

Interim Evaluation Report No.  
R/SR/JHA/01041



# Phare

Interim Evaluation of the  
European Union  
Phare Programme

Country: Slovak Republic

Sector: Justice and Home Affairs/  
Political Criteria

Programmes covered:  
SR-9813 Pre-Ins Facility  
Programme  
SR-9904 Pre-Ins Facility  
Programme/ Minority  
Development Programme,  
SR-9905 Political Criteria/  
Minority Tolerance Programme  
SK-0002 Political Criteria/ Roma  
Minority Programme

Author: OMAS Consortium  
Middle Unit

25 September 2001

Controlled copy.....13.....of.....15.....

Signed:..........

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### MONITORING AND INTERIM EVALUATION SUMMARY

### GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS

### PREFACE

<b>CHAPTER 1 - SECTORAL OVERVIEW</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Activities and Effects	1
1.2 Corrective Actions	9
1.3 Accession Partnership and National Programme for the Adoption of the Acquis	10
1.4 Main Findings of previous Assessment/Interim Evaluation Report	10
<b>CHAPTER 2 - IMPLEMENTATION EVALUATION</b>	<b>10</b>
2.1 Previous Assessment/ Interim Evaluation	10
2.2 Programming/Programme Design	10
2.3 Programme Management	11
2.4 Programme Co-ordination	12
2.5 Financial and Time Management	13
2.6 Contractor's and Counterpart's Performance	13
2.7 Programme Environment	14
2.8 Overall Implementation Evaluation	15
<b>CHAPTER 3 - CONCLUSIONS</b>	<b>16</b>
3.1 Previous Assessment/Interim Evaluation	16
3.2 Achievement of Wider Objectives	16
3.3 Achievement of Immediate Objectives	16
3.4 Sustainability	17
3.5 Progress on Absorption of Acquis Communautaire	17
3.6 Overall Conclusion and Rating	18
<b>CHAPTER 4 - RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>18</b>
4.1 Management Recommendations	18
4.2 Other Recommendations	19
4.3 Recommendations from previous Assessment/ Interim Evaluation	21
<b>ANNEXES</b>	<b>22</b>
ANNEX 1 - Indicators of Achievement of Programme Objectives	23
ANNEX 2 - List of Interviews	24
ANNEX 3 - List of Documents referred to in the Interim Evaluation	27
ANNEX 4 - National Programme for the Adoption of the Acquis	29
ANNEX 5 - Recommendations from previous Assessment/ IE and Follow-up	32
ANNEX 6 - List of Projects supported by the SR-9904 Minority Development Programme	33
ANNEX 7 - Dissenting Views	37

## MONITORING AND INTERIM EVALUATION SUMMARY

### Slovak Republic – Justice and Home Affairs (Roma matters)

**Monitoring Reports:** M/SR/JIA/01004 issued on 11 June 2001, M/SR/JHA/01006 issued on 3 July 2001, M/SR/JHA/01007 issued on 15 August 2001 and M/SR/CIV/01005 issued on 9 July 2001

**Interim Evaluation Report:** IE/SR/JHA/01041

This Monitoring and Interim Evaluation Summary covers Phare assistance under the Justice and Home Affairs (Roma matters) Programmes SR-9813.04 'Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the Spis Region – Community for You Project', SR-9904 'Minority Development Programme', SR-9905.02 'Minority Tolerance Programme' and SK-0002 'Roma Minority Programme'.

Programme/ Component	Start Date	Expiry Date	Allocation	Committed %	Disbursed %
SR-9813.04 Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the Spis Region – 'Community for You'	08/12/1998	31/12/2001	0.450	99	53
SR-9904 Pre-In's Facility/ Minority Development Programme	04/ 11/1999	31/12/2002	2.000	40	16
SR-9905.02 Political Criteria/ Minority Tolerance Programme	11/ 10/1999	31/12/2002	1.800	10	2
SK-0002 Roma Minority Programme	26/09/2000	31/12/2003	3.800	0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>8.050</b>		

In MBUR, source: Perseus dated 6 September 2001.

### Background

The Slovak Government has adopted a strategy for the solution of the problems of the Roma national minority and a set of measures for its implementation has been approved. This strategy is fully in line with Slovakia's pre-accession strategy to the European Union and enactment of relevant European acts for minority rights. The Office of the Deputy Prime Minister for Human Rights, Minorities and Regional Development together with the Section of Human Rights and Minorities at the Office of Government has overall responsibility for the Programmes. Since 1998 Phare interventions actively support the Government's efforts toward improvements of the situation of the Roma minority.

### Objectives

The Wider Objectives are to support minority rights, to develop tolerance and to support the integration of the Roma minority. The Immediate Objectives are to upgrade housing standards of the Roma in the Spis region, to improve their cultural and educational levels and to increase their employment levels; to foster respect for minority rights, to create conditions for the development of minorities and to support cultural and educational levels of minorities; to increase tolerance towards minorities in public services and among citizens, and to improve conditions for Roma to integrate into society while maintaining their ethnic identity.

## Activities, Outputs and Effects

The Roma population in the Spis region is targeted by the Community for You project which aims to improve their cultural and educational levels, and to increase their employment opportunities. Under this pilot project, a 'mother and child' module is being applied to pre-school education of Roma children in ten kindergartens. Five community centres have started their work and social workers and Roma teaching assistants are working closely within the selected communities. The centres are providing a platform for cultural and social meetings of the Roma minority, as well as for the non-Roma majority living in the area. However, the reconstruction of the kindergarten of Markusovce has not started because of the disappearance of the contractor. The activity for providing training and temporary employment for 50 young Roma is still on-going.

The SR-9904 Minority Development Programme is managed by the Civil Society Development Foundation and offers a Grant Scheme for minority-related projects of regional and local Non-Governmental Organisations. Up to May 2001, 58 grants totalling 0.340 MEUR had been awarded. Most of these activities were focused on Roma (26 projects), Hungarians (18 projects) and Ruthenians (5 projects). A further round of 13 projects is currently under way and an additional 21 projects are being contracted.

Under the SR-9905.02 Minority Tolerance Programme, a training programme for local authorities and opinion-makers is expected to start soon. A new tender has to be announced for the public information campaign on minorities in the print media and the Internet. For the public information campaign on minorities in the electronic media, the tender evaluation is under way. The contract related to technical assistance for minority schools is awaiting approval and the purchasing of teaching aids for minority schools, and of computer equipment for minority schools and universities is still at the tendering phase.

The SK-0002 Roma Minority Programme will provide additional support in order to increase mutual tolerance between Roma and non-Roma, to further improve the conditions for young Roma to enter the labour market, and to increase access of Roma to education. Technical specifications and terms of reference for the various activities are still under preparation.

## Implementation Evaluation

The Wider and Immediate Objectives were generally relevant but broad definitions and poor Indicators of Achievement have made evaluation difficult. Programme management carried out by the Section of Human Rights and Minorities/ Department for Project Co-ordination has been efficient, despite crucial shortcomings in staffing, and the management of the Civil Society Development Foundation has improved after internal re-organisations. The management performed by the Ministry of Education is clearly insufficient, and needs a more committed approach as regards organisation and staffing. The co-ordination role of the Section of Human Rights and Minorities/ Department for Project Co-ordination needs to be maintained and strengthened, considering the need to deliver inter-sectoral strategies for integrating the Roma population. Communication between donors and recipients by means of the Donors' Forum needs to be improved. Proper financial and time management has suffered from delays,

understaffing and insufficient absorption capacities of the beneficiary Slovak Non-Governmental Organisations. The performance of contractors is good, with the exception of the works contractor for the Markusovce kindergarten. There are encouraging signs of active participation of Roma population. The Programmes' environment has been politically supportive so far, but political changes in the near future could adversely effect the Programmes' implementation. There are still a number of indispensable preconditions towards education, living conditions and democratic participation of the Roma which need to be addressed immediately if the Phare efforts for Roma integration are to be successful.

## **Conclusions**

The Wider and Immediate Objectives of Programmes SR-9813.04, SR-9905.02 and SK-0002 are likely to be achieved, if individual activities are managed in a pro-active way and well co-ordinated; however, full commitment of the SR-9904 Grant-giving Scheme is at risk, and the full achievement of the related Immediate Objectives is questioned. Sustainability is not strong yet, and will require a very long-term commitment from the Slovak authorities as well as the active involvement of the Roma population. The Programmes are expected to inspire further action by the Slovak Government and, therefore, are likely to contribute to the achievement of the political criteria for the accession process. Overall, the Achievement of Objectives is rated "Satisfactory".

## **Recommendations**

### Management Recommendations

In order to ensure effective supervision and co-ordination of the Roma assistance Programmes by the Department for Project Co-ordination at the Section of Human Rights and Minorities, the Office of Government should: (i) immediately recruit additional staff for the Department to the level of one per Programme, and should identify possibilities to recruit external technical assistance; and (ii) ensure that the Department is given a strengthened role of overseeing and steering all relevant Phare activities.

The Department for Project Co-ordination should ensure the sustainability of the 'Community for You' project by: (i) developing an exit strategy, demonstrating how the activities will be continued after the termination of Phare support; (ii) requesting the relevant local, regional and national authorities to ensure the maintenance of the kindergarten and community centre buildings, and the funding of salaries for Roma teaching assistants and social workers; and (iii) assessing the possible benefits of establishing the involved community centres as Non-Governmental Organisations.

For the educational parts of the Roma Programmes, the Ministry of Education should immediately establish an Implementation Unit with at least three additional staff, and introduce an effective monitoring system.

The Department for Project Co-ordination should disseminate the valuable lessons of the 'Community for You' project by arranging seminars at regional and national level, with active participation at both regional and national events.

To ensure more effective co-ordination between the donors and Non-Governmental Organisations involved in projects concerning minorities, the Section of Human Rights and Minorities/ Department for Project Co-ordination and the Commission Services at the Delegation should request from the Donors' Forum a more pro-active role in calling meetings and promoting the exchange of information between all participants in minority related programmes.

#### Other Recommendations

To reduce the impact of any major governmental changes which may affect the effective co-ordination of Phare Programmes in the area of Roma matters, the Commission Services at the Delegation should request the Slovak Government to guarantee that the co-ordinating Section is retained in its present structural form, or as near to this as is possible, to ensure continuity.

In view of the planned 2001 Phare assistance in the area of Roma matters, the Section of Human Rights and Minorities should ask the Slovak Government to consider in the phase of the design of new assistance that: (i) rather than supplying new infrastructure to (often) remote Roma settlements, to offer to relocate Roma to the main communities, thus bringing them closer to existing infrastructure facilities; the possibility of finding suitable plots for new Roma houses should be actively pursued by regional officials; (ii) the existence of many Roma dwellings without essential public services is unacceptable; and the most basic improvements (drinking water, electricity and waste collection) should be made available within a maximum of two years, under the guidance of the appropriate regional agencies and the overall supervision of the Section of Human Rights and Minorities.

In order to improve crucial issues of the environment in which the Programmes are being implemented, the Section of Human Rights and Minorities should: (i) assist the regional authorities in ensuring to take action when cases of non-fulfilment of statutory duties against Roma population occur; (ii) actively contribute to resolve fundamental legal issues affecting the integration of Roma citizens, by establishing a working party, co-ordinated by the Section and involving all relevant institutions; and (iii) encourage community centre activists to prioritise Roma awareness of the importance of their participation in the electoral process.

