

**Interim Evaluation of the
European Union
Pre-Accession Instrument Phare**

Country: Slovak Republic

Sector: Civil Society

Programmes covered:

**SK-0002 Improvement of the
Situation of Roma in the Slovak
Republic**

**SR-0103.01 Support of the Roma
Minority in the Educational Field**

**SR-0103.02 Infrastructure
Support for Roma Settlements**

**2002/000-610.03 Further
Integration of the Roma Children
in the Educational Field and
Improved Living Conditions**

SK-0013 ACCESS 2000

Author: EMS Slovakia

Date: 09 December 2003

Controlled copy.....of.....

Signed:.....



This report has been prepared as a result of an independent evaluation by the EMS consortium being contracted under the Phare programme. This report has been also produced as part of the EMS know how transfer activities in the area of interim evaluation.

The views expressed are those of the EMS consortium and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Commission.

EUROPEAN COMMISSION, Enlargement Directorate-General

Directorate E - Resources & Finance E3 Evaluation

E-mail: Elarg-Evaluation-EMS@cec.eu.int

ABSTRACT

Scope of the Evaluation

This standard Interim Evaluation covers Phare assistance to the 'Civil Society' Monitoring Sector under Financing Memoranda 2000, 2001 and 2002. The present composition of 'Civil Society' comprises Programmes totalling M€ 15.7 from Phare and M€ 9.4 from national resources. Phare support is being delivered via twinning, classical technical assistance, investments and grant schemes.

Key achievements, findings and recommendations

The main achievements of the Programmes under evaluation will be increased living conditions and improved access to education and employment for parts of the Roma population, as well as strengthened operational capacity of local non-governmental organisations.

All the evaluated Programmes are *relevant*. However, the majority of the Roma assistance has been designed in an over-ambitious way; basic conditionalities and/or assumptions were not fulfilled in time, thus leading to substantial contracting difficulties for the majority of the Roma support (especially for the SR-0103.02 Component). Major parts of the sectoral assistance have been suffering from problems with *efficiency*, particularly due to different forms of delays adversely influencing the proper contracting and implementation of many projects. Crucial contracting difficulties appear still for the SR- 0103.02 Roma infrastructure; if the Commission Services would not agree with the requested one-year extension, a substantial amount of funds would be lost for the Roma housing interventions; however, since this 2001 project is seen as a priority both for the European Commission and the Slovak Government extension is likely to be achieved.

Due to the severe efficiency problems in the Sector *effectiveness* is mixed and definitely not secured yet for a number of 2001 interventions. There is likelihood that all Roma interventions can potentially contribute to the achievement of their wider sectoral objectives, provided the outstanding activities can be contracted and implemented in an acceptable manner. In order to ensure substantial *impact* and *sustainability* of the achievements, the majority of the sectoral assistance will need a continuous commitment from the Government; particularly in the longer-term perspective. This has not been sufficiently ensured yet.

Recommendations include *inter alia*:

- The Office of Plenipotentiary for Roma Communities together with the Pre-Accession Adviser should show how the outputs from the SK-0002 twinning are going to be included into the Government's official documents.
- The status and working conditions of Phare trained Roma field workers and Roma employment counsellors should be clarified, including their future financing.
- The Ministry of Education should present plans for the incorporation of the outcomes of the SR-0103.01 Component into their Roma Education Strategy.
- The Ministry of Construction and Regional Development together with the Section for Human Rights and Minorities should demonstrate the intended use of the 2002 Phare part, focusing on the preparation of technical documentation for further Roma infrastructure interventions.

Sector Sheet

Civil Society			
Number	Type of Assistance	Programme/ project title	Implementing authority
SK-0002	TWIN, TA, INV	Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the Slovak Republic	Office of the Government/ National Labour Office, Ministry of Education
SR-0103.01	TA, INV	Support to the Roma Minority in the Educational Field	Office of the Government/ Ministry of Education
SR-0103.02	TA, INV	Infrastructure Support for Roma Settlements	Office of the Government / Ministry of Construction and Regional Development
2002/000-610.03	TA, INV	Further Integration of the Roma Children in the Educational Field and Improved Living Conditions	Office of the Government/ Ministry of Education/ Ministry of Construction and Regional Develop
SK-0013	GS	ACCESS 2000 Programme	Civil Society Development Foundation

TWIN – Twinning, TA – Technical Assistance, GS- Grant Scheme, INV – Investment,

Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the SR (SK-0002) aims at improvement of living conditions for Roma in the Slovak Republic through enhancement of conditions for Roma to integrate into society while maintaining their ethnic identity, increasing mutual tolerance between Roma and non-Roma municipal communities, facilitating the entry of young Roma people in the labour market and increasing the level of education at all types of schools. The Programme is in line with the relevant governmental strategies, namely, such as ‘Strategy of the Government Addressing the Problems of the Roma National Minority and Set of Measures for Its Implementation – Stage I and II’ and ‘Basic Theses of Government Strategy for Integration of Roma Communities’.

Support to the Roma Minority in the Educational Field (SR-0103.01) focuses on improvement of the educational standards of the Roma minority in the Slovak Republic and promotion of the tolerance and integration to the society via enhancement of the pre-school education in kindergartens, strengthening of the whole day care system and enhancement of concepts of preparatory classes, reintegration of socially disadvantaged children from special schools into the standard primary schools, promotion of tolerance and integration to the society. The Component support implementation of the governmental Roma strategies plus will contribute to the new School Act and the Roma Education Strategy both under auspices of the Ministry of Education.

Infrastructure Support for Roma Settlements (SR-0103.02) concentrates on improvement the living standards of Roma citizens in the Slovak Republic and implementation of the Strategy of the Government of the Slovak Republic for Solving the Problems of the Roma National Minority and the Set of Measures for its Implementation- Stages I and II through co-ordination of the project implementation, preparation of the technical documentation and realisation of the construction works. The Component is in line with the government strategies supporting development of Roma Communities, namely ‘The Priorities of the Government of the Slovak Republic in Relation to Roma Communities for the Year 2002’, ‘The Comprehensive Roma Settlement Development Programme’, ‘The Pilot Programme of Field Social Workers’, ‘The Social Housing Programme’ and ‘The National Plan for Regional Development’

Further Integration of the Roma Children in the Educational Field and Improved Living Conditions (2002/000-610.03) aims at improvement of the educational standard of the Roma population and at creating conditions for improvement of living conditions of socially disadvantaged groups of inhabitants via successful implementation of the integrated system of educating Roma, and at selected municipalities’ ability to improve more effectively the living conditions of the socially disadvantaged groups of inhabitants. As a follow-up of the Roma 2001 assistance, the Programme will support all the relevant governmental strategies relating to Roma education and infrastructure.

ACCESS Programme (SK-0013) focuses at implementation of the acquis in areas of NGO/NPO activities and encouragement of the participation of individuals at risk of being socially, economically or politically marginalised through strengthening of the institutional capacity of NGOs/NPOs, stimulating initiatives from NGO/NPO in favour of acquis objectives, supporting activities by NGO/NPO in sectors where governments are not active strengthening the operational capacity of organisations, through transfer of know-how, training, seminars, etc. and promotion of networking of NGOs/NPOs

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE

GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS

FINANCIAL DATA

Financial and Contractual Data of the Sector 'Civil Society' - Sector Overview
Financial Performance of the Sector 'Civil Society'

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY I

MAIN REPORT 1

1.	SECTORAL BACKGROUND AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION.....	1
1.1.	<i>Sectoral Background</i>	1
1.2.	<i>Scope of Evaluation</i>	1
2.	EVALUATION RESULTS.....	6
2.1	<i>Relevance</i>	6
2.2	<i>Efficiency</i>	7
2.3	<i>Effectiveness</i>	10
2.4	<i>Impact</i>	12
2.5	<i>Sustainability</i>	13
2.6	<i>Specific Issues</i>	14
3.	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	15
3.1	<i>Conclusions and Recommendations</i>	15
3.2	<i>Performance rating</i>	19

ANNEXES..... 21

<i>ANNEX 1. INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT OF SECTOR OBJECTIVES AND EVALUATION CRITERIA</i>	23
<i>ANNEX 2. LIST OF INTERVIEWS</i>	25
<i>ANNEX 3. LIST OF DOCUMENTS REFERRED TO IN THE INTERIM EVALUATION</i>	27
<i>ANNEX 4. NATIONAL PROGRAMME FOR ADOPTION OF THE ACQUIS COMMUNAUTAIRE (NPAA)</i>	29
<i>ANNEX 5. RECOMMENDATIONS FROM PREVIOUS ASSESSMENT / INTERIM EVALUATION AND FOLLOW-UP</i>	31
<i>ANNEX 6. DISSENTING VIEWS</i>	35
<i>ANNEX 7. ANNEX TO CHAPTER I SECTORAL BACKGROUND AND EVALUATION SCOPE</i>	37

PREFACE

This standard Interim Evaluation covers Phare assistance to the ‘Civil Society’ Monitoring Sector in Slovakia under Programme Components SK-0002 ‘Improvement of the Situation of Roma in the Slovak Republic’, SR-0103.01 ‘Support of the Roma Minority in the Educational Field’, SR-0103.02 ‘Infrastructure Support for Roma Settlements’, SK-0013 ‘ACCESS 2000’ and 2002/000-610.03 ‘Further Integration of the Roma Children in the Educational Field and Improved Living Conditions’.

The Interim Evaluation has been prepared by the EMS Consortium¹ with active participation of the Aid Co-ordination Unit (ACU) at the Slovak Office of Government² during the period from August 2003 to September 2003 and reflects the situation at 25 September 2003, the cut-off date for the Interim Evaluation. The factual basis is provided by the Monitoring Report M/SR/CIV/03004 prepared by the Aid Co-ordination Unit at the Slovak Office of Government, covering the period from 1 January to 30 April 2003 and issued on 13 June 2003. Other findings are based on analysis of the Financing Memoranda, formal Programme documentation, and interviews with the main parties and published material.

The Interim Evaluation examines the progress of the programmes towards the objectives stated in the formal programming documents, i.e. Financing Memoranda, Project Fiches, etc. The report is intended to provide management information for the benefit of the Joint Monitoring Committee (JMC) and other involved parties. It draws conclusions and puts forward Recommendations. It provides a general assessment of programmes or components under consideration and included in the corresponding Sectoral Monitoring Report.

Comments requested on the Draft version were received from the following parties:

Parties invited	Comments received
Civil Society Development Foundation	yes
Ministry of Construction and Regional Development/ Regional Development Support Agency	yes
Ministry of Education	yes
Office of Government/ Section of Human Rights and Minorities	yes
Office of Government/ Aid Co-ordination Unit	yes
National Labour Office	yes
Central Finance and Contracting Unit	yes
Ministry of Finance/ National Fund	yes
Commission Services at the Delegation	yes
Commission Services at Headquarters/ Country Team Slovakia	no
Commission Services at Headquarters/ Evaluation Unit	yes

Where possible, the Evaluators have integrated the comments received into the report. Dissenting views are in Annex 6.

¹ The authors of this report are Viera Gazikova (EMS) and Martin Orth (ACU), assisted by ACU Task Managers Kornelia Cajkova, Iveta Faberova, and Denisa Kuttyova. The report was reviewed by EMS Bratislava Team Leader Dietmar Aigner and at EMS Central Office by Project Director Richard Haines.

² This report has been a pilot report, prepared under the EMS activities focusing on the development and strengthening of monitoring and evaluation capacities for candidate country administrations.

GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS

Acronym	Description
ACU	Aid Co-ordination Unit
AP	Accession Partnership
CC	Community Centre
CFCU	Central Finance and Contracting Unit
CSDF	Civil Society Development Foundation
ECD	European Commission Delegation
EDIS	Extended Decentralised Implementation System
EMS	The Independent Interim Evaluation and Monitoring Services of Phare
EU	European Union
FM	Financing Memorandum
FWC	Framework Contract
OoG/ GoS	Office of Government/ Government of Slovakia
IA	Indicator of Achievement
IB	Institutional Building
IE	Interim Evaluation
IO	Immediate Objective
IS	Information System
IT	Information Technology
JMC	Joint Monitoring Committee
JHAMPA	Justice and Home Affairs, Minorities and Public Administration
LO	Labour Office
MoCRD	Ministry of Construction and Regional Development
MoE	Ministry of Education
MoF	Ministry of Finance
MoLSAF	Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family
MR	Monitoring Report
NF	National Fund
NGO/NPO	Non-Governmental /Non Profit Organisation
NLO	National Labour Office
NPAA	National Programme for Adoption of the <i>Acquis Communautaire</i>
NPO	Non-Profit Organisation
PAO	Programme Authorising Officer
PC	Personal Computer
PP	Plenipotentiary
RDSA	Regional Development Support Agency
SAC	Sector Aid Co-ordinator
SC	Steering Committee
SAIA	Slovak Academic Information Agency
SAO	Senior Authorising Officer
SHRM	Section of Human Rights and Minorities
SKK	Slovak Crowns
SMSC	Sectoral Monitoring Sub-Committee
SR/SK	Slovak Republic
SW	Software
TA	Technical Assistance
TC	Twinning Covenant
ToR	Terms of Reference
VAT	Value-added Tax
WO	Wider Objective

FINANCIAL DATA

Financial and Contractual Data of the Sector 'Civil Society' - Sector Overview

Programme Number	Programme Title	Expiry Date for contracting	Expiry Date for disbursement	Allocation (in M€)		Phare Funds		Co-financing	
				Phare	Co-financing	Commitment	Disbursement	Commitment	Disbursement
SK-0002	Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the Slovak Republic	31/12/2002	21/12/2003	3.800	0.309	3.694	2.262	0.092	0.072
SR-0103.01	Support to the Roma Minority in the Educational Field	30/11/2003	30/11/2004	1.700	0.675	0.520	0.152	0.850	0
SR-0103.02	Infrastructure Support for Roma Settlements	30/11/2003	30/11/2004	8.300	8.400	0.185	0.180	0	0
2002/000-610.03	Further Integration of the Roma Children in the Educational Field and Improved Living Conditions	30/11/2004	30/11/2005	1.000	0.050	0	0	0	0
SK-0013	ACCESS 2000	31/12/2002	30/11/2003	0.900	0	0.900	0.720	0	
	Total			15.700	9.434	5.299	3.314	0.942	0.072

