	0	0	0	0
	Quality Assurance		-	-	0.100	0	0	0	0	0
<b>COMPONENT 3 – HEALTH CARE</b>										
<b>2003-004-995-03-06</b>	<b>Strengthening of Statistical Health Information and its Harmonisation with EU Requirements</b>	<b>MoH</b>	-	-	<b>0.600</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.150</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
	Strengthening of Statistical Health Information System		23.04.04	23.02.05	0.150	100	80	0	0	0
	TA for MoH and IHIS		-	-	0.200	0	0	0	0	0
	Supply of Hardware to MoH and IHIS		-	-	0.250	0	0	0.150	0	0
<b>2003-004-995-03-07</b>	<b>Strengthening the Surveillance and Control of Communicable Diseases</b>	<b>MoH</b>	-	-	<b>1.550</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0.184</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

	Harmonisation and Upgrading of Monitoring System of Communicable Diseases and EWS – TW		-	-	0.510	0	0	0	0	0
	Software Development and Training of NPHU Staff		-	-	0.550	0	0	0	0	0
	Supply of HW and SW and Laboratory Equipment for 9 NRC		-	-	0.490	0	0	0.184	0	0
<b>2002/000-610.02 UIBF</b>	<b>Ensuring Preparedness of the SR Health Insurance System to Apply the <i>Acquis</i> on Co-ordination of Social Security Systems</b>	<b>MoH</b>	<b>31.03.04</b>	<b>30.09.04</b>	<b>0.150</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>80</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

PHARE 2001: commitment deadline 31/12/03; disbursement deadline 31/12/04,

PHARE 2002: commitment deadline 30/11/04; disbursement deadline 30/11/05

PHARE 2003: commitment deadline 30/11/05; disbursement deadline 30/11/06

Source: Perseus by cut-off date 20 November 2004

## 1.      **SECTORAL BACKGROUND AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION**

### 1.1      **Sectoral Background**

1.      This Interim Evaluation (IE) report covers the Social Affairs and Human Resources Development part of the PHARE support under the Economic and Social Cohesion (ESC) sector, one of the three monitoring sectors for PHARE assistance in Slovakia. The individual Programmes/Components under the Sector relate to the adoption and application of the *acquis communautaire* by focusing on the protection of minority rights, namely through improving the access of Roma population to the education and health care. Overall, the individual parts of the assistance are in line with the Slovak governmental strategies<sup>3</sup> specifically dealing with Roma minority and its integration into the society, and comply with priorities set out in the National Development Plan. The other parts of the evaluated assistance are directed towards the establishment of structures necessary for the implementation of the European social and employment policy (notably focusing on the long-term unemployed and socially marginalised groups) and partly cover the needs in the area of the health statistics and communicable diseases.

### 1.2      **Scope of Evaluation**

2.      The evaluated assistance cover support financed from the Financing Memoranda (FM) 2001, 2002 and 2003. For the purpose of the IE, the individual activities under the sector were grouped into the following Components:

- Roma Minority
- Human Resources Development (HRD) and European Social Fund (ESF) Preparation
- Health Care

#### 1.2.1      **Performance of Activities**

This section provides a basic overview of activities, outputs and effects. For more detailed information on the individual Components please see Annex 6 of the Report.

#### **Component 1 – Roma Minority**

*2003-004-995-01-05 Support to Further Integration of Roma in the Educational Field,  
2003-004-005-01-06 Improved Access of Roma to Health Care*

#### **Activities and Outputs**

3.      The 2003 Roma Education programme should: (i) support and ease the passage from primary to secondary education for Roma children coming from a disadvantaged

<sup>3</sup> Strategy of the Government Addressing the Problems of the Roma National Minority and Set of Measures for Its Implementation – Stage I and II, Priorities of the Government of the Slovak Republic in Relation to Roma Communities for the Year 2002, Comprehensive Roma Settlement Development Programme, the Pilot Programme of Field Social Workers, the Social Housing Programme and Basic Theses of Government Strategy for Integration of Roma Communities.

environment, (ii) implement multicultural education at secondary schools, and (iii) prepare pupils for entering the labour and business environment. The activities being delivered within the 2003 Roma Health Care programme are intended to improve the access of Roma to health care and to enhance their knowledge and consciousness about healthy lifestyles.

#### Effects

4. ToR and technical specification for the 2003 Roma Education programme were approved in July 2004. Regarding 2003 Roma Health Care, in order to adjust the number of doctor assistants, mobile medical units and medical centres, a change of the Project Fiche (PF) has been requested and is still pending.

### **Component 2 – HRD and ESF Preparation**

*SR-0107.02 Human Resources Development Grant Scheme (HRD GS) through Preventive and Individual Active Measures for the Unemployed, 2002/000.610-15 Human Resources Development Grant Scheme, SR-0110.01.01.0012 Strengthening the Performance of Slovak Administrative Structure Required for Co-ordination of Social Security Schemes, 2002/000.610-02 UIBF Human Resources Development – Legislation in the Field of Education and its Eligibility for ESF Funding, 2003-004-995-03-11 Grant Scheme on Equal Opportunities and Social Inclusion Support, 2003-004-995-03-13 Create the Administrative Capacity for Implementing the Equal Initiative and Support the Launch of the Equal Initiative in the Slovak Republic, 2003-004-995-03-14 Preparing for ESF Project Management*

#### Activities and Outputs

5. The aim of the 2001 HRD GS was to facilitate the access into the labour market for the unemployed by providing them with individual active labour market measures, tailored to their specific needs. The 2002 HRD intervention is directed towards the strengthening of the administrative processes and the absorption capacity needed to implement the Sectoral Operational Programme for HRD at local and regional levels. It comprises the preparation of Strategic Action Plans in eight regions as well as two GS (one for combating youth and long-term unemployment and one for enhancing labour force quality through education). Overall co-ordination of the HRD projects is secured via Technical Assistance (TA). The 2001 twinning light (TWL) project on Social Security Schemes aimed to meet the obligation of EU membership and to ensure the preparedness of the Slovak administration for implementing social security schemes for migrant workers. The purpose of 2002 Legislation in the Field of Education was set out as: (i) to train and to prepare administrative capacity and structures involved in programming, developing and preparation of projects for ESF implementation, and (ii) to verify legislation in the area of education and deliver training in the effective use of ESF. The 2003 GS on Equal Opportunities will support grant projects aimed at increasing the employability of groups threatened by social exclusion and balancing of equal opportunities on the labour market. The aim of the 2003 twinning (TW) project EQUAL Initiative is to support the Managing Authority (MA) for the Initiative in developing the mechanisms for its effective implementation and correct control. The objective of 2003 ESF Project Management is to prepare administration, intermediaries at regional and

district level, and potential beneficiaries for the participation in ESF programme operations. The current 2003 TWL mostly focuses on the establishment of eight ESF guidance pilot centres in the regions.

### Effects

6. The 2001 HRD GS is being completed at the time of this IE. Details of outputs and results are not known at this time because the final reports are currently undergoing the financial control. The 2002 HRD activities on Strategic Action Plans preparation are being implemented; regional teams have been created to proceed with the work. The TA team provides assistance for the regions (mainly training and methodology support is expected) and two experts are assigned for the GS being implemented by the Central Office of Labour, Social Affairs and Family (COLSAF) and by the Ministry of Education (MoEd). The GS projects were selected, grant contracts signed and physical implementation has started recently. The 2001 Social Security Schemes project has been completed and staff of MoLSAF and Social Insurance Company have been provided with necessary skills and knowledge for practical operations of social security schemes in respect of the free movement of workers. The 2002 Legislation in the Field of Education as well as the 2003 GS on Equal Opportunities projects have not started yet. The 2003 EQUAL Initiative TW formalised and adjusted the management structure and procedures to be applied and provided very useful on-the-job training. 2003 ESF Project Management had to be refocused and instead of the originally planned support for regional and district bodies, assistance has mostly focused on the ESF guidance centres.