The Section of Human Rights and Minorities together with the Ministry of Education and the Plenipotentiary for Roma Issues should assess how free kindergarten places in all locations with Roma children could be provided with a suitable curriculum and an adequate support network, which includes Roma assistant teachers.

The Ministry of Education should urgently take action to abolish within five years what usually amounts to a segregated school system in practice, in order to ensure the educational integration of the Roma minority. The current system of testing, which ignores the intellectual capacity of the great majority of Roma children, should be reviewed and abolished within two years and replaced by a more sensitive and realistic assessment scheme.

## GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS

<b>Acronym</b>	<b>Description</b>
ACU	Aid Co-ordination Unit
AP	Accession Partnership
CFCU	Central Finance and Contracting Unit
CSD	Commission Services at the Delegation
CSDF	Civil Society Development Foundation
DIS	Decentralised Implementation System
DPC	Department of Project Co-ordination at the Section of Human Rights and Minorities of the Government Office of the Slovak Republic
DPM	Deputy Prime Minister for Human Rights, Minorities and Regional Development
FM	Financing Memorandum
IA	Implementing Agency
IE	Interim Evaluation
IU	Implementing Unit
JHA	Justice and Home Affairs
JMC	Joint Monitoring Committee
n.a.	not available
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NPAA	National Programme for Adoption of the Acquis
MEUR	Million(s) of Euro
MoE	Ministry of Education
PI	Public Information
RDA	Regional Development Agency
SHRM	Section of Human Rights and Minorities of the Government Office of the Slovak Republic
SKK	Slovak Crowns
SMSC	Sectoral Monitoring Sub-Committee
SR/ SK	Slovak Republic
TA	Technical Assistance
ToR	Terms of Reference

## PREFACE

This Interim Evaluation Report covers Phare assistance to the Justice and Home Affairs (Roma matters) sector in the Slovak Republic under SR-9813 Pre-Ins Facility Programme, SR-9904 Minority Development Programme, SR-9905 Minority Tolerance Programme and SK-0002 Roma Minority Programme.

Financial and Contractual Data of the Programmes under Assessment:

Programme/ Component	Start Date	Expiry Date	Allocation <sup>1</sup>	Committed %	Disbursed %
SR-9813.04 Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the Spis Region	08/12/1998	31/12/2001	0.450	99	53
SR-9904 Pre-In's Facility/ Minority Development Programme	04/ 11/1999	31/12/2002	2.000	40	16
SR-9905.02 Political Criteria/ Minority Tolerance Programme	11/ 10/1999	31/12/2002	1.800	10	2
SK-0002 Roma Minority Programme	26/09/2000	31/12/2003	3.800	0	0
<b>Total</b>			<b>8.050</b>		

In MEUR, source: Perseus dated 6 September 2001.

No previous assistance in the sector was given.

This Interim Evaluation Report has been prepared by the OMAS Consortium<sup>2</sup> during the period from August 2001 to September 2001 and reflects the Programmes' situation at 6 September 2001, the cut-off date for the Report. The factual basis is provided by the following Monitoring Reports:

- M/SR/JHA/01004 covering the period from 2 April 2001 to 3 May 2001, issued on 11 June 2001 (prepared by the Section of Human Rights and Minorities of the Office of Government of the Slovak Republic);
- M/SR/JHA/01006 covering the period from 6 June 2001 to 3 July 2001, issued on 3 July 2001, (prepared by the Section of Human Rights and Minorities of the Office of Government of the Slovak Republic);
- M/SR/JHA/01007 covering the period from 3 July 2001 to 6 August 2001, issued on 15 August 2001, (prepared by the Section of Human Rights and Minorities of the Office of Government of the Slovak Republic);
- M/SR/CIV/01005 (prepared by the Civil Society Development Foundation) covering the period from 1 June 2001 to 30 June 2001 and issued on 9 July 2001.

For Programme SK-0002, no Monitoring Report has been prepared yet. Other findings are based on analysis of the Financing Memoranda, formal Programme documentation, interviews with the main parties and published material.

The Interim Evaluation Report examines the progress of the programmes towards the objectives stated in the formal programming documents, i.e. Financing Memoranda, Project Fiches, etc. The report is intended to provide management information for the benefit of the Joint Monitoring Committee (JMC) and other involved parties. It draws conclusions and puts forward Recommendations. It provides a general assessment of programmes/components under consideration and included in the corresponding Sectoral Monitoring Reports.

<sup>1</sup> Interest excluded.

<sup>2</sup> Author: Dietmar Aigner, Short Term Technical Expert Dr Will Guy.



This Report has been prepared through funding provided by the Commission of the European Union. The views expressed herein are those of the OMAS Consortium and do not necessarily represent any official view of the Commission Services.

Comments requested on the Draft version were received from the following parties:

<b>Parties invited</b>	<b>Comments Received</b>
Office of the Government/ Section for Human Rights and Minorities	Yes
Ministry of Education	Yes
Civil Society Development Foundation	Yes
Office of the Government/ Aid Co-ordination Unit	No
Central Finance and Contracting Unit	No
Commission Services at the Delegation	No
Commission Services at Headquarters/ Interim Evaluation Unit	Yes

Where possible, the Evaluators have integrated the comments received into the report. Dissenting Views are in Annex 7.

## CHAPTER 1 – SECTORAL OVERVIEW

For the Programmes under evaluation the respective Sectoral Monitoring Reports present a broad range of Wider and Immediate Objectives. The Wider Objectives mainly relate to the support of minority rights, to the development of tolerance and, in particular, to the support of the Roma minority and their integration in Slovak society. For the purpose of this Interim Evaluation (IE) the Immediate Objectives can be summarised as follows:

- to upgrade housing standards, to improve the cultural and educational levels of adults and children and to increase employment levels of the Roma population in the Spisska Nova Ves area (SR-9813.04);
- to foster respect for minority rights, to create conditions for their development according to the needs of individual communities, to support cultural and educational levels of minorities and to support the overall integration of Roma minority (SR-9904);
- to increase tolerance towards minorities in public services and among citizens and to improve the situation of minorities by developing their education system with special regard to Roma (SR-9905.02); and
- to improve conditions for Roma to integrate into society while maintaining their ethnic identity (SK-0002).

### 1.1 Activities and Effects

#### 1.1.1 Programmes/ Components Data

Programme/ Component Title	Allocated*	Committed*	Disbursed*
SR-9813.04 Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the Spis Region – ‘Community for You’	0.450	0.445	0.238
SR-9904 Minority Development Programme	2.000	0.805	0.312
SR-9905.02 Minority Tolerance Programme	1.800	0.178	0.039
SK-0002 Roma Minority Programme	3.800	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>8.050</b>	<b>1.428</b>	<b>0.589</b>

\* In MEUR, Perseus to cut-off date 6 September 2001.

#### 1.1.2 Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the Spis Region – ‘Community for You’

Programme/ Component Title	Allocated*	Committed*	Disbursed*
SR-9813.04.01.001-005 & 007-0010 Improving the Cultural and Educational Levels of Adults and Children	0.435	0.430	0.238
SR-9813.04.01.006 Increasing Employment Levels	0.015	0.015	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>0.450</b>	<b>0.445</b>	<b>0.238</b>

\* In MEUR, Perseus to cut-off date 6 September 2001.

#### Aims

1.1.2.1 The aim of this Programme component is to improve the situation of Roma in the region of Spisska Nova Ves through active participation of representatives of Roma in the conception, implementation and supervision of activities related to (i) improvement of

educational and cultural life, (ii) increased Romany awareness of basic civil and political rights and obligations, (iii) creation of employment possibilities for Roma, and (iv) improvement of living standards. The 'Community for You' project is co-financed by the Slovak Government.<sup>3</sup>

### Activities and Outputs

1.1.2.2 Originally, the responsibility for project implementation was with the Regional Development Agency (RDA) of Spisska Nova Ves in co-operation with the District Office in Spisska Nova Ves. Physical implementation of the project started late, since the original Project Fiche appeared to be entirely insufficient to guarantee the achievement of the Programme objectives. The Section of Human Rights and Minorities (SHRM) of the Slovak Office of the Government took the initiative and in close co-operation with the Commission Services at the Delegation (CSD) the design of individual activities was re-drafted, respecting the requirements of the Financing Memorandum (FM). A 14 month technical assistance (TA) contract (value 0.249 MEUR) was signed in October 2000 with a Danish consultant in order to provide project management and expert's input. Since the implementation arrangements appeared not to be fully effective, in May 2001 the newly established Department of Project Co-ordination (DPC) of the SHRM (until 1 September 2001 staffed with one director and one intern, since 1 September staffed with one director and one regular employee) took over responsibility for the project. The project is divided into two sub-activities: (1) Improving the cultural and educational levels of adults and children, and (2) Increasing employment levels<sup>4</sup>.

1.1.2.3 Related to Improving the Cultural and Educational Levels of Adults and Children the TA together with the DPC, the District Office, and local pre-school facilities co-ordinate the implementation of the following activities in the Spis region:

- Policy development and stakeholder care: the TA team in close co-operation with other counterparts organises Steering Committee meetings, regularly consults with the involved mayors and District authorities, and co-ordinates activities and develops co-operation with local Non-Government Organisations (NGOs) and other donors active in the region; local working groups and community stakeholders have been identified and organised in order to ensure participation and partnership with the local Roma population.
- Pre-school education reform (allocation 0.036 MEUR plus 0.035 MEUR for equipment): training of Roma assistant teachers took place; their role is to promote multicultural education, to function as mediators between communities and to act as linguistic and cultural interlocutors; the assistant teachers are placed in individual kindergartens of the District in order to help to implement the module 'mother and child' (kindergartens for the age group 3 to 6, where mothers also attend the kindergarten with the children); and the purchase of equipment for individual kindergartens was underway.
- Setting up of community centres (budget 0.031 MEUR plus 0.022 MEUR for equipment) in the Spis District: at the time of this IE, the reconstruction of buildings for community

<sup>3</sup> In order to arrange the requested co-financing, the Slovak Government together with local authorities has removed some Roma in the village of Rudnany (Spis District) from physically dangerous to safe and adequate housing. The reconstruction of buildings, which are housing the new flats, was carried out with active local Romany population involvement in the work.

<sup>4</sup> Currently, the overall unemployment rate in the Spisska Nova Ves District is 24%, the unemployment among the Roma population of the District (representing 15% of the total number of district inhabitants) is estimated at 97%.

centres was in its final stage<sup>5</sup>; community co-ordinators and social workers were trained and educated, and specific efforts to support community development were undertaken; social advisory and social work (mainly related to legal assistance, family economics, money-lending, cooking, hygiene and fight against drugs) in the community centres of Zehra, Krompachy, Markusovce, Letanovce and Arnutovce is underway and various cultural events have been organised in close collaboration with the local Roma population; during the holidays of the kindergartens the Roma assistant teachers were helping out in the Roma community centres.

- Construction of a new kindergarten for 45 children in Markusovce (0.049 MEUR): a 2 month works contract was signed with a local contractor in December 2000. However, at the time of this IE no works have started, since the contractor had disappeared without starting any works.