Source: Monitoring Report No. M/SR/CIV03004, dated 13/06/2003, Perseus dated 25/09/2003,

Financial Performance of the Sector 'Civil Society'

		Allocation		1 st Monitoring Report 09 May 2002				Current Sectoral Monitoring Report 13 June 2003				Expected performance at next cut off date				Expiry Date ³
		Phare	Co- finance	Phare		Co-finance		Phare		Co-finance		Phare		Co-finance		
				%	%	%	%	%	%	%	%					
Component/ Project Number ⁴	Start Date ⁵	M€	M€	com	dis	com	dis	com	dis	com	dis	com	Dis	com	dis	
SK-0002	28/12/01	3.800	0.309	15	3	0	0	97	51	0	0	97	90	80	80	31/12/03
SR-0103.01	19/12/02	1.700	0.675	0	0	0	0	11	9	0	0	95	95	95	95	30/11/04
SR-0103.02	29/07/02	8.300	8.400	0	0	0	0	2	2	0	0	50	45	50	45	31/11/04
2002/000- 610.03	no com. yet	1.000	0.050	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	95	90	100	100	30/11/05
SK-0013	09/08/02	0.900	0	2	1	0	0	100	78	0	0	100	100	0	0	31/12/03
Total		15.700	9.434	25 ⁶	10 ⁷	0 ⁸	0 ⁹	32	19	0	0	72	67	61	50	

Source: Perseus dated 25/09/03, M/SR/CIV/0112 dated 10/01/02, M/SR/JHA/02002 dated 31/10/02, and M/SK/SOC/02002 dated 18/11/02, M/SR/CIV/03004 dated 13/06/03

³ Last day for disbursement

⁴ Identical with numbers in sector description tables

⁵ Date of first commitment

⁶ = total of committed PHARE funds for this sector divided by total allocated PHARE funds in %

⁷ = total of disbursed PHARE funds for this sector divided by total allocated PHARE funds in %

⁸ = total of committed funds from co-financing sources for this sector divided by total allocated funds from co-financing sources in %

⁹ = total of disbursed funds from co-financing sources for this sector divided by total allocated funds from co-financing sources in %

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Slovak Republic – Civil Society

Monitoring Report: M/SR/CIV/03004 issued on 13 June 2003

Interim Evaluation Report: R/SK/CIV/03121

This standard Interim Evaluation covers Phare assistance to the ‘Civil Society’ monitoring sector under programme components SK-0002, SR-0103.01, SR-0103.02, SK-0013 and 2002/000-610.03. The present composition of ‘Civil Society’ comprises programmes totalling M€ 15.7 from Phare and M€ 9.4 from national resources. The Phare support is being delivered via twinning, classical technical assistance, investments and grant schemes.

Scope and Objectives

The assistance is focused on the adoption and application of the *acquis*, particularly focusing on the protection of minorities’ rights - namely by combating discrimination of Roma and improving their living conditions; on civil society strengthening; and on the development of non-governmental/ non profit organisations.

Evaluation Results

Relevance	All the evaluated programmes are relevant; the majority of the Roma assistance has however, been designed in an over-ambitious way; basic conditionalities/ assumptions have not been fulfilled in time, leading to consequent substantial contracting difficulties.
Efficiency	Assistance under the Sector has suffered from problems with efficiency, particularly due to different forms of delays adversely influencing the implementation of many projects, notably in the area of Roma infrastructure.
Effectiveness	Provided that the severe efficiency problems in the Sector can be resolved, most of the evaluated programmes will at least positively contribute to their respective immediate objectives.
Impact	There is likelihood that all Roma interventions will contribute to the achievement of their wider sectoral objectives, provided the outstanding activities can be contracted and implemented in an acceptable manner.
Sustainability	Sustainability of most of the evaluated Programmes, particularly in their long-term perspective is not sufficiently ensured yet.

Relevance

The individual Components remain relevant, particularly with regard to the Roma minority issue. However, most Components are suffering from over-ambitious designs and very limited time available for implementation. Design of SK-0002 is especially vulnerable with regard to time constraints and delays experienced at the start of individual projects. SR-0103.01 provides mainly research activities and due to its complexity it had to be split into two parts which had caused crucial delays in implementation. The SR-0103.02 Roma infrastructure intervention – suffering from poor project preparation, unclear conditionalities and unfulfilled assumptions - is consequently heavily delayed. The 2002 Roma intervention raises concerns in its part focusing on preparation of technical documentation for further Roma infrastructure improvements, due to the absence of the logical Phare 2003 infrastructure follow-up. SK-0013 is appropriately designed for sectoral purpose.

Efficiency

Proper efficiency of the Sector has to some extent suffered from on-going staff fluctuation of key stakeholders, namely the Section for Human Rights and Minorities and the Office of the Plenipotentiary for Roma Communities. However, performance of the Ministry of Education has clearly improved. Delays in implementation of SK-0002 have also negatively influenced its efficiency. Regarding the SK-0002 twinning both, the benefiting Section of Human Rights and Minorities as well as the Member State Twinning Partners have found co-operation difficult. Both Components of the 2001 Roma Programme are heavily delayed and have been becoming candidates for extension. In the event that the Commission Services Headquarters would not agree with the one-year extension for SR-0103.02, a substantial amount of funds would be lost since no time remains anymore for proper tendering. However, there has been strong likelihood that such an extension would be granted. Performance of the implementing Regional Development Support Agency and commitment of the overall Ministry of Construction and Regional Development has been exceptionally poor. The 2002 Roma Programme will need to follow the lessons learned from implementation of the so far rather poorly performing 2001 Programme. The current commitment and disbursement rates are at disappointing low levels.

Effectiveness

Most of the Programmes will contribute to their immediate objectives, provided that the substantial efficiency problems – particularly for Phare 2001 - can be resolved, notably with the support of the Commission Services. The SK-0002 education sub-programme is likely to become effective once the developed working materials and new curricula will be consequently implemented in schools; the SK-0002 Roma tolerance sub-programme has resulted in the opening of ten community centres. Under the SK-0002 unemployment sub-programme, Phare trained counsellors which work now at various labour offices in order to stimulate Roma employment. Almost no tangible effects can be reported yet from the two-year SK-0002 twinning. For the SR-0103.01 and SR-0103.02 Components, effectiveness to date is poor; only some small activities have been implemented with however, varying success. The 2002 Programme has not started yet but indicative projections can be regarded at sufficient levels for its education sub-programme; effectiveness of the 2002 sub-programme focusing on the preparation of technical documentation for future Roma infrastructure interventions is questionable. SK-0013 has successfully contributed to the fulfilment of most of its immediate objectives; however fewer effects will materialise on the intended institution building for local non-governmental organisations.

Impact

There is likelihood that all Roma interventions will contribute to the achievement of their wider sectoral objectives by producing some immediate impact via their pilot activities – provided the outstanding activities can be contracted and implemented in an acceptable manner. However, for having a broader and longer-term impact the individual pilot activities, stimulated by Phare, will need to be replicated country-wide and backed by a healthy mixture of national and EU financial resources. Regarding SK-0013, apart from the direct impact on the benefiting non-governmental organisations, the broader impact on the third sector as a whole will be limited.

Sustainability

Projections of sustainability are mixed with potential risks notably in the long-term perspective. Some Roma investments should be clearly self-sustainable. Technical assistance delivered for various Roma pilot activities should be sustainable, mostly in the short-term. The

SK-0002 twinning raises serious concerns with regard to its long-term sustainability. Mid-term sustainability of the other SK-0002 sub-programmes is also under threat. Sustainability of pilot activities under SR-0103.01 will require a firm Government commitment with regard to its implementation. The SR-0103.02 infrastructure intervention will need – apart from the final beneficiaries' continuous support - also further Government commitment in order to finance complementary housing schemes; this has been clearly not sufficiently demonstrated yet at this time of the evaluation. No big risks can be predicted for sustainability of the education part of the 2002 Programme; however the 2002 technical assistance for preparation of technical documentation cannot be considered as potentially sustainable at this point of time due to the apparent absence of any clearly defined Roma infrastructure follow-up activities. Long-term sustainability of many local non-governmental organisations, and thus also of the delivered SK-00013 support remains questionable.

Conclusions and Recommendations

Summary of the Conclusions

Due to a number of delays, mostly resulting from insufficient or even unrealistic project design, the majority of the 2000 and 2001 Roma assistance is crucially late. SK-0002 has, to some extent, recovered and a number of activities are now running well. There remains some principal concern on efficiency and effectiveness of the sectoral assistance, recognised in a number of activities, but notably under the SR-0103.01 and SR-0103.02 Components. Both 2001 Components are heavily delayed and have been becoming candidates for extension. If the Commission Services Headquarters would not agree with the requested one-year extension for SR-0103.02, a substantial amount of funds would be lost for the Roma housing interventions; however, since this particular 2001 intervention is seen as a priority both for the European Commission and the Slovak Government extension is likely to be achieved. A major positive exception has been the Civil Society Development Foundation, adequately implementing the SK-0013 Programme. The 2002 follow-up Roma intervention raises some concerns due to the absence of a feasible 2003 Roma infrastructure continuation. Long-term impact and sustainability of the majority of the sectoral assistance will need in particular a continuous commitment from the Government. Whilst there have been encouraging signs in terms of active participation notably from the Ministry of Education, performance of the implementing Regional Development Support Agency and commitment of the Ministry of Construction and Regional Development has been so far rather poor in this regard.

Summary of the Recommendations

- The Office of Plenipotentiary for Roma Communities together with the Section of Human Rights and Minorities and the SK-0002 pre-accession adviser should submit a committing document to the European Commission Delegation and the Aid Co-ordination Unit showing where and when the outputs from the SK-0002 twinning are going to be included into the Government's official documents, including the Roma Strategy.
- The Office of Plenipotentiary together with the Section of Human Rights and Minorities and the Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family should clarify the unclear legal status of Roma field workers, should define their future financing and should present this commitment by means of a relevant document to the European Commission Delegation and the Aid Co-ordination Unit.
- The National Labour Office in co-operation with Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family should present a binding position document to the European Commission Delegation and the Aid Co-ordination Unit, regarding the future employment conditions for the Phare trained pool of Roma employment counsellors.

- The Ministry of Education should present a document to the European Commission Delegation and the Aid Co-ordination Unit showing the detailed plans for the incorporation of the outcomes of the SR-0103.01 Component into the Roma Education Strategy, including a relevant action plan for the implementation of the project outcomes.
- The Ministry of Construction and Regional Development together with the Section for Human Rights and Minorities should submit to the European Commission Delegation written commitment, showing the intended use of the 2002 Phare part, focusing on the preparation of technical documentation for further Roma infrastructure interventions. If no clear commitment can be demonstrated in terms of how and by when future infrastructure interventions will be undertaken by the Slovak Government, the respective funds should be re-allocated.

As a large proportion of the assistance is not being used efficiently with possible adverse consequences on effectiveness, impact and sustainability, the overall rating for this cluster under the ‘Civil Society’ Sector is ‘**Unsatisfactory**’:

	SK-0002	SR-0103.01	SR-0103.02	2002/000-610.03	SK-0013	Sector
Relevance	1	0	1	0	1	1
Efficiency	-1	-1	-2	0	0	-1
Effectiveness	1	-1	-1	0	1	0
Impact	1	1	-1	0	0	0
Sustainability	0	0	-1	-1	-1	-1
Verbal overall rating	Satisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Satisfactory	Unsatisfactory

Ratings guide: -2 unacceptable; -1 poor; 0 sufficient or adequate; +1 good; +2 excellent.

Highly Satisfactory	The programmes reviewed are expected to achieve or exceed all the objectives set during their lifetime
Satisfactory	The programmes reviewed are expected to largely achieve the objectives set during their lifetime
Unsatisfactory	The programmes reviewed are not expected to achieve most of the objectives set during their lifetime
Highly Unsatisfactory	The programmes reviewed are not expected to achieve any of the objectives set during their lifetime

MAIN REPORT

1. SECTORAL BACKGROUND AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION

1.1. Sectoral Background

1. 'Civil Society' (CIV) represents – in terms of financial allocations - at present the smallest of the four Monitoring Sectors of Phare assistance in Slovakia. The individual Programmes/Components under the Sector relate to the adoption and application of the *acquis communautaire* by focusing on the protection of minority rights, namely by combating discrimination of the Roma population and by improving their living conditions. Overall, the individual parts of the CIV assistance are in line with the Slovak Government's 2002 Declaration, which foresees the continuous implementation of development programmes for Roma, their integration into the society with the focus on the regions, and also intends the strengthening of partnership between the Government and the non-governmental sector. The individual Programmes relate also to the National Programme for Adoption of the *Acquis* (NPAA), focusing on education of socially disadvantaged groups and co-existence of Roma and non-Roma communities. Major parts also relate to the 'Strategy of the Government Addressing the Problems of the Roma National Minority and Set of Measures for Its Implementation – Stage I and II', to the 'Priorities of the Government of the Slovak Republic in Relation to Roma Communities for the Year 2002', to the 'Comprehensive Roma Settlement Development Programme', the 'Pilot Programme of Field Social Workers', the 'Social Housing Programme' and to the 'Basic Theses of Government Strategy for Integration of Roma Communities'. Moreover, the 2001 Roma Programme is in line with the National Development Plan (NDP).