### **Component 3 – Health Care**

*2003-004-005-03-06 Strengthening of Statistical Health Information and its Harmonisation with EU Requirements, 2003-004-005-03-07 Strengthening the Surveillance and Control of Communicable Diseases, 2002/000-610-02 UIBF Ensuring Preparedness of the SR Health Information System to Apply the Acquis on Co-ordination of Social Security Systems*

#### Activities and Outputs

7. The activities planned within 2003 Statistical Health Information are expected to ensure methodological and technical strengthening of capacities for statistical health information according to EU requirements/ EUROSTAT. The TWL is dealing primarily with harmonisation of methodologies and preparation of basic requirements for the subsequent development of software tools. The 2003 Communicable Diseases programme aims to strengthen the surveillance and to upgrade the administrative and implementing structures concerning the epidemiological and laboratory control of communicable diseases and to integrate these into EU networks. The TW covenant has been prepared and the project should commence soon. The 2002 Social Security Systems TWL was directly related to the EU accession and prepared the necessary technical and human resources in the Slovak Liaison Body for the direct implementation of EU regulations, in order to export health insurance benefits (benefits in kind) and to make the refunds for benefits. A series of training session was delivered and practical examples were solved.

Effects

8. The 2003 Statistical Health Information TWL has already produced some outputs: the specification of the equipment and Terms of Reference (ToR) for software development were prepared and the methodology part is nearly completed. 2003 Communicable Diseases is not contracted yet. The 2002 Social Security Systems TWL facilitated the professional operations of the Liaison Body and provided the knowledge and skills in handling reimbursement payments for health care within the EU.



## 2. EVALUATION RESULTS

### 2.1 Component 1 – Roma Minority

#### 2.1.1 *Relevance*

9. 2003 Roma Education is a further follow-up of previous education programmes and intends to raise educational levels by supporting children in the higher grades of primary school in order to motivate and prepare them for continuing their education at secondary school. Additional activities are targeted at secondary schools, by developing multicultural training systems for use with socially disadvantaged youth and preparing training courses for pupils to equip them for entering the labour market and a business environment. This programme is *relevant* to improving employment prospects, but a precondition for its relevance on any significant scale is the success of programmes to improve markedly the performance of Roma pupils in primary school and, especially, to avoid their referral to special schools at the start of their educational career. The 2003 Roma Health programme is planned as a pilot testing activity, trying to improve Roma access to healthcare and to introduce field workers/ doctor assistants. Although relevant to the health status of Roma, especially in relation to measures like preventative inoculation campaigns, the IoA referring to reduction of Roma mortality and morbidity is not appropriately chosen.

#### 2.1.2 *Efficiency*

10. The 2003 Roma Education projects should not encounter any substantial implementation difficulties. Sufficient experience has been gained in the course of the previous Programmes' implementation and lessons were learned to enable smooth implementation. The projects under 2003 Roma Health Care, are still at preparatory stage. Substantial effort has been invested into the preparation of the projects, elimination of risks and securing their sustainability. Therefore, no major difficulties with the implementation are expected.

#### 2.1.3 *Effectiveness*

11. No substantial difficulties are expected for pilot activities to be implemented within the 2003 Roma Education and 2003 Roma Health Care initiatives. Nevertheless, both of the initiatives will require careful monitoring of activities in order to provide sufficient and measurable evidence of their success.

#### 2.1.4 *Sustainability*

12. Both 2003 Roma Education and 2003 Health Care are seen as pilot projects and their sustainability will thus depend on the results achieved and their proper dissemination. This should be thought about and prepared before the project completion.

#### 2.1.5 *Impact*

13. The interventions in the area of 2003 Roma Education and 2003 Roma Health Care should in both cases contribute to some of the expected impacts. However, as for the 2003 Roma Health Care programme, the likely overall *impact* on Roma mortality and morbidity as currently identified in the planning documents is less certain.

## 2.2 Component 2 – HRD and ESF Preparation

### 2.2.1 Relevance

14. Overall, the main problems and needs addressed within the HRD and ESF Preparation component were twofold: (i) combating unemployment and (ii) preparation for upcoming implementation of ESF measures. The implemented projects are therefore, in general, considered relevant. The objectives of 2001 HRD GS were consistent and fully supportive of EU and national policies. The IoA were sufficiently quantified, but are a quite ambitious, taking into account the moderate size of the intervention. Moreover, because of legal changes, the IoA, referring to a decreased number of social benefits, would not provide a credible guide any longer. The identical GS are being implemented as part of the 2002 HRD intervention. The design of the programme is also consistent and in line with official policies, however, the stated IoAs do not provide sufficient indication of the expected effects. The abolition of the original implementing body (National Labour Office) together with the introduction of new structures has changed the implementation arrangements at regional level. The TWL on 2001 Social Security Schemes is justified by the necessity to adopt and implement such schemes respecting free movement of workers within the EU. 2002 Legislation in the Field of Education is partly duplicating the efforts of other projects within the component, mainly as regards preparation of capacities and structures for programming, and is too late.

15. The other interventions are clearly focused on ESF implementation. The need to develop administrative capacities at regional and local levels was appropriately reflected in the original planning documents. Despite that, actual implementation has focused mostly at the central level with only marginal involvement of regional structures. Having several ESF and EQUAL calls for proposals already launched, the relevance in terms of timing of the 2003 GS on Equal Opportunities should be questioned. The original purpose - supporting the implementation of the Sectoral Operational Programme Human Resources - will thus duplicate ESF activities. The IoA copied from the 2001 HRD GS can hardly serve any purposes. Moreover, the parallel implementation of identical activities through different instruments (PHARE GS, ESF), using different procedures and rules, is likely to confuse the beneficiaries. The 2003 EQUAL Initiative TW is well designed but earlier commencement would have been better. The IoA stated in the logframe was not sufficiently specific and is identical with the IoA set out for the 2003 ESF Project Management. This initiative is too late. The intervention logic of the programme is correct but commencement of such a project would have been relevant two years ago. At the planning stage, it must have been apparent that such an intervention financed from Financing Memoranda 2003 could not have commenced before 2004. At that stage, the ESF was expected to be fully operational and therefore the objectives did not reflect the actual needs. From this point of view, the programme missed the target. The implementation at this stage can still contribute to the improvement of the current ESF operations.

### 2.2.2 Efficiency

16. A few deficiencies were identified in assessing the efficiency of the component. The current monitoring system did not provide a satisfactory picture of the overall performance

of the various GS. Although the individual grant projects provided regular progress reports, the data were not further processed and analysed. The available database did not permit such processing and summary information and analysis was not required by the Implementing Agency (RDSA). Monitoring of the progress was thus limited mostly to ad-hoc solution of individual implementation difficulties that occurred. On-the-spot monitoring of projects took place in June 2004 but no official report on the results of missions was prepared. This could have been helpful as no summary information on the GS implementation is available. A final summary report on the GS should be prepared only after completion of the information technology (IT) module being realised under the 2002 HRD TA project, which should enable some processing of data/indicators. However, no common harmonised system has been created since all institutions involved in HRD GS, (MoCRD/RDSA, MoEd and COLSAF) are using incompatible systems, and the use of the upcoming overall IT Monitoring System for Structural Funds has been solely dedicated for the purpose of structural funds interventions.

17. The established regional structures, and their operations within the implementation of 2001 HRD GS, had to be reduced because of the abolition of NLO and its subordinated regional offices. This led back to the centralised management approach, which was not originally intended. As stated in the PF the institutional framework for 2002 HRD GS (management, monitoring, payments and implementation) was expected to be the same as that envisaged for the ESF. However, this undertaking has not fully materialised. Only the MoEd staff are simultaneously involved in the implementation of PHARE GS and ESF. MoEd has also been provided with consultancy via informal exchange of experience with the COLSAF. Here, the COLSAF appears to be the most competent institution since it has been running all PHARE HRD GS so far. Currently, COLSAF is also involved in ESF activities through the National Programmes, which are implemented via different mechanisms. The ESF Section of the MoLSAF has already launched several calls for proposals. However, up to now, MoLSAF has not shown much interest in benefiting from the PHARE HRD GS, whilst these GS are clearly inviting the Ministry to develop its capacities through participation in the implementation. Since MoLSAF has not been deeply involved in any of these PHARE activities, its practical experience as regards GS management is limited. Both of the 2002 GS (being implemented by MoEd and COLSAF) were launched in parallel, but the start of the grant projects under auspices of the MoEd was five months delayed, due to problems with arranging the necessary advance payments.