1.1.2.4 As for Increasing Employment Levels (0.015 MEUR), a separate Memorandum of Understanding with CFCU, the Office of Government and the TA contractor was agreed in December 2000, covering (i) the one-year exclusive use of a mobile saw mill for employing Roma and (ii) wages for the employed Roma staff and funding of employment opportunity activities and qualification courses of Roma citizens in small-scale production. The mobile saw mill has been placed in the Special Wood School of Bijacovce. Training and temporary employment for 50 young Roma is being delivered to prepare them for the timber and woodcraft production.

### Effects

1.1.2.5 Regarding the Phare support in order to ensure the Improving the Cultural and Educational Levels of Adults and Children, all activities are being implemented by involving the local Roma inhabitants through direct participation in the concept and realisation of the project. The module 'mother and child' has been carried out in 10 kindergartens of the District and is applied for pre-school education of Roma children. As an immediate consequence, Roma children who have attended the kindergartens are all entering regular schools. All targeted community centres have started their work, social workers and Roma teaching assistants, funded under the Phare project, are closely working within the selected communities, and the centres are providing a platform for cultural and social meetings of the Roma minority, as well as for the non-Roma majority living in the area. Likewise, the reconstruction of the kindergarten of Markusovce has not started yet due to inactivity of the contractor. There are no effects to be reported yet for the Increasing Employment Levels activity which is still on-going.

### 1.1.3 Minority Development Programme

Programme/ Component Title	Allocated*	Committed*	Disbursed*
SR-9904 Management	0.134	0.134	0.038
SR-9904 Grant-giving Scheme	1.866	0.671	0.274
<b>Total</b>	<b>2.000</b>	<b>0.805</b>	<b>0.312</b>

\* In MEUR, Pursues to cut-off date 6 September 2001.

<sup>5</sup> Physical reconstruction of the community centres is co-financed by other donors; the Zehra community centre was financed by Dutch bilateral support, Markusovce is being ensured by a Danish Government grant.

## Aims

1.1.3.1 This Programme aims at support of minority issues in Slovakia and intends to foster development of all minority communities currently living in Slovakia with special emphasis on the Roma minority.

## Activities and Outputs

1.1.3.2 The Civil Society Development Foundation (CSDF), established as NGO in 1993 and currently having 11 staff members, acts as the Implementing Agency (IA) for the Programme<sup>6</sup>, which is divided into two main budget lines: (1) Management costs (allocation 0.134 MEUR), and (2) Grant-giving Scheme (allocation 1.866 MEUR).

1.1.3.3 For the Management component, CSDF costs related to staff, technical equipment and administration of the Grant-giving Scheme will be covered by Phare. In particular, the following activities have taken place:

- Preparation, organisation and advertisement of the Call for Proposals for the years 2000 and 2001 was carried out and the organisation of the selection of proposals and monitoring of the projects was executed;
- in September 2000 an electronic database of NGOs and their projects with data and financial records was created, which contains more than 1,000 projects submitted by NGOs since 1993;
- following the introduction of the Practical Guide<sup>7</sup> (1 January 2001) the CSDF had to re-organise the Programme management and the Grant-giving Scheme. New grant-giving guidelines were prepared and were endorsed by the CSD in April 2001. The role of the CSDF Board of Directors was redefined and a new Statute of the CSDF was registered in April 2001<sup>8</sup>. The evaluation and decision making process on project applications was changed according to the new requirements and an evaluation grid for the members of the evaluation committee was prepared;
- moreover, a new CSDF web site was created and has been available since April 2001 to support better communication with grant applicants.

1.1.3.4 As regards the Grant-giving Scheme component, financial support is being provided for activities of Slovak NGOs active in the area of minorities at local and regional levels<sup>9</sup>:

- For the year 2000 the grant-giving conditions and forms were created by the CSDF in May 2000, and, in total, three Call for Proposals have been announced since May 2000 in the form of presentations for NGOs in six venues in all regions of Slovakia, by press

<sup>6</sup> The CSDF has been also involved in administering the Phare Civil Society Development Programme as well as the Phare LIEN Programme and Democracy programmes. The CSDF is one of the core members of the Donor's Forum – an informal grouping of the largest grant giving foundations with the main mission to support the development of civil society, democracy and European values.

<sup>7</sup> Practical Guide for PHARE, ISPA and SAPARD, issued in December 2000.

<sup>8</sup> Moreover, the previous CSDF Director left at the end of April 2001. The incoming Director has been appointed in June 2001, but appears to be on extended sick leave at the cut-off date of this report.

<sup>9</sup> Originally, co-financing in the amount of 20% of total project costs was required by the Project Fiche, but then it was dropped to 10% to make it easier for Roma NGOs to participate.

conference and by advertisement. Individual consultations for all grant applications were done in the CSDF office in Bratislava and the CSDF project managers in the regions. Two evaluation meetings were held: in June 2000, when the CSDF Selection Committee made awards to 24 projects; and in October 2000, when an additional 34 project awards were made. Information about the successful projects was announced on the CSDF web site and in the monthly newsletter. Contracts were signed in August 2000 and November 2000 respectively and most of the projects were still on-going at the time of this IE;

- for the year 2001, the new grant-giving conditions were presented during May 2001 to the NGO community at eight venues in the Slovak regions, press conference and advertisement in two national media. The first Call for Proposals finished in May 2001 and out of 27 requests, 13 projects were selected by the Evaluation Committee. A further Call for Proposals with a deadline in July 2001 took place. Out of 51 proposals received, 21 projects were selected (total amount 0.248 MEUR) and the respective Evaluation Report was approved by CSD at the end of August 2001. At the time of this IE, a further Call with the deadline in September 2001 had already been announced.

### Effects

1.1.3.5 The Management component of the Programme has helped to ensure the operations of the grant-scheme according to DIS and 'Practical Guide' rules. As regards the Grant-giving Scheme until May 2001 the CSDF has awarded 58 grants totalling 0.340 MEUR (see Annex 6); the selected projects mainly relate to the areas of Life and Minority Association (16 projects) and of Education and Research (10 projects); regarding the addressed minorities, most activities were focused on Roma (26 projects), Hungarians (18 projects) and Ruthenians (5 projects). More than 30% of the selected projects (five activities) have an inter-ethnic character, focusing on more than two minorities, or are oriented on tolerance and good relations between majority and minority. A further round of 13 NGO projects is currently underway and additional 21 projects are being contracted.

### 1.1.4 Minority Tolerance Programme

Programme/ Component Title	Allocated*	Committed*	Disbursed*
SR-9905.02.01 Training Programme for Local Authorities and Opinion-Makers	0.196	0.176	0.037
SR-9905.02** Public Information Campaign on Minorities in the Electronic Media, Printed Media and the Internet	0.226	0	0
SR-9905.02** IA for Minority Schools	0.197	0	0
SR-9905.02** Teaching Devices for Minority Schools	0.559	0	0
SR-9905.02** Technical Equipment for Minority Schools and Universities	0.622	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>1.800</b>	<b>0.176</b>	<b>0.037</b>

\* In MEUR, Perseus to cut-off date 6 September 2001.

\*\* No detailed Perseus numbering available yet.

### Aims

1.1.4.1 The aim of this Programme is to provide Phare financial support in order to (i) to increase the tolerance towards minorities in public service and among citizens, and (ii) to improve the education systems of minorities, in particular, of Roma.

## Activities and Outputs

1.1.4.2 The overall responsibility for programming and implementing of this Programme is with the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister (DPM) for Human Rights, Minorities and Regional Development, together with the SHRM. Since May 2001, the DPC at the SHRM is the responsible Implementing Unit (IU). For the activities related to minority education, the implementation responsibility lies with the Department of European Integration of the Ministry of Education (MoE)<sup>10</sup>; the projects are professionally assessed by the Department of Minority Education of the MoE.

1.1.4.3 In order to increase the tolerance towards minorities in public service and among citizens the following activities are being carried out:

- Delivery of a Training Programme for Local Authorities and Opinion-Makers (allocation 0.196 MEUR): The tender was launched in December 2000, and a contract (value 0.176 MEUR) with a local NGO was signed in March 2001. A sociological research exercise was conducted in May 2001. Responses from 225 questionnaires were summarised in June and a detailed questionnaire for in-depth interviews was developed. Preparation of training programme and methodology took place in July 2001. A 3-day training of the trainers, focusing on the outcomes of the research, roots of socio-economic issues affecting Roma, history and culture of Roma and other minorities, public policy, minority rights and methodology and structure of the training programme was delivered to 14 trainers in July 2001. During the period from September 2001 to June 2002 it is envisaged that training sessions in 55 localities throughout Slovakia will take place. The focus will be mostly on settlements where the Roma population is 50% and over, and around 450 participants will receive training. The contractor will complete services in October 2002.
- Arranging a Public Information (PI) Campaign on Minorities in the Electronic Media and a Public Information Campaign (PI) on Minorities in the Print Media and the Internet: TOR were prepared and sent to CFCU and CSD at the beginning of May 2001, together with proposed allocation of funds for both campaigns (the allocation for the 'Training Programme for Local Authorities and opinion Makers' was not fully committed and 0.019 MEUR was proposed to be re-allocated to the PI campaign projects). By the end of July 2001, tender dossiers for the PI Campaign in the Print Media and Internet (budget 0.081 MEUR) and for the PI Campaign in the Electronic Media (allocation 0.164 MEUR) have been approved by the CSD. However, at the cut off date of this IE only one offer had been received on the tender for the PI Campaign in the Print Media, and evaluation of the tender for the PI Campaign in Electronic Media was on-going.

1.1.4.4 For the improvement of the education systems for minorities, the following activities are being undertaken by the MoE in co-operation with the DPC:

- TA for Minority Schools (allocation 0.197 MEUR): This activity is designed to create effective interactive materials and techniques for teaching and learning the Slovak language, to develop special approaches to teaching and learning minority languages and to

<sup>10</sup> Preparation and implementation of the educational components of the SR-9905.02 and SK-0002 Programmes is at present carried out by only one official of the Department for European Integration.

deliver a special curriculum for teachers working with Roma pupils and students. In addition, the creation of an 'Education, Information, Documentation, Advisory and Consulting Centre' for teachers of schools with a large number of Roma, as well as for the Roma national minority and the rest of the Slovak population, will be supported. ToR for the respective Service Contract were approved by CSD by the end of May 2001. The Request for Service had to be sent twice as the CSD did not respond for the first one within a month. The Request for Service was approved by CSD by the end of July. Evaluation of proposals received from the Framework Contractors took place by the mid of August 2001 and the contracting is currently awaiting CSD endorsement.

- The Teaching Devices for Minority Schools (allocation 0.559 MEUR) will be delivered to 79 pilot schools with minority language of instruction, and Technical Equipment for Minority Schools and Universities (computer and office equipment, educational and teaching technologies) in the amount of 0.622 MEUR is expected to be provided. Tender dossiers were approved by CSD by the end of July 2001. An International open tender procedure has been launched separately for the teaching devices and computer equipment. Tendering of the technical equipment is still on-going, and evaluation of the tender for teaching devices is expected in October 2001.

### Effects

1.1.4.5 The Training Programme for Local Authorities and Opinion-Makers has been prepared and training in the field is expected to commence soon. For the PI Campaign on Minorities in Print Media and the Internet, no satisfactory offers were received and a new tender has to be announced. For the PI Campaign on Minorities in the Electronic Media, tender evaluation has not taken place yet. The contract related to TA for Minority Schools is awaiting approval and the purchasing of Teaching Devices for Minority Schools and Technical Equipment for Minority Schools and Universities is still at the tendering phase.