1.2. Scope of Evaluation

2. This Interim Evaluation (IE) covers CIV related Programmes under Financing Memoranda (FM) 2000, 2001 and 2002, focusing on minorities, civil society strengthening and on the development of Non-Governmental/Non Profit Organisations (NGOs/ NPOs). The 2000 and 2001 Roma assistance under the CIV Sector was previously evaluated as part of the at that time existing Monitoring Sector 'Justice and Home Affairs, Minorities and Public Administration' (JHAMPA) (see R/SK/JHA/03.044, dated 10 March 2003); the other parts of the CIV Sector (SK-0013 and the 2002 Roma intervention) were subject of a carry-over IE (see R/SK/CIV/03.045, dated 26 March 2003). Further support is intended under FM 2003 with two more Roma Programmes focusing on education and health. At the time of this IE the FM 2003 was still under final preparation. Overall, the CIV Sector consists of the following Programmes/Components:

Financial and Contractual Information for the Programmes/Components under Evaluation:

Programme/ Component Title	Allocated (M€)	Committed (M€)*	Disbursed (M€)*
SK-0002 Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the SR	3.800	3.694	2.262
SR-0103.01 Support to Roma Minority in the Educational Field	1.700	0.520	0.152
SR-0103.02 Infrastructure Support for Roma Settlements	8.300	0.185	0.180
2002/000-610.03 Further Integration of the Roma Children in the Educational Field and Improved Living Conditions	1.000	0	0
SK-0013 ACCESS 2000	0.900	0.900	0.720
Total	15.700	5.299	3.314

*Perseus to cut-off date 25 September 2003

1.2.1 Performance of Activities

Component 1: SK-0002 Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the SR

Activities and Outputs

3. SK-0002 is a follow-up of previous Phare assistance and aims at (i) increasing mutual tolerance between the Roma and non-Roma population, (ii) at improving the conditions for young Roma to enter the labour market, and at (iii) increased access of Roma to education. For a detailed description of activities carried out under the Component see Annex 7.

Effects

4. Some effects from the SK-0002 twinning part have materialised through the 'Basic Theses of Government Policy Concept for Integration of Roma Communities', adopted by the Government in April 2003. The EU Report on Slovakia from July 2003 positively evaluated this Roma Strategy and therefore also the Pre-Accession Adviser (PAA) contribution. Though the PAA and his team have contributed to the health part of the Strategy a comprehensive output from the twinning was however still missing at the time of this IE. SK-0002 has brought tangible effects in the form of ten Community Centres (CCs) which have been reconstructed or new built. Also training of about 30 field workers and of more than 400 volunteers has been completed. Phare assistance to Roma employment has succeeded to prepare a pool of 32 trainers/ counsellors who are now placed at labour offices (LO) mostly in East Slovakia. Training of almost 600 Roma (age between 18-26 years) in preparation of employment action plans has been completed and about 150 of them are now being employed in about 20 incubators. Interventions in the field of education are at the final stage of implementation; the respective projects have had some effects - 50 kindergartens, 70 primary schools and 4 secondary schools established alternate education programmes and form. Over 250 persons, supported by six universities and methodical centres, have had training and will introduce new teaching methods including multicultural education. Working and methodological materials for the education of Roma children for kindergartens, primary and secondary schools and adults have been prepared.

Component 2: SR-0103.01 Support of the Roma Minority in the Educational Field

Activities and Outputs

5. This Component aims at (i) improving pre-school education via the implementation of the 'Mother and Child' module in kindergartens with high proportion of Roma children; at (ii) improvement of the primary education of the Roma minority through the introduction of a whole day care and of reintegration modules in the educational process, and at (iii) establishment and functioning of CC. For more details see Annex 7.

Effects

6. Only one framework contract (FWC) for the re-integration of socially disadvantaged children from standard special schools has been under implementation at the time of this IE. The bulk of assistance, covering supplies for kindergartens, schools and CCs, together with Technical Assistance (TA) for CCs has been still not under physical implementation. So far, the education experts have completed school readiness tests and have started to test a group of 300 Roma children. However, the full effect of the assistance will only materialise once the

developed tests are used country-wide. Moreover, the part focusing on differential diagnosis has also not started due to severe delays in approving the chosen experts.

Component 3: SR-0103.02 Infrastructure for Roma Settlements

Activities and Outputs

7. The aim is to improve the living standards of the Roma by delivering basic infrastructure to segregated Roma settlements (e.g. drinking water supply, sewerage systems and road communications), and thus to create better conditions for the integration of Roma into the society. Alongside the infrastructure building, community work will be carried out. For more details see Annex 7.

Effects

8. The only project from this 2001 intervention which has brought some moderate effects is the FWC, which assisted in preparing the technical documentation for a group of 11 settlements, prepared Terms of Reference (ToR) for the second group of villages and delivered some on-the-job training plus office equipment for the implementing Regional Development Support Agency (RDSA). However both the technical documentation and the ToR had to be re-done to a substantial extent by the RDSA. Infrastructure for the beneficiaries (in total 30 Roma settlements) is crucially delayed, due to serious contracting problems stemming from unsolved land ownership, delayed building permits, and thus missing preconditions for preparation of technical documentation and the subsequent start of tendering. Due to the very advanced calendar for Phare 2001 contracting, a one-year extension had to be requested by the implementing RDSA; approval from the Commission Services Headquarters is pending at the time of this IE.

Component 4: 2002/000-610.03 Further Integration of the Roma Children in the Educational Field and Improved Living Conditions

Activities and Outputs

9. This Component aims (i) at the further integration of socially disadvantaged Roma children into standard primary schools and (ii) at preparation of technical documentation for infrastructure projects for municipalities lacking necessary financial resources and having high proportion of socially disadvantaged groups living in their villages. For more details see Annex 7.

Effects

10. No effects can be reported at the time of this IE since project activities have not started yet.

Component 5: SK-0013 ACCESS 2000

Activities and Outputs

11. As a horizontal programme for ten candidate countries, ACCESS aims at institutional building (IB) in order to strengthen the civil society before accession. The Programme supports the operational capacity of NGOs/ NPOs through co-financing grants of projects relevant to certain social need priorities, particularly in the fields of consumer protection, socially disadvantaged groups and environmental protection. NGO/ NPO activities in the social and health field are also supported together with the coverage of participation costs in

EU-wide NGO/ NPO networks (mainly via the Networking Facility focusing on providing grants to cover travel costs). For a detailed description of activities carried out under the Component see Annex 7.

Effects

12. SK-0013 has been fully committed in the form of grants to 98 successful applicants (including the Networking Facility), supporting a broad range of local NGOs in all selected areas. At the time of this IE the implementing Civil Society Development Foundation (CSDF) has been focusing on the monitoring of the supported activities, which have to be completed by 30 October 2003. So far only some effects have occurred from the supported training and other soft skills activities, such as improved social service to handicapped people or raised environmental awareness in certain areas.

1.2.2 Corrective Actions already undertaken for each Component

13. For all Programmes under review the corrective action requested the assurance of an adequate absorption capacity at all relevant implementing bodies. This has been fulfilled only partially with still some gaps. More specifically, for SR-0103.01, the corrective action refers to adjustment of Project Fiche (PF) (the amount of the supply contract) from the side of the European Commission Delegation (ECD). The requested change was endorsed by the ECD on 11 April 2003. For SR-0103.02 besides some semantic clarifications, the corrective action asks for fulfilment of land ownership and building permit as preconditions for future Phare assistance in infrastructure; no further infrastructure projects are envisaged for the CIV Sector under the Phare 2003 allocation.

1.2.3 Anticipated actions for the next interim evaluation

14. For the SK-0002 twinning part, future activities will concentrate on work of the relevant working groups within the participating ministries, further study visits to Member States (MS) and the delivery of inputs into the Roma Strategy plus the final conference to summarise results of the twinning; also, the planned activities in the reconstructed and newly opened CCs will have to be implemented; assistance to young unemployed Roma will deliver further training for counsellors and also for the aged group 15-18. A group of adult Roma will be placed for training in incubators and the equipment has to be delivered to this selected group of companies. The educational strand will put stress on implementation of new working materials in schools, on complete curricula for vocational schools and on further training in multicultural education.

15. For SR-0103.01, contracting of the equipment for kindergartens, schools and CC has to be completed by the end November 2003 latest; reintegration of socially disadvantaged children should start with its differentiation diagnosis part, seminars for teachers have to be completed, sources for development of software need to be provided and the Roma education strategy also needs to be completed. For SR-0103.02 tendering of the construction works for 11 settlements is now expected only for September/October 2003 and preparation of technical documentation for the other 19 villages have to be finished as soon as possible. Construction works for the 11 settlements are expected to commence in autumn 2003. Infrastructure for the remaining 19 settlements cannot be contracted anymore within the regular schedule for Phare 2001, and therefore will need an extension. The project focusing on co-ordination of implementation has to be re-tendered due to previous lack of suitable bids. 2002/000-610.03 should focus on contracting of the relevant TA and equipment. For SK-0013, future activities represent

continuous monitoring of grants/micro projects, collection of final reports and transfer of the final payment to the beneficiaries – all to be completed by the end of November 2003.

1.2.4 Fact-sheet

16. For the detailed Fact-sheets reference is made to Annex 7.

2. EVALUATION RESULTS

2.1 Relevance

17. All Phare Roma Programmes remain relevant due to the widespread and complex problems of the Roma community in Slovakia and also due to the lack of domestic financial resources for their solution. Phare Roma interventions contribute directly to the relevant governmental strategies.

18. The design of SK-0002 covers all main areas of Roma problems. The design however has proven to be over-ambitious, notably once delays have occurred in contracting and implementation. Some designed activities have proven to be unrealistic during the implementation, such as training of very young unemployed Roma (as parents have to approve their training attendance outside their homes) or as having only three incubators for practical training of 150 people. Also more public relation activities should have been included in the Programme design, especially on the regional and national levels to increase awareness about the Phare Roma Programme and also to better disseminate results. Moreover further stages of the de-centralisation process in the country have caused difficulties in implementation of some parts of SK-0002, particularly for the education strand (such as decentralisation of school competences to regional entities), which has not been foreseen in the original assumptions. Also future plans of the Government to streamline some parts of the state services, such as social and unemployment ones might influence outcomes of the Roma unemployment assistance which was not foreseen in the programme's design. On the other hand inclusion of Roma representatives in Steering Committees (SC) of SK-0002 and of NGOs in SK-0013 is positive. Indicators of achievement (IAs) have proved to be very difficult to measure since keeping statistics on Roma pupils seems to be difficult due to compliance with the valid anti-discriminatory legislation in Slovakia. The rating for the SK-0002 Programme is *good*.

19. The design of the 2001 Roma Programme, focusing on Roma education and infrastructure has been also problematic. Particularly SR-0103.02 has been lacking conditionalities of solving land ownership and having building permits prior to preparation of technical documentation. Also the questionable complementarity of this Phare funded infrastructure intervention with the Government's Social Housing Programme¹⁰ has been giving ground for concern between the Ministry of Construction and Regional Development (MoCRD) and the Commission Services. It still remains unsolved. The rating of the SR-0103.02 Component is *adequate*. SR-0103.01 provides mainly research activities with only little foreign input. It had to be modified slightly as the Component was split into the school readiness assessment and differential diagnosis part. This has caused delays notably in approving additional experts for the latter part in order to comply with Phare rules. The role of the teacher assistants has proven to be necessary for successful work with small Roma children. The rating of the SR-0103.01 Component is *good*.

20. 2002/000-610.03 is a follow up of SR-0103.01 and SR-0103.02 by merging the education and infrastructure parts of the 2001 predecessor intervention into a single and quite modestly equipped 2002 Programme. In particular the projected sustainability of the 2002 part focusing only on the preparation of technical documentation for further 30 Roma settlements is questionable due to the absence of a logical 2003-investment follow-up. Financing sources for the intended infrastructure follow-up are not clearly defined and lacking commitment in the

¹⁰ See also IE Report R/SR/JHA/03.044.

respective PF. Apparently, finance from EU structural funds or some governmental programmes might be the available possibilities but have not been assessed in detail in the respective PF. IAs remain poor and are not really applicable for evaluation purposes (see Annex 1). As for these and under given sectoral IAs their improvement is foreseen as a part of the on-going EMS know how transfer activities in monitoring and evaluation. The rating of the 2002/000-610.03 Programme is *adequate*.

21. SK-0013 represents probably the last Phare NGO intervention in Slovakia. The assistance is focused on selected priorities, such as environment and socially disadvantaged groups and complemented by the Networking Facility it remains relevant. The attempt of the implementing CSDF to improve the relevant IA which were of poor quality - as published in Monitoring Report M/SR/CIV03004 of 13 June 2003 - could be praised; however adjustments relate only to the results level and also miss any baseline data that could be used for monitoring and evaluation purposes (see also Annex 1). The rating of the SK-0013 Programme is *good*.

2.2 Efficiency

22. Performance of the CIV Sector is suffering from problems with efficiency, particularly due to different forms of delays adversely influencing the implementation of many projects.

23. Overall co-ordination for SK-0002, SR-0103.01, SR-0103.02 and 2002/000-610.03 remains with the Section of Human Rights and Minorities (SHRM) at the Office of the Government (OoG), where the responsible Sector Aid Co-ordinator (SAC) is placed. As the National Aid Co-ordinator (NAC) is at the same time Deputy Prime Minister for European Integration, Human Rights and Minorities, in the case of the CIV Sector he is having a twofold political responsibility: being the overall co-ordinator of the Phare assistance and at the same time being responsible for the actual implementation of the minority programmes. The staffing at the SHRM has undergone further changes compared to the previous evaluation with two more vacancies to be filled at the time of this IE. Temporary lack of staff at the SHRM has caused difficulties in the timely processing of some documents, such as contractor's reports and invoices. Also communication of the SHRM with the SK-0002 PAA has been very problematic causing, for instance several re-drafting of minutes from monthly meetings and delays in progress reports' approval. The co-ordination of the Roma Programmes from the side of the SHRM seems to be satisfactory. However, co-ordination of the upcoming 2003 Roma Programme is expected to be entrusted to the MoE and the Ministry of Health, with the SHRM's only moderate involvement via participating at SC meetings. SHRM's co-operation with the RDSA of the MoCRD has improved only slightly; monthly meetings are now organised but the informal and more flexible communication is still almost missing.