18. Overall management of 2002 HRD GS is mostly carried out by the contracted TA. Whilst the respective PF refers to a Monitoring Committee with specified responsibilities, no Committee exists. A Memorandum of Understanding mentioned a Steering Committee (SC), which was apparently set up at the time when the programme was launched. This body has not been operational and the list of SC appointments raises some concerns in terms of possible conflicts of interest: at least two members are currently involved in the project implementation as contracted experts. Moreover, fees for the regional expert teams, preparing Strategic Action Plans, are also paid from PHARE funds. These expert teams often comprise employees of Self-Government Counties (SGC) or other public administration institutions, which could contradict the PRAG rules. Additionally, there has been an indication that some of the contracted PHARE experts, who recently left their civil

service posts at beneficiary institutions such as MoLSAF and NLO, are now closely involved in the implementation of PHARE HRD/ESF interventions, and thus create a potential conflict of interest due to their previous involvement in programme/project preparation. Whilst the preparation of Strategic Action Plans in the regions has been already initiated, the involvement of the MoLSAF staff, whose future task will be to prepare the overall national strategy – and therefore, should use the Actions Plans, being prepared under PHARE, is missing.

19. Training activities focusing on project design/project cycle management as well as support for creation of partnership have been already delivered through numerous PHARE projects, and are still planned as part of several on-going/ starting projects<sup>4</sup>. Despite all these numerous efforts, their effects are still not very visible. Co-ordination among institutions involved in the ESF implementation, despite being stressed several times, also requires substantial improvement. The current implementation structure for ESF involves several institutions: (i) MoLSAF, (ii) Social Development Fund, (iii) MoEd and (iv) COLSAF, however, all of these bodies are struggling with the same kind of problems, and trying to overcome these on their own, instead of co-ordinating their efforts and seeking for common solutions, making the maximum use of the limited administrative capacity and experience. For instance, the 2003 ESF Project Management TWL is dealing with the establishment of the ESF Guidance Centres, whilst similar services are being partly provided by local offices of COLSAF and the MoEd is also seeking resources for provision of information to the regions through the 2002 Legislation in the Field of Education project. Unsuccessful tendering of this 2002 project caused delays and the project is being re-tendered but there remains the risk that it will not be contracted. Physical implementation of the 2003 GS on Equal Opportunities is expected next year, which is too late for gaining any experience for ESF. A similar pessimistic judgement is applicable for some 2003 ESF Project Management projects that have not started. The 2003 EQUAL Initiative twinning is running without any substantial difficulties.

### 2.2.3 Effectiveness

20. It is difficult to judge the effectiveness of the 2001 HRD GS because neither a preliminary nor a final summary report on the GS performance has been made available. Having reviewed only a few projects out of approximately 100 projects, a credible performance overview cannot be provided. Nevertheless, the majority of projects have delivered their planned activities and the number of trainees will be impressive. The actual benefit of the numerous training activities supported by the GS, will be more moderate, and for judging the actual success of the individual grant projects the direct beneficiaries' feedback should be requested in a year time (on a project by project basis, but also to identify good practice). Indicators set out for individual projects are measurable and can potentially provide a useful indication of the gained benefits. The IoA determined in the PF will not correspond with the achieved figures since the expected figures were unrealistic and the new legislation has led to a substantial change in the number of social benefits dependents. For the 2002 HRD intervention, it is too early to assess the actual benefits as the projects commenced only recently. Nevertheless, the original aim, focused on

---

<sup>4</sup> TA for 2002 HRD GS – Strategic Action Plans, 2003 ESF Project Management – for Guidance Centres and Pipeline project, 2002 Legislation in the Field of Education.

strengthening of the administrative processes and the absorption capacity at local and regional levels, has been slightly re-directed. The regional bodies are involved only in the Strategic Action Plan preparations. The agreed Action Plans should be implemented in the regions and should also provide an essential base for the next National Plan. Nevertheless, the actual involvement of the regions is very limited in the GS implementation. Although the intended benefits for regions in this respect are not likely to materialise, all HRD GS had a positive feature: the experience gained through the implementation of grants in the regions has undoubtedly contributed to the increased number and quality of applications presented for ESF funding, which would be very limited otherwise.

21. The 2001 Social Security Schemes TWL has met its purpose and the respective beneficiary institutions were provided with necessary knowledge on legislation and posting of workers, family benefits, and re-calculation of pensions. The EU legal requirements were introduced and are applied. If the 2002 Legislation in the Field of Education (MoEd) is successfully tendered, the project is likely to be implemented and thus potentially to duplicate similar activities on-going under the auspices of the MoLSAF. A more co-ordinated and harmonised inter-institutional approach for providing the ESF services (notably information and project design support) at regional levels has not materialised.

22. The aim of 2003 GS on Equal Opportunities supporting the implementation of the HRD Sector Operational Programme through the ESF-type of projects is at this stage duplicating the on-going ESF interventions, and therefore its planned implementation is not likely to bring substantial benefits. The different systems of funding mechanisms applied for PHARE and ESF may cause some competition in the use of these instruments. The 2003 EQUAL Initiative TW is highly appreciated and very useful providing effective – but last minute - assistance for the EQUAL Managing Authority. The achievement of expected benefits is questionable in the case of the 2003 ESF Project Management. The implemented TWL has been so far seeking for possibility of establishing the planned Guidance Centres and to identify the necessary funding arrangements for their operations. Training of the staff should ensure that the aim of the project is met. The Guidance Centres should thus provide the full scope of information on ESF. The other planned activities again focus on management training and project development schemes, and on the establishment of a project pipeline. This sort of assistance can be only reasonably effective if it is closely co-ordinated with all the relevant institutions. Provided it is implemented in the near future, it might deliver some benefit for the next Structural Fund cycle; for the current cycle, it will come too late.

#### 2.2.4 Sustainability

23. The official governmental policy is supportive of all measures contributing to the decrease the unemployment rate. Therefore, sustainability of the 2001 HRD GS in terms of effects for the end-users – unemployed and socially disadvantaged persons - should be potentially promising. A similar positive prediction can be made for the 2002 HRD programme. What has not been sustained is the experience of the regional bodies that were originally involved in the GS implementation as well as GS management experience gained in the course of three subsequent HRD GS projects (PHARE 2000/2001/2002), implemented by COLSAF. The Strategic Action Plans being currently prepared should not

only serve their purpose at the regional level, provided that MoLSAF is more deeply involved in this exercise, the next National Plan should be created mostly via synthesis of the regional plans and, for this purpose also, a link between the Ministry and the regions should be created. This national document should then be used for any future ESF call for proposals.

24. Being enforced through the legislation, the results of 2001 Social Security Schemes project will be sustained. Similarly, the benefits of the 2003 EQUAL Initiative TW will also be sustained. The outputs are used for day-to-day work of MoLSAF staff managing EQUAL. Similar prospects are expected for the 2003 GS on Equal Opportunities, where the achieved benefits can be sustained. What remains doubtful is sustainability of the widespread training activities planned within 2002 Legislation in the Field of Education and 2003 ESF Project Management. As previously mentioned, activities of similar nature in the past have not provided many sustainable effects.

### 2.2.5 Impact

25. In very general terms, the component will contribute to economic and social development. More specifically, 2001 HRD GS will, to a certain extent, contribute to the strengthening of the economic and social cohesion by fostering the employability of the most vulnerable groups. Less success is expected for the 2002 HRD intervention, where the preparation for the ESF administration, in particular for the MoLSAF and at the regional levels, was poor. The 2001 Social Security Schemes project provides a valuable contribution for the social securities of migrant workers. Based on the previous experience, not much is expected in terms of impact from 2002 Legislation in the Field of Education. On the contrary, it is expected that 2003 EQUAL Initiative will provide all necessary preconditions for the successful implementation of EQUAL Initiative. The duplicated intervention 2003 GS on Equal Opportunities could also contribute to the reduction and prevention of unemployment, and to increase the employability of socially excluded people. The expected impact from the 2003 ESF Project Management, determined as prompt absorption and maximum impact for ESF, is unlikely to be significant.

## 2.3 Component 3 – Health Care

### 2.3.1 Relevance

26. The objectives set for the programmes under this component are closely related to the implementation of the *acquis* and to the obligation of the SR as a new EU Member State to comply with the respective EU requirements. The objectives set out in the programming documents are consistent and relevant. The IoA were well chosen, however, in the case of the 2003 Communicable Diseases initiative, they could have been more specific, determining clear baselines and benchmark data. The 2003 Communicable Diseases will focus on administrative and implementing structures of epidemiological and laboratory control to ensure their integration into EU networks and to strengthen surveillance of communicable diseases. 2003 Statistical Health Information is assisting the introduction of the EU applied methodologies for gathering and processing data on health statistics, to be provided for the EUROSTAT (through the Statistics Office of the SR) and other international bodies. A part of the PHARE resources is devoted for the purchase of

hardware and for subsequent development of software tools for the data processing. The original intention of the programme - to implement simultaneously all three projects (TWL, hardware purchase and software development) - was not realistic, knowing the length of PHARE procedures. In particular, the ToR have to be developed with assistance of a TWL, which is planned for maximum 10 months duration. The need for direct involvement of SR into refunds for health benefits through a specific Liaison Body was addressed through the 2002 Social Security Systems activities. Although undoubtedly relevant, this assistance would have been much more useful if implemented earlier.