### 1.1.5 Roma Minority Programme

Programme/ Component Title	Allocated*	Committed*	Disbursed*
SK-0002 Roma Minority Programme - Improvement of the Situation of the Roma in the Slovak Republic	3.800	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>3.800</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

\* In MEUR, Perseus to cut-off date 6 September 2001.

### Aims

1.1.5.1 This Programme, as a logical continuation of previous assistance, aims at (i) increasing mutual tolerance between the Roma and non-Roma population, (ii) improving the conditions for young Roma to enter the labour market, and (iii) increased access of Roma to education. A further continuation of support to the Roma matters is envisaged under the 2001 Phare National Programme.<sup>11</sup>

<sup>11</sup> Currently, the Slovak Government is preparing two substantial Programmes in the framework of Phare 2001: the first Programme called 'Romany Affairs' will improve access of the Roma to common and more effective education of the Romany national minority; the second proposed Programme, being implemented under the auspices of the Ministry of Construction and Regional Development, will support construction of 'Infrastructure for Romany Settlements'.



## Activities and Outputs

1.1.5.2 The overall responsibility for Programme implementation rests with the SHRM/ DPC. Individual components will be implemented in co-operation with relevant ministries and organisations. Following the broad scope of aims for the Programme it will be divided in three sub-programmes.

1.1.5.3 Sub-Programme 1 (allocation 1.300 MEUR) is to be implemented in co-operation with the Office of the Plenipotentiary on Roma Affairs and will address the improvement of conditions for mutual tolerance between Roma and non-Roma inhabitants by the following means:

- A special training programme module for 30 field workers living in Roma settlements will be delivered (indicative budget 0.100 MEUR);
- after completion of the training module, individual one-year contracts with approximately 20 successful field-workers are envisaged (allocation 0.510 MEUR) in order to provide assistance to activities addressing the Roma minority;
- five community centres for local inhabitants will be established (total budget available 0.060 MEUR);
- approximately 450 local Roma and non-Roma leaders in municipalities will be trained on development of self-knowledge, on explanation of the origin of prejudices and on elimination of communication gaps (total allocation 0.080 MEUR);
- the existing 'Government Strategy for the Solution of Problems of the Roma Minority and the Set of Measures for Its Implementation' will be reviewed and improved by implementing best practice of EU Member States through the means of a Pre-Accession Adviser assignment (allocation 0.550 MEUR).

1.1.5.4 Sub-Programme 2 (allocation 0.780 MEUR) to be jointly implemented with the National Labour Office will focus on improved conditions for young Roma to enter the labour market:

- Special training programme modules will be delivered and 30 future trainers will receive training in order to develop special intervention techniques, career guidance, development of curricula and special methodology responding to the particular needs of young Roma (allocation 0.200 MEUR);
- following this it is envisaged to deliver the training modules to approximately 450 young Roma who left school early without qualifications or vocational training (allocation 0.200 MEUR); training will be provided in 15 training centres of the National Labour Office and equipment supply in the amount of 0.060 MEUR is foreseen for these training centres;
- a small activity (budget 0.020 MEUR) is planned to provide a group of 300 to 500 young unemployed Roma with individual action plans in order to find employment;
- a pilot training activity for long-term unemployed Roma will be delivered through means of three simulated firms (allocation 0.200 MEUR); for these simulated firms additional equipment in the amount of 0.100 MEUR is to be provided by Phare.

1.1.5.5 Sub-Programme 3 (allocation 1.720 MEUR) will be realised by the involvement of the MoE and intends to ensure better conditions for Roma self-realisation in the education system by the following activities:

- Firstly, a common approach in order to reinforce a comprehensive pre-school education system for Roma children, including mothers' involvement into the education process, assisted by trained Roma teaching assistants will be developed; in the next stage, 50 of such kindergartens will be established in settlements with high share of Roma inhabitants. Contracted TA will be responsible for the overall management of this project and is expected to provide experts' input (total allocation 0.230 MEUR); the budget for equipment supplies for the 50 kindergartens amounts to 0.200 MEUR;
- moreover, a modular approach for the establishment of preparatory classes will be developed, which would include the curricula of the work of these classes and training of the teacher. It is also envisaged to establish preparatory classes in 70 selected basic schools. The budget for the TA in order to assist in the preparation and delivery of this project amounts to 0.420 MEUR, equipment supplies for 70 elementary schools are foreseen to the value of 0.315 MEUR;
- a special pilot project activity is planned in order to develop vocational and training education for Roma children without completion of compulsory school attendance. This activity will include TA (0.140 MEUR) as well as the provision of equipment for teaching and workshops for four vocational schools (0.085 MEUR);
- Finally, training for educational staff, such as Roma teacher assistants for elementary and secondary schools located in regions with high density of Roma population and on the standardisation of Roma language will be delivered. The TA budget including training costs is estimated at 0.160 MEUR. Teaching equipment for six university departments or methodological centres and for ten pilot elementary schools will be also provided in the amount of 0.170 MEUR.

1.1.5.6 At the time of this IE, technical specifications and ToR for the various projects and activities were still under preparation.

### Effects

1.1.5.7 No effects can be reported yet for the individual sub-components since the SK-0002 Programme is still at a very early stage.

## **1.2 Corrective Actions**

### 1.2.1 Programme

1.2.1.1 There were no corrective actions foreseen for the SR-9813.04 and SR-9904 Programmes. As for Programme SR-9905.02, an optimisation and quantification of Indicators of Achievement had been considered by the DPC and CSD. No Monitoring Report has been prepared yet for the SK-0002 Programme.

## 1.2.2 Component

1.2.2.1 There were no corrective actions planned for the individual components of Programmes SR-9813.04 and SR-9904. For the Programme components under SR-9905.02, there was a need identified to clarify the necessary co-financing needs, to be done by the DPC, Aid Co-ordination Unit and the National Fund.

## 1.2.3 Project/Contract

1.2.3.1 For Programme SR-9813.04 the CFCU was requested to communicate urgently with the contractor for the construction of the kindergarten in Markusovce in order to force them to start the works; and a former employee of a Regional Development Agency had illegally taken some security equipment for one of the community centres and the CFCU had been requested to involve the help of police in order to sort out this issue. No specific management actions at the project level were defined for SR-9904. As for Programme SR-9905.02, an urgent need to define the tendering procedure for the public information campaign projects had arisen, and an agreement had to be achieved between the CSD, CFCU and the DPC; at the cut-off date of this Report, the corrective action had been carried out.

## 1.3 Accession Partnership and National Programme for the Adoption of the Acquis

1.3.1 The assistance is directly linked to the priorities of the Accession Partnership (AP) and the National Programme for the Adoption of the *Acquis* (NPAA), in particular focusing on the achievement of political criteria for accession (improvement of the situation of Roma community in Slovakia, see Annex 4).

## 1.4 Main Findings of previous Assessment /Interim Evaluation Report

1.4.1 There has been no previous Assessment/ Interim Evaluation Report focusing on minority/ Roma matters in the Slovak Republic.

## CHAPTER 2 – IMPLEMENTATION EVALUATION

### 2.1 Previous Assessment/Interim Evaluation

2.1.1 There has been no previous Assessment/Interim Evaluation Report focusing on minority/ Roma matters in the Slovak Republic.

### 2.2 Programming / Programme Design

2.2.1 Overall, the Wider and Immediate Objectives for the Programmes under evaluation are relevant, but broadly defined and are not supported by valid, measurable Indicators of Achievement, preventing any measurement of the level of achievement (see Annex 1). Only Indicators of Achievement for the SK-0002 Programme are well defined and measurable. The Risks/ Assumptions defined for the Programmes are relevant but sometimes too general. The Special Conditions mainly relate to the Slovak Government commitment, to appropriate co-

ordination between the various stakeholders involved, and to an improved participation of Roma representatives in the implementation; they have been fulfilled for the SR-9813.04 component and are expected to be largely achieved for the other Programmes under evaluation.

### 2.2.2 More specifically the following design points are noted:

- Programme component SR-9813.04 was the first Phare intervention in Slovakia directed at the Roma minority. The initial stage of the ToR was prolonged due to political changes and poor preparation. Re-drafting and change in the management became necessary (see 1.1.1.2). In spite of this delay, the consequences have been beneficial, as the end result was a better conceptualised and more democratic ToR, setting the framework within which the 'Community for You' project was able to develop. Although this intervention is a pioneering project, the background information is presented frankly and the conceptualisation is particularly strong, responding sensitively to the wide variations among the Roma population of the region;
- although in practice Roma are the main target of Programme SR-9905.02, it was felt important to frame it as a general initiative for all minorities, not only to meet broader AP requirements, but also to prevent Roma being polarised as the only problem group. In the belief that hostile attitudes are fostered by ignorance, the design of this Programme seeks to promote tolerance towards all minorities in Slovakia with special emphasis on the Roma. In this way the Programme complies with both the NPAA and AP for Slovakia and is well designed;
- Programme SR-9904 is the first specifically minorities-oriented Programme to be undertaken in Slovakia. As such, it complies with the AP and NPAA. The Programme supports a wide variety of NGO minority projects (see Annex 6), however, it does not ensure an adequate match between defined key needs and NGO activities. It would have been beneficial at the design stage if the planners had identified and prioritised specific key areas to be tackled, with the aim of later inviting bids from NGOs interested in pursuing them;
- Programme SK-0002 is extremely important in that its design directly confronts the main problem areas of discrimination, unemployment and education. Not entirely missing but nevertheless peripheral to the main focus of this Programme is the key area of living conditions, particularly infrastructure, which is envisaged under the 2001 Phare Programme (see 1.1.5.1). Since this Programme, like those it draws on, is limited in its scope, it too is intended to serve as a pilot for later and more extensive expansion of these and similar initiatives.

## 2.3 Programme Management

2.3.1 The SHRM, as the overall management authority for Programmes SR-9813.04, SR-9905.02 and SK-0002, has limited capacity available for administration related to preparation and technical implementation of projects. The SHRM has gone through the process of internal development and personnel changes and its staff has, so far, little experience with administration related to Phare-funded activities. The SHRM staff demonstrate substantial commitment, but its primary role is to support the Government bodies. Serious understaffing has continued to the point that since the inception in May 2001 of the Department of Project Co-ordination (DPC), two people in this Department have borne the exacting responsibility for implementing and monitoring three Phare Programmes, including the initial 1998 Programme

component which is nearing completion (see 1.1.2.2). In the near future these Programmes will be supplemented by others and the drafting of three more Programmes within the 2001 and 2002 Phare National Programme is already underway. Although additional staff may be appointed during September 2001, this still amounts to an excessive workload on the present staff, which has been found to be contrary to good practice. In spite of the enormous demands on staff time, the DPC has proved itself both highly capable and committed, and the continuation of its successful supervisory and management role should be safeguarded even in the event of political or administrative change.

2.3.2 After substantial re-organisation of the CSDF and its management procedures, the SR-9904 Grant-giving Scheme is managed now in a more effective way (see 1.1.3.3, 1.1.3.4 and 1.1.3.5). The CSDF has clearly been successful in seeking to attract Roma, and in encouraging and supporting them through practical help in project preparation. Guidelines for Applicants, Grant Application Forms and supplementary documentation are well-designed and clear. However, changes in CSDF management and personnel have resulted in delays in communication and activity. In particular, instability related to leadership change has occurred since the previous CSDF director left at the end of April 2001, while the incoming director has only been in post since June (see 1.1.3.3 third bullet point). The monitoring of projects is carried out by CSDF in batches over a period of three to four days, where several projects are grouped closely in particular localities and can be visited together. In the monitoring process, planned activities are seen in action, technical equipment is inspected and expenditure checked. Budget control is reported not to pose undue problems.