24. Implementation capacity of the Regional Development Support Agency (RDSA) at the Ministry of Construction and Regional Development (MoCRD) has to some extent improved compared to the last IE, especially after the arrival of a new Director of the Implementation Department in February 2003. In the main however, the RDSA is still confronted with tremendous contracting difficulties for Phare 2001, which do not allow anymore complete contracting before the end of the 2001 commitment period. As a first consequence this has resulted - among others - also into a formal request of the Government for an analysis of the Phare 2001 infrastructure contracting problems and of the RDSA's performance (which is being currently prepared by the MoCRD). Some signs of improvement of the RDSA performance could be seen only for the Phare 2002 preparation, where moderate progress can be observed. The previously reported trend of an improved performance of the Ministry of Education (MoE) has continued, which positively influenced implementation of the Roma

education projects. The decrease of implementation capacity of the Office of Plenipotentiary (PP) for Roma Communities – envisaged in the previous IE - has unfortunately materialised. The understaffing of the PP Office was especially alarming during the first half of 2003 with only three permanent experts working for the PP. The human resources situation is improving only gradually with more organisational changes to come next year, pending on the Government approval. The proposal of the PP new organigram includes, besides a Secretariat with overall responsibilities, a new Office for Integration of Roma Communities under the Government, responsible for implementation of specific projects.

25. Efficiency of SK-0002 has suffered from delays at the start of the projects due to combination of late contracting and lengthy approval of the inception reports. Besides the four-month initial delay of the two-year twinning arrangement, further delays in implementation of the other one-year projects were even more drastic. Time constraint has caused several difficulties, notably in the Roma tolerance strand where several activities had to run in parallel, rather than in sequence (such as reconstruction of CCs and training of its staff). A similar situation has occurred for the assistance part dedicated to unemployed young Roma. In the case of the Roma education, the timing of this over-complex Programme was also dependent on the school year, thus shortening the effective time for implementation even more. The activities aimed at kindergartens were negatively influenced by the late opening of the ‘parents rooms’ funded through co-financing. Lack of time will negatively influence potential effects of several activities, as not enough time is being provided, for example for monitoring the Roma counsellors performance at LOs or for testing of new methods and their practical implementation under real life conditions (mostly schools). Further delays were caused by some logistic problems (SK-0002 twinning – PAA’s office moved twice). Also employment of experts with insufficient English knowledge (education strand of SK-0002) seems to be questionable, though private resources are now being spent for translation purposes. On the other hand, lack of resources for translation of draft documents causes difficulties in legal advice of the SK-0002 twinning. Quality of reporting from the twinning has unfortunately not improved compared to previous IE (R/SK/JHA/03.044) with regard to the form and also content of the provided information. Some changes were necessary to be made notably in the strand focusing on the improved employment of young Roma. Due to difficulties to find the planned group of very young unemployed Roma – under 18 - more adults have been trained. Also out of the planned three incubators only one existed at the start of the project. Presently about 30 companies have been short listed to serve as incubators for the project purposes. Though this new arrangement would require more resources for on-site monitoring, we can evaluate the planned increased number of incubators as a positive step towards efficiency and effectiveness of the assistance to the unemployed Roma. With some exception, information sharing and co-operation among individual stakeholders seems to be satisfactory also due to the fact that one contractor is responsible for two strands of the SK-0002 intervention and the SR-0103.01 Component. The rating of the SK-0002 Programme is *poor*.

26. Implementation of SR-0103.01 was also delayed due to complexity of tasks in the school readiness assessment part of the Component and also lengthy approval of experts for the differential diagnosis part. The latter has led to the request for project extension (till February 2004), which has been recently approved by the ECD. Also problems with payment of Value Added Tax (VAT) that was not originally included in the co-financing part for the equipment for kindergartens, schools and CCs, have caused delays in contracting the relevant supplies. According to Phare rules co-financing is a net contribution, and thus the final beneficiary should ensure VAT payments from national co-financing. Probably due to unawareness about this fact from the side of beneficiaries this was not done. Consequently, the Government via

its Decree of July 2003 had to approve a respective increase of budgetary funds for VAT coverage.

The rating of the SR-0103.01 Component is *poor*.

27. Efficiency of SR-0103.02 shows pretty poor results (see also Annex 7). The MoCRD/RDSA has requested a one-year extension of the contracting and disbursement periods mainly due to unsolved land ownership and missing building permits in the second group of the settlements. The request was done in early August 2003 and the (likely positive) decision is expected only by the end of November 2003. In the case of a rejection of the extension - with consequent loss of Phare funds - realisation of this more than M€ 6 infrastructure part is almost unrealistic. Also the situation with the supporting local Social Housing Programme remains still unclear at the time of this IE. Though appropriate funds from the 2004 state budget were made pre-conditional for the extension of the contracting and disbursement periods, the M€ 11 allocation for the 20 Roma settlements under the Government's priority programmes is expected to be decided only after the cut-off date of this IE in the Government and subsequently later this year in Parliament. In case the allocation is not approved for the selected Roma settlements, these together with other municipalities, would need to compete for a pool of about M€ 20 forecasted for housing support within the MoCRD budget line. Also the 2001 project focusing on co-ordination of implementation has not been contracted yet due to difficulties of the bidders to comply with the very complex Terms of Reference (ToR). The rating of the SR-0103.02 Component is *unsatisfactory*.

28. To assure efficiency of 2002/000-610.03, close co-ordination between the SHRM on one side and the MoE and the RDSA on the other side will be needed, together with active involvement of other the key stakeholders, such as Office for PP for Roma Communities. For follow-up assistance, the results and lessons learnt from the Phare SR-0103.01 and .02 Components should be used in the 2002 Roma Programme to assure its smooth implementation and to avoid unnecessary delays. At present the progress in preparing its contracting is sufficient. The rating of 2002/000-610.03 is *adequate*.

29. When evaluating efficiency of SK-0013, the effect of late transfer of funds from the National Fund (NF) to the Civil Society Development Foundation (CSDF), causing a fourth-month slippage of paying the first tranche to grantees. This was partially overcome by flexibility of respective NGOs in financing the activities. The CSDF Director fulfils the role of a SAC adequately. The CSDF has currently four employees who should be able to finish all the necessary activities including monitoring of all the grants until November 2003. The future of the CSDF beyond December 2003 remains rather unclear and depends on senior political decisions. The rating of the SK-0013 Programme is *adequate*.

30. The Central Finance and Contracting Unit (CFCU), together with RDSA and CSDF, is responsible for contracting of the Programmes under evaluation. The CFCU however does not provide any monitoring of projects they have contracted. Besides the transfer of the Unit to the Ministry of Finance (MoF) as of 1 January 2003 and appointment of a new Director as of 1 March 2003, the Unit has undergone almost a complete change of its staff after the departure of the EU funded Programme Managers end of June 2003 (with a couple who quitted in August 2003 and one leaving in December 2003). Despite a rather lengthy selection process with currently a few more vacancies, the re-shuffle of staff has not had significant negative influence on the CFCU performance for the CIV Sector, though some criticism with regard to the quality of submitted contracting documents and also concerns with Extended Decentralised Implementation System (EDIS) readiness exist. Moreover, some old problems with physical

delivery of documents between the ECD and the CFCU reoccurred, causing slight delays in the contracting process.

31. At the European Commission Delegation (ECD) a very committed Task Manager is responsible for overall supervision of all the Programmes under review. However, her broad portfolio where Roma programmes represent about 80 percent is hardly manageable by one person and lowers her possibilities of personal interventions notably in projects' implementation and monitoring.

32. There were two Programme Managers responsible among other responsibilities also for the CIV Sector at the Aid Co-ordination Unit (ACU). One of them left ACU at end of August 2003. As her successor will have to deal with the Justice and Home Affairs agenda besides the Roma Programme we can predict that some time will be needed for her to get familiar with such a broad portfolio of responsibilities. The ACU is presently preparing for new tasks related to the decentralisation of evaluation, and thus its staff actively participated also at this IE. Also as of 1 August 2003 the National Contact Point for Twinning was transferred from the Communication Strategy Department of the GoS to the ACU, which could be evaluated as a positive step towards better co-ordination of all twinning-related issues.

33. The National Fund (NF) plays an important role in co-financing of the Programmes. A new Director has started in July 2003 and the NF has undergone some fluctuation of staff. It is too early therefore to evaluate impact of these changes. The co-financing of the SK-0002 Programme has been delayed also contributing to the late implementation of some activities (mostly in the education strand). Problems with the omission of the VAT in Phare 2001 seem to be beyond the NF responsibilities. However, it is still difficult for evaluators to obtain updated and accurate information on commitment and disbursement rates of co-financing for the evaluated programmes from the NF.

34. The commitment/disbursement figures of the entire CIV Sector under evaluation show an overall 34 percent commitment, accompanied by only 21 percent disbursement rates and one and zero percent for the co-financing part. Compared to the official priority of this Sector these are disappointing results. The poor performance is caused mostly by the outstanding contracting of the 2001 Components (particularly the heavy SR-0103.02 intervention).

2.3 Effectiveness

35. Provided that the severe efficiency problems in the Sector can be to some extent resolved most of the CIV Programmes will at least positively contribute to the respective immediate objectives (IOs).

36. SK-0002 will substantially contribute to the achievement of its IO aiming at *improving conditions for Roma to integrate into society while maintaining their ethnic identity*. Almost all of the 2000 activities are at their last stage of implementation, mainly focusing on testing the transferred know-how in the real life. We can foresee that e.g. the intervention to Roma education will result into tangible effects, such as multiethnic education in kindergartens and primary schools, when using the developed working materials by the teachers and assistants trained. The relevant IA (see Annex 1) measuring increased Roma students at all levels of education is therefore only of limited relevance as e.g. university education is covered only partially under the SK-0002 Programme. Also community work in the selected Roma settlements should clearly benefit from the functioning of the reconstructed and newly opened CCs. The pool of trained counsellors currently placed at LOs and on the job training of young

Roma should have a positive effect on Roma employment. However the relevant IA seems to be too optimistic, not mentioning difficulties with finding the relevant statistical data. Compared to the previous IEs we are less positive when evaluating the potential effects of the twinning project. Though being under implementation now for the second year, due to a combination of problems such as complicated environment requesting senior level of political support and also logistic problems, not many effects can be reported at this stage (besides some contribution input into the Roma Strategy as approved by the Government in April this year). There are still some hopes for more effects to be shown in the comprehensive strategy document which has to be delivered by November 2003. The rating of the SK-0002 Programme is *good*.

37. The only projects, which have brought some effects from SR-0103.01 and SR-0103.02, have been so far the both small FWCs. The SR-0103.01 education FWC focusing on reintegration of socially disadvantaged children into standard schools will positively contribute to the IO, namely *successful implementation of the new systematic educational structures for the Roma minority*. As the project has progressed only with the development and testing of new school readiness assessment, further efforts would be needed to implement entry tests in the real life and also to adjust the existing Roma education strategy by the MoE. However the defined IAs seem to be again over-ambitious, particularly the *30 percent increase of community members participating at the education system within two years*. So far effectiveness is rather poor. The rating of the SR-0103.01 Component is *poor*.

38. The SR-0103.02 FWC focusing on preparation of technical documentation finished in December 2002. However, the completed documentation for the first group of 11 settlements required further inputs from the side of the MoCRD in order to be used for the infrastructure purposes. Overall, the whole Component is seriously delayed and effectiveness is at heavy risk. Particularly the part dealing with infrastructure for the 19 settlements with unsolved land ownership cannot be secured anymore without Programme extension. Thus the IO tackling *improvement of the Roma living conditions in the East of Slovakia* cannot be achieved anymore under normal conditions and will need a positive decision on the side of Brussels regarding the one-year extension of the commitment and disbursement periods and also positive developments with regard to the state budget allocation for the Social Housing Programme. Moreover, due to lack of co-operation in some settlements from the side of mayors (Svinia) and perceiving land ownership problems (Letanovce), a serious threat exists that at least one of these settlements would finally not be included into the programme. We also remain sceptical about achieving the *improved conditions for 20 percent of Roma living in settlements* as defined in one of the IA. The rating of the SR-0103.02 Component is *poor*.

39. 2002/000-610.03 has not started yet, and thus none of its planned effects has been achieved at this pre-implementation stage. From its design we can predict a potential contribution to the IO focusing on *implementation of integrated system of Roma education* via the model of integrated schools. Due to limitations of its design the part providing TA to municipalities in preparation of technical documentation is not likely to contribute significantly to its IO aimed at improved *living condition of socially disadvantaged groups*. The rating of the 2002/000-610.03 Programme is *adequate*.

40. SK-0013 has so far resulted into some effects, such as awareness raising via training activities, seminars on the relevant parts of *acquis* in the area of the environment and social development, and also improved living conditions of the socially excluded groups, and thus we remain positive with regards to fulfilment of the relevant IO focusing on *stimulation of acquis*

driven activities in the third sector or support of activities where government is not active. Also the Networking Facility will clearly contribute to the fulfilment of the IO aiming at *promotion of NGO networking* mainly via funding of participation of NGO representatives at European conferences and other similar events. Few hopes remain about achievement of the IO focusing on *strengthening of institutional capacity of NGOs* since substantial IB is represented in the supported grants only to a rather limited extent. The IAs available for IOs cannot be used for evaluation purposes. The rating of the SK-0013 Programme is *good*.

2.4 Impact

41. There is likelihood that all Roma interventions will contribute to the achievement of their wider sectoral objectives by producing some immediate impact via their pilot activities.