### 2.3.2 Efficiency

27. The project implementation has not encountered any substantial problems so far. The MoH has provided sufficient resources and skilled staff and is managing the projects adequately. The co-operation with the concerned beneficiary institutions (Institute of Health Information and Statistics - IHIS, health insurance companies, etc.) has worked well and regular meetings have been organised to share information and to monitor progress. Preparatory work on the projects included consultations with all the involved parties.

28. The estimated implementing schedules of 2003 Statistical Health Information was very tight and delays have occurred in the course of EDIS accreditation. The planned TA project was transferred into twinning light, which limited the duration of activities to 10 months maximum. The planned pilot testing activity cannot take place as scheduled and has been replaced by the preparation of medical accounts. The testing criteria will be determined but testing itself has to be postponed. Both related projects – hardware supply of as well as software development should start soon while the TWL activities are nearly completed. Taking into account that similar systems (for regional statistics and EU internal trade statistics) have been developed recently by the Statistical Office of the SR, it could be helpful to share the valuable experience for the successful management of such projects. Moreover, the data processed by the IHIS will be provided to the EUROSTAT through the Statistical Office. 2002 Social Security Systems TWL was implemented in line with the planned schedule. The individual 2003 Communicable Diseases projects are likely to commence soon and should be implemented smoothly.

### 2.3.3 Effectiveness

29. It is too early to judge the overall effectiveness of the health care component projects under this evaluation since only two projects have been implemented. The 2003 Statistical Health Information TW is providing the required methodological support and supplementary projects (hardware and software) should eventually enable the full provision of health statistical data in compliance with the EUROSTAT requirements. The indicators set out in the PF are likely to be achieved. The 2002 Social Security Systems TWL - although it was more urgently needed at an earlier stage - has delivered the expected effects and health insurance benefits and refunds are reimbursed in line with the EU legal framework. The 2003 Communicable Diseases projects are also likely to deliver the planned benefits, although in this case the supporting evidence in the form of the IoA is vague.

### 2.3.4 Sustainability

30. It is highly probable that all initiatives implemented as part of the health care component will be sustainable. In both 2003 Statistical Health Information and 2002 Social Security Systems, project ownership was secured from the outset. The outcomes are obligatory, following the legal measures applied in EU countries and therefore self-sustainable. The same expectation is valid for 2003 Communicable Diseases since the beneficiary institutions, dealing with the epidemiological and laboratory control of communicable diseases, are to be integrated into the operational EU networks.

### 2.3.5 Impact

31. Following the intervention logic of the programming documents, the projects under the health care component will contribute to the completion of the *acquis* in the respective areas, i.e. creation of systems and monitoring of health statistics, and surveillance and control of communicable diseases. The achievement of these overall objectives will mainly be attributable to the implemented project activities. In general, the impact of these interventions will materialise in the form of compliance and harmonisation of health sector systems, specifically those concerning reimbursement of health benefits within the EU, health statistics and communicable diseases.

## 2.4 Specific Issues

32. The accreditation process for the Extended Decentralised Implementation System (EDIS) has been completed and since 19 October 2004 all PHARE assistance has to be managed in line with this system. Any public procurement, including PHARE, should thus follow the respective Slovak legislation. However, the current local legislation does not permit some of the tools/instruments that are being used for implementing PHARE projects, notably as concerns GS, TW and TWL. To ensure the smooth implementation of PHARE assistance, and also those of the upcoming Transition Facility, legal solutions must be sought quickly to allow for the use of these instruments. The current legal framework concerning the implementation of PHARE (local directives etc.) which so far has been strictly following PRAG rules, can show some discrepancies in relation to the roles of Programmes Authorising Officers, Sector Aid Co-ordinators etc., that may require some adjustment in order to be in line with the newly introduced EDIS provisions.



### 3. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### 3.1 Conclusions and Recommendations

##### *Component 1 - Roma Minority*

33. An indispensable precondition for relevance of the 2003 education interventions is evidently the success of initiatives to improve markedly the performance of Roma pupils in primary school and especially to avoid their placement in special schools at the start of their educational career. The activities planned in the health area are complementary and together with the educational activities should result in positive synergy effects.

34. The efficient use of the assistance for Roma education and health care activities should not be endangered. Apart from the need to launch tenders as soon as possible to avoid last minute contracting, no substantial problems are currently foreseen for the upcoming 2003 Roma initiatives.

35. Based on the programming documents of the planned Roma initiatives, the achievement of the expected effects is seen as realistic. The pilot testing should provide indications of the most optimal solutions to be applied at the national level.

36. The 2003 interventions are pilot activities and therefore will notably require dissemination strategies to be in place. This should be decided before the end of the projects in order to ensure their sustainability.

37. For the time being, the 2003 Roma education and health care activities are expected to contribute to their planned overall objectives. At this stage it is however too premature to discuss the extent of this impact which is likely to materialise in a few years.

##### *Component 2 - HRD and ESF Preparation*

38. The principal need that was recognised during the planning period of the various projects under the HRD and ESF Preparation component was the necessity to prepare for the upcoming management and use of ESF. In this respect, most of the projects are considered *relevant* with the exception of a few projects where the assistance is likely to come too late, and therefore does not reflect the actual needs (2003 GS on Equal Opportunities, 2003 ESF Project Management). Overall, the quality of planning documents is acceptable with the usual weaknesses, notably in setting out appropriate IoA.

39. The *efficient* implementation of the HRD and ESF Preparation projects has encountered some difficulties. The monitoring of PHARE GS will require some improvements to fulfil its functions. The newly developed monitoring system is also only a short-term solution, and while it should assist the processing of final reports from 2001 and 2002 GS, it is not likely to be used for any other purpose.

40. Regarding the ESF structures, the 2001 and 2002 PHARE GS projects were intended to prepare the capacities for ESF. However, the ESF Section of MoLSAF is new and its staff have not been directly involved in PHARE GS activities. On the contrary, the long-

term experience of COLSAF, so far the only local institution dealing with HRD GS implementation, is of little help and mostly devoted to the implementation of National Programmes being co-financed by ESF. The intention of the PHARE projects to provide assistance on ESF management and administration to the regional bodies did not fully materialise: the original regional structures of the NLO were abolished (and replaced by the creation of a new COLSAF) and ESF is currently managed centrally, without much regional involvement. The closer link between MoLSAF and the regions is missing, which can be also seen in the 2002 project focusing on Strategic Action Plans preparation. The 2002 HRD intervention was expected to have an overall co-ordination body; however, this was either not established or not made operational. There has been an indication that some of the PHARE experts involved in HRD implementation have a conflict of interest due to their previous involvement in project preparation. Moreover, the reimbursement of PHARE fees to regional expert team members (Strategic Action Plans) who are at the same time employees of SCG's or other public institutions, has been observed in a number of cases, and this does not respect the PRAG principles. The current institutional arrangements for the ESF tends to duplicate some of the PHARE activities. This concerns mainly training in the area of project design and in development of partnership. Therefore, a more co-ordinated inter-institutional approach is needed to reach tangible effects for this part of ESF support. In this respect, the 2003 ESF projects, which have not started yet, will require serious re-consideration, to ensure the efficient use of funds.

41. It is expected that the individual HRD grant projects will mostly achieve their *effects* however it is not easy to predict the overall benefit, which can be finally expected from the 2001 HRD GS. Undoubtedly, some positive effects will be delivered, but based on the limited time and data available; it is not possible to estimate the benefits precisely. The 2002 HRD intervention is only partly in line with the original intent and therefore not likely to bring the full scope of expected results. The current ESF implementation is fully centralised and the projects have reflected this apparent centralised approach. Nevertheless, much closer co-operation of MoLSAF with the regions and their direct involvement is needed to guarantee successful results. The experience and knowledge gained through the 2000 and 2001 HRD GS provided a good platform for the current ESF proposals (in terms of number of applications and their quality). Rather limited benefits are expected from the 2003 GS on Equal Opportunities, clearly overlapping with the already launched ESF assistance in this area. To ensure effectiveness of the 2003 ESF Project Management projects (with the only exception of the already started TWL) these would need to be better re-focused towards the next structural funds cycle and should clearly involve regional levels. Moreover, at least within the current ESF arrangements, the institutions involved should agree on a reasonable approach, replacing the numerous but identical training initiatives for different target groups all over the country - which have been delivered also in the past but without much effect – through more effective support measures.