2.3.3 At the MoE, there is at present only one person responsible for ensuring the preparation and implementation of education measures required in both Phare Programmes SR-9905.02 and SK-0002 (see 1.1.4.2). The educational part of Programme SK-0002 is very ambitious involving eight sub-activities and a substantial budget. While the MoE is said to have promised two or three additional workers by 1 January 2002, this is by no means certain to be realised. In the light of earlier delays, probably related to inactivity by previous personnel, it is essential that a strong and effective organisational structure is immediately created within the MoE if the Programmes are to be delivered successfully.

2.3.4 The CSD has assisted with the implementation of the Programmes under evaluation. The Programme Officer in charge has provided pro-active support to the preparation of activities and has followed up implementation issues in an effective way, contributing to the efficient utilisation of the allocated funds.

2.3.5 The Aid Co-ordination Unit (ACU) follows the Programmes from an overall point of view; however, a more pro-active attitude of the ACU towards the initial difficulties of the SHRM in preparing ToR and communicating with the Commission Services would have been welcome. The CFCU has contracted activities in compliance with the procedures, it checks the proposals thoroughly before approval, and performs its tasks without any major difficulties.

## **2.4 Programme Co-ordination**

2.4.1 The Office of the Deputy Prime Minister for Human Rights, Minorities and Regional Development together with the SHRM/ DPC has responsibility for the overall concept,

implementation and reporting of Programmes and is appropriately liaising with and co-ordinating the activities of a variety of other bodies including the Office of the Plenipotentiary on Roma Affairs, the National Labour Office, the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family, and NGOs.

2.4.2 However, in the view of the implementation of the very ambitious Programmes under the 2000 and 2001 Phare facilities (see 1.1.5.1 and 1.1.5.3 until 1.1.5.5), there is need to improve co-ordination. Rather than simply maintaining the current role of the SHRM by appropriate staff increases, there is an urgent need for strengthening this Section's overall supervisory function in order to help secure improvements to the situation of Slovakia's ever-growing Roma minority. Without such a strategy, and a sufficiently empowered and resourced central body to oversee it, there can be little hope for an effective co-ordinated solution.

2.4.3 As regards the financing of minority schemes in Slovakia, there was poor co-ordination and exchange of information with donors of NGO activities in the past. This situation was improved by creating the Donors' Forum in 1997 as an informal grouping of the largest grant-giving foundations (see 1.1.3.2). In the autumn of 2000 the position of this Forum was formalised as an institution. However, there is evidence that communication and dissemination of information between donors and recipients is still not properly addressed and needs to be improved.

2.4.4 For the SR-9813.04 'Community for You' project, the local co-ordination with other donors' activities is appropriately carried out by the SHRM/ DPC and the TA team (see 1.1.2.3 first bullet point).

## 2.5 Financial and Time Management

2.5.1 Programme component SR-9813.04 is 99% committed, however, substantial commitment has been only achieved 22 months after the signature of the FM, by contracting of the TA (see 1.1.2.2); there is a risk that the reconstruction of the kindergarten of Markusovce will not be finished until after the end of the disbursement period, since the contractor has disappeared without starting any works; in general, there appeared to be a 'last minute' approach for the contracting of the SR-9813.04 activities – 36% of the total allocation were contracted at the very end of the commitment period. The same is likely to happen for Programme SR-9905.02 where, in particular, the education-related components are late, and expected to be contracted only at the ultimate end of the commitment period (see 1.1.4.4 second bullet point). Programme SR-9904 has also suffered delays due to changes in the CSDF management and because of the necessary adaptation to comply with the requirements of the Practical Guide. Taking into account the advanced time schedule for Programme SR-9904, there are doubts if the Grant-giving Scheme can be fully committed until the end of 2001, leading to a possible loss of funds (see 1.1.3.7). This situation might also reflect the difficulties the minority-related NGOs are facing in absorbing the available funds within reasonable time. No commitments for Programme SK-0002 have been made yet but seem to be underway (see 1.1.5.7).

## 2.6 Contractor's and Counterpart's Performance

2.6.1 Only a few activities have been contracted and, in general, the performance of the contractors appears to be satisfactory, with the exception of the contractor for the reconstruction of the Markusovce kindergarten (see 1.1.2.3 fourth bullet point). The TA contractor for the 'Community for You' project has established a good working relationship with key players at both national and regional level. The entire TA team retains a very positive and optimistic spirit. It evidently shares a strong sense of commitment, as well as a realistic appraisal of problems, many of which are beyond its capacity to resolve as a small group with limited resources.

2.6.2 As regards the active participation of the Roma population, there are encouraging signs of civic initiatives linked to the Phare initiatives. As for the 'Community for You' project, even when the establishment of community centres was prevented by circumstances beyond the TA team's control, it is a measure of their commitment and of their acceptance by the Roma community that the intended activities took place even in the absence of buildings. This resilience was a feature of both Markusovce and Letanovce and is no small achievement, given the context.

2.6.3 In spite of evidence of many worthwhile activities, it is disconcerting that many examples can be found of paralysing inactivity, the result of both the denial of citizens' rights by non-Roma, and also of the abdication of them by Roma themselves. Moreover, these occur in municipalities selected for the 'Community for You' project, which is to serve as a National model. This reflects the scale of the problem of integrating Roma in a State where opinion polls regularly show that many in the majority society believe that Roma should live separately. Yet, set against these difficulties, there is the case of the vice-mayor of Krompachy, a former mining town with the highest unemployment rate in the region, who takes an active and enthusiastic part in the project working group. Problems of resistance are hardly unexpected, but evidently there is still a very long way to go before anything that could be described as meaningful 'integration' will be achieved.

## 2.7 Programme Environment

2.7.1 External environment has a substantial impact on the success of the evaluated Programmes:

- As regards legislation, Government policy and the general recognition of the importance of minority rights and the role of NGOs, the Slovak Government created in November 1998 the position of a Deputy Prime Minister (DPM) for Human Rights, Minorities and Regional Development. The DPM acts as an overall co-ordinating body for national minority issues, and this has brought a more committed and systematic approach towards minority needs. However, due to expected changes in the composition of the Slovak Government, the position of the DPM will become uncertain by the end of September, and this may lead to uncertainty about the future handling of minority issues within the Slovak Government. The organisational role of the SIIRM and its related DPC, both subordinated to the DPM, appears to be unclear if the present DPM leaves. The initial SR-9813.04 Programme component has already been delayed by political changes, and these circumstances could

occur again with similar adverse effects for the assistance. Given the complex inter-sectoral nature of the co-ordinating work, the levels of expertise already gained and the smoothly functioning networks of communication established, any major structural shifts could jeopardise the effective delivery and success of Phare programmes and outputs;

- the situation in many Roma settlements reveals multiple problems in which the statutory rights of Roma citizens are not met, and in practice, denied. Such issues often involve either indifference or even obstruction on the part of municipal and other authorities, and prevent the integration to which the Government of Slovakia is committed;
- if effective progress in integrating the Roma population is to be achieved it is essential that underlying issues of legality are urgently resolved. These are widespread and jeopardise attempts to fulfil the political requirements of the AP and NPAA. In particular the refusal of municipal authorities to register individuals on the grounds that their dwellings are illegal is a common phenomenon;
- the widespread introduction of kindergartens to all areas with Roma children might prevent the referral of large numbers of Roma children to 'special schools', as well as significantly reduce the impact of testing. At present in Slovakia, kindergartens remain outside the state education system as voluntary institutions, dependent on parental contributions. However, Slovak law does permit children suffering from a socially and linguistically disadvantaged environment, usually with poor school attendance, to have the opportunity to attend the kindergarten without paying financial contributions. There is a general consensus that education must form the basis of any solution to the marginalisation of Roma. Therefore, the pro-active provision of further free kindergarten places would seem the single most important step that could be taken towards the greater integration of the Roma minority as required by the political criteria for EU accession;
- the issue of integrating normal Roma children into mainstream basic schools and the related topic of the educational testing, by which children are consigned to special schools needs to be resolved. Slovakia, among others, has long attracted widespread criticism on these matters both from domestic NGOs and international bodies. Although these issues are thought to be addressed in the Phare 2001 Programme, the slow progress in tackling such controversial practices is a continuing cause of concern. Further research was to be carried out in Slovakia, comparing the effectiveness of kindergarten education with so-called 'year zero' classes for Roma children, i.e. a preparatory year prior to commencing compulsory full-time education. However, 'year zero' classes have reportedly been under consideration in Slovakia since 1992. This demonstrates a disturbing complacency in the MoE that needs to be replaced with a sense of urgency if the AP requirements are to be adequately met<sup>12</sup>.

<sup>12</sup> The MoE have commented that a new long-term Conception of Education in the Slovak Republic, followed by the National Programme for Education in the Slovak Republic, has been developed. In 2001, the Conception of Education of Roma Children and Pupils was approved by the MoE. New legislation regarding preparatory classes will be a part of the new Act on Education, which should enter into force in September 2002.



## 2.8 Overall Implementation Evaluation

2.8.1 The Wider and Immediate Objectives were generally relevant but broad definitions and poor Indicators of Achievement have made evaluation difficult. Programme management carried out by the SHRM/ DPC has been efficient, despite crucial shortcomings in staffing, and CSDF management has improved after necessary internal re-organisations were undertaken. Management performed by the MoE is clearly insufficient and needs a more committed approach in terms of organisation and staffing. The co-ordination role of the SHRM/ DPC needs to be maintained and strengthened considering the need to deliver inter-sectoral strategies for integrating the Roma population. Proper financial and time management has suffered from delays, understaffing and insufficient absorption capacities of NGOs. The Programmes' environment has been politically supportive so far, but political changes in the near future could adversely effect the Programmes' implementation. There are still a number of indispensable preconditions, related to education, living conditions and democratic participation of Roma, which need to be addressed immediately if the Phare efforts for Roma integration are to be successful.

## CHAPTER 3 – CONCLUSIONS

### 3.1 Previous Assessment/Interim Evaluation

3.1.1 There has been no previous Assessment/Interim Evaluation Report focusing on minority/ Roma matters.

### 3.2 Achievement of Wider Objectives

3.2.1 In the main, all the projects successfully carried out under Programmes SR-9813.04, SR-9904, SR-9905.02 and SK-0002 are expected to contribute to the Achievement of their Wider Objectives, related to the *support of minority rights*, to the *development of tolerance* and in particular to the *support of the Roma minority and their integration in the Slovak society*. It is not possible to evaluate the level of contribution because the respective Indicators of Achievement are not quantified.

### 3.3 Achievement of Immediate Objectives

3.3.1 The Immediate Objectives addressing an *upgrading of housing standards*, *improving the cultural and educational levels of adults and children* and *increasing employment levels* of the Roma population in the Spisska Nova Ves area will be mainly achieved with the finalisation of the SR-9813.04 'Community for You' project. In particular the establishment of kindergartens implementing the 'mother and child' module and the successful operations of the community centres may provide evidence for the achievement of these Objectives. The small sub-activity related to the provision of job qualification and temporary employment for young Roma might show some pilot character, but is not likely to provide substantial employment opportunities in order to guarantee *increasing employment levels* in the Spis District within the Programmes' lifetime (see 1.1.2.3 until 1.1.2.5). Moreover, there are concerns about the sustainability of the project outcomes, in the event that Phare support stops.