42. Due to its broad definition we can expect that SK-0002 will have a certain positive impact on the *improved living conditions of Roma* as defined in its wider objective (WO). We can predict at least local impact of the assistance to community development of Roma settlements via functioning of 10 CCs though these pilot activities call for countrywide replication. However, even the latest Roma strategy of April 2003 misses a longer-term concept and identified finances for improvement of Roma living standards. The longer-term impact of the twinning has only partially been secured. However, for a broader impact, the assistance calls for more concrete outputs of all the key areas covered by the twinning, namely housing, health, unemployment and education. Due to implemented changes of the unemployment part of the assistance we are now more optimistic that the assistance will bring some impact notably on the employment of adult Roma in the selected regions – about 600 Roma trained and 150 placed in companies for on-the job experience. For the education strand, to bring broader impact the country-wide distribution of project results needs to be assured, such as working materials for primary schools (as now only 70 are included) and curricula for vocational training (only 4 are participating), pending on the MoE's approval later this year (such as basic pedagogical documentation for secondary schools). Impact of the assistance could be broader once the proposal of the compulsory last year of kindergartens instead of preparatory classes is approved, as originally foreseen in the new of the School Act (currently at the commenting stage within the MoE). The rating of the SK-0002 Programme is *good*.

43. SR-0103.01 could lead to a substantial impact in terms of *improvement of Roma educational standards* when more Roma pupils are accepted to standard schools or moved from special schools to regular ones (as a result of suitable school readiness assessment and diagnosis of mental retardation), presuming the tests developed under the respective project will be used country-wide. The Component will also have an impact on *promotion of tolerance and integration* as foreseen in the relevant WO via introduction of 'transitional classes' in 20 pilots special schools, paired with 20 primary schools. The rating of the SR-0103.01 Component is *good*.

44. The SR-0103.02 intervention to 30 Roma settlements in Slovakia will have positive impact on the *improved living conditions of Roma* and *implementation of the relevant Roma Strategy* (its Housing part), provided the severe efficiency problems can be resolved with the help of the Commission Services. Again, this pilot activity calls for broader dissemination in order to have substantial impact on all the needed settlements and their inhabitants and requires substantial financial resources into Roma housing either from domestic or foreign resources. The rating of the SR-0103.01 Component is *poor*.

45. 2002/000-610.03 as a follow-up of the 2001 intervention foresees further re-integration of Roma children into standard schools via a pilot activity for 20 schools in municipalities with high proportion of Roma minority. Design of the 2002 intervention resembles a lot the SR-0103.01 assistance with the same WO, and thus forecasts of its fulfilment remain relatively optimistic, pending on the countrywide dissemination. The second 2002 part, providing assistance in preparation of technical documentation for Roma infrastructure, will have in the best case a direct impact on the immediately benefiting 30 municipalities which is quite a limited number. Moreover without a direct complementary infrastructure programme, the fulfilment of the WO aiming again at *improvement of living conditions of the marginalised groups* remains questionable. The rating of the 2002/000-610.03 Programme is *adequate*.

46. From the portfolio of the supported grants and NGOs we can be pretty optimistic that the SK-0013 will contribute to its WO, aimed at *implementation of the relevant areas of the acquis*. The implemented activities will also encourage participation of handicapped people in social life, as defined in the second related WO. Direct impact of SK-0013 will represent about 100 NGOs included the Networking Facility. However impact on the Third Sector, as a whole is questionable due to the transition process of the NGOs in the country, competing for a rather limited pool of resources available, and thus facing serious survival problems. The rating of the SK-0013 Programme is *adequate*.

2.5 Sustainability

47. Sustainability of most of the CIV Programmes is mixed, but particularly in their long-term perspective appears to be often questionable in the absence of a firm commitment to finance follow-up activities.

48. Sustainability of the SK-0002 twinning arrangement raises concerns as at the time of the IE it was not fully clear yet where and when the planned key outputs of the four main parts of the Roma strategy would materialise. Only some indications existed about the inclusion of strategy prepared by the twinning into the yearly update of the Government's long-term strategy. Also sustainability of the sub-programme for community development, under which a pool of 32 field workers was trained, remains questionable due to the unclear legal status of field workers and due to unclear prospects of their future financing beyond 2004. Sustainability of the unemployment part of SK-0002 is threatened due to unsafe jobs of the trained Roma employment counsellors currently placed at LOs; most of these jobs are secured only until the end of 2003/ first half of 2004. Moreover, the present National Labour Office (NLO) and its local LOs should be re-organised in way that 45 territorial offices for social and employment services (fully financed from the state budget per 1 January 2004) have to be established. During these on-going organisational changes securing of further employment for 32 Roma counsellors does apparently not represent a priority but would require firm commitment from the Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family (MoLSAF). However, as complementary schemes to support employment exist - funded from the Phare Human Resources Development Programmes - at least these follow-up activities should contribute to some sustainability of the 2000 assistance. Further employment of Roma teacher assistants depends on available resources of relevant municipalities which were however not secured at the time of this IE. Certification of teacher assistants should be provided by an accredited institution and the educational working materials to be approved by the MoE together with new vocational curricula for the education sub-programme should become sustainable. The rating of the SK-0002 Programme is *adequate*.

49. As most of the SR-0103.01 assistance represents supplies to kindergartens, schools and CCs these should be either self-sustainable or in the case of CCs the similar arguments apply as with SK-2000. The TA in the area of re-integration of Roma children to standard schools, due to its innovative approach, needs however firm commitment from the side of the MoE that the results of the research and testing are going to be used country-wide and will become parts of the Roma education strategy as foreseen in the programme documents. The rating of the SR-0103.01 Component is *adequate*.

50. SR-0103.02 shows mixed prospects with regard to sustainability. The TA part has performed quite poorly with this regard due to a very limited transfer of know-how to the RDSA in the area of preparation of tender documentation according to EU rules; only some hands-on training activities were realised within the limited duration of the FWC. Sustainability of the infrastructure works - though it might potentially improve the living conditions in the 30 pilot Roma settlements - requires in the mid and longer-term the Government's commitment, notably with regard to the construction of social housing together with the likely commencing of structural funds (SF), based on the priorities of the NDP. Also sustainability for the pilot housing projects will be questionable unless continuous commitment by the final beneficiaries and the involved municipalities is ensured. The rating of the SR-0103.02 Component is *poor*.

51. Sustainability of 2002/000-610.03 should bring better results in its educational strand, as it should result into sustainable outcomes in the form of established and equipped multicultural integrated school classes. Also further Phare assistance is foreseen under the FM 2003 for such multicultural education. We remain however pessimistic when predicting sustainability of the intended preparation of technical documentation for further infrastructure projects. The follow-up 2003 infrastructure project fell out from the portfolio of approved Phare projects and also no firm and detailed commitment from the Government's side exists yet with regard to securing local or structural funds for further complementary infrastructure interventions. The rating of the 2002/000-610.03 Programme is *poor*.

52. Sustainability of SK-0013 shows mix results. Overall, we remain rather pessimistic with regard of future of the Third Sector as a whole, particularly for the period of phasing out of foreign donors, which is particularly detrimental for small local NGOs. On the other hand sustainability of the CSDF looks more optimistic as it represents a key NGO, acting as a grant giving institution on behalf of Phare for the last ten years. The CSDF has prepared a business plan with different scenarios for its future functioning, including submission of programme documents for Phare 2003 and project proposals for the Transition Facility. Moreover, the proactive CSDF Director was nominated as a member of the Government's Council for NGOs. As a result of the successful third sector lobbying the amendment of the tax law of the MoF that has to come into force next year, still includes the one percent donation for the third sector with prospects to be increased even to three percent in the future. However, there are many question marks for sustainability of the SK-0013 outcomes which are often depending on senior political decisions on the future of the NGO sector in Slovakia. The rating of the SK-0013 Programme is *poor*.

2.6 Specific Issues

53. There were no specific issues.

3. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

3.1 Conclusions and Recommendations

Relevance

54. The individual Components of the CIV Sector remain relevant for the Sector purpose, particularly with regard to the Roma minority issue. However, most Components are suffering from over-ambitious designs and in fact very limited time available for the implementation of such complex activities. Design of SK-0002 is especially vulnerable with regard to time constraints and delays experienced at the start of individual projects. This forced a parallel implementation of several activities and thus will often not allow enough time anymore for a thorough follow-up of the initiated activities, such as performance monitoring of the Roma employment counsellors or of the trained teachers in multicultural education. SR-0103.01 consists mainly of a research project and due to its complexity it had to be split into two parts which had caused crucial delays in implementation. The SR-0103.02 infrastructure intervention – suffering from poor project preparation, unclear conditionalities and unfulfilled assumptions - is also heavily delayed. The 2002/000-610.03 intervention as a follow-up of the 2001 Programme is broadly relevant, however raises concerns in its part focusing on preparation of technical documentation for further Roma infrastructure improvements, due to the absence of the logical Phare 2003 infrastructure follow-up. SK-0013 has provided standard grants in order to support NGOs in selected areas of the *acquis* and thus is relevant. The IAs for the CIV Sector show an implicit problem with their measurement since obtaining relevant statistics on Roma can hardly comply with the given anti-discriminatory legislation.

Efficiency

55. Proper efficiency of the CIV Sector has suffered from on-going staff fluctuation of key stakeholders, namely SHRM and the PP Office. Minor improvements can be reported with regard to the staffing of the RDSA. Up to now however, the RDSA has not been able to manage SR-0103.02 in a professional manner. Performance of the MoE has clearly improved. Delays in implementation of SK-0002 have negatively influenced its efficiency. Both Components of the 2001 Roma Programme are heavily delayed and have been becoming candidates for extension: in the case of SR-0103.01 its complexity has been clearly underestimated; for SR-0103.02 crucial conditionalities or assumptions, necessary for the individual projects' success were not fulfilled in time. Performance of the implementing RDSA and commitment of the overall MoCRD has been – even for the local circumstances – exceptionally poor. In the event that the Commission Services Headquarters would not agree with the one-year extension for SR-0103.02, a substantial amount of funds would be lost since no time remains anymore for proper tendering; however extension has been likely to be granted. The 2002 Roma Programme should follow the lessons learned from the difficult implementation of the 2001 predecessor. The current commitment and disbursement rates are disappointing. The CSDF is managing SK-0013 appropriately.

Effectiveness

56. Due to the given brought definitions most of the CIV Programmes will contribute to their IOs, provided that the substantial efficiency problems – particularly for Phare 2001 - can be resolved, notably with the support of the Commission Services. Positive prospects of effectiveness remain for the robust SK-0002 education sub-programme, particularly once the new curricula will be approved by the MoE and consequently implemented in schools; also the SK-0002 Roma tolerance sub-programme has resulted in the opening of ten CCs. Under the

SK-0002 unemployment sub-programme, Phare trained counsellors which work now at various LOs in order to stimulate Roma employment. Almost no tangible results can be reported yet from the two-year twinning at the time of the IE; the comprehensive Roma strategy – a key output of the twinning – is likely to be presented only by November 2003. For the SR-0103.01 and SR-01030.02 Components, effectiveness to date is poor. Only the FWCs have been implemented bringing some few effects, such as new testing tools for Roma children (currently being at the testing stage) or preparation of technical documentation for about 30 percent of the target group of Roma settlements. The 2002 Programme has not started yet but indicative projections can be regarded at sufficient levels for its education sub-programme; effectiveness of the 2002 sub-programme focusing on the preparation of technical documentation for future Roma infrastructure interventions is questionable. SK-0013 has successfully contributed to the fulfilment of most of its IOs via grant making to almost 100 NGOs and through funding of soft skills training, provided by NGOs; however fewer effects will materialise on the intended IB for local NGO/NPO.

Impact

57. WOs are defined quite broadly and are often identical with the preceding objectives given under previous Phare Roma support. Overall, there is likelihood that all Roma interventions will contribute to the achievement of their wider sectoral objectives by producing some immediate impact via their pilot activities, such as those of CCs, housing, multicultural education, employment counselling or re-integration of school children – provided the outstanding activities can be contracted and implemented in an acceptable manner. However, for having a broader and longer-term impact the individual pilot activities, stimulated by Phare, will need to be replicated country-wide and backed by a healthy mixture of financial resources. Regarding SK-0013, apart from the direct impact on the benefiting NGOs, the broader impact on the third sector as a whole will be rather limited.

Sustainability

58. Projections of sustainability are mixed with potential risks notably in the long-term perspective. Some investments, such as equipment for kindergartens/ schools, CCs or incubators should be self-sustainable. TA delivered for various Roma pilot activities should be sustainable, mostly in the short-term. The SK-0002 twinning raises serious concerns with regard to its long-term sustainability, due to the draft stage of its key output - the Roma strategy - and also due to the unclear situation with regard to the future inclusion of this Strategy into the Government's official documents. Mid-term sustainability of the other SK-0002 sub-programmes is under threat, namely due to the lack of a recognised status of Roma community field workers and also because of the unclear future for the trained pool of Roma employment counsellors. Sustainability of pilot activities under SR-0103.01 will require - besides the incorporation of the project outputs into the relevant MoE strategy - also a firm commitment with regard to its implementation. The robust SR-0103.02 infrastructure intervention will need – apart from the final beneficiaries continuous support - also further Government commitment in order to finance complementary housing schemes; this has clearly not sufficiently materialised yet at this time of the IE. No big risks can be predicted for sustainability of the education part of the 2002 Programme. On the other hand the 2002 TA for preparation of technical documentation cannot be considered as potentially sustainable at this point of time due to the apparent absence of any clearly defined Roma infrastructure follow-up activities. Long-term sustainability of many local NGOs, and thus also of the delivered SK-00013 support, remains questionable.