42. In general, the majority of the HRD and ESF Preparation projects have achieved, or are expected to achieve results that have good prospects for *sustainability*. In terms of sustainable capacity building, however, it is unfortunate that the long-term experience of the COLSAF (and also of some regional structures) in managing GS will have very limited

future use when, at the same time, such experience is urgently needed at MoLSAF. Based on previous experience, the sustainability of the often identical project design and training activities that are being planned again within different ESF projects is questioned.

43. Some positive *impact* from the HRD and ESF Preparation component through increased employability may be expected from the 2001 HRD GS and from the 2003 GS on EQUAL opportunities. A positive long-term impact, identified as stable and increased employment is also expected from the 2003 EQUAL Initiative. In terms of improved administration for the effective use of ESF, less is expected from the 2002 HRD GS due to the marginal involvement of the regional levels. Similarly, not much impact is expected from the 2003 ESF Project Management activities, which would have been much more useful if implemented earlier.

#### *Component 3 - Health Care*

44. Concerning the Health Care projects, their *relevance* is justified. The individual projects were mostly linked with the implementation of the *acquis* and/or necessity of the SR as the new Member State to harmonise the legal framework in this area with EU Directives. Implementation of the projects within the Health Care component has been running smoothly and *efficient*. The pilot testing of the Statistical Health Information System will not be carried out as part of the respective TWL but all preconditions are being provided to manage this task successfully. Since the provision of health statistics has to be carried out through the Statistical Office of the SR, and taking into account the recent experience of this Office with the development of similar statistical systems, there are issues that could be discussed commonly to ensure the best possible implementation of the projects and use of results.

45. The various Health Care projects are on the right track to become *effective*. Taking into account the current management structure, performance as well as design of the projects and expected results, the same expectation is also valid for the projects that are still to commence. *Sustainability* of the Health Care projects is highly probable. The expected results are mostly self-sustainable because they are linked with EU membership obligations. It is also expected that all of the projects will contribute to the achievement of their overall objectives, thus bringing some *impact* in the mid-term perspective. The harmonised system for the reimbursement of health benefits is already operational. Harmonisation of health statistics is also being completed. Following completion of the IT system, health statistics are likely to be fully harmonised. In the area of communicable diseases, an established system in the mid-term, which is becoming fully compliant with the respective EU Directives.

46. In the overall context of the EDIS introduction in Slovakia, the current legal framework concerning PHARE implementation may require some adjustments in order to be in line with the newly introduced EDIS provisions.

**RECOMMENDATIONS TABLE**

<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Output</b>	<b>Reference/ Paragraph</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Deadline</b>
Implementation of the 2003 pilot projects should include also the preparation for dissemination of positive outputs and achieved results.	The implementing bodies (MoEd, MoH) should prepare, as part of the pilot project, a dissemination strategy, which would include training of relevant staff, foreseen to replace the contracted TA experts, as well as determination of funds and sources, needed to ensure that the dissemination is targeted properly and realised smoothly at the national level.	Dissemination of good practice	12,36	MoEd, MoH	At the beginning of project implementation
The 2003 ESF preparation projects are not relevant any longer, because of their late start, and should be re-oriented. Such adjustment should address deficiencies identified in the currently implemented PHARE HRD/ ESF projects.	Where possible, MoLSAF should re-consider the current design of the 2003 projects and should find ways to use these funds more effectively, taking into account the need to include also regional and local levels in the project implementation.	Re-designed 2003 projects	15, 22,38	MoLSAF	With immediate effect
In some HRD/ ESF Preparation projects, PRAG rules seem to be not fully respected. Potential conflicts of interest were identified for contracted PHARE experts and reimbursement of fees to public administration staff should be reviewed in the light of the valid procedures.	The RDSA, as the IA in charge, should clarify if PRAG rules were respected for the identified cases and where possible and needed the RDSA should introduce corrective measures.	Respect of PRAG rules	18, 40	RDSA	With immediate effect
The current institutional set up for the ESF has the tendency to duplicate some of its activities. This concerns mainly training in the area of project design and in development of partnership.	All institutions involved in ESF management should be invited by MoLSAF to identify their common activities/services that could be covered by horizontal structures at the central and regional/local levels. For the time being, the provision of ESF information and ESF project generation services can be provided by the Guidance Centres.	Creation of harmonised horizontal structures	14, 19, 21, 40, 41	MoLSAF	With immediate effect
As the provision of health statistics is to be carried out through the Statistical Office of the SR, and taking into account its recent experience with the development of similar statistical systems, there are issues that could be commonly discussed to ensure the	The Institute of Health Information and Statistics (IHIS) and the Statistical Office of the SR should share the information on the project implementation and should consider the possible use of the same tools for the presentation and provision of statistical data for their end-users to keep the same format of data.	Exchange of information	28, 44	IHIS	With immediate effect

best possible implementation of the projects and use of results.					
To ensure the smooth implementation of PHARE assistance and of the upcoming Transition Facility interventions under EDIS, quick solutions should be sought to respect all legal arrangements.	The National Fund (NF) /National Authorising Officer (NAO) should call a meeting of all IAs, ACU and Public Procurement Office in order to clarify the valid legal framework and the rules that have to be followed for PHARE and Transition Facility. If some discrepancies are found between EDIS rules and the existing governmental directives, necessary changes should be introduced and guidelines, to be followed by the IAs, should be prepared.	Clear rules for implementation of upcoming assistance under EDIS	32, 46	NF/NAO & IAs	With immediate effect

### 3.2 Performance Rating

Component/ Project	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Sustainability	Impact	Verbal overall rating
<b><i>Roma Minority</i></b>						
2003-004-995-01-05	1	1	1	0	1	S
2003-004-995-01-06	1	1	1	0	1	S
<b><i>HRD and ESF preparation</i></b>						
SR-0107.02	1	0	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.15	1	-1	0	1	0	S
SR-0110.01.01.12	1	1	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.02 UIBF	-1	-1	0	-1	0	U
2003-004-995-03-11	-1	0	-1	1	1	U
2003-004-995-03-13	1	1	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-14	-1	0	0	-1	-1	U
<b><i>Health Care</i></b>						
2003-004-995-03-06	1	0	1	1	1	S
2003-004-995-03-07	1	0	1	1	1	S
2002/000-610.02 UIBF	1	1	1	1	1	S
<b>Taking into account the contextual constraints on the evaluation, the sector overall is rated to be 'SATISFACTORY'</b>						
<b><i>ESC Monitoring Sector/ Social Affairs and Human Resources Development</i></b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>S</b>

Ratings guide: -2 unacceptable; -1 poor; 0 sufficient/adequate; +1 good; +2 excellent.  
 HS-Highly Satisfactory, S- Satisfactory, U-Unsatisfactory, HU-Highly Unsatisfactory.

## **ANNEXES**

## ANNEX 1 INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT

Immediate Objective (Project Purpose)	Indicators of Achievement (Objectively Verifiable Indicators)	Remarks
<b>Component 1 – Roma Minority</b>		
<b>2003-004-995-01-05 Support to further Integration of the Roma Children in the Educational Field</b>		
Support and making it easier to pass from primary to secondary education for children coming from disadvantaged environment	Tutoring programme for preparation of children for secondary education introduced to schools	More exact specification in terms of number of schools and time frame is missing
Implementation of multicultural education at Slovak secondary schools	Multicultural development training programmes approved and becoming integral part of the Slovak secondary education system	Considered as valid at the national level, deadline could be useful
Adequate preparation of pupils for entering the labour and business environment	Training programmes preparing pupils for labour/ business environment approved and introduced to secondary schools	More exact specification in terms of number of schools and time frame is missing
<b>2003-004-995-01.06 Improved Access of Roma to Health Care</b>		
Improve the access of Roma to health care and raise their understanding of a healthy lifestyle	Roma morbidity rates approach national Slovak averages	Too ambitious for one project, baseline missing
<b>Component 2 – HRD and ESF Preparation</b>		
<b>SR-0107.02 Human Resources Development through Preventive and Individual Active Measures for the Unemployed</b>		
Facilitating the access into the labour market of the unemployed by providing them with individual	Decreased rate of unemployed from vulnerable groups (by 1.5% in 2004 compared to 2001)	