3.3.2 For the Immediate Objectives addressing the need to *foster respect for minority rights, to create conditions for their development according to the needs of individual communities, to support cultural and educational efforts of minorities and to support the overall integration of Roma minority*, the finalisation of the individual NGO minority projects funded under the SR-9904 Minority Development Programme is expected to contribute to the achievement of this Objectives (see 1.1.3.5). However, this does not mean that even if the NGO projects are completed as planned the projects will necessarily make a significant impact in realising the Programme Objective of the overall *integration of Roma minority*, although some definite benefits will undoubtedly result. Moreover, the full commitment of the Grant-giving Scheme is put at risk taking into account the advanced stage of the Programme schedule (see 2.5.1).

3.3.3 The Immediate Objective addressing *increased tolerance towards minorities in public services and among citizens* will be supported by successful implementation of the Training Programme for Local Authorities and Opinion-makers and by carrying out the Public Information Campaigns of the SR-9905.02 Minority Tolerance Programme (see 1.1.4.3). Substantial achievement of the Immediate Objective *to improve the situation of minorities by developing their education system with special regard to the Roma* is expected to take place only when the full contracting of education parts is ensured by the end of commitment period, and if sufficient staff in terms of number and qualification are provided by the MoE immediately, in order to ensure the effective implementation of the educational part of Programme SR-9905.02 (see 1.1.4.4, 2.3.3 and 2.5.1).

3.3.4 It is too soon to evaluate the achievement of the Immediate Objective related to *improved conditions for Roma to integrate into society while maintaining their ethnic identity* since the related SK-0002 Roma Minority Programme is at a very early stage; individual activities are still at different phases of preparation but are well underway (see 1.1.5.6). However, it is apparent that such a complex Programme will need a proper co-ordination structure if it is to deliver useful outcomes in order to achieve its Immediate Objective (see 2.4.2).

### 3.4 Sustainability

3.4.1 Overall, there is the potential for sustainable results, in the longer term, if the project outputs are properly utilised (for example, successful Roma project participants would serve as positive examples for other members of their community and thus promote the importance of education). Likewise, education plays a vital part in all Roma-related Phare programmes and, in particular, this needs to be done in a proper and sustainable way since it represents the only hope of a better future for the growing numbers of Roma children.

3.4.2 In spite of the positive results achieved in the SR-9813.04 'Community for You' project, sustainability of the output remains uncertain (see 1.1.2.5). While the kindergartens have been reconstructed they will require maintenance, hopefully with the support of the municipality where they are located. However, the Roma teaching assistants are on a one-year Phare contract and their salaries need to be secured by alternative forms of funding. For the community centres, there is an undoubted and demonstrable need, and it is unreasonable to expect that required social work support can become permanent and continue successfully if the

main source of funding to sustain them is sporadic, like short-term grants from charitable, external donors. Even if delivered successfully, it is questionable whether the employment initiative of this project will make any significant impact on the general situation of Roma unemployment in the Spis District. Whilst the evident commitment of the District Office to seeking placements for young Roma was very encouraging, the actual planned reduction of unemployment directly from project activities is only at the rate of 5% per year (over a two-year period). Even if these measures were successful and sustained in the future, this means that many years would be needed before the unemployment rate for the Roma minority even approached the present high levels for the Spis District.

### 3.5 Progress on Absorption of *Acquis Communautaire*

3.5.1 Phare is going to support the priority actions related to the improvement of the situation of Roma in Slovakia and fight against racial discrimination. A remarkable contribution has been made to the Government's own efforts (in particular Office of the Government and the MoE), by delivering the 'Community for You' pilot project, but there have been only a few small activities completed so far in this field. More comprehensive assistance is underway, but as regards improvement of ethnic relationships and integration of the Roma community, short-term radical changes are not to be expected. The activities supported by Phare are likely to initiate changes and, therefore, are going to contribute to the absorption of the *acquis communautaire*. But to achieve substantial progress in the protection and integration of minorities, like the Roma people, as requested by the Copenhagen Criteria, an increased very long-term commitment from the Slovak Government will remain indispensable.

### 3.6 Overall Conclusion and Rating

3.6.1 The Wider and Immediate Objectives of Programmes SR-9813.04, SR-9905.02 and SK-0002 are likely to be achieved, if individual activities are managed in a pro-active way and well co-ordinated; however, full commitment of the SR-9904 Grant-giving Scheme is at risk and the full achievement of the related Immediate Objectives is questionable. Sustainability is not strong yet, and will require a long-term commitment from the Slovak authorities as well as the active involvement of the Roma population. The Programmes are expected to inspire further action by the Slovak Government and, therefore, are likely to contribute to the achievement of the political criteria for the accession process. Overall, the Achievement of Objectives is rated "Satisfactory".

## CHAPTER 4 – RECOMMENDATIONS

### 4.1 Management Recommendations

4.1.1 In order to ensure effective supervision and co-ordination of the Roma assistance Programmes by the Department for Project Co-ordination (DPC) at the Section of Human Rights and Minorities (SHRM), the Office of Government should:

- (i) acknowledge the critical workload of the DPC and immediately ensure that each Phare Programme involving the characteristic complexities of this type of work will be supervised by

a single person. Additional officers should be recruited not later than by January 2002 to the level of one per Programme; moreover, possibilities to recruit temporary external technical assistance should be identified (see 2.3.1); and

(ii) consider the need to develop and implement an inter-sectoral strategy for the solution of the problems of the Roma minority, which will only be realised effectively if an overall competent body is directly charged with this responsibility. Therefore, the DPC within the SHRM should be given a strengthened role of overseeing and steering all relevant Phare activities, including the upcoming 2001 'Infrastructure for Roma Settlements' Programme (see 2.4.2).

4.1.2 In order to ensure the sustainability of the outcomes of the SR-9813.04 'Community for You' project (see 3.4.2) the SHRM/ DPC should:

(i) in collaboration with the Technical Assistance (TA) project team, the appropriate regional departments and the relevant ministries, develop an exit strategy, demonstrating how the activities will be continued after the termination of Phare support. These follow-up activities should serve as a continuing experiment and as a developing example of good practice and for these reasons fully justify wider regional and national support, in addition to what can reasonably be expected to be provided locally;

(ii) request from the relevant municipalities funding to ensure the maintenance of the kindergarten and community centre buildings; the responsibility for salaries of Roma teaching assistants should be shared between the region and the Ministry of Education (MoE). Likewise, responsibility for social workers' salaries should be borne by the region as a statutory duty but with the active assistance of the Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family. Local Roma involvement should be demonstrated by supplementary fund-raising activities and contributions of voluntary labour; and

(iii) assess, together with the TA team and volunteers associated with community centres, the possible benefits of establishing the community centres as Non-governmental Organisations (NGOs).

4.1.3 As for the educational parts of the Roma Programmes (see 2.3.3) the MoE should ensure that:

(i) an Implementation Unit with at least three additional staff will be established at the Department for European Integration not later than 1 January 2002. A strong and effective organisational structure created within the MoE is necessary to ensure professional management and effective delivery of the educational components of Phare programmes; and

(ii) an effective monitoring system is introduced; the MoE officials with responsibility for planning and co-ordination should meet on a monthly basis with the SHRM/ DPC and with the Commission Services at the Delegation (CSD) in order to liaise on progress.

4.1.4 In order to spread valuable lessons of the 'Community for You' project as widely as possible, the SHRM/ DPC in close co-operation with the TA team and the regional authorities should arrange seminars at regional and national level with the active participation, at both regional and national events, of all levels of society from local citizens, representatives and regional officials to national bodies such as ministries and government. Such events should receive extensive local and national media coverage by television and the press (see 2.2.2 first bullet point, 3.4.1 and 3.4.2).

4.1.5 In order to ensure closer and more effective co-ordination between the donors and NGOs involved in projects concerning minorities, especially Roma, the SHRM/ DPC and the CSD should request the Donors' Forum, as the already existing institution performing this function, to play a more pro-active and dynamic role in calling meetings and promoting exchange of information between all participants in minority related programmes. A first workshop should be initiated by the Director of the Donors' Forum not later than by the end of January 2002 (see 2.4.3).

## 4.2 Other Recommendations

4.2.1 In the event of major governmental changes (e.g. dissolution of the present coalition government) the ability of the Government to maintain effective co-ordination of Phare programmes in the area of Roma matters could be threatened, as administrative changes could result in either the dissolution or relocation of the current co-ordinating SHRM/ DPC. This could put at serious risk the delivery of Programmes to which the Slovak Government is committed. Therefore, the CSD should request from the Slovak Government that this co-ordinating section is retained in its present structural form (or as near to this as is possible), particularly in relation to the ministerial bodies whose activities, vis-à-vis minorities, it now supervises. This continuity should be guaranteed by the Government (see 2.3.1, 2.4.2 and 2.7.1 first bullet point).

4.2.2 In view of the upcoming 2001 Phare assistance in the area of Roma matters (see 2.2.2 fourth bullet point and 3.5.1), the SHRM should ask the Slovak Government to consider in the design of new assistance that:

- (i) rather than supplying new and expensive infrastructure to often remote and inaccessible Roma settlements, where much of the housing is, in legal terms, unfit for habitation and of very low value, a more logical solution would be to offer to relocate Roma to the main communities, thus bringing them closer to existing infrastructure facilities. This strategy would also comply with the political requirements of the Accession Partnership for increased integration of the Roma minority and would in most cases very probably meet with the approval of Roma citizens. Nevertheless, possibilities for finding suitable plots for new Roma houses, ideally by negotiation but, if necessary, even involving compulsory purchase of land, should be actively pursued by regional officials. Such an approach would seek to minimise the negative effects of the current infrastructure policy which merely provides basic services to what will, notwithstanding, remain segregated shanty-town slums;
- (ii) it is completely unacceptable that many existing Roma dwellings, particularly those in segregated settlements, remain without essential public services such as access to safe, drinkable water, posing life-threatening and general health risks to their inhabitants on a daily basis. In the meantime, and irrespective of partial solutions such as the Phare 2001 Programme, the most basic improvements such as water, electricity and waste collection should be made available to existing settlements on the basis of public health and safety within a maximum of two years under the guidance of the appropriate regional agencies and the overall supervision of the SHRM.

4.2.3 In order to improve crucial issues of the environment wherein the Programmes are being implemented (see 2.7.1 second and third bullet point) the SHRM should:

(i) assist the regional authorities in ensuring that their own departments and municipalities take action when cases of non-fulfilment of statutory duties occur which disadvantage the Roma population, preferably by firm and directed encouragement, but if necessary, by administrative or legal enforcement. The regions should be pro-active in checking on non-compliance with statutory duties (e.g. to collect waste regularly) for all municipalities. Particular attention should be paid to the inclusion of proportionate numbers (quotas) of Roma in public works programmes;

(ii) actively contribute to resolve fundamental legal issues affecting the integration of Roma citizens (e.g. refusal of registration of Roma individuals since their dwellings are supposed to be illegal), by establishing a working party to resolve neglected contradictions between rights and current practices. Under the overall co-ordination of the SHRM, such a working party should involve all relevant ministries, particularly those of Internal Affairs and of Justice; and

(iii) encourage community centre activists to prioritise Roma awareness of the importance of their participation in the electoral process, so that they vote regularly at elections, and are represented by an appropriate numbers of municipal councillors.