Conclusion	Recommendation	Output	Reference/ Paragraph	Responsibility	Deadline	Debriefing Results
Mid-term sustainability of some of the SK-0002 sub-programmes is under threat, e.g. due to the lack of a recognised legal status of the Roma community field workers and their unclear future financing.	The Office of PP together with the SHRM and the Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family (MoLSAF) should clarify the unclear legal status of Roma field workers, should define their future financing and should present this commitment by means of a relevant document to the ECD and ACU.	Improved sustainability, impact	42, 48, 58	Office of PP, SHRM, MoLSAF	With immediate effect	
The SK-0002 twinning arrangement raises serious concerns with regard to its long-term sustainability, due to the apparent draft stage of its key outputs, namely sectoral Roma strategies, and also because of an unclear situation with regard to its future inclusion in the Government's official documents.	The Office of Plenipotentiary for Roma Communities (Office of the PP) in co-operation with the SK-0002 Pre-Accession Adviser (PAA) should submit a committing document to the European Commission Delegation (ECD) and the Aid Co-ordination Unit (ACU) showing where and when the outputs from the SK-0002 twinning are going to be included into the Government's official documents, including the Roma Strategy.	Improved sustainability	36, 42, 48, 58	Office of PP, PAA	With immediate effect	
Future employment conditions of the trained pool of Roma employment counsellors under the SK-0002 sub-programme are insecure.	National Labour Office (NLO) in co-operation with MoLSAF should present a binding position document to the ECD and ACU, regarding the future employment conditions for the trained pool of 32 Roma employment counsellors.	Improved sustainability and impact	42, 48, 58	NLO, MoLSAF	With immediate effect	
Sustainability of the SR-0103.01 pilot activities would require - besides the incorporation of project outputs into the relevant MoE strategy - also a firm governmental commitment with regard to their implementation.	The Ministry of Education (MoE) should present a document to the ECD and ACU showing the detailed plans for the incorporation of the outcomes of the SR-0103.01 Component into the Roma Education Strategy, including a relevant Action Plan for the implementation of the project outcomes and their dissemination.	Improved effectiveness, impact and sustainability	38, 43, 49, 58	MoE	With immediate effect	

Conclusion	Recommendation	Output	Reference/ Paragraph	Responsibility	Deadline	Debriefing Results
Mid-term sustainability of some of the SK-0002 sub-programmes is under threat, e.g. due to the lack of a recognised legal status of the Roma community field workers and their unclear future financing.	The Office of PP together with the SHRM and the Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family (MoLSAF) should clarify the unclear legal status of Roma field workers, should define their future financing and should present this commitment by means of a relevant document to the ECD and ACU.	Improved sustainability, impact	42, 48, 58	Office of PP, SHRM, MoLSAF	With immediate effect	
We remain pessimistic when predicting sustainability of the 2002 part focusing on the preparation of documentation for infrastructure projects; the intended 2003 follow-up infrastructure project fell out from the portfolio of approved Phare projects and no firm commitment from the Government's side exists with regard to securing complementary funds for further follow-up infrastructure interventions.	The Ministry of Construction and Regional Development (MOCRDR) should submit to the ECD and ACU written commitment, showing the intended use of the 2002 part, focusing on the preparation of technical documentation for further Roma infrastructure interventions. If no clear commitment can be demonstrated in terms of how and by when future infrastructure interventions will be undertaken by the Slovak Government, the respective funds should be re-allocated.	Improved sustainability	51, 58	MoCRDR	With immediate effect	

3.2 Performance rating

	SK-0002	SR-0103.01	SR-0103.02	SK-0013	2002/000-610.03	Sector
Relevance	1	0	1	1	0	1
Efficiency	-1	-1	-2	0	0	-1
Effectiveness	1	-1	-1	1	0	0
Impact	1	1	-1	0	0	0
Sustainability	0	0	-1	-1	-1	-1
Verbal overall rating	Satisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Satisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory

<i>Unacceptable</i>	<i>Poor</i>	<i>Sufficient/ adequate</i>	<i>Good</i>	<i>Excellent</i>
-2	-1	0	1	2
<i>Highly Unsatisfactory</i>	<i>Unsatisfactory</i>		<i>Satisfactory</i>	<i>Highly Satisfactory</i>
<i>HU</i>	<i>U</i>		<i>S</i>	<i>HS</i>

Highly Satisfactory	The programmes reviewed are expected to achieve or exceed all the objectives set during their lifetime
Satisfactory	The programmes reviewed are expected to largely achieve the objectives set during their lifetime
Unsatisfactory	The programmes reviewed are not expected to achieve most of the objectives set during their lifetime
Highly Unsatisfactory	The programmes reviewed are not expected to achieve any of the objectives set during their lifetime

ANNEXES

ANNEX 1. INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT OF SECTOR OBJECTIVES AND EVALUATION CRITERIA

Indicators of Achievement	Valid as Indicator	Remarks	Reference to evaluation criteria
SK-0002 Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the SR			
Number of Roma graduates at all level of education increased (by 10 % in 2003 compared to 2001)	No	Indicator is in general applicable, however influenced also by macro developments in the country	Effectiveness, impact
Number of Roma finding permanent employment increased (by 15% in 2003 compared to 2001)	No	Indicator is in general applicable, however influenced also by macro developments in the country	Effectiveness, impact
SR-0103.01 Support to the Roma Minority in the Educational Field			
Increased number of Roma graduates at all levels of education (by 10% in 2004 compared to 2002)	No	Indicator is in general applicable, however influenced also by macro developments in the country	Effectiveness, impact
Increased number of Roma community members participating in the education system (by 30% in 2004 compared to 2002)	No	Indicator is in general applicable, however influenced also by macro developments in the country	Effectiveness, impact
SR-0103.02 Infrastructure Support for Roma Settlements			
Utilities (water, transport, electricity) for up to 52.000 citizens in the 30 selected municipalities in line with EU standards	No	Indicator is applicable, however misses the baseline	Effectiveness, impact
Living standards for up to 20 % of the Roma living in settlements improved	No	Indicator is applicable, however misses the baseline	Effectiveness, impact
Conditions created for participation of up to 20 municipalities in the Social Housing Programme	No	Indicator is applicable, however misses the time line	Effectiveness
2002/000-610.03 Further Integration of the Roma Children in the Educational Field and Improved Living Conditions			
Increased number of Roma studying at standard primary schools	No	Indicator is not applicable, missing the time line and is not quantifiable	Effectiveness, impact
Increased number of municipalities using the technical documentation for construction of infrastructure	No	Indicator is not applicable, missing the time line and is not quantifiable	Effectiveness, impact
SK-0013 ACCESS 2000			
Increased in number and quality of applications for funding	No	Indicator is not applicable, missing the time line and is not quantifiable	Effectiveness, impact
Number of projects/activities carried out successfully	No	Indicator is not applicable, requires more precise definition	Effectiveness
Increased number of NGOs/NPOs active in EU-wide networks	No	Indicator is not applicable, missing the time line and is not quantifiable	Effectiveness, impact

ANNEX 2. LIST OF INTERVIEWS

INSTITUTION	INTERVIEWEE	DATE
Wide Open School Foundation Dr. Janskeho 19/16 SK-965 01 Ziar nad Hronom	Ms Zita Badurikova	18/08/2003
Office of the Plenipotentiary for Roma Communities Drienova 24 SK-813 70 Bratislava	Ms Bronislava Bomchesova	05/09/2003
CFCU Radlinskeho 37 SK-813 70 Bratislava	Ms Silvia Czuczorova	14/08/2003
ECO Stromova 50 SK-831 01 Bratislava	Mr Hans De Facq	18/08/2003
Office of the Plenipotentiary for Roma Communities Drienova 24 SK-813 70 Bratislava	Mr Michel Digne	05/09/2003
Office of the Government of the SR Aid Co-ordination Unit Namestie slobody 1 SK-813 70 Bratislava	Ms. Katarina Homolova	13/08/2003
National Labour Office Zupne nam. 5-6 SK-812 67 Bratislava	Ms. Darina Lacikova	02/09/2003
Wide Open School Foundation Dr. Janskeho 19/16 SK-965 01 Ziar nad Hronom	Ms Eva Koncokova	18/08/2003
National Labour Office Zupne nam. 5-6 SK-812 67 Bratislava	Ms. Valeria Kubalova	02/09/2003
Agmin Italy AJS Management Cintorinska 3 SK-814 76 Bratislava	Mr. Willem Kolthof	21/08/2003
Office of the Government of the SR Section of Human Rights and Minorities Namestie slobody 1 SK-813 70 Bratislava	Ms Jana Kviecinska	25/08/2003
Comenius University Gonmdova 2 SK-818 01 Bratislava	Ms. Barbora Mesarsova	04/09/2003
Office of the Government of the SR Section of Human Rights and Minorities Namestie slobody 1 SK-813 70 Bratislava	Ms Kinga Novotna	25/08/2003
ECO Stromova 50 SK-831 01 Bratislava	Mr Martin Obuch	18/08/2003 04/09/2003
Plenipotentiary for Roma Communities Namestie slobody 1 SK-813 70 Bratislava	Ms Klara Orgovanova	05/09/2003

INSTITUTION	INTERVIEWEE	DATE
Ministry of Construction and Regional Development Regional Development Support Agency Spitalska 8 SK-816 44 Bratislava	Ms Anna Polniserova	20/08/2003
Inforoma Foundation Poziarnicka 13 SK-080 01 Presov	Ms Ingrid Repova	18/08/2003
Inforoma Foundation Poziarnicka 13 SK-080 01 Presov	Mr Miroslav Sklenka	18/08/2003
Delegation of the European Commission Panska 3 SK-811 01 Bratislava	Ms. Ivana Skodova	01/08/2003 09/09/2003
Ministry of Construction and Regional Development Regional Development Support Agency Spitalska 8 SK-816 44 Bratislava	Ms Alena Soltysova	20/08/2003
Ministry of Education of the SR EU Policy and Programme Dept. Hanulova 5/b SK-813 30 Bratislava	Ms Julia Stepankova	19/08/2003
Civil Society Development Foundation Ruzova dolina 6 SK-821 08 Bratislava	Ms Katarina Vajdova	25/08/2003
Civil Society Development Foundation Ruzova dolina 6 SK-821 08 Bratislava	Ms Judit Young	25/08/2003
<i>Telephone interviews are indicated with * and e-mail/fax correspondence with **</i>		

ANNEX 3. LIST OF DOCUMENTS REFERRED TO IN THE INTERIM EVALUATION

Name of Originator	Date	Title of Document
Government of the Slovak Republic/ European Commission	2000	Financing Memorandum and Project Fiches SK-0002, SK-0013
Government of the Slovak Republic/ European Commission	2001	Financing Memorandum and Project Fiches SR-0103.01 and 02
Government of the Slovak Republic/ European Commission	2003	Financing Memorandum and Project Fiche 2002/000.610-03
Aid Co-ordination Unit of the Office of Government of the SR	May 2002	Monitoring Report No M/SR/JHA/010010
Aid Co-ordination Unit of the Office of Government of the SR	October 2002	Monitoring Report No M/SR/CIV/02002
Aid Co-ordination Unit of the Office of Government of the SR	November 2002	Monitoring Report No M/SK/SOC/02002
Aid Co-ordination Unit of the Office of Government of the SR	April 2003	Monitoring Report No M/SR/CIV/03004
Government of the SR and RACINE, France	December 2001	Twinning Covenant Nr. SK0002/SK00/IB-OT-01 for the twinning project under SK-0002
RACINE France	May 2002--May 2003	Progress Reports Nr. 1-5
ECO Consortium	April 2003	Inception Report SK 0002.01 Mutual Tolerance between Roma and Non-Roma
ECO Consortium	February-July 2003	Monthly Reports SK 0002.01 Mutual Tolerance between Roma and Non-Roma
ECO Consortium	February 2003	Inception Report SK 0002.01 Roma self-realisation in education system
ECO Consortium	February - July 2003	Monthly Reports SK 0002.01 Roma self-realisation in education system
ECO Consortium	May 2003	Inception Report SR-0103.01 Reintegration of Socially Disadvantaged Children
Agmin Italy	February 2003	Inception Report SK-0002.01 Improved Conditions for Young Roma to enter the Labour market
Agmin Italy	May 2003 September 2003	1 st and 2 nd Progress Reports SK-002.01 Improved Conditions for Young Roma to enter the Labour market
Office of the Government of the SR	2002	Terms of Reference for Technical Assistance, and Technical Specifications under SK-0002
Office of the Government of the SR	2002	Terms of Reference and Technical Specifications for TA and Supplies under SR-0103.01 and 02 Projects
Ministry of Construction and Regional Development SR	August 2002	Inception and Interim Reports for TA under SR-0103.02 Project
OMAS Consortium Middle Unit	25 September 2001	R/SK/JHA/01.041 Interim Evaluation Report (Sector: Justice and Home Affairs/ Political Criteria)
EMS Slovak Republic	10 March 2003	Interim Evaluation Report R/SK/JHA/03.044 (Sector: Justice and Home Affairs, Minorities and Public Administration)
EMS Slovak Republic	25 March 2003	Interim Evaluation Report R/SK/CIV.03.045 (Sector: Civil Society)
RDSA	December 2002	Progress Report on SR-0103.02
ECD and CSDF	November 2001	Memorandum of Understanding
CSDF	March 2002	Guidelines for Applicants to Call for Proposals – ACCESS 2000
CSDF	July 2001	Terms of Reference Networking Facility

Documents requested but not made available (with reasons): none

ANNEX 4. NATIONAL PROGRAMME FOR ADOPTION OF THE *ACQUIS COMMUNAUTAIRE* (NPAA)

Legal Act	Priority Code	Action	Activity/Measure	Responsible Body	Implementation Date	Cost Estimate
Minorities						
		<i>Short-term priorities</i>				
Law on Human Rights' Ombudsman			Adoption of the law	Parliament, Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development	1/1/2002	2000: State Budget n.a. Phare ME3.8 2001: State Budget ME 5 Phare ME 5
European Charter of Regional or Minority Languages			Ratification of the charter	Parliament, Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development	31/12/2001	
			Prepare a report on the implementation of the Phare project on Minority Tolerance Programme for 2000-2001	Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development	31/12/2001	
			Prepare a project of the Minority Development Programme for 2001-2002 with ME 5 allocation	Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development	31/12/2001	
			Prepare a project for setting up a Central Node of Drug information Centrum System	Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development	30/09/2001	
			Strengthen the Office of Governments Commissioner on Roma Affairs by means of World Bank grant	Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development	31/12/2001	
			Prepare information on the status of preparation of the re-codification of the Roma language	Government's Commissioner on Roma Affairs	31/12/2001	
			Evaluate public discussion on the problem of discrimination, public and domestic violence	n.a.	31/12/2001	