active measures tailored to their specific needs	Decreased number of social benefit dependents (by 2% in 2004 compared to 2001)	The indicator could even show more significant decrease than indicated but this would be due to the legal changes introduced in relation to the social benefits and therefore the figures could be misleading
<b>2002/000-610.15 Human Resources Development Grant Scheme</b>		
To strengthen the administrative processes needed to implement SOP-HRD contained in the National Development Plan at local and regional levels	Rate of absorption of the Grant Scheme	Not valid, it is not clear what should be actually measured
	Successful testing of all procedures of the programme cycle	Not valid, the Grant Scheme is centrally managed by the MoEd and COLSAF
<b>2003-004-995-03-11 Grant Scheme on Equal Opportunities and Social Inclusion Support</b>		
To support the implementation of the SOP-HRD through ESF type of projects aimed at employability support and development of inclusive labour market	Decreased rate of unemployed from vulnerable groups (by 1.5% in 2004 compared to 2001)	
	Decreased number of social benefit dependants (by 2% in 2004 compared to 2001)	
<b>2003-004-995-03-13 Create the Administrative Capacity for Implementing the EQUAL Initiative</b>		
Support of the Managing Authority for the EQUAL initiative and creating of mechanisms for effective implementation, correct control and launching the 1 <sup>st</sup> phase EQUAL initiative implementation	Targets stated in the development plan of the Managing Authority achieved by 05/2004	The referred targets are not known and deadline has already expired, not valid as an indicator
<b>2003-004-995-03-14 Preparing for ESF Project Management</b>		
Slovak administration, intermediaries at regional and district level and potential beneficiaries prepared for the participation in ESF programme operation	Targets stated in the development plan of the Managing Authority achieved by 05/2004	The referred targets are not known and deadline has already expired, not valid as an indicator
<b>Component 3 – Health Care</b>		
<b>2003-004-995-03-06 Strengthening of Statistical Health Information and its Harmonisation with EU Requirements</b>		

Methodological and technical strengthening of capacities for provision of statistical health information according to requirements of relevant foreign institutions	New methodology used in the data centre	Valid and applicable
	System passes all required performance tests	Valid and applicable
<b>2003-004-995-03-07 Strengthening the surveillance and Control of Communicable Diseases</b>		
Administrative and implementing structures concerning the Epidemiological and Laboratory Control of Communicable Diseases upgraded and surveillance of Communicable Diseases strengthened	The Communicable Diseases detection and response rate increased	Baseline and benchmark are missing and in this case more specific/ quantified indicators could have been provided

## ANNEX 2 LIST OF INTERVIEWS

INSTITUTION	INTERVIEWEE	DATE
Office of the Government of the SR Aid Co-ordination Unit Namestie slobody 1 SK-813 70 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Robert Ondrejko</b> Programme Manager	11.10.2004
Representation of the European Commission in the Slovak Republic Palisady 29B SK-811 06 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Ilianna Karastamati</b> Task Manager	13.10.2004
Representation of the European Commission in the Slovak Republic Palisady 29B SK-811 06 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Daniela Hanusova</b> Task Manager	14.10.2004
Ministry of Labour , Social Affairs and Family PHARE Unit Spitalska 4-6 SK-816 43 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Veronika Orsavova</b> SPO	18.10.2004
Ministry of Labour , Social Affairs and Family PHARE Unit Spitalska 4-6 SK-816 43 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Katarina Alexyova</b> SPO	18.10.2004
Ministry of Education of the SR PHARE Implementation Unit Section of European Integration Hanulova 5/b SK-844 29 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Julia Stepankova</b> SAC	19.10.2004
Ministry of Education of the SR Department for ESF Section of European Integration Hanulova 5/b SK-844 29 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Marta Slaninkova</b>	19.10.2004
Ministry of Health Project Unit of Foreign Aid Limbova 2 SK-837 52 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Zuzana Skublova</b> SAC	20.10.2004 10.11.2004
Ministry of Construction and Regional Development RDSA Implementation Department Špitálska 8 SK-816 44 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Alena Soltysova</b> Director	21.10.2004
Ministry of Construction and Regional Development RDSA Špitálska 8 SK-816 44 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Beatrix Baranyova</b>	24.10.2004
General Health Insurance Company (VsZP) Mamateyova 17 SK-850 05 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Andrea Galikova*</b>	25.10.2004

Institute of Health Information and Statistics Drienova SK- Bratislava	<b>Mr. Lubomir Vlcek*</b> SOP	28.10.2004
ECO Stromova 50 SK-831 01 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Ivan Takac</b> Deputy Team Leader	29.10.2004
Central Office of Labour, Social Affairs and Family Zupne nam. 5-6 SK-812 67 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Maria Sebova</b>	29.10.2004
Central Office of Labour, Social Affairs and Family Zupne nam. 5-6 SK-812 67 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Valeria Kubalova</b> Phare Grant Scheme Expert	29.10.2004
Representation of the European Commission in the Slovak Republic Palisady 29B SK-811 06 Bratislava	<b>Mr. Jochen Schult</b> Financial Officer	29.10.2004
Plenipotentiary of the Slovak Republic for Roma Communities Office of Government Cukrova 14 SK-811 08 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Klara Orgovanova</b>	05.11.2004
Afpa 13 place du General de Gaulle FR-931 08 Montreuil Cedex	<b>Ms. Mireille Ferre</b>	10.11.2004
Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family ESF Section Spitalska 6 SK-816 43 Bratislava	<b>Ms. Andrea Kostolna</b> Director General	11.11.2004
Civil Association "Dostojny zivot" Hviezdoslavova 15 SK-052 01 Spisska Nova Ves	<b>Ms. Dana Kacaliakova*</b> Project manager	11.11.2004
* telephone interviews		

### ANNEX 3

#### LIST OF DOCUMENTS REFERRED TO IN THE INTERIM EVALUATION

Name of Originator	Date	Title of Document
All ToR		
EMS Consortium	9 December 2003	R/SR/CIV/03.121
EMS Consortium	11 June 2003	R/SK/ESC/03.046
POHL	4 August 2004	R/SK/ESC/03.POHL
Government of the Slovak Republic/ European Commission	2001	Financing Memorandum 2001 and Project Fiches
Government of the Slovak Republic/ European Commission	2002	Financing Memorandum 2002 and Project Fiches
Government of the Slovak Republic/ European Commission	2003	Financing Memorandum 2003 and Project Fiches
Ministry of Health	May 2004	Romska cesta
Ministry of Education	6 September 2004	M/SR/CIV/04003
Ministry of Health	9 September 2004	M/SR/HEALTH/04003
Section of Human Rights and Minorities, Slovak Republic Government Office	10 September 2004	M/SR/CIV/04003
Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family	10 September 2004	M/SR/ESC/04008
Aid Co-ordination Unit	10 August 2004	M/SR/ESC/04007/HRD
Federal Ministry of Health and Social Security, Germany	June 2004	Inception report
Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, Spain	1 July 2004	Start-up report Ensuring Preparedness of the Slovak Public Health Insurance System to apply the Acquis on Co-ordination of Social Security Schemes
	August 2003	Memorandum of Understanding for HRD Grant Scheme
ECO	30 August 2004	Inception report TA for the project 2002/000.610-15
All Self-government Counties	September 2004	Inception reports - Development of Strategic Action Plans and
European Social Fund Division of the Joint International Unit, UK	April 2004	Twinning covenant - Create the administrative capacity for implementing the EQUAL Community Initiative
European Social Fund Division of the Joint International Unit, UK	September 2004	1 <sup>st</sup> Quarterly report twinning project: SK03/IB/SO/02
Ministry of Employment, Labour and Social Cohesion, France	July 2004	Start up report Preparing for ESF Project Management
RFV- National Social Insurance Board	April 2004	Start-up report - Strengthening the Performance of Slovak Administrative Structures Required for Co-ordination of Social Security Schemes

## ANNEX 4

### RECOMMENDATIONS FROM PREVIOUS INTERIM EVALUATION

#### Interim Evaluation Report No. R/SK/ESC/03046, issued 11 June 2003

Programmes/Components evaluated: SR-0107.02 Human Resources Development through Preventive and Individual Active Measures for the Unemployed, 2002/000-610.15 Human Resources Development Grant Scheme

Recommendation	Applied	Responsibility for Follow-up	Deadline	Remarks
MoLSAF should immediately review the managerial arrangements for PHARE projects at the Ministry with a view to determine clear and transparent responsibilities and competences. Moreover, the Ministry's Unit for European Social Fund should participate actively in the 2001 and 2002 PHARE HRD Programmes, with a view to benefit for their entire preparation activities.	Yes	MoLSAF/ Managing Section of the European Social Fund	With immediate effect	The PHARE Unit has been strengthened in terms of human resources. No direct participation of ESF Unit in the HRD Grant Schemes has been observed.
There is an urgent need to define the individual responsibilities of institutions involved in the 2002 HRD Grant Scheme. Also with regard to the 2002 HRD Grant Scheme, MoEd should immediately assess and remedy its rather poor administrative capacities so far made available for Grant Schemes, and should closely co-operate with RDSA, MoLSAF and NLO to ensure transfer of know-how necessary for successful implementation.	Yes	MoEd MoLSAF, NLO, RDSA	With immediate effect	Informal co-operation links have been established mainly with COLSAF due to the experience available on managing grant schemes. Staff has been hired however, the financial management on behalf of the MoEd has been suggested through a number of options but so far no final decision of the Ministry has been taken.