4.2.4 The single most effective step in avoiding the referral of Roma children to special schools would seem to be the provision of further free kindergarten places in all locations with Roma children, as piloted by Programme SR-9813.04. The SHRM, in collaboration with the MoE and the Plenipotentiary for Roma Issues, should assess ways how this could be done with a suitable curriculum and an adequate support network, which includes Roma assistant teachers. In places without existing kindergartens, this would involve the establishment of new kindergartens. Ideally, all such establishments should be open to all children whether Roma or non-Roma (see 2.7.1 fourth bullet point).

4.2.5 In order to ensure a valuable outcome of the educational parts of the upcoming Phare Programmes, the MoE should urgently take action to abolish what usually amounts to a segregated school system in practice, in order to ensure the educational integration of the Roma minority. A definite time-period of five years maximum should be specified in which this goal should be achieved. Likewise the current system of testing, which ignores the genuine intellectual capacity of the great majority of Roma children, should be reviewed and abolished within two years and replaced by a more sensitive and realistic assessment scheme (see 2.7.1 fifth bullet point).

### **4.3 Recommendations from previous Assessment/Interim Evaluation**

4.3.1 There has been no previous Assessment/Interim Evaluation Report focusing on minority/ Roma matters.

## **ANNEXES**

## ANNEX 1

## INDICATORS OF ACHIEVEMENT OF PROGRAMME OBJECTIVES

Indicators of Achievement	Valid as Indicator	Remarks
<b>SR-9813.04</b>		
Improved quality of life and integration in civil society of Roma population in the district	No	Indicator too general; no specification/quantification provided
<b>SR-9904</b>		
Increased number of minority NGOs with sustainable programmes	Yes	Not specified; not only directed related to the Programme;
Number of minority events and activities increased	Yes	Not specified; not only directed related to the Programme;
Number of tolerance and inter-ethnic events increased	Yes	Not specified; not only directed related to the Programme;
<b>SR-9905.02</b>		
Minorities participating and presented in the media	No	Not specified; not only directed related to the Programme; difficult to measure during the Programme's lifetime
More democratic and tolerant public service	No	Not specified; not only directed related to the Programme; difficult to measure during the Programme's lifetime
Improved education opportunities for minorities	No	Not specified; not only directed related to the Programme; difficult to measure during the Programme's lifetime
Increased number of graduates from minorities of all school levels	No	Not specified; not only directed related to the Programme; difficult to measure during the Programme's lifetime
<b>SK-0002</b>		
Increased participation of Roma in the self-government (by 10% in 2003 compared to 2001)	Yes	No evidence; Programme still at an very early stage
Increased participation of Roma in the education system (by 15% in 2003 compared to 2001)	Yes	No evidence; Programme still at an very early stage
Increased public funds available for Roma minority projects (by 15% in 2003 compared to 2001)	Yes	No evidence; Programme still at an very early stage
Increased number of Roma graduates at all level of education (by 10% in 2003 compared to 2001)	Yes	No evidence; Programme still at an very early stage
Increased number of Roma finding permanent employment (by 10% in 2003 compared to 2001)	Yes	No evidence; Programme still at an very early stage



## ANNEX 2

## LIST OF INTERVIEWS

Name / Institution / Address	Phone	Fax	Dates
<b>Mr Vladimir Belovic</b> Director Department of European Integration Ministry of Education Stromova 1 SK-813 30 Bratislava	+421 2 6920 2222	+421 2 6920 2219	03/08/2001 21/08/2001
<b>Mr Juraj Bena</b> Head of the District District Office of Spisska Nova Ves Stefanikovo namestie 1 SK-052 01 Spisska Nova Ves	+421 9654423121	+421 9654421305	23/08/2001
<b>Ms. Katarina Bezakova</b> Project Co-ordinator Department of Project Co-ordination Section of Human Rights and Minorities The Slovak Republic Government Office Namestie Slobody 1 SK-813 70 Bratislava	+421 2 57295 183	+421 2 57295 424	20/08/2001
<b>Mr. Attila Denes</b> Project Manager Civil Society Development Foundation Ruzova dolina 6 SK-821 08 Bratislava	+421 2 50221 550	+421 2 50221 553	30/07/2001 21/08/2001 04/09/2001*
<b>Mr Juraj Kalnický</b> Phare Sector Co-ordinator Director General Section for International Co-operation and European Integration Ministry of Education Stromova 1 SK-813 30 Bratislava	+421 2 6920 2216	+421 2 6920 2219	21/08/2001
<b>Ms Marta Kulikova</b> Assistant of the Project Co-ordinator Project office Radnicne namestie 4 SK-052 01 Spisska Nova Ves	+421965 4298420	+421965 4298420	22/08/2001 23/08/2001

<b>Ms. Jana Kviecinska</b> General Director Section of Human Rights and Minorities The Slovak Republic Government Office Namestie Slobody 1 SK-813 70 Bratislava	+421 2 57295 167	+421 2 57295 424	04/07/2001 20/08/2001
<b>Ms Jana Lorencova</b> Senior Project Manager Non-Profit Consulting Amrop Jenewein Group Vysoka 30 SK-814 99 Bratislava	+421 2 529 01104	+421 2 5292 0114	22/08/2001
<b>Mr Ladislav Maturkanic</b> Director Vocational School for Wood Processing SK-053 06 Bijacovec	+421 53 4541623	+421 53 4599194	23/08/2001
<b>Ms. Kinga Novotna</b> Director Department of Project Co-ordination Section of Human Rights and Minorities The Slovak Republic Government Office Namestie Slobody 1 SK-813 70 Bratislava	+421 2 57295 273	+421 2 57295 424	04/07/2001 20/08/2001 22/08/2001 05/09/2001*
<b>Ms. Anna Oszlanyiova</b> Programme Manager Central Finance and Contracting Unit Mlynske Nivy 61 SK-821 09 Bratislava	+421 2 5341 8093	+421 2 5341 8095	04/07/2001 15/08/2001 04/09/2001**
<b>Ms. Zuzana Pohocikova</b> Senior Project Manager Civil Society Development Foundation Ruzova dolina 6 SK-821 08 Bratislava	+421 2 50221 557	+421 2 50221 552	30/07/2001 21/08/2001 04/09/2001** 05/09/2001**
<b>Mr Peter Razus</b> Project Co-ordinator Project office Radnicene namestie 4 SK-052 01 Spisska Nova Ves	+421 965 42984	+421 965 42984	22/08/2001 23/08/2001
<b>Mr Kristian Sorensen</b> International Expert Dialogue Development Nybrogade 18 DK-1203 Copenhagen K	+45 33 91 1500	+45 33 91 1522	22/08/2001

<b>Ms Julia Stepankova</b> Project Manager Department of European Integration Ministry of Education Stromova 1 SK-813 30 Bratislava	+421 2 6920 2225	+421 2 6920 2227	03/08/2001 21/08/2001
<b>Mr. John-Andrew Young</b> Task Manager Delegation of the European Commission in the Slovak Republic Panska 3 SK-811 01 Bratislava	+421 2 5443 1727	+421 2 5443 2980	04/07/2001 24/08/2001
<b>Mr Martin Zilak</b> Programme Manager Central Finance and Contracting Unit Mlynske Nivy 61 SK-821 09 Bratislava	+421 2 5341 8093	+421 2 5341 8095	16/08/2001 04/09/2001*
<b>Mr Patrik Zoltvany</b> Senior Consultant Non-Profit Consulting Amrop Jenewein Group Vysoka 30 SK-814 99 Bratislava	+421 2 529 01104	+421 2 5292 0114	22/08/2001

---

\* telephone interview

\*\* e-mail conversation

## ANNEX 3

## LIST OF DOCUMENTS REFERRED TO IN THE INTERIM EVALUATION

Name of Originator	Date	Title of Document
European Commission/ Government of Slovak Republic	1998	SR-9813 Financing Memorandum/ Project Fiche
European Commission/ Government of Slovak Republic	22/12/1999	SR-9904 Financing Memorandum/ Project Fiche
European Commission/ Government of Slovak Republic	02/11/1999	SR-9905 Financing Memorandum/ Project Fiche
European Commission/ Government of Slovak Republic	2000	SK-0002 Financing Memorandum/ Project Fiche
Civil Society Development Foundation	09/07/2001	Monitoring Report No M/SR/CIIV/01005
Office of Government, Section of Human Rights and Minorities	11/06/2001	Monitoring Report No M/SR/JHA/01004
Office of Government, Section of Human Rights and Minorities	15/08/2001	Monitoring Report No M/SR/JHA/01007
Office of Deputy Prime Minister for Human Rights, Minorities and Regional Development		Terms of Reference SR-9813.04/ Technical Assistance to Improve the Roma Position in the Spis Region
Office of Deputy Prime Minister for Human Rights, Minorities and Regional Development		Pre-Ins Fund Summary Project Fiche 'Improving the Position of Roma in the Spisska Nova Ves Region'
Office of Deputy Prime Minister for Human Rights, Minorities and Regional Development Sandor Marai Foundation		Terms of Reference SR-9905.02 Minority Tolerance Programme/ 'Training Programme for local authorities and opinion-makers' Inception Report 'Training programme for local authorities and opinion-makers'
Office of Deputy Prime Minister for Human Rights, Minorities and Regional Development		Terms of Reference SR-9905.02 Minority Tolerance Programme/ 'Public Information Campaign on Minorities' (electronic media + print media and internet)
Office of Deputy Prime Minister for Human Rights, Minorities and Regional Development		Terms of Reference SR-9905.02 Minority Tolerance Programme/ 'Increasing the Standards of Teaching and Learning language at Schools with Minority Language of Instruction and Establishing a Roma Education, Information, Documentation, Advisory and Consulting Centre'
Office of Deputy Prime Minister for Human Rights, Minorities and Regional Development Dialogue Development	31/01/2001	Technical Specification SR-9905.02 Minority Tolerance Programme/ 'Teaching Device' Inception Report SR-9813.04.01.003 'Community For You'
CSDF/ Ministry of Finance	09/11/2000	Side Letter to the Financing Agreement for the Implementation of Phare Projects Through Implementing Agency CSDF Programme SR-9904

Commission Services at the Delegation/ CSDF	30/06/2000	Memorandum of Understanding on operating costs for SR-9904
CSDF	April 2001	Progress Report SR-9904
CSDF	16/07/2001	Progress Report SR-9904
CSDF		Minority Development Programme – Grant Application Form
CSDF		Minority Development Programme – Guidelines for Applicants to Call for Proposals 2001

**Documents requested but not made available:**

None.