Legal Act	Priority Code	Action	Activity/Measure	Responsible Body	Implementation Date	Cost Estimate
	<i>Mid-term priorities</i>					
			Complete the building of the system of institutions for effective protection of human rights in accordance with the amended law through the Office of the Ombudsman, National Centre for Human Rights, Centre Against Xenophobia	Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development, Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family	continuous	
			Permanently train teachers, judges, police officers in the human rights area	n.a.	continuous	
			Create conditions for implementing provisions of the European Charter of Regional and Minority Languages within 12 months of its ratification	n.a.	continuous	
			Create conditions through the new school law for multicultural education in Slovakia, not only through ensuring the possibility of education in the mother tongue, but also through including multicultural issues into the curricula	n.a.	2002	
			Develop a comprehensive system of financing minority cultures in Slovakia	n.a.	2002	
			Ensure successful conditions for the co-existence of Roma and non-Roma communities	n.a.	continuous	
			Develop principles and mechanisms for effective teaching of children and young persons coming from socially disadvantaged environment	n.a.	continuous	

ANNEX 5. RECOMMENDATIONS FROM PREVIOUS ASSESSMENT / INTERIM EVALUATION AND FOLLOW-UP

Interim Evaluation Report No.R/SK/JHA/03.044 issued on 10 March 2003

Relevant Programmes/Components covered: SK-0002 Improvement of the Situation of Roma in the SR, SR-0103.01 Support of the Roma Minority in the Educational Field, SR-0103.02 Infrastructure Support for Roma Settlements and SK-0002 Political Criteria/Roma Minority Programme

Recommendation	Applied	Responsibility for Follow-up	Deadline	Details of action/ Remarks
Regional Support Development Agency needs immediately to increase the speed on preparing and contracting the construction works under SR-0103.02. Moreover, the Agency should also initiate that progress is done with regard to the complementarity of the State Social Housing Programme and should regularly inform the European Commission Delegation on the progress achieved. In the event that – due to further delays – the original implementation schedule appears to be not realistic anymore, the Aid Co-ordination Unit, together with the European Commission Delegation should consider in time the re-allocation of parts of the SR-0103.02 funds towards other recipient areas.	Yes	Regional Development Support Agency EC Delegation, Aid Co-ordination Unit	With immediate effect	No need for reallocation was recognised during the relevant SMSC meeting on 25.3.2003. Ms Novotná, SAC, requested the RDSA to indicate the needs for reallocation. She received an e-mail that no needs for reallocation are envisaged. ECD is awaiting a letter from Minister of Construction and Regional Development concerning the State Social Housing Programme.
Office of the Government/ Section for Human Rights and Minorities and Regional Development Support Agency need immediately to formalise co-ordination of their activities via, for instance, establishing regular monthly meetings covering the Roma Programmes. Moreover, Regional Development Support Agency needs to improve its monitoring tasks in order comply with the Phare requirements for Monitoring Reports. If necessary relevant in-house training should be organised by the Regional Development Support Agency in project cycle management with the stress on tendering procedures and monitoring.	Yes	Office of the Government/ Section for Human Rights and Minorities, Regional Development Support Agency	With immediate effect	Regular monthly meetings on Roma projects are organised. Monthly monitoring reports are elaborated by the RDSA. ECD also needs to be provided by the reports. Minor shortcomings from the Sectoral Monitoring Report (to the cut-off date 31.12.2003) as pointed out by the SMSC meeting will have to be removed.

Recommendation	Applied	Responsibility for Follow-up	Deadline	Details of action/ Remarks
Office of the Government/ Section for Human Rights and Minorities together with the Pre-Accession Adviser for the SK-0002 twinning project, representing the French Partner, should immediately solve the funding of study visits as foreseen in the twinning covenant. In addition the Pre-Accession Adviser together with his short-term experts should improve the quality of reporting and should secure that written documents from the various twinning missions are regularly produced and disseminated broadly, in order to serve as reference materials and support the know-how transfer.	Yes	Office of the Government/ Section for Human Rights and Minorities, Pre-Accession Adviser	With immediate effect	French PAA revised the budget that will allow the study visits to be organised as originally foreseen in the twinning covenant. Reporting have to be improved in next reports.
Respective ministries, government bodies and other institutions responsible for Phare implementation in co-operation with the Office for State Civil Service should immediately make progress in securing full and competent staffing of the implementing authorities. The Office of the Plenipotentiary for Roma Communities should at least raise their staff to their minimum levels, covered in by the state budget. Moreover staff needs to be continuously trained in the Phare project cycle management, thus securing also improved quality of implementation and monitoring.	Yes	Respective ministries and government agencies, Office for State Civil Service	With immediate effect	Serious problems with the recruitment of staffs and their turnover were confirmed. Young university graduates, fluent in English are not attracted by the remuneration package offered by State Service. Recruitment procedure should be a rather short process. However, reality shows that it can take months (6 – 12) to staff the vacant position. Poor co-ordination between State Service Office and other Central State Institutions in this field is also being experienced. In this respect, Ministry of Finance is preparing a Government Decree that will ensure extra bonus for employees dealing with pre-accession assistance in state service.

Interim Evaluation Report Number: R/SK/CIV/03.045 issued on 26 March 2003

Programmes/Component evaluated: SK-0002 Improvement of the Situation of Roma in the SR, SR-0103.01 Support of the Roma Minority in the Educational Field, SR-0103.02 Infrastructure Support for Roma Settlements and SK-0002 Political Criteria/Roma Minority Programme, 2002/000-610.03 Further Integration of the Roma Children in the Educational Field and Improved Living Conditions and SK-0013 ACCESS 2000

Recommendation	Applied	Responsibility for Follow-up	Deadline	Details of Action/Remarks
Civil Society Development Foundation should prepare a mid-term business plan including several scenarios for future funding or revenue creation activities of the Foundation. At the same time the Foundation should start to discuss with the relevant ministries and government bodies involved, possibilities for arranging co-financing from the state budget, needed for further activities supporting the Third Sector.	Yes	Civil Society Development Foundation, relevant ministries, government bodies	ASAP	Currently CSDF does not have direct legal tools for fulfilling the recommendation except for initiating actions through the Donors Forum and the Council of the Government for the NGOs (lacking tax deduction system as a segment of the Tax Laws, delay of the fiscal decentralization, absence of the Law on Sponsorship, lack of the possibility of the NGOs to have income from lotteries, no practice of the government bodies to outsource services to the NGOs, including the grant giving schemes, missing State Endowments in Slovakia). So far the only possibility in place is the 1% tax reallocation of the income tax (individuals since 2002, entities from 2004) to compensate the withdrawal of the foreign sources starting from 2004. Council of the Government for the NGOs has established two committees last month: Committee for the EU integration and the Economic-legal Committee. The committees should serve as the intermediary for presenting the Slovak NGOs position towards the drafted, proposed and commented legislation, which affects the civil society issues, including the issues of the longer term complex financial sustainability of the NGOs. However as of today, despite existing positive development, the complex vision of the government regarding the sustainability of the civil society from domestic financial sources is still under the threat. Effective sustainable outcomes are not ensured.
Aid Co-ordination Unit together with involved implementing authorities should initiate a participatory process in order to refine Indicators of Achievement and making them applicable for monitoring and evaluation purposes. The next sectoral monitoring report should foresee to apply relevant Indicators, in order to regularly measure any project progress. .	Yes	Aid Co-ordination Unit, Section of Human Rights and Minorities, Civil Society Development Foundation	Next MR cut-off dates (30.4.2003 and 31.8.2003)	Sectoral monitoring report for all projects covered by the Civil Society sector made recommendation to reformulate the indicators in order to make them measurable. CSDF already reformulated some of its indicators in a measurable way. Further activities in this field will be done mainly by Phare assistance recipients supported by relevant ACU and ECD project managers. The assistance of the EMS consortium can be also utilised in this respect.

ANNEX 6. DISSENTING VIEWS

Office of the Government /Section of Human Rights and Minorities

Conclusions and Recommendations

'We highly disagree with the evaluation of projects SR 0103.01 and 2002/000-610.03 and thus with the overall sector evaluation and unclearly formulated recommendations, that are not in line with the so-called Competency Law 575/2001 of the Slovak Republic.'

'In the draft of IE the overall evaluation of the project SR 0103.01 is presented as unsatisfactory. The efficiency and effectiveness of the mentioned project is rated as poor (-1). The project comprises of three elements, first is reintegration of children from special to standard primary schools (FWC), the second, establishment of community centres (TA) and third supply of equipment. At the time of the interim evaluation the FWC was running, the TA was successfully tendered out during the evaluation, and the problems with the supply concerning the VAT were efficiently addressed and solved.'

European Commission Delegation

Conclusions and Recommendations

'We do not agree with marking -1 the efficiency of SK-0002 nor the sustainability by 0 of the same programme.'

ANNEX 7. ANNEX TO CHAPTER I SECTORAL BACKGROUND AND EVALUATION SCOPE

SK-0002 Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the SR

Sub-programme 1 (M€ 1.300) Improved conditions for mutual tolerance between Roma and non-Roma inhabitants of municipalities

The purpose of this sub-programme is to increase tolerance between the Roma minority and the majority population by continuous and planned work of field workers in Roma settlements and by providing training on communication and planning in municipalities, where the Roma and non-Roma inhabitants are at similar social or economic level, but co-operation is difficult because of communication gaps. It is being implemented in co-operation with the Office of the PP for Roma Communities. The sub-programme - in spite of some delays at its start - has succeeded in the selection and training of a pool of about 30 field workers who are to be placed in the ten reconstructed or new CC (to be officially opened in October 2003). The respective Contractor is also working on training manuals as a further output of the project. Besides field workers who are currently lacking any legal status, also a pool up to 500 volunteers is being trained, especially in villages without CCs where the 2001 Infrastructure Component has to be realised. The delayed two-year twinning project with the French partner placed at the Office for PP for Roma Communities is still suffering from lack of attention from the side of senior Slovak representation which has been reflected in a low frequency of inter-ministerial committee meetings. Also progress in the preparation of sector Roma strategies in the four chosen areas is slow with the Ministry of Health being the least co-operative with this regard. After solving the financing of study visits by the French partner the first visit was organised in May 2003 with more to follow by the end of the project. However the expert's input into the Roma strategy as presented by the Government in April 2003 was only limited and more can be expected only in early November this year when a comprehensive document has to be presented during the final conference.

Sub-Programme 2 (M€ 0.780) Improved conditions for young Roma people to enter the labour market

The aim is to improve the conditions for young Roma people at the age of 15 to 26 by providing counselling and training seminars for them focusing on motivation, re-training and craft skills, complemented by work experience. This Phare intervention has been jointly implemented with the NLO and focuses on improved conditions for young Roma in order to enter the labour market. The unemployment sub-project was also delayed as was the rest of SK-0002, and thus several activities have to run in parallel, such as training of trainers and consulting activities of the pool of 32 selected trainers/counsellors. The trained groups of Roma employment professionals are now placed as public workers at district LOs and are helping also to develop programme modules for young unemployed Roma. Also, a bigger than expected group of adult Roma – about 600 have been trained in preparation of action plans and one part of these - 150 people – will be later placed in about 30 selected incubators for job experience. A smaller group of about 250 youngsters – less than planned due to problems with their selection – will be trained on similar employment issues later this year. Training equipment was delivered in May 2003 and equipment for incubators will follow after the final selection of companies.

Sub-Programme 3 (M€ 1.720) Better conditions for Roma self-realisation in the education system

The main goal is to set up relevant pre-conditions for strengthening the systematic education of Roma children and youth with direct involvement of parents (especially mothers) as well as local authorities. The long-term objective is to establish an institutional framework for permanent education of Roma with the perspective to increase their chances on the labour market in future. The sub-programme has been realised by the involvement of the MoE. The intervention into improvement of Roma education is robust with a team of about 40 foreign and local experts being involved so far in training of pedagogical staff and also mothers in 50 kindergartens, including also the preparation of working materials. Progress of some activities has been hampered by delays in completion of 'parents' rooms' in kindergartens, which are to be financed from co-financing means. Training of teachers and teacher assistants in 70 selected schools was split into eight modules with some of them being jointly delivered also for secondary school/ university teachers and students. The Contractor has prepared also relevant working materials, which are now being commented. The vocational training in four pilot schools seems to be the most difficult part of the sub-programme; the first version of the new curricula to comply with EU rules is currently being considered by the MoE.

SR-0103.01 Support of the Roma Minority in the Educational Field

Activity 1 Pre-school education in kindergartens

Emphasis is placed on the reinforcement of alternative methods in the educational process of minorities. The 'mother and child' type kindergarten will be introduced under the project, representing the first kind of institution in a series of educational facilities where next to the professional teachers also assistant teachers will actively participate in the educational process. 50 kindergartens will be established and equipped in areas with high density of Roma population. As the current conditions of kindergartens are usually not suitable for the 'mother and child' model, the refurbishment of kindergartens should be carried out firstly. Indicatively, 20 children and five mothers will be invited to attend one kindergarten where all activities for children and mothers will be carried out under the supervision of professional teachers and assistant teachers. At the end of the project, the curriculum for training mothers in childcare, as one of the outcomes of the 2000 Phare programme, will be further developed by including surveys and experience of the assistant teachers.