### Interim Evaluation Report No. R/SK/ESC/03.POHL, issued 4 August 2004

Programmes/Components evaluated: SR-0107.02 Human Resources Development through Preventive and Individual Active Measures for the Unemployed, 2002/000-610.15 Human Resources Development Grant Scheme

Recommendation	Applied	Responsibility for Follow-up	Deadline	Remarks
The implementing institutions should establish as a matter of urgency an appropriate financial management and control system for verification of payment claims. Advances should only be made in case of demonstrable need, and then only in smaller amounts, to be topped up as necessary against verified expenditure	Yes	MoCRD/ Section for Regional Development, RDSA	With immediate effect	RDSA has modified its Internal Manual accordingly. A monitoring of grants has not been established by the IA and is performed by the institutions managing the implementation of GS. Only final control is taking place at IA.
Steps need to be taken to augment the resources of the COLSAF to enable it to manage the Grant Schemes under its jurisdiction. Training should also be provided to the above as well as to the MoEd, which have very little experience in managing Grant Schemes.	Yes	Ministry of Education, MoLSAF, COLSAF, RDSA	With immediate effect	The Technical Secretariats at the Regional Labour Offices were closed down in January 2004 and, instead, employees responsible for Grant Scheme implementation at the Local Labour Offices were nominated in February 2004. Training on Project Cycle Management including monitoring and evaluation has been provided. The experience was shared with MoEd staff on informal basis.
Improved project preparation skills to be developed at the RDSA and in the regions. There should also be an immediate review of the status of projects to check their eligibility and a pipeline of projects to be prepared.	Yes	MoCRD/ RDSA	With immediate effect	Project design and contracting rate of the FM 2002 projects administered by the RDSA have improved in comparison to the FM 2001 projects. Internal Manual developed by the RDSA will further strengthen the management of the projects. Partnership approach in project design and implementation (within the MoCRD as well as with outside authorities) shall be applied rigorously in Phare and Structural Funds.

## ANNEX 5 DISSENTING VIEWS AND COMMENTS NOT INCORPORATED

### Comments not incorporated

Comment	Reference	Evaluators Response
<b>Aid Co-ordination Unit</b>		
consider whether the recommendation should not be addressed also to the EC Representation in the SR since then EC Delegation in the SR exercised the ex-ante control/ approval function at that time;	Page IV, Recommendation addressed to the RDSA, and page22	ECR was informed during drafting period; following EDIS introduction ECR cannot take any direct measures.
<b>European Commission Representation</b>		
Regarding the potential conflict of interest of some of the Phare experts and the payment of fare fees to employees of regional public administrations, the ECR would appreciate to receive in written form all available information. RDSA should not only clarify the issue and take corrective measures if necessary as recommended by the IE, but should inform accordingly the ECR.	para 31, page 12 para 53, page 20	The information was made available to the ECR/Financial Officer on 29 October 2004. All available information is reported in this IE report.  Provision of information to ECR can be agreed during debriefing meeting.
The 2003 HRD GS will be implemented by the MOLSAF, to be mentioned and to further underline the limited experience of MOLSAF. To recommend training of the staff of ESF section, the good practice of informal cooperation of MoEd and COLSAF could be of use.	para 30, page 12	A sort of informal training of MoLSAF staff was reported to take place and moreover, MoLSAF has already started to implement SF measures and therefore is likely to have experience before the 2003 GS on Equal Opportunities is implemented.
The 2002 HRD GS TA was contracted very late. It is nowhere mentioned in the IE.	Financial data table	Compared to the quite frequent practise to contract projects at the last date before commitment deadline the Evaluators do not consider contracting in June 2004 as being too late. Contracting is mentioned in the financial data table.
Recommendation to IAs involved (RDSA & CFCU), update financial data in PERSEUS quicker. The November 20 version used by the IE shows 0% disbursement for projects contracted in July. In case that the disbursement is indeed 0% after 3 months the reason of the delay should be mentioned.	Financial data table	According to the Evaluators' knowledge the Perseus system is updated min. twice a month or even more frequently. The original data provided by EC were much more outdated. Reason for 0% disbursement is occasionally caused by the lack



"on-the-spot monitoring ... no official report on the results was prepared". A recommendation to increase on-the-spot monitoring initiatives could be added. The preparation of such reports and their distribution to other parties involved should be strongly recommended.	para 29, page 11	of funds on the National Fund account. The Evaluators were assured that the new software module which is about to be completed will enable such summary reporting.
--	------------------	---

## **ANNEX 6**

### **ANNEX TO CHAPTER 1 SECTORAL SCOPE AND BACKGROUND OF THE EVALUATION**

#### **Component 1 – Roma Minority**

##### **2003-004-005-01-06 Improved Access of Roma to Health Care**

Although the foreseen projects have not started yet, substantial preparatory work has been carried out so far. Numerous data and information were gathered from various sources, through questionnaires, personal visits, discussions with NGOs, surveys etc., and analysed. The selection criteria were determined and co-operating municipalities were chosen. This approach has resulted in a change of the original PF that had already listed 15 municipalities selected on the base of statistical data. Further changes were proposed in relation to the number of field workers who are supposed to cover several municipalities (micro-regions), the number of mobile health care units and medical centre while the original project purpose remains. To reflect expected legal changes and to secure sustainability of the results, solutions were sought to resolve the future ownership of mobile health care units. The letter of notification was sent requesting the change of the PF. No feedback has been provided so far.

#### **Component 2 – HRD and ESF Preparation**

The management of the several projects under the HRD and ESF Preparation component has been entrusted to several institutions: Central Finance and Contracting Unit (CFCU) and RDSA are involved as Implementing Agencies. The implementation itself is managed by the Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family (MoLSAF), Central Office of Labour, Social Affairs and Family (COLSAF) and the Ministry of Education (MoEd).

##### **SR 0107.02 Human Resources Development Grant Scheme through Preventive and Individual Active Measures for the Unemployed**

The project is managed by COLSAF, successor organisation of the National Labour Office (NLO). Based on experience with the previous 2000 HRD GS the technical secretariats were established at the eight Regional Labour Offices. Each secretariat had up to five trained people who dealt with the promotion, selection and administration of the GS. However, with the abolishment of NLO and its regional structures (January 2004), all these tasks were transferred to COLSAF and each of its 46 local offices nominated one person as a contact point for the grant beneficiaries at the local level.

The call for proposal was published in August 2003. Regional promotion presentations were organised by the technical secretariats. The budget allocation was proportionally divided for the regions, giving priority to those with high unemployment rates (number of long-term unemployed) and to the disadvantaged regions (allocation for Kosice being thus three times higher than for Bratislava) and the selection process was carried out in all regions separately. In total 430 applications were received and 97 projects were selected and approved for financing. Contracts were signed in November 2003. On-the-spot monitoring of all projects was carried out in June/ July 2004. The grant contracts expired

on 30 September 2004 and all final reports were delivered by 15 October 2004. The financial control (to be done by an external auditing company) is taking place at present but the outputs and results are not processed yet.