**ANNEX 4**  
**NATIONAL PROGRAMME FOR THE ADOPTION OF THE ACQUIS (POLITICAL CRITERIA)**

Legal Act	Priority Action Code	Activity/ measure	Implementation		Cost estimate
			Responsible Body	Date	
Law on Human Rights' Ombudsman	Short-term priorities	Adoption of the law	Parliament, Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development	1/1/2002	Roma Affairs 1999; State Budget n.a. Phare 1.8 MEUR 2000; State Budget n.a. Phare
European Charter of Regional or Minority Languages		Ratification of the charter	Parliament, Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development	31/12/2001	1.8 MEUR 2000; State Budget n.a. Phare
		Prepare a report on the implementation of the Phare project on Minority Tolerance Programme for 2000-2001	Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development	31/12/2001	3.8 MEUR 2001; State Budget 5 MEUR Phare 5 MEUR
		Prepare a project of the Minority Development Programme for 2001-2002 with 5 MEUR allocation	Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development	31/12/2001	
		Prepare a project for setting up a Central Node of Drug information Centrum System	Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development	30/09/2001	

		Strengthen the Office of Governments Commissioner on Roma Affairs by means of World bank grant	Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development	31/12/2001
		Prepare information on the status of preparation of the re-codification of the Roma language	Government's Commissioner on Roma Affairs	31/12/2001
		Evaluate public discussion on the problem of discrimination, public and domestic violence	n.a.	31/12/2001
	Mid-term priorities	Complete the building of the system of institutions for effective protection of human rights in accordance with the amended law through the Office of the Ombudsman, National Centre for Human Rights, Centre Against Xenophobia	Deputy Prime Minister for Human and Minority Rights and Regional Development, Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family	continuous
		Permanently train teachers, judges, police officers in the human rights area	n.a.	continuous

			<p>Create conditions for implementing provisions of the European Charter of Regional and Minority Languages within 12 months of its ratification</p> <p>n.a.</p>	n.a.	continuous
			<p>Create conditions through the new school law for multicultural education in Slovakia, not only through ensuring the possibility of education in the mother tongue, but also through including multicultural issues into the curricula</p> <p>n.a.</p>	2002	
			<p>Develop a comprehensive system of financing minority cultures in Slovakia</p> <p>n.a.</p>	2002	
			<p>Ensure successful conditions for the co-existence of Roma and non-Roma communities</p> <p>n.a.</p>	continuous	
			<p>Develop principles and mechanisms for effective teaching of children and young persons coming from socially disadvantaged environment</p> <p>n.a.</p>	continuous	



## ANNEX 5

### RECOMMENDATIONS FROM PREVIOUS ASSESSMENT/IE AND FOLLOW-UP

Not applicable

## ANNEX 6

## LIST OF PROJECTS SUPPORTED BY THE SR-9904 MINORITY DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME

## NGO projects under implementation by the end of July 2001

Beneficiary	Project	Area	Amount
EccE – Association for Support of East Slovakia Regional Development	Increasing of majority sensibility towards Roma community in Slovakia by media (Roma Press Agency)	Press & Media	1,169,600 SKK
Eurocommunity	Roma people participation in local self-government and public life	Legislative and Active Protection of Human Laws of the Minorities	250,000 SKK
Camber Folklore Ensemble Szottes	Folklore as tool for self-recognising	Culture	700,900 SKK
Civic Club of Košice	Universal information is the best weapon against demagogu	Society life	653,300 SKK
Cultural – Educational Organisation Roma-Gemer	Reinforcement of Roma ethnic public life in city of Dobšiná	Social	362,146 SKK
KVO Roma Zemplin	RomaNet	Society Life	493,730 SKK
Bridges Between Us	For dignified life on Hviezdoslavova street	Society Life	344,000 SKK
NOTA	International Music Festival	Culture	259,720 SKK
Roma Edifying Association on Považie	Stimulation of the Roma children and youth	Children and Youth	770,600 SKK
PDCS	Management Education on Roma Projects	Education	936,670 SKK
SPACE	Painting for Education	Education	77,400 SKK
Vydra – The Country Development Activity Čierny Balog	Confirm at first, then integrate	Children and Youth	569,800 SKK
Letanovský mlyn in Letanovce	Upholding of Roma community in Letanovský mlyn settlement and it's preparation for integration with Letanovce village	Social	1,218,100 SKK
Civil Association Waked Song	Ethnic categories "we" and "they" in student distance	Intercultural communication	41,160 SKK
Civil Association Ester	Tomorrow	Intercultural communication	101,950 SKK
Foundation of Sándor Marai	Communication training	Intercultural communication	682,500 SKK
Hungarian Social House-Košice	Common Way - intercultural programme for national minorities living in Košice	Intercultural communication	75,000 SKK
Kaleidoscope	Romano drom	Intercultural communication	341,000 SKK
Folklore Community	Life and traditions of Slovak people and national minorities living in Slovakia	Intercultural communication	514,000 SKK
Association of Gergely	Co-organisation of the presentation	Culture	40,000 SKK

Czuczor	about life and work of Gergely Czuczor and organisation of competition in poems delivery		
Civil Association Zsákszínház	Condition making for working, development and retaining civil association Zsákszínház by framework of the performances	Culture	150,000 SKK
Art Club Prospecta	Rusin's Children and traditional culture	Culture	150,000 SKK
Association of A.Duchnovič Theatre friends	Programme of Rusin's culture revitalisation	Culture	150,000 SKK
Bridges-Gesharim	For co-operation between people	Culture	100,000 SKK
Foundation for Development of Gombasek	Gemer Folklore Centre	Culture	225,000 SKK
Civil Association Polifón	Dance, singing and music in tolerance spirit	Culture	125,400 SKK
Pro Literis	Maintenance and development of cultural movement	Culture	50,000 SKK
Association Perseus	Folklore Ensemble Project	Culture	26,400 SKK
Rusin's Revival	Rutheri-Rusins of Slovakia	Media	276,000 SKK
Romany Association under the Vihorlat	Common raising of the Romany ethnic and it's co-existence	Children & Youth	103,300 SKK
Civil Association Vofnočasko	Roma voices	Children & Youth	183,250 SKK
Civil Association Hope for Children	Health life style for the valuable development of children and parents individualities	Children & Youth	490,890 SKK
Centre for Lunik IX Community Development	Right Men Association	Children & Youth	150,000 SKK
Romany Youth unit with settlement in Prešov	Happy Children	Children & Youth	361,270 SKK
Arvácska-Association for Young Talents	Young talents of Hungarian community in Košice	Children & Youth	149,000 SKK
Gemer Youth Community	Dúha	Children & Youth	325,000 SKK
Patria	Crossways	Children & Youth	149,000 SKK
Pro Gaudio	Let's go to play with us	Children & Youth	70,000 SKK
Domka	Development of Roma minority through children and youth	Children & Youth	253,140 SKK
For Better Life	Go further - don't surrender!	Children & Youth	640,640 SKK
Association of Roma Children and Youth	Romany heart in the heart of Slovakia	Children & Youth	180,600 SKK
Unit of Hungarian Nationality Scouts	All unit winter and spring camping	Children & Youth	213,000 SKK
See Charity	Common House	Social	699,280 SKK
Civil Association for Village Development - RODON	Women and child -effective information in the village	Social	105,000 SKK
Club of Roma Women	Roma Informative Centre	Social	300,000 SKK
Civil Association Way of Hope	Roma Advisory Centre	Community life	300,000 SKK
Culture-edifying Organisation Kálo Ciriklóro Čičava	Parents and child - we are living among you	Community life	136,500 SKK
Culture-Social Romany Association Romane Jile	Project for Roma children and youth club working	Community life	71,928 SKK
Borzová	Quality Improvement of Silická Brezová village	Community life	148,500 SKK
Czech Community in Slovakia	Community life of the Czech national minority in Slovakia	Community life	504,700 SKK

Concordia	People on the border of the city	Community life	150,000 SKK
Civil Association Romano Jilo	Women Unit	Community life	136,000 SKK
Association for Solving Romany issues in Slovakia	Romany community club	Community life	323,640 SKK
Women Singing Group Ohrady	Heritage of our fathers save to us, Lord	Community life	200,000 SKK
Rusin-Ukraine Community in Slovakia	Producing of the book from I.Vandat: 'Volyn's action' Change of population between Czechoslovakia and the Soviet Union in spring 1947	Community life	140,000 SKK
German-Carpathian Community in Slovakia	Support for the revitalisation of German-Carpathian culture	Community life	300,000 SKK
Romany Cultural Association in Slovakia	Development of the Roma community life in the Romany communities	Community life	653,850 SKK
Community of Rusins in the Spiš	Development and saving of the Rusins in cultural and handmade traditions areas	Community life	120,000 SKK
RAMAD	In the terrain under the roof	Community life	420,000 SKK
PHOENIX LUTETIA	From pessimism to optimism	Community life	221,000 SKK
Hungarian Singing Teachers Community of Lajos Vass	Music and community art in culture-educational ambitions of the minorities	Community life	471,000 SKK
Co-ordination Commission of the Reopiants	Research of transfer, return and life of Rusin and Ukraine people from Slovakia to Ukraine during 1947-2000	Research	94,000 SKK
Slovak Folklore Society	Multiethnic background from multiethnic perspective	Research	51,000 SKK
Society of the Cultural Anthropology	Establishing the permanent exposition of the popular culture of people from the Southern Gemer	Research	150,000 SKK
Community of the Queen of the Peace	IMRO (Young Roma integration)	Education	200,000 SKK
Romany Bodybuilding and Sport Unit	Establishing of educational centre for educational and culture/social activities, with considering of cultures fixation	Education	134,400 SKK
Romany Women Club in Slovakia	Roma in self-governments	Education	300,000 SKK
Association of the Rusin's Intelligence in Slovakia	Development of the Rusin's poetry in Slovakia between the Twenties and the Nineties of the 20 <sup>th</sup> century	Education	115,000 SKK
Open School	Partnership project	Education	500,000 SKK
Forum Institute	International library of nationalities in Slovakia	Education	1.060,400 SKK
Romany Christian Association in Slovakia	Educational-edifying programme for children in pre-school and school age in Plavecký Štvrtok village	Education	250,000 SKK
Civil Association Wadke Song	Ethnic categories "we" and "they" in student distance	Intercultural communication	41,160 SKK
Civil Association Ester	'Tomorrow'	Intercultural communication	101,950 SKK
Hungarian Social House-Košice	Common way -intercultural programme for minor nationalities living in Košice	Intercultural communication	75,000 SKK
Association of Gergely Czuczor	Co-organisation of the presentation about life and work of Gergely	Culture	40,000 SKK

	Czuczor and organisation of competition in poems delivery		
Bridges – Gesharim	For co-operation between people	Culture	100,000 SKK
Civil Association Vol'nočasko	Romany voices	Children & Youth	183,250 SKK
Community of Hungarian Nationality Scouts	All unit winter and spring camping	Children & Youth	213,000 SKK
Association of the Rusin's Intelligence in Slovakia	Development of the Rusin's poetry in Slovakia between the Twenties to the Nineties of the 20 <sup>th</sup> century	Education	115,000 SKK

## ANNEX 7

### DISSENTING VIEWS

#### **Office of the Government/ Section for Human Rights and Minorities**

3.6. Overall Conclusion and Rating: Although we accept that several projects were evaluated at the same time, thus comes the rating. We would like you to provide precise evaluation of each project accordingly. Furthermore, we would like to stress the fact that out of four evaluated projects [i.e. programmes] only two are intended for 'Roma only', thus carrying specific features. Therefore, we would suggest to evaluate the so-called 'Minority' projects separately from 'Roma only' projects.

#### **Ministry of Education**

2.7.1. fifth bullet point: Since 1991, several activities regarding the improvement of the education in the first grades of primary schools were carried out successfully. The evaluation of the results came in its last stage at present and new legislation regarding preparatory classes as part of the new Act on Education should enter into force in September 2002 at the latest.