Activity 2 Strengthening of the whole day care system and enhancement of concepts of preparatory classes

This project aims at establishing and equipping 70 additional preparatory classes at primary schools with the purpose of strengthening the whole-day care system and enhancing the concept of preparatory classes. This concept is addressed to socially disadvantaged children while respecting their needs and facilitating their individual development. In order to encourage and motivate the Roma community, also parent rooms in each school will be established as areas of interaction between school, child and family. Also great emphasis will be placed on the role of assistant teachers who will provide several lessons per week in Romany language.

Activity 3 Reintegration of socially disadvantaged children from special schools into the standard primary schools

The purpose of this activity is to increase the number of Roma pupils reintegrated from special schools into the standard primary schools via establishment of 20 additional transition classes at 20 special schools in micro-regions with high density of Roma inhabitants. The staff of one experimental class will consist of two main key figures with specific job description, namely trained teachers for special classes and their assistants. Under this project diagnostic tests have been re-evaluated in order to increase the number of pupils re-integrated from special schools into standard primary schools, ensuring that for pupils are adequately diagnosed by enrolling to the first grade of a primary school and that pupils are sufficiently prepared for standard school education. Seminars will be for teachers and teacher assistants. The new tests and methodology of teaching Roma children is expected to be re-integrated into regular schools. Also software will be developed for the new evaluation and a sector-wide strategy for implementation of the results of the project. Equipment for special schools will comprise information technology, including software, teaching and electric devices. A FWC has started in January 2003. The Inception Report was approved only after several consultations and commenting in May 2003 and changed the design of the project in favour of more differential diagnosis. However the procedure of approval of four additional local experts (employed in the state budget contribution institution) appeared to be rather lengthy and eventually has resulted into a request for the extension of the disbursement period for the project until February 2004, which was approved by the ECD in September 2004. After fact-finding and needs assessment earlier this year, the Contractor completed school readiness tests for assessment of children capacity which are about to start standard primary school. A group of about 300 Roma children is now being tested, using the newly developed testing tools to be followed by recommendations to the MoE for updating the existing Roma Education Strategy.

Activity 4 Establishment of CC

This activity focuses on the development of the Roma community, through the establishment of CC. Phare supports the establishment, equipment, maintenance and work of mediators for ten new CC in those locations where large numbers of Roma are situated and at the same time the Phare financed SR-0103.02 Infrastructure Intervention will be realised. After assessment of specific needs of communities involved in the project, social field workers will be selected and later trained using a training module and a combination of a 15-day classroom and later on-the job training. The ten CC will function as meeting places for local inhabitants and therefore places of interaction of various cultures (especially the Roma and non-Roma). The supplies for CC include teaching and electric devices, IT and furniture are to be contracted together the supplies for kindergartens and schools. Technical specification was still in a draft stage at the time of this IE; also equipment for kindergartens, schools and CCs being contracted under one joint tender has not been launched yet. TA to CCs has been contracted only shortly before the cut off date of this report.

SR-0103.02 Infrastructure for Roma Settlements

Activity 1 Co-ordination of Implementation

Separate activities are proposed to guarantee the active involvement of the Roma population in the project, the acceptance of changes by the majority population and the improvement of mutual tolerance between the Roma and non-Roma communities. A team of ten ‘mediators’ will be trained; it will later work in settlements in East Slovakia where the infrastructure is being built under SR-0103.02. Besides community development activities and co-ordination of the work and communication among all parties involved in implementation, the mediators will prepare regular reports on the situation in the villages with a special focus on the settlements and progress in community development, improvement of living conditions and monitoring of the actual realisation of the construction works. After unsuccessful tendering of this activity (due to lack of suitable bids and complexity of the given requirements) the Terms of Reference (ToR) have to be re-drafted by the SHRM.

Activity 2 Preparation of Technical Documentation

This activity includes assistance for the investment projects, such as preparation of the land-use plan, submission of detailed technical drawings to the district authority for obtaining the building permits or drafting of the full tender dossier for launching the tender. The group of 30 settlements was split into two sub-groups. The TA for the first set of 11 villages started in summer 2002. The EU experts worked on tender documentation according to the EU rules. Tender documentation was however delayed and the RDSA had to put additional input to the technical documentation in order to be accepted for tendering purposes. The ToR for the TA for the second group of settlements (19 villages) had to be re-drafted several times and are now expected to be contracted under negotiated procedure by the end of October 2003. Besides some office equipment also on-the job training was delivered to the RSDA in a very limited form via the TA FWC.

Activity 3 Construction Works

In the selected 30 Roma settlements different works will be performed, such as roads construction, water supply, sewerage, electricity and wastewater treatment plants. The realisation of the works is planned to assure the active involvement of the Roma in the construction phase through the Public Beneficial Works Programme, financed from the State Budget in order to enhance the sustainability of the project results. However it is up to the contractor and municipality to decide on Roma employment pending on the type of a contract. After successful tendering the works of the first group of settlements (11 villages) works are expected to start in autumn 2003 (six months later than originally foreseen) and are expected to last about a year. From the second group of settlements two villages seem to be rather problematic, mainly due to the unsolved land ownership and lack of co-operation from the side of the municipality and its inhabitants.

2002/000.610-03 Further Integration of the Roma Children in the Educational Field and Improved Living Conditions

Activity 1: Re-integration of children from socially disadvantaged environment from special schools into regular primary schools

The purpose of this activity is to increase the number of Roma pupils re-integrated from special schools into the standard primary schools by means of establishing detached classes of standard primary schools in the premises of specialised primary schools in municipalities. This approach will enable Roma children to attend standard education in the place of their residence and should motivate Roma parents to support schooling of their children on the appropriate level according to their skills. In the framework of the project's implementation, classes of standard primary schools will be established at 20 special primary schools in municipalities with high numbers of Roma inhabitants. Phare is funding also equipment in the form of teaching devices, furniture and media players for the selected 20 classes.

Activity 2: Identification of municipalities to receive support and reviewing existing technical documentation

This activity aims at identification of those municipalities, which will receive assistance in the preparation of technical documentation for Roma infrastructure, particularly those which do not have sufficient financial resources and capacity to prepare land planning and technical documents and where people are living in extreme poverty, socially excluded. These locations are mostly located in the Eastern regions of the Slovakia.

Activity 3: Preparation of technical documentation for municipalities with high share of socially disadvantaged groups of inhabitants

The project foresees support to selected municipalities in the preparation of technical documentation – land-use plan (in order to obtain a decision for land use), detailed technical drawings, maps, technical specifications, budgets, etc. - needed for obtaining various permits regarding Roma infrastructure construction. The Programme is at the pre-implementation stage with the Technical Specification (TS) being prepared by the MoE and ToR under drafting by the RDSA respectively.

SK-0013 ACCESS 2000 (M€ 0.900)

In Slovakia, ACCESS 2000 supports NGO/ NPOs in two main areas:

- (i) activities related to the adoption and implementation of the *acquis communautaire* in the fields of environmental protection and socio-economic development.
- (ii) activities in the social sector, contributing to the social reintegration and/or promoting sustainable health and social support for marginalised groups of population.

Networking Facility (M€ 0.050)

The purpose of the Networking Facility is to allow the NGOs/ NPOs of the candidate countries to participate in multinational activities organised by other NGOs or NPOs in the EU Member States and other candidate countries. This participation should promote the integration of candidate country based NGOs/NPOs in the existing networks and platforms, notably at the EU level. Grants have been provided to cover travel and accommodation costs. The CSDF

contracted the Slovak Academic Information Agency (SAIA) in July 2001 for technical support in order to assist in the technical management of the Phare ACCESS programme/Networking Facility in Slovakia. SAIA's tasks include among other maintaining of the information system for the networking facility, organisation of calls for proposals; assistance of the beneficiary organisations during the project implementation in all project related matters and evaluation and reporting on the performances of the beneficiaries to the CSDF. 60 grants were awarded as a result of two rounds of selection process in June and October 2002 respectively and 38 networking grants were chosen in July 2002. After delays - caused by late transfer of 80 percent of finances from the CSDF to grantees - the first activities started in autumn 2002. Currently, the monitoring of all micro-projects is on-going and NGOs prepare their final reports for the last 20 percent of grants to be paid afterwards. The Networking Facility is before its completion with a few final reports still to be received.

Fact Sheet

Project/sub-project Title	Activities	Outputs
SK-002		
Twinning	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Twinning Covenant between French NGO RACINE and DPM endorsed on 28 December 2001; • Twinning activities started in March 2002; • Opening conference for 60 participants – 12 April 2002; • Seminar on Roma in Slovakia – education, employment, housing and health –13/14 June 2002; • Second meeting of the Inter-ministerial Committee and first common meeting of the Plenipotentiary - 19 June 2002; • Preparation of the twinning web page; • Daily advice to PP on updating the Roma Strategy; • Seminar on Roma strategy – 22/24 January 2003; • Seminar on Roma integration and Decentralisation – 25/27 March 2003; • Third meeting of the Inter-ministerial Committee and first common meeting of the PP – 6 May 2003; • Study visit to France on education – 12/18 May 2003; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Completion of the synthesis memorandum and preliminary proposal for the update of the Strategy June 2002; • Web site on the twinning completed and included into the government web page – September 2002; • Input into Basic Theses of Government Strategy of Integration of Roma Communities – April 2003;
TA, investments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supply and service contracts signed – December 2002; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PCs and of the equipment delivered – spring/summer 2003;
Mutual tolerance in municipalities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fact finding and initial assessment; • Selection of field workers and volunteers– March/April 2003; • Training for field workers and volunteers – April/August; 2003 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inception report – April 2003; • 32 field workers and more than 400 volunteers selected and trained – September 2003; • 10 CCs opened – August 2003;

Project/sub-project Title	Activities	Outputs
Improved conditions for Roma to enter the labour market	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Working trip for field workers and mayors to CCs – 20/21 May 2003 • Preparation of municipal plans for reconstruction of CCs; • Training of volunteers; • Preparation of training manuals; • Selection of trainers and counsellors – March/April 2003; • Training of trainers and consultants – three sessions – May/August 2003; • Preparation of programme modules for socially excluded Roma; • Selection of training participants – young Roma without qualification – March/May 2003; • Consultations and training, implementation of special programme packages – June 2003; • Selection of programme leaders and training participants for individual action plans; • Selection of incubators; • SC meeting – 09 September 2003; • Training for pedagogical staff and seminars for mothers from kindergartens – April/August 2003; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inception Report approved – March 2003; • Contract amended – April 2003; • 32 trainers and counsellors selected – April 2003; • 250 young Roma under 18 and 600 adults selected; • Training modules finished– August 2003; • Training centres equipment delivered and installed - May 2003 • Technical equipment for practical training – delivered in May 2003; • Part of the technical equipment for incubators delivered in August 2003; • About 30 incubators selected – September 2003;
Roma self-realisation in education system	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Completion of pedagogical documents for kindergartens – April/August 2003; • Preparation of training modules for pedagogical staff and Roma mothers and working materials for primary schools; • Training needs assessment of training for teachers and teacher assistants – February 2003; • Training of teachers of primary and secondary schools, students and university teachers – Module I – VIII – March/September 2003; • Vocational and training education seminars – February-September 2003; • Completion of pedagogical documents for vocational 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inception Report – February 2003; • Report from entrance monitoring of 70 elementary schools – April 2003; • Report on monitoring parent in education process – April 2003; • Reports on school attendance, educational process results and parents involvement – August 2003; • Training Modules I-VIII and for kindergartens- September 2003; • Plan for kindergarten – September 2003; • Worksheets and observation sheets for kindergarten – September 2003;

Project/sub-project Title	Activities	Outputs
	schools – August 2003;	
SR-0103.01		
Equipment TA to CCs FWC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tendering started – September 2003 • Contract signed in September 2003; • Fact finding, needs assessment, preparation of new entry tests – January/March 2003; • Completion of Inception report; • Completion of school readiness tests – February/May 2003; • Re-evaluation of motivation strategy – May/July 2003; • Testing 300 Roma children started in May 2003; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No output yet; • No output yet; • Report on curricula and education methods in standard and special primary schools – March 2003; • Inception report – approved May 2003; • School readiness tests completed-June 2003;
SR-0103.02		
TA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FWC signed on 29 July 2002 • On-job training for RDSA; • Training for 10 mayors on Phare tendering – November 2002; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ToR for long-term assistance drafted – August 2002; • Inception Report completed – August 2002; • Interim Report Completed – September 2002; • Technical specification for the equipment completed – September 2002; • Delivery of equipment for RDSA – October 2002; • Completion of Tender dossier; • Tender documentation for 11 settlements – October 2002; • Draft Final Report – December 2002; • Tender launch for 11 settlements – July 2003
2002/000-610.03		
Integration of Roma children Improved living conditions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Completion of TS by the MoE 2003; • Completion of ToR by RDSA; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No output yet; • No output yet;
SK-0013		
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Negotiations on the implementation, management, and budget issues between the EC Delegation and CSDF started in July 2001; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Financing Agreement signed by the NAO and PAO in May 2001;
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Drafting ToR, the Service Contract and the negotiation report for Slovak Academic Information Agency (SAIA); 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Networking facility signed with SAIA – July 2001;
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC meeting social sector– 10 September 2001 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Memorandum of Understanding between the ECD and the CSDF signed on 21 November 2001
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Drafting guidelines, call for proposals for micro projects; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Guidelines approved by ECD in March 2002;

Project/sub-project Title	Activities	Outputs
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Micro projects scheme announced by the CSDF on March 15, 2002; 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentation of the Programme on the press conference organised by the CSDF on 20 March 2002; 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentation to NGOs on micro projects – March 2002; 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Five presentations of the Networking Facility to 114 NGOs – June/October 2002; 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two calls for proposals for micro projects - May and September 2002; 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Four evaluation committee meetings for micro projects – July/October 2002; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 60 grants awarded - M€ 0.760;
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evaluation committee meeting for Networking – July 2002; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 38 networking grants awarded - M€ 0.050;
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Selection of grants for Networking finished in December 2002; • Monitoring of grantees – March/September 2003; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No output yet;