### **2002/000.610-15 Human Resources Development Grant Scheme**

#### *Development of Strategic Action Plans and Building of Partnership at Regional, Sub-regional and Local Level (MoLSAF)*

The purpose of this project has been to develop Action Plans for Employment based on the agreed HRD strategies in all Slovak regions and also in compliance with the principles of European employment policy and National Action Plan for Employment. These plans should be developed in close co-operation with the relevant partners on regional and local levels. Originally, the proposed GS thus provided grants – through direct agreements – to eight Self-Government Counties (SGC). The project implementation started on 20 July 2004. Each SGC created a project team, analysed the situation in the region and sought for relevant partners. The inception reports were elaborated and SGC were eagerly waiting for the methodology to be delivered by the simultaneously running TA project that provided four experts (each covering two regions), assisting in development of an unified methodology for partnership development, regional capacity building as well as Strategic and Action Plans. Preparation of a framework for project design should be another important aspect of Strategic Action Plans. The TA experts are expected to deliver training on project cycle management, partnership building, strategic and action plans dissemination and to transfer knowledge within the SGC, sub-regional and local levels.

#### *Flexibility of Labour Market (GS - COLSAF)*

Call for proposals was published on 19 December 2002 and eight regional information seminars were organised by regional technical secretariats of the NLO. The GS is focusing on the promotion and implementation of preventive measures and support of the unemployed re-integration into working life. 267 applications were received. 142 did not pass the administrative compliance part of the evaluation. 50 projects were selected, contracts were signed on 7 June 2004 and implementation started successively. Since the former technical secretariats were abolished regional contact points were established to assist mainly with the selection of the unemployed for the grantees. The grant projects provide quarterly monitoring reports.

#### *Quality of Labour Market (GS - MoEd)*

The call for proposals for this GS was launched in January 2004. Regional presentations were organised with very high participation of potential beneficiaries (around 100 people at each event) and the necessity to comply with all administrative requirements when applying for grants was emphasised. Despite that, out of 370 applications received, 232 did not pass the first part of the selection due to non-compliance with these requirements. 49 projects were awarded grants and contracts were signed in July 2004. Unlike COLSAF, the MoEd applied joint co-financing. However, once the GS documents were prepared, it was not taken into account that the advance payment, though being paid by RDSA, is funded from two separate sources (PHARE and State budget) and thus two requests for funds had to be prepared, which delayed the start of the grant projects. The original requests for advance payment submitted by the grantees had to be re-submitted and an annex to each

contract had to be prepared and signed. As most of the grantees are not financially strong institutions the project implementation has not been started. It has been agreed that official project start is the date of the advance payment, which was - also due to the lack of funds in the National Fund - taking place only in mid-October 2004.

#### *Technical Assistance*

The aim of the TA project is to ensure that the implementing institutions possess the required skills and competencies and to assist the final users in fulfilling certain strategic functions in the co-ordination, and the development of partnerships and projects based on ESF principles. The TA has been providing assistance for each of the above-mentioned projects. As these three projects started earlier than the TA, the part of the TA tasks that was completed in the meanwhile had to be replaced by additional activities. The TA needs of the GS implementing authorities (COLSAF, MoEd) have been mostly focused on monitoring. One TA expert is dedicated to each GS. COLSAF possesses sufficient experience with GS and intensive discussions were held to share the knowledge with the MoEd staff where experience is lacking. In the case of COLSAF the TA experts are expected to assist mainly with the monitoring activities. GS databases are created by the implementing institutions comprising few and very basic information. However, the link/access of other relevant bodies to data and vice versa does not exist and should be subject of TA activities. Currently the module on monitoring reports is being prepared, which should enable automatic processing of data.

Regional workshops were organised for SGC teams to make them familiar with general aspects of EU and national employment strategies. The first part of methodology on data collection has been prepared and distributed.

#### **SR-0110.01.01.0012 Strengthening the Performance of Slovak Administrative Structure Required for Co-ordination of Social Security Schemes**

The project has served the purpose to confirm and enforce correct implementation of EU Directive transposed into the valid national legislation. Presentations, workshops and seminars were delivered for participants from MoLSAF and Social Insurance Company (SIA). The presented topics included legislation - bilateral agreements and the new regulation, posting of workers, handling of e-forms, pension calculations, family benefits, co-ordination of social security schemes, and a study visit to social insurance authorities in Sweden was organised. The Swedish EAT system (computer software for analysing e-forms and associated legislative information) was delivered and installed at MoLSAF and SIA, which is used to support the handling of cases for migrant workers. The strategy document for the dissemination of information on social security for migrant workers was drafted by the TW partner and was submitted for approval of the beneficiary institutions.

#### **2002/000.610-02 UIBF Human Resources Development – Legislation in the Field of Education and its Eligibility for ESF Funding**

The ToR were re-drafted several times and a TA tender was launched but only one offer was received. The project was changed into TWL and circulated in order to provide the last chance to contract it before the expiry date of the contracting period.

### **2003-004-995-03-11 Grant Scheme on Equal Opportunities and Social Inclusion Support**

The GS has not been launched yet. Because of the lack of previous experience with the GS implementation at MoLSAF, it has been decided to include a TA component into the GS.

### **2003-004-995-03-13 Create the Administrative Capacity for Implementing the Equal Initiative and Support the Launch of the Equal Initiative in the Slovak Republic**

The structure had to be established before the project launch. The TW thus provided mainly 'on-the-job' training for the ministry staff and for the Social Development Fund staff that represents the National Support Structure (NSS) in the regions. With the assistance of TW experts, tasks and responsibilities of the Managing Authority (MA) and NSS were set out and a draft work plan prepared, draft application form and selection criteria were improved. Training was provided for the MA EQUAL staff and new NSS staff. A two-day course for the co-ordinators took place to encourage and develop good quality applications. A study visit to enable both MA and NSS staff to understand financial and management information systems was organised. Manuals for MA and NSS staff and for applicants were produced. The call for proposal has been launched recently.

### **2003-004-995-03-14 Preparing for ESF Project Management**

#### *Twining Light*

The aim of the TWL is (i) to transfer the experience concerning ESF programme organisation and management structures to the regional and district administrations, (ii) to upgrade the skills of future specialists of the regional and district ESF administrations for directing the programme activities of intermediaries and beneficiaries, (iii) to develop manuals for Guidance Centres and (iv) to establish eight Guidance Centres at regional level. Since the ESF is managed centrally for the current programming period (up to 2006), the activities have focused mainly on the establishment of Guidance Centres. An initial mission took place with an aim to assist the SGC in finding partners in the regions. A further mission focused on the analysis of the situation for ESF – needs, availability of facilities, staff etc. in all regions. The SGC are being visited to discuss the establishment of the Guidance Centres. It is assumed that the staff of the Centres will be selected by the SGC by the end of November 2004. The contractor is going to test the employees to identify the gaps and to prepare the necessary training that should be subsequently delivered. The salaries of these employees will be reimbursed from the TA budget of ESF whilst the expenditures connected with the operation of the Centres should be covered by SGC, based on the agreement signed with the MoLSAF. The number of staff will depend on the scope of services provided by individual Centres (advisory services, project design assistance). A manual is being prepared to provide basic guidelines for the staff. The performance of the Centres should be measured via the indicators (such as number of submitted and selected projects).

#### *ESF Project Management Capacities, Project Generation Facility, and Quality Assurance*

The projects should provide further training for Guidance Centres, in order to deal with the project design at the regional level and with the quality of the projects. ToR have been drafted and submitted for approval.

### **Component 3 – Health Care**

#### **2003-004-005-03-06 Strengthening of Statistical Health Information and its Harmonisation with EU Requirements**

##### *Strengthening of Statistical Health Information System*

The TWL is running with an aim to harmonise methodologies in order to provide relevant information in the specific structure requested by EU institutions and other international authorities. Some adaptations of the project were introduced at the inception phase. This concerned mainly pilot testing of the system that was correctly replaced by determination of testing criteria and introduction of health accounts, which is completely new and likely to become compulsory in EU. The preparation of technical specification (supply of hardware) and ToR (software development) was assisted by the TWL partner. Tender evaluation for supply of hardware has been taking place and a contract should be signed soon. The tender for software development is being launched. The analysis of indicators' harmonisation is nearly completed.

#### **2003-004-005-03-07 Strengthening the Surveillance and Control of Communicable Diseases**

The TW partner has been selected and signature of the covenant is expected soon. Two more projects should be implemented: software development and training, and supply of hardware, software and laboratory equipment.

#### **2002/000-610-02 UIBF Ensuring Preparedness of the SR Health Information System to Apply the Acquis on Co-ordination of Social Security Systems**

The TWL comprised series of seminars dealing with selected topics delivered for the employees of the Health Insurance Companies and MoH staff. The participants gained knowledge and skills in handling reimbursement payments for health care within EU, processing of e-forms and provision of statistical data. The Liaison Body is operational and manual on using and processing e-forms was prepared.